

Russell Squire  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee  
Monday, September 18, 2023 – 6:30pm  
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom***

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, September 20, 2023**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**MINUTES:**

**Board Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpern, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo, and Kimberly Selway (Public Member).

**Resolutions for Approval:**

**Item 1:** 1000 Fifth Avenue - Approval

**Item 2:** 895 Park Avenue - Unanimous Approval

**Item 3:** 1312 Madison Avenue - Approval

- 1. 1000 Fifth Avenue - The Great Hall of the Metropolitan Museum of Art - Interior**  
**Landmark** *Brett Gaillard, Head of Capital Projects at museum presenting.* A Beaux-Arts style interior space designed by Richard Morris Hunt and constructed in 1905. Application is for installation of 4 digital displays: two in the north vestibule and two in the south vestibule.

**WHEREAS** The Great Hall is a Beaux Arts-style interior space designed by Richard Morris Hunt and constructed in 1905;

**WHEREAS** the applicant would like to install 4 digital display boards within the Great Hall - 2 on the north side of the Great Hall and 2 on the south side of the Great Hall behind the existing columns;

**WHEREAS** the display boards are now installed; the museum received a temporary permit from the Landmarks Preservation Commission to do this; the museum would like the screens to be permanent;

**WHEREAS** the display screens would not impact the historic fabric of the Great Hall; the screens would be attached to plaster only and could be easily removed;

**WHEREAS** the permanently installed screens at 6' wide x 3'6" high would be slightly smaller than the existing temporary screens, would be more centered than the existing temporary screens and would have a less intrusive mounting;

**WHEREAS** the screens would cut down on the amount of paper in the form of maps and other notices that the museum has been handing out; the screens would help visitors find their way around the museum;

**WHEREAS** given the location of the proposed screens, the disruption to the landmarked Great Hall is minimal;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that this application is **approved** as presented.

**VOTE: 8 In Favor** (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Parshall, McClement, Tamayo);

**1 Opposed** (Birnbaum)

**1 Public Member In Favor** (Kimberly Selway)

2. **895 Park Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District)** - *John B. Murray, Architect* - A Classicizing Art- Deco style building designed by Sloan & Robertson and constructed in 1929. Application is for the replacement of existing penthouse windows with new wood windows conforming in design, configuration, and finish to the 1997 window master plan and new pergola at 20th-floor penthouse terrace facing Park Avenue.

**WHEREAS:** 895 Park Avenue sits on the southeast corner of 79<sup>th</sup> Street and Park Avenue, and;

**WHEREAS:** the building instituted a window master plan in 1997 that permitted the replacement of existing steel double-hung windows with aluminum windows of very similar profile, and;

**WHEREAS:** applicant seeks to replace original steel windows - while also adding one window on the 20<sup>th</sup> floor - with custom wood windows that closely conform to the original profiles and dimensions, and;

**WHEREAS:** said windows are located in the penthouse apartment that occupies the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> floors of 895 Park Avenue, and;

**WHEREAS:** applicant proposes to add a painted metal pergola to a terrace at the 20<sup>th</sup> floor facing Park Avenue, and;

**WHEREAS:** said pergola closely imitates traditional wood pergola structures in its details proposing an ironic materials reversal – steel windows replaced by wood windows that imitate steel and “wood” pergola details executed in powder coated metal, and;

**WHEREAS:** the proposed pergola will be self-supporting and anchored to the terrace floor while not touching the existing masonry wall, and;

**WHEREAS:** ample precedent exists for pergolas on buildings both of this period and in the Historic District generally, and;

**WHEREAS:** the proposed window replacement alters only the material called for in the window master plan of 1997, and;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that this application is **approved** as presented.

**VOTE: 8 In Favor** (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpen, Parshall, McClement, Tamayo)

**1 Public Member In favor:** Kimberly Selway

3. **1312 Madison Avenue (Carnegie Hill Historic District)** - *Alta Indelman, Architect* - A Renaissance style building designed by George W. Spitzer and constructed in 1897. Application is for legalization of an existing awning and HVAC unit.

**WHEREAS** 1312 Madison Avenue is a Renaissance style apartment building designed by George W. Spitzer and constructed in 1897;

**WHEREAS** the ground floor corner retail space is occupied by the restaurant Hiramasa;

**WHEREAS** the existing awning and the existing HVAC unit are in violation of the Madison Avenue retail establishment guidelines (Madison Avenue Master Plan); the awning extends farther than the existing storefront for the restaurant and is boxier;

**WHEREAS** the non-compliant awning hides the boxier HVAC unit; the current tenant installed the awning without the necessary permit from the Landmarks Preservation Commission; the previous tenant installed the very large A/C unit;

**WHEREAS** the conundrum for the applicant is how to install the condenser portion of the A/C and thus remove the non-compliant awning; other buildings on the block have yards and low roofs for A/C equipment;

**WHEREAS** the applicant presented 3 different options for a condenser all of which the applicant considered not to be optimal since the base of the building is stone;

**WHEREAS** because of the stone, a smaller condenser (which would reduce the profile of the awning) cannot easily be swapped in without a very expensive renovation; such an expensive renovation would create a severe hardship for the tenant;

**WHEREAS** Lo van der Valk of Carnegie Hill Neighbors suggested a compromise whereby the applicant would be allowed to keep both the existing non-compliant awning and the existing bulky HVAC unit for a five -year period by means of a temporary permit. At the end of five years, the applicant would return to the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that this application is **approved** on a provisional basis only for a period of 5 years.

**VOTE: 9 In Favor** (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohen, Baron, McClement, Parshall)

**1 Opposed** (Tamayo)

**1 Public Member In Favor** (Kimberly Selway)

**David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs**