

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, May 15, 2023 – 6:30pm
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom***

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, May 17, 2023**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpert, John McClement, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo. Public Member, Kimberly Selway, was also present.

Resolutions for Approval:

- Item 1:** 1014 Fifth Avenue - Disapproval
- Item 2:** 134-138 East 74th Street - Approval
- Item 3:** 177-179 East 73rd Street - Unanimous Approval
- Item 4:** 972 Fifth Avenue - Unanimous Approval

1. **1014 Fifth Ave (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** – *David Chipperfield Architects, KARO Architects* - A Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Welch, Smith & Provot and constructed in 1906-7, with renovation and extension by Trowbridge & Livingston in 1926. Application is for further design developments to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness as well as responding to two LPC conditions that were attached to the C of A.

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue, now the home of the German Cultural Center, is a Beaux-Arts style town house designed by Welch, Smith & Provot and constructed in 1906-07. A renovation and extension by Trowbridge & Livingston 1926;

WHEREAS in June 2021 David Chipperfield Architects (after winning an international competition) together with New York-based KARO architects were commissioned by the Federal

Government of Germany to convert the former headquarters of the Goethe Institute into a new center for transatlantic dialogue;

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue came before the Community Board #8 Landmarks Committee last July (2022);

WHEREAS the Landmarks Commission approved a Certificate of Appropriateness last September with two conditions attached: a narrower entrance canopy and a change to the window material at the ground floor to the left of the entrance;

WHEREAS the applicant is also proposing further design development: egress stair improvement, bench relocation, vitrine relocation to interior vestibule and previously approved limestone paving to become granite;

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the egress stair result in the relocation of the entrance vitrine and the bench;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair presents as more practical and is now centered on the existing window to the left of the front entrance; the formerly proposed steel window will be replaced with a new wood window following an LPC condition;

WHEREAS the new basement opening resulting from the new egress stair utilizes an existing window lintel;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair will have a limestone banister/balustrade;

WHEREAS the proposed egress stair will have a metal gate;

WHEREAS the proposed vitrine will be moved from the sidewalk to the interior vestibule; the bench will be moved to the right of the entrance;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes more hard-wearing 5'x5' granite paving instead of limestone to replace the sidewalk along the 25' frontage along 5th Avenue; the proposed granite paving will be lighter in color than the adjacent sidewalks;

WHEREAS the proposed limestone relocated bench and the proposed limestone balustrade for the egress stair will reference/reinterpret historic details from the original front elevation, including the rounded details on the proposed bench and the proposed balustrade;

WHEREAS the entrance gate is now full-height, changing from a domestic scale to a cultural scale; the design of the painted steel metal work at the front entrance and at the gate for the proposed egress stair will be sensitive in quality but presents as a more graphic and abstract representation with a more or less square grid; the applicant does not want to replicate the decorative metal work at the 2nd floor balcony;

WHEREAS the juxtaposition of a more contemporary metal design on the entry gate and the gate to the egress stair with the historic ironwork on the rest of the front elevation is intended to complement the existing diversity of the metal work at the front elevation;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes new signage — a bronze signage plaque that fits into the stone rustication that will signify the building's address; to be added at the same location to the left of the entrance as the previous signage plaque;

WHEREAS the garden space to the south of 1014 5th Avenue now projects out 14'; it is atypical that a garden space along 5th Avenue is so wide; the resulting sidewalk space in front of 1010 Fifth Avenue is pinched;

WHEREAS if the garden space were to be made narrower, the proposed bench would project beyond the garden space and would have to be shortened;

WHEREAS the proposed refinements at the front elevation are an improvement; there is now more sympathy to the existing building;

WHEREAS the design of the full height metal gate at the entrance and of the matching design at the gate to the egress stair is too harsh and presents as too contemporary and is not contextual with the rest of the decorative iron work on the front elevation;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 5 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Tamayo)

3 Opposed (Cohn, Helpern, Parshall)

1 Abstention (Chu)

1 Public Member Against (Selway)

- 2. 134-138 East 74th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** - *Peter Pennoyer Architects* - Italianate styled buildings designed by Joh Prague and constructed in 1871-75. Application is for change at street level entry to include the replacement of a service door with window, planters within the entryway and the removal of secondary entry steps at 134 and removal of two-story commercial addition, restoration of façade to include parlor floor windows and street level entry with planters and fencing and a gate, bulkhead addition at rooftop at 138.

WHEREAS 134 - 138 East 74th Street are Italianate-style buildings designed by John Prague and constructed in 1871-1875;

WHEREAS the three houses that comprise this application were originally part of a row of 26 houses; the three houses now present as one double house and one narrower house with a total width of almost 50'; they will be combined internally to create a single family home;

WHEREAS remnants of the original historic fabric exist at both the double house and the single house;

WHEREAS at 134 East 74th Street, the applicant proposes: 1) removing a secondary areaway gate and entry door, 2) making the iron railing continuous, 3) replacing the existing secondary entrance door with a window that matches adjacent windows, 4) removing the gate and steps down to the areaway where the proposed new window will now be, 5) replace sheet metal cornice as needed, and 6) at the roof, the applicant proposes to introduce a new stair bulkhead to be clad in brick to accommodate an internal stair;

WHEREAS the facade at 134 East 74th Street is made of Dorchester stone which cannot be exposed; the facade will be painted the same exact color as Dorchester stone;

WHEREAS at 138 East 74th Street, the applicant proposes: 1) new railing and gate to replicate original railings shown in a 1912 photograph, 2) lower portion of facade to be rebuilt in plane (the projecting existing non-original extension at the ground floor and first floor to be removed) with new wood double hung windows and surrounds to replicate original masonry openings, 3) at the ground level the applicant proposes a new door wood door and window and a modified lower entry, 4) at second and third floors replace all existing windows with new double hung wood windows 5) at the third floor replace existing French doors with new wood double hung window, 6) replace sheet metal cornice as needed, and 7) at the roof, the applicant proposes to introduce a new stair bulkhead to be clad in brick to accommodate an internal stair;

WHEREAS the continuing of the iron railing at 134 East 74th Street — the applicant proposes to extend into the sidewalk for approximately 22 “so that the railing at 134 East 74th Street aligns with the railing at 138 East 74th Street and with the predominant fence line along the rest of the block;

WHEREAS the 22' extension into the sidewalk/public way requires a Revocable Consent from the Department of Transportation;

WHEREAS at the roof the new bulkhead will maintain an 8' height and have a skylight, the existing chimneys and skylights will be removed and a new chimney for the kitchen exhaust will be installed;

WHEREAS the bulkhead— while setback 16' from the front elevation — is most visible at the NE corner of 74th Street and Lexington Avenue with an exposure of about 6' above the parapet line;

WHEREAS the width of 134 East 74th Street is 18'9” — the 22” incursion into the public way will have the exact same width — however, 12' 4” of sidewalk will remain;

WHEREAS the applicant has presented a sensitive and appropriate intervention at the front elevation that is appropriate within the historic district;

WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for the detailed and lucid drawings that accompanied the presentation.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 7 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)
1 Opposed (Camp),
1 Abstention (Birnbaum)
1 Public Member In Favor (Selway)

3. **177-179 East 73rd Street (Individual Landmark)** - *JFG Architects* - A Beaux Arts Style garage building designed by Charles F. Hoppe and constructed in 1906. Application is to reconstruct a visible secondary facade in conjunction with work approved under the Certificate of Appropriateness.

WHEREAS this individual landmark is to be converted from a garage to a Jewish Center;
WHEREAS the proposed conversion received a Certificate of Appropriateness in 2018;
WHEREAS subsequent investigation of the existing conditions concluded due to the deterioration, the existing concrete floor slabs and existing masonry west wall had to be replaced with new concrete slabs and a new masonry wall;
WHEREAS the face of the existing west wall is of a lesser quality brick than the brick on the main façade;
WHEREAS the west wall of the garage, when built, would have been a lot line wall;
WHEREAS the west wall appears to have been designed in anticipation of being covered by another building and, therefore, not seen;
WHEREAS 175 East 73rd Street, which is part of the Jewish Center Complex, is set against the west wall of the former garage;
WHEREAS the uncovered portion of the west wall of 177-179 East 73rd Street will be visible;
WHEREAS the new west wall will be finished with a face brick that matches the existing brick of the main façade in color, size, and texture;
WHEREAS the mortar joints in the new west wall will match the mortar joints in the main façade in color, thickness, and texture;
WHEREAS a perfect match between the brick in the new west wall and the brick in the main façade may not be possible;
WHEREAS the new west wall is set back from the westerly return of the main façade thereby minimizing possible differences in the color of the brick on the west and the brick on the south, or main façade;
WHEREAS the flues original to the garage building are no longer necessary;
WHEREAS the flue protrusions will be eliminated on the new west wall;
WHEREAS the new west wall will have some variation within the plane of the wall in that soldier courses with vertical brick will be integrated into the predominantly horizontal courses of brick;
WHEREAS the design of the new west wall is appropriate and contextual for the individual landmark;
THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 9 In Favor: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)
1 Public Member In Favor: (Selway)

4. **972 Fifth Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District)** - *Architectural Preservation Studio, DPC* - A high Italian Renaissance style building designed by McKim, Mead & White and constructed in 1902-1906 Application is to move one of the existing border stones 8 to 10 inches into the courtyard so the legs would no longer encroach over the public space.

WHEREAS 972 Fifth Avenue, the Payne Whitney House, is the home of the French Cultural

Services in New York of the French Embassy;

WHEREAS the American Society of Le Souvenir Francais seeks to honor Antoine du Saint-Exupery, the author of “The Little Prince;”

WHEREAS the 972 Fifth Avenue mansion has a courtyard to the south with a low granite wall along the sidewalk;

WHEREAS the proposed honor will be the placement of a sculpture of “The Little Prince” by sculptor Jean-Marc De Pas on the low granite wall enclosing the courtyard garden;

WHEREAS the length of the wall is 27’-1” from the southern edge of 972 Fifth Avenue to the northern edge of 1 East 78th Street, the Institute of Fine Arts of New York University;

WHEREAS the gate in the wall into the courtyard is at the southern edge of 972 Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the wall varies in height with the slope of the sidewalk from north to south;

WHEREAS the height of the wall at the proposed location of the sculpture is 2’-3” above the sidewalk;

WHEREAS the stone block approximately in the middle of the wall is about 11’-0” from the southern edge of 972 Fifth Avenue and is about 11’-0” long;

WHEREAS this stone block will be set back eight inches on a new, shallow granite base to enable the sculpture to sit on the stone wall without protruding past the property line;

WHEREAS the sculpture will be placed approximately 13’-3” from the southern end of the mansion on the southern portion of the stone block;

WHEREAS a bronze plaque will be placed on the face of the stone towards the southern end of the stone block;

WHEREAS the overall height of the sculpture is 4’-1;”

WHEREAS the upper portion of the sculpture sitting on the stone is 2’-4” high and the bottom portion of the sculpture is 1’-9” high;

WHEREAS the positioning of the sculpture on the setback portion of the wall eliminates the objections of the Departments of Transportation and Design and Construction of the extension of the sculpture over the property line;

WHEREAS the setting back of a portion of the wall creates a defined setting for the sculpture and the plaque;

WHEREAS the placing of the sculpture on the recess in the wall is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 9 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 Public Member In Favor (Selway)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs