Russell Squire Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com – Website info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

The City of New York Community Board 8 Manhattan Full Board Committee Meeting PUBLIC HEARING Wednesday, March 9, 2022 - 6:30 PM Conducted Remotely via Zoom

### **MINUTES:**

**Community Board Members Present:** Vanessa Aronson, Elizabeth Ashby, P. Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Lori Ann Bores, Taina Borrero, Lorraine Brown, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, Saundrea Coleman, Rebecca Dangoor, Felice Farber, Edward Hartzog, David Helpern, Wilma Johnson, Paul Kriker, Craig Lader, Rebecca Lamorte, Valerie Mason, Evan Meyerson, Greg Morris, Jane Parshall, Peter Patch, John Philips, Rita Popper, Margaret Price, Elizabeth Rose, Barbara Rudder, Abraham Salcedo, William Sanchez, M. Barry Schneider, Rami Sigal, Cos Spagnoletti, Russell Squire, Lynne Strong-Shinozaki, Marco Tamayo, Carolina Tejo, Adam Wald, Elaine Walsh, Charles Warren, and Sharon Weiner.

**Community Board Members Absent:** Lowell Barton, Harrison Pierson-Panes, Sharon Pope-Marshall, and Yma-Rodriguez Thoma.

Community Board Members Excused: Billy Freeland

**Total Attendance: 42** 

Chairman Russell Squire called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

#### 1. Updates from the 19th Precinct

Officer Lombardi delivered updates from the 19 Precinct.

- 2. Public Session Those who wish to speak during the Public Session must register to do so by 6:45 pm.
  - Rabbi Joshua Stanton spoke on the uptick of Antisemitism in the nation and the UES.
  - Matt Bauer spoke on updates of the Madison Avenue B.I.D.
  - George Todorovic spoke in favor of increasing Composting and Community Garden sites.
  - Alida Camp spoke in opposition to "To-Go' alcoholic drinks and promoted the CB8M Art Show.
  - Lauren Trapanotto spoke on loud noise coming from the 494 East 90<sup>th</sup> construction site.
  - Suzan Fruchtman spoke on the loud noise coming from the 494 East 90<sup>th</sup> construction site.
  - Andrew Ravaschiere spoke on development and environmental issues.
- 3. Adoption of the Agenda Agenda Adopted
- 4. Adoption of the Minutes Minutes Adopted
- Manhattan Borough President's Report Manhattan Borough President Mark Levine reported on his latest initiatives.

#### 6. Elected Officials' Reports

- Manhattan DA Alvin Bragg
- Council Member Julie Menin
- State Senator Liz Krueger
- Assembly Member Dan Quart
- Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney
- Assembly Member Rebecca Seawright
- 7. Chair's Report Russell Squire Chair Russell Squire gave his report.
- 8. **District Manager's Report Will Brightbill** District Manager Will Brightbill gave his report.
- 9. Committee Reports and Action Items

a) Youth, Education and Libraries Committee – Taina Borrero and Rami Sigal, Co-Chairs

YEL-1 Item 1 & 2 Unanimous Approval

# Item 1: Support of the confirmation of Deborah Lipstadt to the Office of the Special Envoy To Monitor and Combat Anti-Semitism

WHEREAS, Community Board 8 Manhattan condemns the recent string of anti-Semitic attacks within Manhattan Community District 8 as well as the antisemitic attacks that are happening throughout the country;

WHEREAS, Community Board 8 Manhattan calls on law enforcement officials and the judicial system to hold those who participated in these hate crimes to be prosecuted to the fullest extent;

WHEREAS, the anti-Semitic attacks experienced by members of the Upper East Side are only the latest in a 275% spike in antisemitic incidences in the month of January 2022 alone;

**WHEREAS,** in the United States and globally, anti-Semitism is on the rise, leading to significant harm to the global Jewish population, including Jews who live within Manhattan Community District 8;

WHEREAS, the rise in anti-Semitism in recent years and months is staggering and Jews have consistently been victims of slander, violence, and terrorism in alarming rates;

**WHEREAS**, the Special Envoy to Monitor and Combat Antisemitism was established by the Global Anti-Semitism Review Act of 2004;

WHEREAS, the Special Envoy post is required by statute to be filled;

**WHEREAS**, the post had been vacant for three years during President Trump's administration, until early 2019;

**WHEREAS,** President Biden nominated Emory University Professor Dr. Deborah Lipstadt to fill the critical role in the Department of State on July 30, 2021;

WHEREAS, Dr. Deborah Lipstadt is one of the world's leading scholars of anti-Semitism;

**WHEREAS,** Dr. Deborah Lipstadt's efforts to combat anti-Semitism have been successful not only in the United States but globably;

WHEREAS, the U.S. cannot afford to leave the post vacant during this critical time of increased hate crimes being committed against Jews;

WHEREAS, Dr. Lipstadt's record proves she is the most qualified person to fill the role;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED,** Community Board 8 Manhattan calls on our federal representatives to expedite the approval of Dr. Lipstadt to the office of Special Envoy to Monitor and Combat Anti-Semitism.

