

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, July 18, 2022 - 6:30 pm
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, July 20, 2022**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michelle Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway*, and Marco Tamayo.

*Public Member

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1: 1014 Fifth Avenue Disapproval (Unanimous)

Item 2: 18 East 68th Street Approval (Unanimous)

Item 3: 53 East 79th Street Approval (Unanimous)

Item 4: 1071 Fifth Avenue Disapproval

1. **1014 Fifth Avenue (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** - *KARO Architects LLP* - A Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Welch, Smith, & Provost and constructed in 1906-1907. Application is for replacement of all front windows, replacement of entry door, horizontal extension on 3rd and 4th floors in rear, addition of 5th floor roof terrace in rear and new landscaping in the rear yard.

WHEREAS 1014 Fifth Avenue is a six-story townhouse in the Metropolitan Museum Historic District originally built as a private residence and formerly used as Goethe House; and

WHEREAS significant changes to the Fifth Avenue façade (window replacement, alterations to the front yard and the removal of the stoop) beginning in the 1920's have altered the building's original appearance while maintaining its original, residential character; and

WHEREAS the building has remained vacant since Goethe House moved out in 2009; and

WHEREAS the owners of the building, the German Republic, passed ownership to a not-for-profit organization, 1014 Inc for the purpose of reopening the building to transatlantic cultural exchange activities; and

WHEREAS the applicants have requested a rear extension on the upper floors; and

WHEREAS the applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness broken into four categories:

1. West façade (Fifth Avenue)
2. East façade (rear yard)
3. North and South Facades (side yards)
4. Roof/Bulkhead replacement; and,

WHEREAS for the Fifth Avenue façade applicant proposes a program of limestone cleaning and repair, repairs to the copper roof, ornamental metalwork cleaning and repair, window replacement in kind (with better thermal performance) on the second and third floors; and

WHEREAS the new windows replacing the double-hung windows on the fourth, fifth and sixth floors with casement windows replicating the appearance of the existing windows; and

WHEREAS the existing first floor window will be replaced with a modern style steel construction, and the existing double entry door will be replaced by a single blackened steel pivot door; and

WHEREAS the existing non-original sidewalk extension will be occupied by a semicircular limestone bench facing the building, and the existing concrete paving replaced by limestone pavers; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a backlit vitrine perpendicular to Fifth Avenue for the purpose of advertising programs at 1014 Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to introduce a flat glass and black steel canopy at the entrance; and

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a substantial addition to the rear of the third, fourth and fifth floors with a balcony at the third-floor level, a double height common room with a glazed east wall, and a terrace enclosed on three sides; and

WHEREAS the proposed addition does not increase the building footprint and is not visible from the public way; and

WHEREAS the additional building mass will be clad, insofar as it is not windowed in brick compatible with existing construction; and

WHEREAS additional glazing will be steel, and existing windows will be replaced in kind; and

WHEREAS the side yard facades will be extended at the third through sixth levels presenting blank brick facades to the neighboring buildings approximately eleven feet away; and

WHEREAS the rooftop alterations will be primarily mechanical equipment and elevator/stair bulkheads and not visible from either the public way nor the main entry stairs to the Metropolitan Museum of Art across Fifth Avenue; and

WHEREAS seven members of the public testified in opposition to the proposal, citing issues related to:

- The inappropriate modernity of the proposed entry door
- The potential nuisance of the illuminated vitrine through light pollution
- The encroachment of the inappropriately detailed limestone bench on the sidewalk and the public way and its potential as an attractive nuisance for persons who would not be visible from the sidewalk
- The inappropriate glass entrance canopy

- The additional mass at the rear which will compromise light and air to the apartments facing it across the narrow lightwells to the north and south
- The potential for noise pollution from the expanded facility, particularly from the open terrace (with enclosed walls north and south) at the upper level; and

WHEREAS the members of the Committee in attendance enthusiastically agreed with the public comments; and

WHEREAS the proposed interventions, in particular the first-floor entrance, landscape, fenestration canopy and illuminated vitrine present an inappropriately commercial image and run counter to the building's residential qualities and the residential nature of this portion of Fifth Avenue; and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 7 In Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

2. 18 East 68th Street (Upper East Side Historic District). *Alexander B. Jacobs, Architect.* - A Beaux-Arts Style building designed by Cass Gilbert and constructed in 1904-05. Application is for installation of a cast-iron gate at the front stoop.

