

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, November 13, 2023 – 6:30 PM
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom.***

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, November 15, 2023**. They may testify for up to two minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Abraham Salcedo, Marco Tamayo, and Christina Davis (Public Member).

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 1020 Fifth Avenue - Unanimous Approval

Item 2: 1149 Park Avenue

Part A - Unanimous Approval

Part B - Approval

- 1. 1020 Fifth Avenue (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) - Acheson Doyle Partners Architects - Neo-Italian Renaissance-style building designed by Warren & Wetmore and constructed in 1924-25.
Application is for a 200 SF addition on a north-facing non-primary facade and an exterior roof access stair concealed by a chimney stack.**

WHEREAS 1020 Fifth Avenue is a neo-Renaissance style building designed by Warren and Wetmore, the designers of Grand Central Station, and constructed in 1924-1925;

WHEREAS 1020 Fifth Avenue is located at the NE corner of 83rd Street and Fifth Avenue across from the Metropolitan Museum of Art and Central Park;

WHEREAS 1020 Fifth Avenue has 14 floors with just 13 apartments - ceiling heights vary from 10 feet to 18 feet; the building's penthouse is among the grandest ever built;

WHEREAS the north-facing elevation looks out over the National Registrar-listed Marymount School;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a 200 SF addition at the top floor of the 2-story penthouse;

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes a new stairway to the roof with a roof access gate; the roof is not a green roof put presents as a walkable roof;

WHEREAS the exterior wall at the existing family room at the second floor, now set back by about 10' 5" will be pushed out onto part of an existing terrace to add 200 SF of interior space;

WHEREAS part of the existing terrace will disappear and a new Hope's steel casement window will be inserted on the new exterior wall;

WHEREAS by bringing the wall forward, the recess or visual set back to brought forward will be reduced to 18" (formerly 10' 5" wide) and will present as a Juliette balcony;

WHEREAS the addition is minimally visible at the north facing elevation; the most visible part is the new window and door — the Hope's steel casement window and French door configuration measuring 10'3" high x 7'2" wide — which will present as coming off the face of the existing penthouse;

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes a 62 SF exterior staircase to the roof to be located behind the the existing chimney stack for the building to provide access to the roof;

WHEREAS the proposed exterior stair would connect to a proposed interior stair that is at the west end of the proposed 200 SF addition; the proposed stair will provide access to the roof from the enlarged family room;

WHEREAS the proposed exterior stair is not visible; there is a proposed stairway bulkhead — also to be hidden behind the chimney stack and not visible;

WHEREAS the proposed new window and door system is sufficiently recessed with an 18" setback;

WHEREAS the proposed penthouse enlargement is modest;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented

VOTE: 7 in Favor: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Cohn, Helpen, Parshall, Tamayo, Salcedo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Davis)

2. **1149 Park Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District)** – RAMSA (Robert A.M. Stern Architects)
– A Modern Classical-style rowhouse that was built in 1885 and redesigned in 1917 by Emery Roth.
Application is to expand an existing penthouse and reconfigure existing rear yard extensions.

WHEREAS 1149 Park Avenue was built as the northernmost house of four four-story rowhouses in 1885;

WHEREAS the rowhouse was redesigned in 1917 by Emery Roth in a modern classical style;

WHEREAS the rowhouse is built on a site that is 16'-5" wide by 70'-4" deep;

WHEREAS the context for the rowhouse is the three rowhouses to the south built at the same time and a townhouse on the southeast corner at East 91st Street, also built at the same time;

WHEREAS the rowhouse is bordered on the north by 1155 Park Avenue, a 15-story apartment house;

WHEREAS the renovation of the townhouse is extensive and complex, this resolution is divided into two parts.

PART A: Front Facade and Rear Facade

WHEREAS the front façade will be restored;

WHEREAS the existing limestone will be cleaned;

WHEREAS all windows and doors will be replaced;

WHEREAS the existing main wood and glass door with side lights will be replaced with a wood door with sidelights in a historic design;

WHEREAS the wood and glass service door will be replaced with a wood door in a historic design;

WHEREAS new lantern light fixtures will be installed either side of the main entrance door;

WHEREAS new double glazed wood windows to match historic muntin pattern will be installed;

WHEREAS the portions of the rear façade will be demolished and built with new massing;

WHEREAS the first two floors are built full, to the rear property line;

WHEREAS the second floor will be set back four feet;

WHEREAS the “L” shaped third and fourth floors, which is set back 9’-4 and extends 28’-5” from the rear property line, will be demolished;

WHEREAS the third and fourth floors will be rebuilt full width and set back 20’-0” from the rear property line;

WHEREAS the façade material for the four floors will be red brick;

WHEREAS new, divided lite, fire-rated wood windows and doors will be installed in the façade of the first and second floors;

WHEREAS operable skylights will be installed for legal light and air for the first and second floors;

WHEREAS new, divided lite wood windows and doors will be installed in the façade of the third and fourth floors;

WHEREAS new brick piers and a wood handrail will be installed at the third-floor roof level;

WHEREAS a new wood handrail and wood posts will be installed at the roof level;

WHEREAS the façade material on the exposed portion of the north side of the rear façade will be brick to match the brick on the rear façade;

WHEREAS the restoration of the front façade and the reconstruction of the rear façade are appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Part A of this application is **approved** as presented.

VOTE: 7 in Favor: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Salcedo, Tamayo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Davis)

PART B: New Penthouse

WHEREAS the existing penthouse is set back 28’-0” from the front façade and 28’-5” from the rear façade except for a narrow extension on the northern side of the penthouse that is set back 19’-0” from the front façade;

WHEREAS the new penthouse will be set back 15'-0" from the front façade and 24'-0" from the rear façade;

WHEREAS front of the new penthouse will be clad in limestone to match the original front façade material;

WHEREAS the rear of the new penthouse will be clad in metal with a Kynar finish in a zinc color;

WHEREAS the mechanical equipment, elevator overrun will be screened in the front and rear, and south side with a metal parapet that will be gray in color to minimize its visibility;

WHEREAS the metal parapet will be set back further from the front façade than the front of the penthouse;

WHEREAS the chimney extension will be through the south side of the penthouse at the southwest corner and in front of the metal parapet;

WHEREAS the top of the existing penthouse roof and the top of the proposed penthouse roof is 52'-1 ½" above the average grade and the elevator overrun is 56'-1 ½" above the average grade;

WHEREAS the mechanical equipment in the rear of the penthouse roof is about 62'-0" above the average grade;

WHEREAS the mock-up of the proposed penthouse is partially visible from along Park Avenue;

WHEREAS the façade materials for the proposed penthouse in both the front and rear use traditional materials that either match existing materials or are subdued in color;

WHEREAS the proposed new penthouse is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT Part B of this application is **approved** as presented.

VOTE: 5 in Favor: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Cohn, Helpern, Tamayo)

2 Opposed: (Parshall, Salcedo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Davis)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs