

Valerie S. Mason  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

February 23, 2024

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair  
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission  
Municipal Building  
One Center Street, 9th Floor  
New York, New York 10007

**RE: 5 East 63rd Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Edward Shalat* – A Neo-Classical style building designed by Heins & LaFarge and constructed in 1900, with façade modifications and added upper stories by Harry Hurwuit in 1942. Application is for a new cornice on the street façade, replacement of double-hung windows with casement windows on the front and rear facades, modifications to the existing stair bulkhead on the roof, replacement of lot line windows, and the addition of a new skylight on the roof.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on February 21, 2024, the Board unanimously approved the following resolution by a vote of 35 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

**WHEREAS** 5 East 63rd Street is a neo-Classical style building designed by Heins & LaFarge and constructed in 1900, with façade modifications and added upper stories by Harry Hurwuit in 1942;

**WHEREAS** at the front elevation the applicant proposes to infill existing windows at the roof and install a fiberglass cornice that will not replicate the original historic cornice;

**WHEREAS** other proposed restoration work at the front elevation has already been approved at the staff level at the Landmarks Preservation Commission;

**WHEREAS** at both the front and rear elevations at all six floors, the applicant proposes to replace the existing one-over-one windows with new multi-light casement windows;

**WHEREAS** at the east elevation at the 6th floor, the applicant proposes to infill one lot line window to the west of a space formerly a small terrace; the applicant also proposes to replace the directly adjacent lot-line window with a new casement window;

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to remove the existing above-mentioned small terrace at the east elevation as part of a program to reconfigure part of the 6th floor so that a larger terrace can be carved out utilizing part of the 6th floor;

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes a new skylight over the now enclosed space that was formerly the terrace;

**WHEREAS** at the roof, the applicant proposes to enlarge the existing stair bulkhead and to clad the entire bulkhead, including the new portion, in brick to match the rest of the house;

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to cover the extended bulkhead with a new skylight;

**WHEREAS** the proposed new bulkhead will extend horizontally three feet forward and will be visible from the public way; the existing bulkhead is minimally visible;

**WHEREAS** at the west elevation at the 6th floor, the applicant proposes to replace an existing multi-light lot-line window with a fixed single pane window;

**WHEREAS** at the rear elevation at the 6th floor, the applicant proposes to remove the windows and to remove a portion of the roof so that the proposed open courtyard/terrace can be carved out;

**WHEREAS** the open courtyard will have three walls and three openings where there were formerly windows;

**WHEREAS** double hung wood windows go with the style and time of the original historic house; the applicant could not say with certainty that the original windows were double hung;

**WHEREAS** the proposed casement windows are not contextual within the historic district;

**WHEREAS** the proposed fixed single pane lot-line window at the east elevation at the 6th floor is out of character with the rest of the house;

**WHEREAS** Heins and LaFarge were responsible for the original Romanesque-Byzantine east end and crossing of the Cathedral of St. John the Divine as well as the architecture and details for the Interborough Rapid Transit Company among other notable projects;

**WHEREAS** the Heins and LaFarge front door at 5 East 63rd Street is a bold expression of the modern French movement at the turn of the century;

**WHEREAS** the proposed replacement fiberglass cornice doesn't have the gravitas that 3 East 63rd Street deserves and is too small for a building of this size;

**WHEREAS** if a replacement cornice is to be considered it should be made of limestone and replicate the original majestic cornice;

**WHEREAS** the proposed open space at the 6th floor presents as an artificial opening and reads as vacant because of the removal of the windows and is not contextual within the historic district;

**WHEREAS** bringing forward the bulkhead makes it too visible from the public way;

**WHEREAS** the application doesn't rise to what the building once was; the wonderful proportions of the original building are completely lost;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,

*Valerie S. Mason*

Valerie S. Mason  
Chair

*David Helpern and Jane Parshall*

David Helpern and Jane Parshall  
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Kathy Hochul, Governor of New York  
Honorable Eric Adams, Mayor of the City of New York  
Honorable Mark Levine, Manhattan Borough President  
Honorable Jerry Nadler, 12th Congressional District Representative

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District  
Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District  
Honorable Edward Gibbs, NYS Assembly Member 68th Assembly District  
Honorable Alex Bores, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District  
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District  
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District  
Honorable Julie Menin, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District  
Honorable Diana Ayala, NYC Council Member, 8<sup>th</sup> Council District