

Valerie S. Mason
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, March 18, 2024 – 6:30 PM
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, March 20, 2024**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, David Helpern, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Abraham Salcedo, Judith Schneider, Kimberly Selway (Public Member), and Marco Tamayo.

Approximate Number of Public Attendees: 45

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 1000 Fifth Avenue: Metropolitan Museum of Art - Unanimous Approval

Item 2: 1 East 70th Street: The Frick Collection

Part A – Approval

Part B – No Position

Item 3: 18 East 74th Street – Approval

Item 4: 15-17 East 77th Street – Unanimous Approval

Item 5: 944 Park Avenue – Approval

Item 1: 1000 Fifth Avenue: Metropolitan Museum of Art (Individual Landmark) – *Nader Tehrani* – A Beaux-Arts style building designed by numerous architects, chiefly, Calvert Vaux and Jacob Wrey Mould, who designed the initial Ruskinian Gothic structure of the MET and constructed in the 1880s. Application is for a Wing J Roof replacement in the Ancient Near East Gallery.

WHEREAS the Museum has works of art in the Ancient Near East Gallery on the second floor of Wing J, located to the south of the Great Hall;

WHEREAS the works of art must be protected from sunlight;

WHEREAS the existing laylight ceiling in the gallery was blocked to create an attic space that prevents the sunlight from being transferred into the gallery;

WHEREAS the skylight has deteriorated and needs to be replaced;

WHEREAS Wing J is symmetrical with Wing E to the north of The Great Hall;

WHEREAS the former skylight on Wing E had been replaced by an opaque roof with Monel, a nickel alloy;

WHEREAS the skylight in Wing J will be replaced to match the Monel roof in Wing E;

WHEREAS the existing Monel border at the skylight will remain and be repaired as required;

WHEREAS the new Monel roof will have standing seams that will align with the standing seams in the eastern Monel border;

WHEREAS the new Monel roof will be insulated to provide energy efficiency;

WHEREAS the existing Monel roof on Wing E is minimally visible;

WHEREAS the Monel roof will match the roof on Wing E and be minimally visible;

WHEREAS the symmetry of the Museum when seen in elevation will be enhanced by installing the proposed Monel roof;

WHEREAS this project is appropriate and contextual for this individual landmark;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Ashby, Birnbaum, Helpen, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo

Board Member in Favor: Schneider

Public Member in Favor: Selway

Item 2: 1 East 70th Street: The Frick Collection (Individual Landmark) – *Beyer Blinder Belle* – A French Louis XVI architecture style building designed by Carrere & Hastings and constructed in 1913, the museum galleries designed by John Russell Pope and constructed in 1935, and the reception hall, garden, and surrounding walls designed by Bayley, Van Dyke, and Poehler in 1975. Application is for the installation of exterior informational and identification signage.

WHEREAS The Frick Collection is located at the Henry Clay Frick House, a Beaux-Arts mansion designed for Henry Clay Frick by Carrere & Hastings in 1913. The Frick also houses the Frick Art Reference Library;

WHEREAS in 1931 John Russell Pope converted the Frick House into a museum; the house was expanded in 1977 to accommodate additional works of art;

WHEREAS an additional expansion was approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission in June 2018; the Frick hired Annabelle Selldorf in partnership with Beyer Blinder Belle to design a major enlargement that required the museum to close during construction; the enlargement was approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission in June 2018; City Planning Commission approval was also required for the enlargement because of needed zoning changes within the new envelope;

WHEREAS The Frick Collection is now scheduled to reopen in late 2024;

WHEREAS the proposed signage package includes new visitor signs that flank the front door of the main entrance on East 70th Street, a primary Fifth Avenue sign, a sign/poster at the corner of 71st Street and Fifth Avenue, and a new replacement sign at the entrance to the reference library on East 71st Street;

WHEREAS the primary Fifth Avenue sign — “The Frick Collection” — will be above the height of cars traveling along Fifth Avenue; the applicant proposes to nest it in relation to the existing wrought iron fence and balustrade by placing it on top of the balustrade adjacent to the fence;

WHEREAS there will be a wash of light from the bottom of the sign for illumination; the light element will be placed on top of the balustrade;

WHEREAS the sign will be 15’ long x 1’ high and 4 1/2” deep; the letters will be 7” tall and will cover 13’9” of the 15’ length;

WHEREAS at one side (the side to the east) of the main entrance will be a 2’7/8” x 1’11” wide informational sign with times and pricing for entry; on the other side will be a triptych with one informational sign and two posters advertising current exhibitions;

WHEREAS at the corner of 71st Street and Fifth Avenue, there is an existing poster set into an existing niche; the applicant proposes to enlarge the poster so that it feels more confident in that space;

