

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, October 17, 2022 - 6:30 pm
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, October 19, 2022**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michelle Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway*, and Marco Tamayo.

*Public Member

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 3 East 78th Street Disapproval (Unanimous)

Item 2: 22 East 81 Street Disapproval (Unanimous)

Item 3: 1045 Park Avenue Approval

1. **3 East 78th Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** - *Scott Koniacko, AIA* - A Francois Premiere Revival building designed by C.P.H. Gilbert and constructed in 1897-1899. Application is for changing two un-seeable windows on the fifth floor to a sliding door.

WHEREAS 3 East 78th Street is a Francois I (King of France 1515-1547) or “High Renaissance” revival-style building designed by C.P.H. Gilbert and constructed in 1897-1899.

WHEREAS C.P.H. Gilbert was one of the architectural giants of late 19th and early 20th century townhouses and mansions;

WHEREAS at the 5th story at 3 East 78th Street there is a gabled window consisting of 2 transom windows with sash windows below;

WHEREAS the applicant proposing replacing the sash windows and the center mullion that divides them with a sliding door that extends down for an additional 15” (from 4’4” to 5’8” — the change in height from the underside of the transom — so that the 3’6” balcony is more accessible;

WHEREAS the proposed window to be changed into a sliding door is not visible from the public way;

WHEREAS the existing stonework/carved limestone will not be violated;

WHEREAS the existing railing framing the 3'6" balcony is 36" high; to meet code requirements, the existing balcony will be built up by 6";

WHEREAS the 6" addition to the existing balcony will be mounted on the inside of the existing railing for balcony and thus invades and disturbs original historic fabric;

WHEREAS it was never the intention of the architect that the balcony be used;

WHEREAS the 5th floor window is central to the composition of the front elevation, even though invisible from the public way;

WHEREAS removing the center mullion and changing the window to a sliding door is not appropriate for a building of this caliber and violates the the original intent of the architect:

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 8 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpen, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 Public Member In Favor: Kimberly Selway

2. 22 East 81st Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) - Drew Lang - A brownstone constructed in 1883-84 by Thom & Wilson. Application is for facade renovation, window replacement, and adding a 3rd window at the 1st and 2nd floors.

WHEREAS 22 East 81st Street is a brownstone designed by Thom & Wilson and constructed in 1883-1884;

WHEREAS 22 East 81st Street was originally a brownstone townhouse but now presents as a modernist design;

WHEREAS the applicant, as part of an overall renovation, proposes to introduce a more traditional look, including the addition of a cornice and string courses at the first and second floors and below the cornice;

WHEREAS as part of the renovation, the applicant proposes to change the cladding on the house to limestone, revert to 3:windows at the 2nd floor where there are now two, and to install two new wood and glass doors at the ground level with a window in between;

WHEREAS all the proposed new windows at the front elevation would be single-pane black-painted wood windows with limestone window surrounds;

WHEREAS the proposed new doors at the 1st floor (ground level) would also have limestone surrounds;

WHEREAS the original windows when the house presented as a brownstone were double-hung;

WHEREAS the applicant's proposal for the front elevation presents as timid and bland with a false uniformity and an austerity and lack of texture that is out of context within the historic district;

WHEREAS the applicant's proposal makes no reference to the original historic Brownstone;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 8 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpen, Parshall, Tamayo).

1 Public Member In Favor: Selway

3. 1045 Park Avenue (Park Avenue Historic District) - Arthur Chabon Architects - A Colonial Revival building designed by Schwartz and Gross constructed in 1922-1923. Application is for exterior renovations and modifications to penthouse apartment.

WHEREAS 1045 Park Avenue has a two-story penthouse that was built incrementally;

WHEREAS a one-story penthouse was built initially; a partial second story added over half of the penthouse; and a partial second story added over the other half of the penthouse;

WHEREAS the original single-story penthouse was converted into two, two-story penthouses incorporating the two additions;

WHEREAS the two penthouses were converted into one penthouse;

WHEREAS the current penthouse is an agglomeration of styles and elements;

WHEREAS the renovation of the penthouse provides an opportunity to improve the appearance and the organization of the elements of the penthouse;

WHEREAS the rearrangement of the interiors is being done in concert with the exterior of the penthouse;

WHEREAS interior stairs will be demolished;

WHEREAS all windows and exterior doors will be removed;

WHEREAS the chimney for the second-floor fireplace will be demolished;

WHEREAS the great room on the second floor will be extended to the north;

WHEREAS a new stair in a metal and glass enclosure will be added to the north of the great room on the western side of the penthouse but within the footprint of the first floor of the penthouse;

WHEREAS a large, exterior spiral staircase will be added from the first-floor terrace to the second-floor terrace at the northern end of the penthouse and a small, exterior spiral staircase will be added from the second-floor terrace to the second-floor roof;

WHEREAS the railings of the spiral staircases, the railings on the terrace of the second floor, and the railings on the roof will be black, epoxy coated steel;

WHEREAS minor changes will be made to locations and/or sizes of windows and doors and all windows and doors will be replaced;

WHEREAS new windows will be aluminum clad wood windows;

WHEREAS new windows will be multi-pane top and bottom with clear glazing in the middle;

WHEREAS new windows will be similar to many windows in the building;

WHEREAS new doors will be aluminum clad wood doors with glazing similar to the windows;

WHEREAS windows will be aligned at the tops throughout the penthouse, creating a datum, and the arched windows on the second floor that will be removed will be replaced windows that align with the new datum;

WHEREAS new doors and windows will be recessed to improve weathertightness and reflect the traditional set-in window relationships to walls;

WHEREAS metal on new doors and windows will have a Kynar coating to match the charcoal gray of the windows in the building;

WHEREAS the wood fireplace in the great room will be relocated and changed to gas;

WHEREAS the fireplace and the flue will be centered on the great room inside and outside;

WHEREAS the walls of the penthouse were originally stucco and were originally white;

WHEREAS existing stucco will be repaired, and new stucco will be added, all in a smooth finish, and all painted white;

WHEREAS a new wood pergola, painted black, will be added to the northwest corner of the second floor of the penthouse;

WHEREAS the roof of the second floor will become a garden;

WHEREAS the water tower will remain in place;

WHEREAS the mass of the penthouse will be increased by slight changes in plan such as the enlargement of the great room;

WHEREAS the current penthouse is most visible from the northeast and southeast, the increased volume will add minimally to the visible mass of the penthouse from these views;

WHEREAS the visual disorder that was due to the incremental additions to the penthouse will be replaced with a visually ordered composition;

WHEREAS this major renovation of the existing penthouse will provide a coherent architectural statement;

WHEREAS the renovated penthouse will be contextual and appropriate within the historic district;
THEREFORE, be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 7 In favor (Baron, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

2 Abstentions (Ashby, Birnbaum)

1 Public Member In Favor: (Selway)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs