

Valerie S. Mason
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, September 16, 2024 – 6:30 PM
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, September 18, 2024**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpen, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway*, and Marco Tamayo.

* - Public Member

Approximate Number of Public Attendees: 28

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 116 East 78th Street

Item 2: 980 Park Avenue

Item 3: 12 East 69th Street

Item 4: 726 Madison Avenue – Unanimous Approval

Item 5: 53 East 77th Street

Item 6: 910 Fifth Avenue – Unanimous Approval

Item 1: 116 East 78th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – Marc Albertin – A neo-Georgian building designed by Lee Harris and constructed in 1909. Application is to legalize excavation in the rear yard.

WHEREAS the rear yard of 116 East 78th Street was excavated and constructed without a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Preservation Commission; and

WHEREAS the rear yard was excavated and constructed with a permit from the Department of Buildings issued in 2019; and

WHEREAS the application to the Landmarks Preservation Commission had been prepared but not processed, possibly due to oversights during COVID; and

WHEREAS the current application is to legalize the excavation in the rear yard at the Landmarks Preservation Commission; and

WHEREAS the purpose of the excavation was to create a mechanical space; and

WHEREAS the elevation of the rear yard was maintained and not changed from prior approvals; and

WHEREAS the excavation of the rear yard is not held back five feet from the rear property line to create a planted area as required by the Landmarks Preservation Commission; and

WHEREAS the full excavation in a prior design for the rear yard was approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission; and

WHEREAS the as built condition has planters on either side of the rear yard extending the full length of the rear yard; and

WHEREAS the rear yards on either side of the rear yard of 116 East 78th Street do not have five-foot-deep planted areas abutting their rear property lines; and

WHEREAS the neighbors either side accept the as built condition at 116 East 78th Street and do not seek changes; and

WHEREAS the as-built condition of the rear yard of 116 East 78th Street is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 8-3-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Tamayo)

Board Members Opposed: (Camp, Parshall, Selway*)

Item 2: 980 Park Avenue (Park Avenue Historic District) – Michael Doyle – A Renaissance Revival building designed by William Schickel & Company and constructed between 1885 and 1900. Application is for new brass doors and to construct a new trash platform.

A motion to disapprove this application failed by a vote of 3 in favor, 8 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 980 Park Avenue is the St. Ignatius Loyola Church, occupying with its vestry and school the entire western block front of Park Avenue between 83rd and 84th Streets; and

WHEREAS the church occupies the southwest corner of Park Avenue and 84th Street; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to restore the bronze pocket doors at the central portal; and

WHEREAS the applicant wishes to replace the inner bronze doors with narrow stile and rail bronze doors to increase visibility of the interior from the street; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the side doors with the same bronze doors as at the center doors; and

WHEREAS all inner doors will be glazed with attack resistant glazing that includes a ceramic frit pattern of 75% opacity; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to extend the last step of the staircase at the center doors by 8” with matching granite to provide a better landing at the doors and to modify the existing handrail accordingly; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to introduce a platform at the 84th Street side to facilitate trash removal under Department of Sanitation rules; and

WHEREAS the proposed platform will be made of steel grates painted to match the existing fence, and

WHEREAS the proposed platform will be minimally visible from the street and allow for better organization of trash;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 8-3-0-0 (Baron, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Selway*, Tamayo)

Board Members Opposed: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp)

Item 3: 12 East 69th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – Ferguson & Shamamian – A Neo-Classical building designed by William Schickel and constructed in 1883, with a complete façade replacement by William Welles Bosworth in 1913. Application is for restorative work at the primary façade and alterations within the sunken areaway, alterations to the rear façade fenestration and changes within the rear yard, alterations to the rooftop bulkhead, and construction of two new shade structures at the roof.

WHEREAS the applicant seeks to restore the front façade; and

WHEREAS the major work is at the main entrance; and

WHEREAS added blocks at the bases and tops of the pilasters framing the main entrance will be removed; and

WHEREAS the limestone surround, including the entablature and pilasters, will be restored to match the original; and

WHEREAS new wood pilasters, a new six panel wood door, and new leaded glass transom to match the originals will be set within the limestone surround; and

WHEREAS new limestone steps, new metal railings, and new lanterns on metal posts will match the historic condition; and

WHEREAS the riser height on the new steps will be reduced and the landing will be set down from the inside landing to match the historic condition; and

WHEREAS the new entry door will be recessed to increase the depth of the outside landing; and

WHEREAS the floor grating at the basement level will therefore be lowered and a new door and security gate installed; and

WHEREAS the basement entry level will be reduced by one foot, but the cellar level will remain the same; and

WHEREAS new planter boxes will be hung from the wood window surrounds on the two first floor windows; and

WHEREAS the rear yard is 1'-8" below the basement level; and

WHEREAS a new terrace will be created at the basement level adjacent to the semi-circular projected area; and

WHEREAS a new masonry opening and a modified masonry opening for new windows will provide light to the cellar; and

WHEREAS masonry openings on the basement level are modified to provide new windows and a new door to the new terrace; and

WHEREAS masonry openings on the first floor will be modified to create two symmetrical openings with windows; and

WHEREAS new planter boxes will be hung from the second, third, and fourth floor window surrounds; and

WHEREAS the stair and elevator bulkhead will be reconfigured to accommodate a larger stair and new elevator; and

WHEREAS a new elongated skylight with semicircular ends will be added to the roof; and

WHEREAS two metal shade structures with roofs that have the shapes of tents will be added to the roof at the rear of the building; and

WHEREAS the proposed metal trellis structures along the sides of the roof and the metal shade structures will be painted French blue; and

WHEREAS the bulkhead will be made of zinc, which has a matt finish; and

WHEREAS none of the roof top elements are visible from across the street; and

WHEREAS the treillage and penthouse are minimally visible from long angled viewpoints but are visible from Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS a shade structure is visible through the slot between two buildings on East 68th Street; and

WHEREAS the restoration and modifications are consistent with or improve the original design of the building; and

WHEREAS the metal shade structures are “follies” that do not detract from the restoration; and

WHEREAS this restoration and modifications are appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 9-1-1-0 (Ashby, Baron, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, McClement, Parshall, Selway*, Tamayo)

Board Members Opposed: (Camp)

Board Members Abstained: (Birnbaum)

Item 4: 726 Madison Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District) – Nelson – A Neo-Georgian building designed by Morrell Smith and constructed in 1932. Application is for façade restoration, alterations to entrances, window and shutter replacement, and rooftop installations.

WHEREAS 726 Madison Avenue occupies the southwest corner of 64th Street and Madison Avenue; and

WHEREAS the two story plus attic building was built as a bank for JP Morgan Chase, who continues to own and operate the building; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to undertake a thorough restoration of the building as part of re-purposing it as a conference center; and

WHEREAS the program for restoration includes new windows to closely duplicate the original, marble and masonry cleaning, repair of the wood cornice and other painted elements, a new rooftop stair and elevator bulkhead, new mechanical equipment on the roof, a new egress door on the 64th Street side, and a replacement of the Madison Avenue entrance fabricated in marble to match the original design; and

WHEREAS the new marble of the entry will match the material of the existing stringcourses and window ornaments; and

WHEREAS the design of the new entry door will restore the entrance to its original appearance; and

WHEREAS the new egress door will require the removal of one window on the 64th Street side and will be the same width and height as the existing opening; and

WHEREAS the existing “Chinese Chippendale” railing at the roof will be repaired and repainted with a glass guardrail behind for code compliance, and

WHEREAS new rooftop structures (stair, elevator bulkhead, and mechanical equipment) will not interfere with the neighboring commercial buildings and will be painted to blend in with the adjacent structures; and

WHEREAS the applicant has made every effort to reduce the size and visibility of the additional rooftop structures and has overall produced a proposal of very high quality and attention to detail;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 11-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, McClement, Parshall, Selway*, Tamayo)

Item 5: 53 East 77th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – Studio MDA – A modified neo-Spanish Renaissance building designed by Henry Rutgers Marshall and constructed in 1901, with an alteration to the original Beaux Arts building to the above style in 1926. Application is to restore the primary façade to its 1901 appearance, expand the existing penthouse floor forward, construct a rear yard addition, modify secondary façade window openings, and replace windows.

WHEREAS 53 East 77th Street was built in 1901 with a Beaux-Arts façade; and

WHEREAS 53 East 77th Street was altered in 1927 with a Spanish Medieval facade; and

WHEREAS the building will be converted to an art gallery; and

WHEREAS the building was held back from the west lot line so that windows could be placed in the west wall; and

WHEREAS the two primary façades are the south façade, or front façade, and the west façade, or side façade; and

WHEREAS the original limestone base from 1901 was replaced with square brick; and

WHEREAS about 50 percent of the original brick remains on the upper portions of the south and west façades; and

WHEREAS brick will be removed from the south and west façades and be replaced with limestone with the historic details; and

WHEREAS the two entrance doors on the front elevation will be relocated to either side to match the original; and

WHEREAS the two entrance doors will be set within limestone arches; and

WHEREAS the restoration will incorporate details from the original design including, for example, the rustication of the arch and the bas relief over each of the entry doors; and

WHEREAS the brick will be patched to match existing on the south and west façades; and

WHEREAS the masonry openings for windows on the south and west façades will be restored with limestone headers including semi-circular headers, keystone headers, and straight headers; and

WHEREAS the bay window on the west elevation will be restored; and

WHEREAS the circular window within the limestone will be restored; and

WHEREAS new double hung wood windows will be installed on the south façade and for the first two rows of the west façade; and

WHEREAS two new double hung wood windows will be installed to align with the two rows of windows above; and

WHEREAS the remaining new windows will be metal, double hung, except for the leaded glass windows on the third floor of the north façade, which will be saved; and

WHEREAS the existing brick walls of the penthouse will be removed on the south, west, and north walls and replaced with brick to match the original; and

WHEREAS the penthouse will be extended with brick to match the original; and

WHEREAS the penthouse will be extended so that it is about two thirds of the overall length of the building and will include a row of six double hung windows on the west façade aligning with the windows below; and

WHEREAS the first and second floor of the north façade will be removed so that the double height space to be created within the existing building can be extended into the rear yard; and

WHEREAS the rear extension will be clad primarily in stucco in a beige color to match the brick on the west façade; and

WHEREAS the metal fire escape and round exhaust pipe will be removed from the north façade; and

WHEREAS the two floors on the north façade will have double hung metal windows in masonry openings; and

WHEREAS the north face of the penthouse will have four new double hung windows set in a horizontal rectangular masonry opening; and

WHEREAS the overhanging roof at the south end of the penthouse terrace will be removed; and

WHEREAS the limestone balustrade and cornices will be restored at the penthouse terrace and the balance of the cornice restored on the west façade; and

WHEREAS the penthouse extension is visible, it is set back, grows out of the floors below, is made of the same materials as the bulk of the building, and presents as part of an overall design; and

WHEREAS the restoration and the modifications are appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 9-2-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Helpern, McClement, Selway*, Tamayo)

Board Members Opposed: (Cohn, Parshall)

Item 6: 910 Fifth Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District) – *Dorota Szwam* – A no-style building designed by Fred F. French and constructed in 1919, with the present façade altering the original Neo-Italian Renaissance style designed by Sylvan Bien and constructed in 1958-1959. Application is for an alteration to the south terrace bay window.

WHEREAS 910 Fifth Avenue is an apartment house occupying the northeast corner of Fifth Avenue and 72nd Street; and

WHEREAS the original twelve-story building was enlarged to sixteen stories and underwent an alteration, transforming its exterior from Neo-Italian Renaissance to white brick; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to alter the configuration of bay window structures added after the 1959 renovation/addition; and

WHEREAS the flat roofed bays will be more in keeping with the building architecture than the greenhouse type additions currently in use; and

WHEREAS the applicant further proposes to modify the railing at the north side of the apartment surrounding a large terrace for safety reasons; and

WHEREAS the proposed interventions are of a modest and appropriate aesthetic and will be minimally visible from the public way;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED AS PRESENTED**.

Board Members in Favor: 11-0-0-0 (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, McClement, Parshall, Selway*, Tamayo)

Items 7&8: Old Business/New Business

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 10:07 PM.

Anthony Cohn and David Helpern, Co-Chairs