WHEREAS the enlarged poster will be lit from the front and will measure 8’ 1 3/8” tall x 4’ 11” wide so that it is scaled appropriately for the niche that is there;

WHEREAS on 71st Street, at the Reference Library and Group Entrance (relocated from the main entrance on 70th Street) to the left of the entrance, there will be one informational sign 2’ tall x 1 1/2” wide;

WHEREAS in addition to the 4 main signage areas, approximately 12 exterior code-compliant 6” x 6” signs will be scattered on 70th and 71st Streets;

WHEREAS except for the modest code-compliant signage, all signage will have illumination with low light levels; the illumination will remain on after dark, including when the museum is closed;

WHEREAS the lighting will always be angled toward the signage; the light source is invisible, and the level of light is very low;

WHEREAS the proposed signage package is a last step as The Frick Collection completes its transition from a house museum to a major art institution and prepares to reopen;

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: PART A, The proposed FIFTH AVENUE SIGN and PART B, The proposed SIGNAGE AT ENTRANCE, AT THE CORNER OF FIFTH AVENUE AND 71ST STREET, AND SIGNAGE AT ENTRANCE TO REFERENCE LIBRARY

PART A, The Proposed Fifth Avenue Sign

WHEREAS the proposed sign is out of context and inappropriate for the Individual Landmark, The Frick House;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT Part A of this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall

Committee Members Opposed: Chu, Salcedo, Tamayo

Board Member Opposed: Schneider

Public Member Opposed: Selway

Committee Member Not Voting for Cause: Helpern

THIS MOTION FAILED AND A SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTION WAS INTRODUCED

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Chu, Salcedo, Tamayo

Committee Members Opposed: Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall

Board Member in Favor: Schneider

Public Member in Favor: Selway

Committee Member Not Voting for Cause: Helpern

PART B, Signage at the main entrance, at the corner of Fifth Avenue and 71st Street, and the signage at the Reference Library

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part B of this application be **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Chu, Salcedo, Tamayo

Committee Members Opposed: Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall

Board Member in Favor: Schneider

Public Member Opposed: Selway

Committee Member Not Voting for Cause: Helpern

PART B OF THIS RESOLUTION FAILED TO PASS WITH A VOTE OF 4 IN FAVOR, 4 OPPOSED, AND 1 NOT VOTING FOR CAUSE. THEREFORE, THE COMMITTEE HAS NO POSITION ON PART B OF THIS RESOLUTION.

Item 3: 18 East 74th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – Patino Architecture, PLLC – A Neo-Italian Renaissance building constructed 1871, with a new façade designed by A. Wallace McCrea and constructed in 1921. Application is to change the façade finish to cast stone from existing exterior insulation finishing systems.

WHEREAS the original four-story building received a two-story addition in 2001;

WHEREAS the façade of the original four stories is limestone;

WHEREAS the façade material approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) for the 2001 enlargement was cast stone;

WHEREAS the facade of the vertical addition was built of concrete block with an exterior insulation finish system (EIFS);

WHEREAS the EIFS system is built up of layers and has a finish coat similar in appearance to stucco;

WHEREAS the finish coat and the substrate of the EIFS system has deteriorated;

WHEREAS this project will remove the EIFS system and replace it with cast stone;

WHEREAS the windows will be replaced with historic wood windows approved by the LPC in July of 2022;

WHEREAS the original stone balusters that were set above the EIFS addition will be incorporated in a new balustrade terminating the new cast stone façade;

WHEREAS the cast stone is similar in appearance to limestone but not a perfect match;

WHEREAS the LPC often prefers to differentiate new materials from old;

WHEREAS the cast stone is separated from the limestone in that the cast stone begins above the original cornice;

WHEREAS this project is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Ashby, Chu, Helpern, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo

Committee Member Abstaining: Birnbaum

Board Member in Favor: Schneider

Public Member in Favor: Selway

Item 4: 15-17 East 77th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – *Steven Harris Architects* – A Neo-Grec style building designed by John G. Prague and constructed in 1878. Application is for modifications to the front areaways, replacement of the front windows, excavation at cellar and rear yard, a new rooftop addition, and modifications and addition to the rear facades.

WHEREAS the two buildings have been integrated into one residence;

WHEREAS the combined buildings are 33'-4" wide;

WHEREAS the front façade will be restored to be historically accurate;

WHEREAS the façade restoration will be reviewed by staff at the Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) and does not require a public hearing;

WHEREAS the front façade, with its brownstone cladding and grey painted wood windows, was included in the presentation, it provided a context for the proposed alterations;

WHEREAS the two separate areaways are to become one large areaway;

WHEREAS the new areaway will have bluestone paving;

WHEREAS the approximate 3'-0" high fence at 15 East 77th Street and the 7'-7" high fence at 17 East 77th Street will be replaced with a new 6'-6" high decorative, painted steel fence with gates opposite the restored doorways;

WHEREAS the rear existing three-story extensions at 15 and 17 East 77th Street, which were built partially into what would have been the required rear yard, will be removed;

WHEREAS the house will be extended about 10'-2" to the rear across the full width of the combined buildings, to create an overall length of 70'-2" and leaving a 30-foot rear yard;

WHEREAS in conjunction with the expansion to the rear the cellar will be lowered and extended toward the rear;

WHEREAS the variation of styles and materials in the rear yards of the buildings on the block is so great that there is no organizing motif or materials touchstone;

WHEREAS the proposed rear façade of 15-17 East 77th Street is limestone, a traditional material for buildings in the Historic District;

WHEREAS the façade is built as a single plane of limestone blocks;

WHEREAS there are new limestone cornices at the existing height reflecting the original two buildings;

WHEREAS there is a rainwater leader down the center expressing the original two buildings;

WHEREAS the windows are multi-pane, white bronze;

WHEREAS there is a continuous balcony across the full width of the first floor of the house and a balcony on the second floor of the former 15 East 77th Street building;

WHEREAS there is a spiral stair leading from the ground level to the first-floor balcony;

WHEREAS the balconies are made of etched glass with a translucent coating set in steel beams with a light-colored bronze painted finish;

WHEREAS the balcony railings and spiral stair are made of steel with a light-colored bronze painted finish;

WHEREAS the ground floor, the basement level, has a window wall with two pairs of white bronze glass doors in the center;

WHEREAS the first floor has four pairs of white bronze French doors that open onto the balcony;

WHEREAS the second floor has two pairs of white bronze French doors that open onto the balcony at the #15 portion of the house and a bay window at the #17 portion of the house;

WHEREAS the third and fourth floor levels have four windows each that appear to be double hung but have a fixed lower portion and an awning above;

WHEREAS the existing roof will be demolished;

WHEREAS a new roof for the rear and middle portions of the house will be built higher and a new roof over the front portion of the house will be built slightly lower, behind the upper portion of the front wall, whose overall height is unchanged;

WHEREAS the new roof heights create a double height space in the rear and a new, partial fifth floor in the middle of the house;

WHEREAS a new painted steel and glass artist's skylight with zinc-coated copper cladding completes the rear façade;

WHEREAS the mechanical equipment is set on the rear of the roof on the eastern side, and the new elevator and stair bulkheads are in the approximate middle of the roof on the western side;

WHEREAS the new roof configuration creates a lower roof terrace in the front of the building and an upper roof terrace in the middle of the building;

WHEREAS each roof terrace will have stone paving on a pedestal system;

WHEREAS the existing neighbor's chimney and flues on the east side of the roof and close to the front wall are being raised to meet the Code requirement;

WHEREAS the neighbor's chimney and flues will be the only rooftop element to be visible from the street;

WHEREAS the chimney and flues will be only partially visible;

WHEREAS this project is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in Favor: Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Helpern, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo

Board Member in Favor: Schneider

Public Member in Favor: Selway

Item 5: 944 Park Avenue (Park Avenue Historic District) – *Bryan Brown Architects* – An Art Deco style building designed by George F. Pelham and constructed in 1929-30. Application is for a sidewalk canopy replacement.

WHEREAS 944 Park Avenue is an Art Deco - style building designed by George F. Pelham and constructed in 1929-1930;

WHEREAS the proposed new canopy rises above the entrance and obscures some of the existing decorative stonework;

WHEREAS the applicant is also replacing the front entry door; the existing door is 7' 5"; the proposed new door, approved at the staff level of the Landmarks Preservation Commission, is 10'1" high;

WHEREAS the height of the new door requires that the canopy rests against the masonry above the doorway;

WHEREAS the masonry above the door is non-historic;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Committee Members in favor: Ashby, Chu, Helpern, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo.

Board Member in favor: Schneider.

Public Member in favor: Selway

Committee Members opposed: Birnbaum, Camp.

Item 6: 61 East 77th Street (Upper East Side Historic District) – *Christopher J. Stone* – A Neo-Federal style building with Beaux-Arts style features designed by Harde and Hasselman and constructed in 1916. Application is to replace the existing front stoop to remove a step at the entry door and add a step to the outer steps to the sidewalk, replace the existing entry doors with touch pad-activated doors complying with ADA requirements, provide a walkway over a former window areaway behind an existing fence, and provide an ADA handicap lift at the east end of this areaway.

This item was laid over for discussion at a future meeting.

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 10:01 PM.

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs