

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, December 12, 2022 – 6:30pm
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom***

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, December 14, 2022**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

MINUTES:

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Judy Schneider, Marco Tamayo. Public Members Christina Davis and Kimberly Selway were also present.

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 16 East 79th Street Disapproval

Item 2: 5G Link NYC Kiosks in Historic Districts

1. **16 East 79th Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) - Design Primitives LLC -** A Neo Georgian style building designed by Warren & Wetmore and constructed in 1901-03. Application is for window replacement at the front elevation.

WHEREAS 16 East 79th Street is a neo-Georgian style town house designed by Warren & Wetmore and constructed in 1901-1903;

WHEREAS Warren and Wetmore was one of the most successful and prolific architectural practices in America during the first three decades of the twentieth century, whose major commissions included the design for Grand Central Station;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to change the existing windows at the front elevation to 6 over 6 and 9 over 12 double hung windows made of aluminum clad with wood so that the windows present as neo-Georgian; multipaned windows are more typical of the neo-Georgian style;

WHEREAS at the basement, 3rd and 4th floors, the windows are now double hung; with casement windows on the 1st and 2nd floors;

WHEREAS the historic windows present as casement windows;

WHEREAS the applicant presented a very thoughtful set of window details as part of the applicant's premise that since the house is "neo-Georgian", it needs "neo-Georgian" style windows;

WHEREAS the original casement windows better serve the Warren and Wetmore design for the house;

WHEREAS the introduction of “historical” elements where they have not existed or the dividing up of the windows into small panes goes against the historical nature of the building;
WHEREAS 16 East 79th Street with its original casement windows speak to the “Modern French” antecedents so characteristic of the design and so much of Warren and Wetmore’s work;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 6 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Helpern, Parshall, Cohn)
1 Public Member In Favor: Christina Davis
1 Public Member Opposed: Kimberly Selway

2. **Continued discussion of 5G Link NYC Kiosks in Historic Districts** (Continued from the December 2022 Transportation Committee meeting)

WHEREAS New York City, through its Office of Technology and Innovation (OTI), has contracted with CityBridge to install and operate a citywide wireless communications network;
WHEREAS the Transportation Committee of Community Board 8 had an extensive hearing with public participation on the benefits and drawbacks of the proposed towers;
WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 had a subsequent hearing with public participation on the benefits and drawbacks of the proposed 5G towers;
WHEREAS the towers are to be placed on sidewalks in historic districts;
WHEREAS the towers are 32 feet high and, therefore, out of scale with the buildings in historic districts;
WHEREAS the modernist design of the towers is unrelated to the architectural characters of buildings in historic districts;
WHEREAS the towers can be placed ten feet from an individual landmark building or a building in a historic district, thereby detracting from the presence of the historic structure;
WHEREAS the screens on kiosks or towers conflict with the Special Madison Avenue Preservation District’s design guidelines;
WHEREAS 5G transmission cables can be placed fully underground, connect directly to buildings, and have no visual impact on the streetscape;
WHEREAS each 5GTower proposed for installation within a historic district must first receive a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Preservation Commission
WHEREAS 5G towers are not appropriate and contextual in historic districts and should not be approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission in historic districts;
WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 has reviewed the resolution prepared by the Transportation Committee of Community board 8;
WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 supports the resolution prepared by the Transportation Committee;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the installation of Link 5G towers in historic districts in Community Board 8 is **DISAPPROVED**;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that a moratorium be placed on construction and planning of Link5G towers and devices in Community District 8 Manhattan.

6 In Favor: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Helpern, Parshall, Schneider, Tamayo)
1 Opposed: (Baron)
1 Public Members In Favor: (Selway)

David Helpern and Jane Helpern, Co-Chairs