# Item 2: Support of the City of New York and the State of New York to adopt the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) definition of anti-Semitism

**WHEREAS**, Community Board 8 Manhattan condemns the recent string of anti-Semitic attacks within Manhattan Community District 8 as well as the anti-Semitic attacks that are happening throughout the country;

**WHEREAS**, Community Board 8 Manhattan calls on law enforcement officials and the judicial system to hold those who participated in these hate crimes to be prosecuted to the fullest extent;

**WHEREAS**, the anti-Semitic attacks experienced by members of the Upper East Side are only the latest in a 275% spike in antisemitic incidences in the month of January 2022 alone;

WHEREAS, in the United States and globally, anti-Semitism is on the rise, leading to significant harm to the global Jewish population, including Jews who live within Manhattan Community District 8;

WHEREAS, clearly defining and using a more all-encompassing definition antisemitism using the IHRA deiniation will help shape the prosecution of hate crimes in New York and close loopholes in the current hate crimes law;

**WHEREAS,** the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) defines anti-Semitism as: "Antisemitism is a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical manifestations of anti-Semitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities;"

WHEREAS, this definition of anti-Semitism has been adopted by 33 countries, 4 U.S. states, countless universities, organizations, and departments of the the federal government;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8 Manhattan calls on the City of New York and the State of New York to adopt the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) definition of anti-Semitsm;

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8 Manhattan directly calls on our City and State legislators to propose the IHRA definition of anti-Semitism in New York.

# Community Board 8 Manhattan unanimously approved both resolutions by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

#### b) Transportation Committee – Charles S. Warren and Craig M. Lader, Co-Chairs

TR-1 Item 1 Approval

### Item 1: Revocable Consent for a Sidewalk Planted Area with Lighting at 109 East 79th Street

**WHEREAS;** a revocable consent is requested by 109 East 79<sup>th</sup> Street to, maintain and use a new sidewalk planted area with lighting; and

**WHEREAS;** each planter would extend 6 feet from the building line, providing 11' 6" of clearance where tree pits are present and 16 feet of clearance to the curb; and

**WHEREAS;** two planters with pleached carpinus trees will be placed on both sides of the building entrance, with one being 11' 10" wide and the other is 17' 1" wide; and

WHEREAS; soft lighting will be installed to illuminate the pleached carpinus trees; and

**WHEREAS**; a boxwood planting with evergreen shrubbery will be placed on eastern end of the building with a width of 24' 9.5"; and

WHEREAS; the location of the eastern-most planter was decided upon to provide as much clearance as possible from the Siamese fire connection required by FDNY; and

WHEREAS; one existing tree that will remain in place, and two new trees that were removed for construction that will be replaced; and

**WHEREAS;** NYCDOT has approved the plans for the requested revocable consent, and both NYCDOT and NYC Parks have approved the plan to replace the trees;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, that Community Board 8 approves, as presented, the request by 109 East 79<sup>th</sup> Street for a revocable consent to construct, maintain and use a new sidewalk planted area with lighting.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 39 in favor, 3 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

c) Landmarks Committee – David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs

LM-1 Item 1 Approval

LM-2 Item 2 Approval

LM-3 Item 3 Unanimous Approval

Item 1: 20 East 79th Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District) - Application is to add a building sign to the frieze of the portico above the main entry door.

**WHEREAS** 20 East 79th Street is a French neo-classical style building designed by C.P. H. Gilbert and constructed in 1912.

**WHEREAS** 20 East 79th Street, formerly partially residential, is now completely occupied by the Skarstedt Gallery; the gallery formerly occupied the three lower floors, but has now taken the entire space;

**WHEREAS** a Certificate of Appropriateness is required since the frieze of the cornice is less than 12" in height — in this case, approximately 10";

**WHEREAS** the proposed signage would be 68.6" wide x 7" high x 1" deep and would be fastened to the limestone frieze with a silicone adhesive — the lettering would not penetrate or disturb the limestone behind it;

**WHEREAS** the signage would replace the smaller, more hidden signage that is currently on the exterior wall behind the entry columns.

**WHEREAS** the applicant is proposing a modest intervention that is contextual and appropriate within the historic district,

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

## Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 37 in favor, 4 opposed, 1 abstention and 0 not voting for cause

**Item 2: 38 East 75th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Robert A.M Stern Architects* – A "no-style" row house designed by Thom & Wilson and constructed in 1881-82 and altered by John W. Ingle in 1926. Application is to demo the existing front and rear facades, as well as the upper floors, and construct a new five-story limestone facade with a sixth story mansard and setback bulkheads above.

WHEREAS, 38 East 75<sup>th</sup> Street, a non-contributing building in the Upper East Side Historic District, originally built in 1881, was stripped of its façade ornament in 1929; and

WHEREAS, applicant proposes to demolish the street façade (north-facing), garden façade, and some of the existing mass at the garden (south-facing); and

WHEREAS, by removing some existing floor structure and lowering floor to floor heights, a five-story townhouse become a six-story townhouse while only raising the parapet height by two feet; and

WHEREAS, a new rooftop bulkhead while ten feet higher than the existing parapet (and eight feet higher than the proposed parapet), is set back from the street line by about twenty-eight feet; and

WHEREAS, a new elevator bulkhead while twenty feet higher than the existing parapet (and eighteen feet higher than the proposed parapet), is set back from the property line by about forty-eight feet; and

WHEREAS, neither rooftop addition is visible from any vantage point along the public way; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicants have chosen a Neo-Classical vocabulary for the street façade (north-facing) and a similar, but more restrained vocabulary for the garden façade; and

**WHEREAS,** for the street façade the applicants have chosen to introduce a shallow faceted oriel extending three floors vertically, and nearly the entire width of the building, topped by a columnar balustrade with the fourth and fifth floors aligning with the building immediately to the west. The visible composition is completed by a sixth-floor mansard with projecting round headed windows; and

WHEREAS, the openings in the facade are similar in proportion and size to those found on other buildings nearby; and

**WHEREAS**, the materials proposed for the street facing façade are Indiana Limestone, semi-custom wood windows and doors, and copper roofing for the mansard; and

**WHEREAS,** the garden facade (south-facing) presents a largely brick and wood exterior, with a massing that steps back from the existing non-conforming rear yard, allowing more light into the center of the block; and

**WHEREAS**, although somewhat crowded largely on account of the additional floor, the design, materials, and proposed craftsmanship are both appropriate and a welcome addition to the Historic District; but

**WHEREAS**, the existing entry steps at the street facade, which descend to the garden level, project beyond the property line, as do existing garbage bins; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicant proposed to extend that intrusion into the Public Way by centering the steps and moving them to the north, creating planters to either side of the steps, and whose north face aligns with the building to the west; and

**WHEREAS**, the applicants propose a 4'-8" tall wrought-iron fence to enclose the planters with slender limestone pillars marking the entrance, with an out-swinging gate; and

WHEREAS, the Committee believes that this intrusion into the Public Way requires a Revocable Consent from the City, and an appearance before the Community Board Eight Transportation Committee; therefore, be it

**RESOLVED**, That Community Board Eight **approves** the proposed renovations and additions to **38 East 75<sup>th</sup> Street** with the **condition** that the applicant appear before the CB8M Transportation Committee and receive a ruling from the Full Board on the proposed front yard extension prior to an appearance before the Landmarks Preservation Commission.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 36 in favor, 6 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

**Item 3: 201 East 65<sup>th</sup> Street (Individual Landmark)** – *Adam Kushner, Architect* –A modern style building designed by Mayer & Whittlesy, Skidmore, Owings & Merrill and constructed in 1947-1951. Application is for legalizing installation of entrance awing along East 65th Street for medical office located in the cellar.

WHEREAS 201 East 65<sup>th</sup> Street is an international style building constructed in 1951;

**WHEREAS** this full block building is an individual landmark that sets the aesthetic standards for apartment houses in the modernist style;

WHEREAS the building is set in a garden open to the sky;

WHEREAS there is an original stair in the easterly end of the south side of the garden;

WHEREAS the stair, which leads to a lower level of the building, was designed to be open to the sky;

WHEREAS the low granite walls on the perimeter of the site enable uninterrupted views into the garden;

WHEREAS the space on the lower level is occupied by medical offices;

**WHEREAS** the applicant seeks to cover the stair with a canopy to provide protection from the weather and to provide lighting at night;

WHEREAS the canopy will be made of a water repellent fabric;

WHEREAS the fabric will have a sand color that is meant to replicate the color of the granite walls;

WHEREAS the canopy will have an L shape;

**WHEREAS** the portion of the canopy at the entrance will extend north from the top of the original entrance arch and the face of the canopy will align with the southern face of the original arch;

WHEREAS the portion of the canopy over the stair will run east-west, parallel to the sidewalk;

WHEREAS the portion of the canopy over the stair will have a downward slope;

WHEREAS the portion of the canopy over the stair will be 7'-0" wide by 10'-11" long;

WHEREAS the portion of the canopy over the stair will be 9'-9" wide by 17'-8" long;

WHEREAS each section of the canopy will have a gable shape with an overall height of 36 inches;

WHEREAS the gable will be 18 inches high, and the vertical sides will be 18 inches high;

WHEREAS there will be identification signs on the south and east faces of the canopy;

WHEREAS there will be a directory sign on the eastern face of the western leg of the arch;

WHEREAS the underside of the canopy will be lit, but only when the medical practice is open;

WHEREAS the overall shape of the proposed canopy is awkward and ungainly;

WHEREAS the proposed sand color is significantly different from the color of the granite walls;

WHEREAS the proposed canopy will block the view across the low stone wall and garden to the building;

WHEREAS the proposed canopy will be a visual intrusion into the garden setting for the building;

WHEREAS the proposed canopy is not in the spirit or character of the original design;

**WHEREAS** the proposed canopy appears to be a temporary solution and not integral to the overall composition of the building and garden;

**WHEREAS** the canopy is not appropriate and contextual with the modernist aesthetic of the building and site;

**THEREFORE**, this application is disapproved.

Community Board 8 Manhattan unanimously approved this resolution by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention and 0 not voting for cause

d) Sanitation Committee – Cos Spagnoletti and Billy Freeland, Co-Chairs

ST-1 Item 1 Unanimous Approval

Item 1: Reinstating the Necessary Funding to Allow DSNY to Establish Composting Scrap Drop-Off Sites.

WHEREAS: The Mayor has proposed drastic budget cuts to DSNY in the upcoming FY23 budget; and

**WHEREAS:** Dropoff sites at greenmarkets and at various sites in Community District 8 will encourage individuals to compost; and

WHEREAS: Increased composting is important for the environment; and

**WHEREAS:** Increased composting will minimize garbage disposal and therefore decrease rats and strewn garbage;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED,** that CB8M urges the City Council and the Mayor to reinstate necessary funding to allow DSNY to establish composting scrap drop-off sites.

Community Board 8 Manhattan unanimously approved this resolution by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention and 0 not voting for cause

e) Zoning & Development Committee – Elizabeth Ashby and Anthony Cohn, Co-Chairs

**ZD-1** Item 3 Approval **ZD-2** Item 5 Motion to Table

### Item 3: Governor's Proposal to Lift Restriction on Allowable Residential FAR

WHEREAS, On January 18, 2022, Governor Kathy Hochul proposed an amendment to the New York State Multiple Dwelling Law with the stated purpose: "to return to New York City authority with respect to the floor-area ratio limit on residential density;" and

WHEREAS, the stated justification for the amendment is that the proposed budget "supports an increase in the supply of housing to combat rising housing costs and homelessness"; and

WHEREAS, the New York State Multiple Dwelling law as amended by chapter 748 of the laws of 1961 established a maximum Floor Area Ratio (FAR) of 12.0 for all Residential Buildings in New York State; and

**WHEREAS**, the text of the amendment removes the limitation only to cities with populations greater than 1,000,000 persons; and

**WHEREAS**, New York City is the only city in New York State with a population in excess of 1,000,000; and

**WHEREAS,** the population density of New York City is over 31,000 persons per square mile per the 2020 Census), making it the most densely populated city in the United States; and

**WHEREAS**, only five other US cities (with a population of over 500,000) have a population density of even 10,000 persons per square mile; and

**WHEREAS**, if enacted, the proposed amendment would allow New York City to increase the floor area of residential buildings without limit by removing the current limitations; and

WHEREAS, if enacted, the proposal would become effective in 180 days with no specified end date; and

WHEREAS, if enacted, the proposed amendment would impose no conditions that might encourage the creation of affordable housing; and

WHEREAS, if enacted, the proposed amendment would impose no conditions that might combat rising housing prices; and

WHEREAS, if enacted, the proposed amendment contains no language or provisions that would combat homelessness; and