WHEREAS 18 East 68th Street (also known as the Sloan Mansion) is a Beaux-Arts style building designed by Cass Gilbert and constructed in 1904-05;

WHEREAS the application is for a front stoop gate;

WHEREAS a prior design for a front stoop gate was approved by Community Board #8; the Landmarks Preservation Commission, however, did not issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the design considering it to be too ornate and to distracting from the openness of the front elevation;

WHEREAS the applicant is now presenting a revised version of the front gate that presents as lower and less dense;

WHEREAS the revised version of a lower front gate does not disturb the view of the main entry door while still incorporating some of the elements of the existing iron work at the front elevation;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application be **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 7 In Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Selway)

3. 53 East 79th Street – The New York Society Library (Individual Landmark) – *Larson Architecture Works PLLC* - An Italian Renaissance style townhouse designed by Trowbridge & Livingston, constructed in 1916-17 and retrofitted in 1937 for its current library use. - Application is for replacing two front windows at the cellar level with operable windows and for a horizontal extension at the cellar and first floor levels at the rear yard.

WHEREAS 53 East 79th Street, the John S. and Catherine C. Rogers House, is an Italian Renaissance-style townhouse designed by Trowbridge and Livingston and constructed in 1916-1917;

WHEREAS 53 East 79th Street was retrofitted in 1937 for its current use as The New York Society Library;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to expand at the rear at the cellar and first floor levels to create more space or stacks for books;

WHEREAS the proposed extension or infill into the rear yard would be 10' wide x 42' long x 23' high;
WHEREAS while the existing rear yard is 12' wide, the Zoning Code does not allow for construction all the way to the rear property line;
WHEREAS the applicant also proposes to replace two windows at the sidewalk (cellar level) at the front elevation with operable hopper windows to match existing historic windows as closely as possible, the existing historic grilles will remain;
WHEREAS the two windows, now covered with plywood painted black, will provide light and air to the space behind the windows;
WHEREAS at the rear, the doughnut has already been compromised by rear extensions; the new Peter Pennoyer Architects-designed apartment building ("The Benson"), directly west of the proposed west-facing elevation of the extension, on Madison Avenue, has a blank concrete wall on its rear property line;
WHEREAS the extension is not visible from the public way;
WHEREAS The Society Library received Certificate of Appropriateness approval for a similar capital project in 2002, but did not, at that time, have funding in place to move forward.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application, for the two-story extension and the restoration of the two windows at the side walk at the front elevation, be **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 7 In Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Selway)

- 4. 1071 Fifth Avenue - Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum - (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District)** – Event Network LLC - A Modern-style museum building and interior designed by Frank Lloyd Wright and built in 1956-59, and subsequently enlarged by an addition designed by Gwathmey Siegel and Associates and built in 1988-92. Application is to modify designated interior spaces.

WHEREAS 1071 Fifth Avenue is home to the Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum in the Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District; and

WHEREAS the interior, including the ground floor retail space was designated an Interior Landmark in 1990; and

WHEREAS the retail space was not part of the original proposed design, and was intended to remain an open driveway and was only enclosed in 1975; and

WHEREAS the current retail space was designed by the architectural firm of Gwathmey Siegel in 1988-90; and

WHEREAS the applicants (the current retail operators) seek a Certificate of Appropriateness for major renovations to the retail space; and

WHEREAS the applicants propose to remove virtually all the existing casework and replace it with new retail fixtures, an accessible point-of-sale while retaining the existing floor and ceiling treatments; and

WHEREAS the proposed plan is expected to improve traffic flow through the retail space; and

WHEREAS the location of the new point-of-sale will eliminate public view of a window to the north located at the junction of Wright's small rotunda and the Gwathmey Siegel gallery addition to the east; and

WHEREAS the new store fixtures are intended to recall the detailing, color, material and finish of the original Wright details; and

WHEREAS the Committee majority felt strongly that the proposed elements and composition did not support the museum's original architecture; and

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 4 In Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Tamayo)

1 Opposed (Cohn)

1 Abstention (Parshall)

1 Public Member Opposed (Selway)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs