Valerie S. Mason Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com – Website info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

The City of New York Community Board 8 Manhattan Landmarks Committee Monday, September 15, 2025 – 6:30 PM This meeting was conducted via Zoom.

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, September 17, 2025**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Christina Davis*, David Helpern, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway, and Marco Tamayo.

*Public Member

Approximate Number of Public Attendees: 66

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 133 East 95th Street

Item 2: 831-37 Madison Avenue

Item 3: 821 Park Avenue Item 4: 1143 Park Avenue Item 5: 1 East 60th Street

Item 1: 133 East 95th Street (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District) – *Mark Bearak* – A Neo-Federal style building designed by Frank Wennemer and constructed in 1889-90. Application is for a horizontal rear addition on each floor, interior wall reconfiguration, upgraded utilities throughout, addition of central AC via VRF system, renovation of rear yard, and direct replacement of front window.

WHEREAS 133 East 95th Street is a neo-Federal style building designed by Frank Wennemer and constructed in 1889-1890; and

WHEREAS 133 East 95th Street is between Lexington and Park Avenues on the south side of the block; and

WHEREAS 133 East 95th Street was one of 7 houses constructed at the same time; the house was renovated in the neo-Federalist style in 1932; the stoop was removed and the front elevation was clad in brick; and

WHEREAS the applicant plans a complete renovation of the front elevation, including new in-kind wood windows; and

WHEREAS at the front, the applicant also proposes a metal fence that would match the existing fences at 131 East 95th Street and 135 East 95th Street; the addition of the fence would provide a visual connection to 131 and 135; and

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant proposes moving the facade 16' to the north for the entire 5 floors of the existing house; the rear yard would now present as 27 1/2', compromising the 30' rear yard requirement; and

WHEREAS the proposed new rear elevation would present as mostly glass with multipanes at each floor other than the ground floor; the multipanes provide texture; and

WHEREAS the dimensions of the proposed new windows include at the ground floor 105" high x 167" wide, at the first floor 90" x 167", at the second floor 94" x 167", at the 3rd floor a 3" window combination; and

WHEREAS the windows at the rear elevation would not be made of wood, but of a wood clad composite material; and

WHEREAS the proposed 5-story extension is out of context and inappropriate within the historic district; rear yard additions generally stop at the 3rd floor; top floors are not filled in; and

WHEREAS the height of the 5-floor incursion is out of scale and compromises the integrity of the donut; the donut is a major feature for the houses within the Goat Hill Neighborhood Association; and

WHEREAS no plan or elevation of the proposed fence was included in the applicant's presentation;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is DISAPPROVED as presented.

Board Members in Favor: 8-0-1-0 (Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

Board Members Abstained: (Ashby)

Item 2: 831-37 Madison Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District) – David Chipperfield Architects – A no-style rowhouse originally constructed 1885-6 and altered in 1956. 833-837 Madison Avenue are three altered rowhouses designed by Charles Buek & Co. (833 Madison), William Schickel (835 Madison) and Thom & Wilson (837 Madison), and constructed in 1884-86. Application to demolish the no-style building at 831 Madison Avenue and construct a new residential building; excavate existing cellars and create new subcellar at 831-837 Madison; install new wood windows and storefront infill and combine interior ground and second floor retail spaces at 833-837 Madison; construct rooftop and rear yard additions at 833 Madison and construct a rear yard addition at 835-837 Madison.

WHEREAS 831-837 Madison Avenue has been transformed over time; and

WHEREAS 831 Madison is a non-contributing building; and

WHEREAS this application includes the demolition of 831 Madison and the construction of a new apartment building with a retail base; and

WHEREAS the new building will be in line with the apartment house at 839 Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS 831 Madison will be in scale with other apartment houses on Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS the proposed tower will be 194'-8" tall or 203'-11" tall including the bulkhead; and

WHEREAS the proposed tower will be shorter than the apartment house across the avenue at 828-854 Madison; and

WHEREAS the new tower has a modernist design with a front façade of limestone, glass, and steel railings and window frames in galvanized steel with a bronze finish; and

WHEREAS the new tower has two materialities, similar to other tall buildings on Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS the proposed tower uses traditional materials including buff limestone with sandblasted and honed finishes and limestone colored brick; and

WHEREAS existing towers have one material on the front and another on the side, often turning the corner with the front material; and

WHEREAS the limestone façade of the proposed tower turns the corner to meet brick masonry on the sides; and

WHEREAS the new tower steps back on the 15th floor; and

WHEREAS all work to restore the facades of the 833, 835, and 837 buildings above the second floors is being approved at the LPC at the staff level; and

WHEREAS 833 will be enlarged by a three-story vertical addition; and

WHEREAS the façade of the edition will have terracotta colored, textured brick, and terracotta frames at the masonry openings for the windows; and

WHEREAS the two-story base of 839 will be restored, including the extension down to the first floor of the bay window; and

WHEREAS the two-story storefront at 835 will be reconfigured and restored in metal and glass; and

WHEREAS the two stories of windows and frames at 833 will be restored and renovated; and

WHEREAS the proportions of the storefronts at 833 and 835 will be adjusted to align; and

WHEREAS the major horizontal elements of the first two stories of 831 through 837 will align; and

WHEREAS the floors of 833, 835, and 837 will be fully demolished; and

WHEREAS the volumes of 833, 835, and 837 will be re-built so that the first and second floors of 831 through 837 align and retail spaces can be combined; and

WHEREAS all the floors of 831 and 833 will align; and

WHEREAS all new volumes in the rear will be built to the rear property lines; and

WHEREAS the existing apartment houses are on corners and not on interior lots; and

WHEREAS apartment houses on Madison Avenue have typically been built in the styles fashionable at the time of design and construction; and

WHEREAS the new tower could have been designed in the neo-classical style of many new limestone apartment houses; and

WHEREAS the restoration and design adjustments to 833, 835, and 837 are appropriate in the historic district; and

WHEREAS the proposed modernist tower is not contextual and appropriate within the historic district; and

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is DISAPPROVED.

Board Members in Favor: 9-1-0-0 (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, McClement, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

Board Members Opposed: (Davis*, Helpern)

Item 3: 821 Park Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District) – Kenneth Miraski AIA – A Neo-Renaissance style building designed by Lorenz Weiher and constructed in 1890. Application is for the replacement of the first floor storefront fronting Park Avenue and East 75th Street corner, including new stone bulkhead, a reconfigured storefront design, and new glass transom above the storefront.

WHEREAS 821 Park Avenue is a neo-Renaissance style building designed by Lorenz Weiher and constructed in 1890; and

WHEREAS the ground floor is a grandfathered retail establishment currently rented to the Gagosian Gallery; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the storefront window at the first floor, while maintaining all existing elements at the front elevation except for widening the front door, introducing a new fluted translucent glass transom and removing the existing spandrel at the corner as the window glazing wraps around to 75th Street; and

WHEREAS the proposed new wood framed glass door will now be 6'4" wide; the existing door is 5'4" wide;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is APPROVED as presented.

Board Members in Favor: 9-0-0-0 (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

Item 4: 1143 Park Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District) – *Michael G. Fahey* – A Neo-Grec style building designed by John Sullivan and constructed in 1885, with an updated façade designed by Emery Roth and constructed in 1924. Application is for a one-story vertical extension to the top of existing townhouse, and a horizontal extension at rear façade at third and fourth floors.

WHEREAS 1143 Park Avenue is a four-story townhouse, 16'-0" wide by 70'-0" deep by 44'-7" high at the top of the front parapet; and

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the front façade include removing the steps and wood door at the northern entrance; and

WHEREAS a new wood door with glass panels and a bronze kick plate will be installed at the northern entrance; and

WHEREAS the awnings over the doors will be amended; and

WHEREAS the limestone color of the façade will remain; and

WHEREAS the window frames, stools, and aprons will be painted black; and

WHEREAS the existing cornice will be removed, the parapet raised five inches to 45'-0", and a new cornice added in a neo-Greco style; and

WHEREAS the face of the proposed fifth floor addition, which will be setback 15'-0", will be 55'-7" high; and

WHEREAS the setback of 15'-0" matches the setback of the fifth floor of 1145 Park Avenue; and

WHEREAS the proposed fifth floor is 33'-4" long so that its rear façade is in line with the rear of the fourth floor; and

WHEREAS the exterior finishes of the fifth-floor walls and windows will match the front façade; and

WHEREAS the changes to the front façade are appropriate, the fifth-floor addition is not; and

WHEREAS the fifth-floor addition will be visible from the avenue and will change the scale of the building from four stories to five stories; and

WHEREAS the visibility of the fifth floor is not contextual and appropriate within the historic district; and

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is DISAPPROVED.

Board Members in Favor: 7-2-1-0 (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Helpern, McClement, Parshall)

Board Members Opposed: (Chu, Tamayo)

Board Members Abstained: (Davis*)

Item 4: **1 East 60th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Acheson Doyle Partners Architects, P.C.* – A Neo-Italian Renaissance style building designed by Mckin, Mead, and White and constructed in 1892-1894. Application is for a Continued Maintenance Program to facilitate a transfer of development rights from the Metropolitan Club to 655 Madison Avenue.

WHEREAS the Metropolitan Club seeks approval for a Continued Maintenance Program; and

WHEREAS ADP Architects and Fried Frank presented a report for landmark restoration and proposed capital work; and

WHEREAS the Club has made repairs that have kept areas of the buildings in good or serviceable condition; and

WHEREAS façade cleaning and restoration was completed in 2023 but is maintained with ongoing work as required; and

WHEREAS annex wing roof, main club building roof, and main club building are in generally good condition; and

WHEREAS there are areas in the buildings in need of restoration and repair, some of which are set forth herein; and

WHEREAS proposed capital work includes courtyard restoration and exterior lighting; main club library wing rear façade; library wing, club, and annex roofs; and

WHEREAS courtyard work includes restoring cobblestone paving, facade base, entrance, drain, and low windows; and porches include repairing and relacing tiles; and

WHEREAS library wing, rear façade, includes masonry repair for cracking and spalled brick, repointing, and bird mitigation; and

WHEREAS main club building library wing roof includes repairing masonry, replacing spalling brick, and parging; and

WHEREAS the Continuing Maintenance Plan will require the not-for-profit foundation that owns the club to do the work identified in the report and maintain the landmark structure; and

WHEREAS the foundation will have to undertake a survey every ten years for the benefit of the Landmarks Preservation Commission and carry out work identified in the survey; and

WHEREAS the work will include general construction, mechanical, electrical, plumbing, and fire protection; and

WHEREAS the foundation will be required to keep a maintenance fund for the initial work and ongoing survey and landmarks work; and

WHEREAS the Continued Maintenance Program will be funded by the sale of air rights for a super tall tower at 655 Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS the tower will not be appropriate on Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS the Club has the obligation to maintain the building with or without a funded Maintenance Program;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is DISAPPROVED.

Board Members in Favor: 6-1-0-0 (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, McClement, Parshall)

Board Members Opposed: (Helpern)

Items 5&6: Old Business/New Business

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:12 PM.

Anthony Cohn and David Helpern, Co-Chairs