

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

June 23, 2023

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10007

RE: 1209 Park Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District) - *J.L. Ramirez Architect, P.C.* - A Modern styled building designed by Lucien David and constructed in 1960-62. Application is for front facade redesign, rooftop addition, rear facade alteration, and rear yard alterations.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on June 21, 2023, the board approved the following resolution by a vote of 39 in favor, 2 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1209 Park Avenue was built as a townhouse with a stone base and brick above;

WHEREAS the building was converted to a school in 1960;

WHEREAS the exterior of the building was reconstructed in a modern style from 1960-62;

WHEREAS the building is being returned to a single-family house;

WHEREAS the applicant showed precedents of limestone townhouses with basement level entrance doors in historic districts;

WHEREAS the front façade will be made of limestone applied over the existing brick;

WHEREAS the limestone panels on the ground floor will be rusticated;

WHEREAS new wood casement windows will be set in the existing openings and framed with limestone casings;

WHEREAS the new windows will be painted black;

WHEREAS there will be an architrave over the ground floor;

WHEREAS the entry door will be wood with a tempered glass panel and wrought iron protecting the glass;

WHEREAS the windows on the ground floor will be protected with wrought iron;

WHEREAS there will be wrought iron guard rails either side of the steps leading down to the entrance door;

WHEREAS the rear of the building has a projection to the south;

WHEREAS the recess to the north has been filled in with a stair to serve the school;

WHEREAS the applicant intends to replace the stair with an enlargement of the building that will align with the eastern edge of the southern portion of the rear of the building;

WHEREAS the rear façade will be brick with multi-pane steel windows painted black;

WHEREAS the windows will have limestone lintels;

WHEREAS the ground floor and the second floor will have steel French doors, the former opening to the rear yard and the latter to a balcony with a wrought iron railing;

WHEREAS the French doors and glazing either side will be centered in the façade;

WHEREAS the rear yard will be planted on the perimeter;

WHEREAS the applicant intends to build a partial fifth floor at the rear of the building, 42 feet from the front façade, with the rear face of the enlargement in the same plane as the existing rear façade;

WHEREAS the mock-up is not visible from across Park Avenue but becomes visible as one goes west on 95th Street;

WHEREAS the fifth floor will be 9'-10" high with a 2'-6" parapet above for a total height of 12'-4";

WHEREAS the current height of the building in the rear is about 43'-0" and the proposed height is 55'-4";

WHEREAS 1209 Park extends about 10 feet further to the east beyond the townhouses to the north;

WHEREAS the townhouse to the north has a fifth story which is about half a floor above the top of the current four floors of 1209 Park;

WHEREAS the fifth floor of 1209 Park will extend about half a floor higher than the fifth floor of the townhouse to the north;

WHEREAS 1209 Park abuts the apartment house to the south;

WHEREAS the enlargement will closely match the brick of the apartment house;

WHEREAS the proposed fifth floor will block lot line windows in the apartment house;

WHEREAS the enlargement will block views currently enjoyed by the residents of the apartment house whose windows will be covered;

WHEREAS the lot line windows are not required for light and air and the proposed enlargement of 1209 Park is in compliance with the New York City Zoning Resolution;

WHEREAS the filling in of the area in the rear now occupied by the stair and adding the partial fifth floor increased the bulk of 1209;

WHEREAS the scale of the rear of 1209 is increased to the point that it is not appropriate in relation to its neighbors to the north;

WHEREAS the design of the front façade is not sufficiently distinguished to merit landmark status and would be a non-contributing building in the historic district;

WHEREAS 1209 Park is not appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,

Russell Squire

Russell Squire
Chair

David Helpern and Jane Parshall

David Helpern and Jane Parshall
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Eric Adams, Mayor of the City of New York
Honorable Mark Levine, Manhattan Borough President
Honorable Jerry Nadler, 12th Congressional District Representative
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District
Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District
Honorable Edward Gibbs, NYS Assembly Member 68th Assembly District
Honorable Alex Bores, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District
Honorable Julie Menin, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District