

Valerie S. Mason  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee  
Monday, October 21, 2024 – 6:30 PM  
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, October 23, 2024**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**MINUTES:**

**Board Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpern, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway, and Marco Tamayo.

**Approximate Number of Public Attendees:** 22

**Resolutions for Approval:**

**Item 1:** 1000 Fifth Avenue: Metropolitan Museum of Art

**Item 2:** 593 Park Avenue

**Item 3:** 1185 Park Avenue (Windows)

**Item 4:** 1185 Park Avenue (Interior Courtyard)

**Item 1: 1000 Fifth Avenue: Metropolitan Museum of Art (Individual Landmark)** – *Beyer Blinder Belle* – A Beaux-Arts style building designed by numerous architects, chiefly, Calvert Vaux and Jacob Wrey Mould, who designed the initial Ruskinian Gothic structure of the MET, and constructed in the 1880s, with additions in the 2000s. Application is to restore the three original entrance doors on the plaza at 83rd Street to create an additional step-free entrance to the Museum’s public spaces, as well as undertake a mechanical infrastructure project to replace the north side chiller plant, a project that involves the installation of new cooling towers behind a new louvered screen wall partially visible at 83rd Street.

**WHEREAS** the Metropolitan Museum seeks to restore the 83<sup>rd</sup> Street entrance and replace the north side chiller plant; and

**WHEREAS** the restoration of the original three entrances will provide accessible entrances with a direct connection to the Great Hall, reduce congestion at the 81<sup>st</sup> and 82<sup>nd</sup> Street entrances, and reduce crowding on the Plaza; and

**WHEREAS** the replacement of the outmoded chiller plant with the new plant will reduce electrical consumption by 54% from the current consumption and increase resilience by moving the plant above the level of recent flooding; and

**WHEREAS** the construction work for the new entrances will be at Wing E, and the construction work for the chiller plant will be in Wings W and X; and

**WHEREAS** Wing E was designed by McKim, Meade & White with three entrances; and

**WHEREAS** the stone infill of the two original entrances either side of the current single entrance is visible; and

**WHEREAS** the stone infill of the two original entrances will be removed to recreate the original openings; and

**WHEREAS** the current door and transom in the single entrance will be removed to recreate the three original openings; and

**WHEREAS** the new doors will be similar to the main entrance 82<sup>nd</sup> Street doors in design and material; and

**WHEREAS** the new doors will have dark bronze frames with clear glass infills; and

**WHEREAS** the new doors will have dark bronze transoms, soffits, and jamb extensions; and

**WHEREAS** the tops and bottoms of the door frames will align with the joints in the Indiana limestone; and

**WHEREAS** recessed push buttons for the power-actuated doors will be set into the jamb extensions; and

**WHEREAS** there will be a recessed light in each soffit; and

**WHEREAS** the jamb extensions and the soffits will be 18 inches deep; and

**WHEREAS** the transom panels will be 23" high and 6'-3" wide; and

**WHEREAS** the transoms will include signs with 4-inch-high light bronze letters on the dark bronze panels; and

**WHEREAS** the language of the signs will be determined separately from this application; and

**WHEREAS** the existing blade sign will remain; and

**WHEREAS** the current chiller plant is in the cellar, where, due to climate change, it is subject to flooding; and

**WHEREAS** the new chiller plant will be one floor up, replacing existing shops; and

**WHEREAS** the new chiller plant will use 54% less electricity than used by the current chiller plant; and

**WHEREAS** two existing light wells will be filled in; and

**WHEREAS** the shops will be relocated to and expanded on the fifth floor; and

**WHEREAS** the existing south side and screen wall will remain; and

**WHEREAS** the existing north side cooling towers will be removed; and

**WHEREAS** new vertical cooling towers will be placed on the north side; and

**WHEREAS** the new cooling towers will sit on steel dunnage girders over the Grace Rainey Rogers Auditorium, supported on the remaining masonry walls from the McKim, Mead & White design; and

**WHEREAS** a new screen wall, similar to the design of the screen wall on the south side, will be placed in front of the new cooling towers; and

**WHEREAS** the new screen wall will match the aluminum louver panels in of the screen wall on the south side in material and color; and

**WHEREAS** the north and south sides are not perfectly symmetrical with respect to the numbers of doors and the McKim, Meade & White pediment in front of the proposed screen wall on the north; and

**WHEREAS** the screen walls are not visible from the eastern side of Fifth Avenue but become slightly visible as one progresses east on 81<sup>st</sup> and 83<sup>rd</sup> Streets; and

**WHEREAS** this project is contextual and appropriate for the individual landmark;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 8-0-1-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Cohn, Helpem, McClement, Parshall, Selway)

**Board Members Abstained:** (Tamayo)

**Item 2: 593 Park Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Walter B. Melvin Architects, LLC* – A neo-Gothic building designed by Henry C. Pelton and Allen & Collens and constructed in 1920-1922. Application is for exterior lighting fixtures at the sanctuary and the belltower.

**WHEREAS** 593 Park Avenue is the Central Presbyterian Church, occupying the northeast corner of Park Avenue and 64th Street; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes a scheme of exterior lighting at the large windows of the nave on 64th Street, the West window on Park Avenue, and all eight sides of the bell tower; and

**WHEREAS** the current proposal is part of an extensive restoration project begun in 2015, part of which involved the removal of previously installed exterior lighting; and

**WHEREAS** at the large Park Avenue-facing window, the applicant proposes to add LED lighting strips at the base of each of the three major divisions of the window; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to add lighting strips similarly at each of the five major windows of the nave along 64th Street; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to light the tower from up to four strips with additional vertical LED strips on the Park Avenue facade; and

**WHEREAS** the proposed lighting strips will be approximately 5 ½” high and painted to match the existing material of the church exterior; and

**WHEREAS** the proposed lighting will require minimal penetrations of the original church fabric to bring power to the fixtures; and

**WHEREAS** the proposed lighting will be used only for night-time illumination;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 9-1-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, McClement, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Birnbaum)

**Item 3: 1185 Park Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District)** – *Joshua Brandfonbrener* – A neo-Gothic style building designed by Schwartz and Gross and constructed in 1928-1929. Application is to remove an existing half window and an existing AC louver in the maid’s room and replace it with a full louver in the entire window opening.

**WHEREAS** 1185 Park Avenue is a block-wide building between 93<sup>rd</sup> and 94<sup>th</sup> Streets; and

**WHEREAS** the building has a courtyard that is part of the designation within the historic district; and

**WHEREAS** the 14L apartment extends from 94<sup>th</sup> Street to the interior courtyard; and

**WHEREAS** the air conditioning for the apartment is made up of through-wall units on the courtyard side and a condenser unit set in the maid’s room behind louvers in the upper half of the window on 94<sup>th</sup> Street; and

**WHEREAS** the three through-wall units on the courtyard side no longer work and cannot be replaced in kind, these units will be removed and the masonry restored; and

**WHEREAS** the existing condenser unit in the maid’s room will be stacked with a new condensing unit to replace the through-wall units; and

**WHEREAS** the two condensing units require twice as much fresh air; and

**WHEREAS** the existing louvers in the upper half of the 94<sup>th</sup> Street window will be replaced with louvers requiring the full window opening; and

**WHEREAS** Skyline is a building standard for window replacements; and

**WHEREAS** the new louvers will be set in a Skyline frame with a six over six muntin grid to match the six over six typical windows; and

**WHEREAS** the louvers and the muntin grid will be black to match the color of the windows; and

**WHEREAS** the masonry façade in the courtyard will be repaired; and

**WHEREAS** the infill of louvers in the maid's room window will be minimally visible; and

**WHEREAS** the minimal addition of louvers to create a full window instead of a half window of louvers is the least invasive of possible options that were considered;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 8-1-1-0 (Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Selway, Tamayo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Parshall)

**Board Members Abstained:** (Ashby)

**Item 4: 1185 Park Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District) – Michael Doyle** – A neo-Gothic style building designed by Schwartz and Gross and constructed in 1929. Application is to renovate six existing lightwells at the interior courtyard for new waterproofing and structural reinforcement.

**WHEREAS** 1185 Park Avenue is an apartment house occupying the east blockfront of Park Avenue between 93rd and 94th Streets; and

**WHEREAS** 1185 Park Avenue remains one of the few apartment houses in Manhattan that possesses an interior courtyard, which is considered a public space for the purposes of the Landmarks Preservation Commission; and

**WHEREAS** the courtyard has been altered many times since its original construction; and

**WHEREAS** the basement areas below the central courtyard were originally lit from windowed lightwells; and

**WHEREAS** the windows were replaced with metal grates at some time after 1930; and

**WHEREAS** these metal grates have deteriorated and weakened the structural integrity of the planters to either side of them and the basement areas below; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the damaged grates with a granite front to match the historic fabric of the courtyard planters and to install a solid granite top at planter height, with contrasting decorative marble panels; and

**WHEREAS** the changes will prevent further water intrusion to the basement areas;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

**Board Members in Favor:** 7-3-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, McClement, Tamayo)

**Board Members Opposed:** (Helpern, Parshall, Selway)

**Items 5&6: Old Business/New Business**

The meeting was capped off by a brief discussion on the expansion of The Frick Collection. There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 8:36 PM.

**Anthony Cohn and David Helpern, Co-Chairs**