WHEREAS, the proposal contains no mechanism for augmenting services and city infrastructure to accommodate additional residential density; therefore be it

**RESOLVED**, That Community Board Eight **opposes** the proposed Budget Bill (S8006-A and A9006-A) PART CC: "AMENDMENT TO THE MULTIPLE DWELLING LAW"; and be it further

**RESOLVED**, That Community Board Eight urges our State and City legislators to oppose the proposed bill and demands that Governor Hochul withdraw this bill from the State Budget.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 27 in favor, 14 opposed, 0 abstention and 0 not voting for cause

Item 5: Use Of Restaurant At 220 E 81st Street As A Catering Facility

Community Board 8 Manhattan tabled this resolution by a vote of 27 in favor, 14 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

f) Street Life Committee - Abraham Salcedo, Chair

SL-1 Items 1a,1b,2a & 2c Unanimous Approval

SL-2 Item 2b Approval

Item 1a: York Avenue Senior Care LLC, dba The Bristal at York Avenue, 1622 York Avenue (Between 85th and 86th Streets) - New Application and Temporary Retail Permit for Liquor, Wine, Beer & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls; therefore

**BE IT RESOLVED** that the application is APPROVED, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1b: Copri Corp, dba Cacio E Pepe, 1479 York Avenue (Between 78th and 79th Streets) – Expansion into Municipal Property

WHEREAS this is a New application for use of municipal space; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls; therefore

**BE IT RESOLVED** that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 2a: 85th & 3rd LLC, dba Emmy Squared, 1426 Third Avenue (Between 80th and 81st Streets) - Corporate Change Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer & Cider

WHEREAS this is a corporate change application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls; therefore

**BE IT RESOLVED** that the application is **APPROVED**, **subject to the stipulations above**.

Item 2c: Madison Global LLC, dba Nello, 696 Madison Avenue (Between 62nd and 63rd Streets) – Corporate Change Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a corporate change application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

**WHEREAS** the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls; therefore

**BE IT RESOLVED** that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Community Board 8 Manhattan unanimously approved these resolutions by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

Item 2b: 60<sup>th</sup> Street LLC, dba The Jeffrey, 311 East 60th Street (Between First and Second Avenues) – Alteration Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer & Cider

WHEREAS this is an alteration application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is APPROVED, subject to the stipulations above.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 38 in favor, 3 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause

10. Old Business

11. New Business

Russell Squire, Chair

Name	Attendance	YEL-1 Items 1&2	TR-1: Item 1	LM-1: Item 1	LM-2 Item 2	LM-3 Item 3	ST-1 Item 1	ZD-1: Item 3	ZD-2: Item 5 Motion to Table	SL-1: Items 1a,1b,2a,2c	SL-2: Item 2b
ARONSON, VANESSA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
ASHBY, ELIZABETH	Present	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
BARON, P. GAYLE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
BARTON, LOWELL	Absent-										
BIRNBAUM, MICHELE	Present	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
BORES, LORI ANN	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
BORRERO, TAINA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
BROWN, LORAINE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
CAMP, ALIDA	Present	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
CHU, SARAH	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
COHN, ANTHONY	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
COLEMAN, SAUNDREA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
DANGOOR, REBECCA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
FARBER, FELICE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
FREELAND, BILL	Absent										
HARTZOG, EDWARD	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
HELPERN, DAVID P.	Present	Yes	Yes	Xes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
JOHNSON, WILMA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
KRIKER, PAUL	Present	Yes	No	Ves	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
LADER, CRAIG	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
LAMORTE, REBECCA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Ves	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MASON, VALERIE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
MEYERSON, EVAN	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Xes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MORRIS, GREGORY	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
PARSHALL, JANE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PATCH, PETER	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
PHILIPS, JOHN	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Tes Ver	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
PIERSON-PANES, HARRISON	Absent	Ies	ies	Tes	Tes	res	Tes	INO	Tes	Tes	Tes
POPE-MARSHALL, SHARON	Absent-										
POPPER, RITA	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Vas	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PRICE, MARGARET	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Voo	ites	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
RODRIGUEZ-THOMA, YMA	Absent-	Tes	ies	Tes	NO	les	Tes	Tes	NO	Tes	Tes
ROSE, ELIZABETH		Vag	Vac	Abst	No	Vag	Vac	Voc	No	Vec	Vac
RUDDER, BARBARA	Present Present	Yes	Yes Yes	Yes	Yes	Vag	Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes	Yes Yes	Yes
SALCEDO, ABRAHAM	Present	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Tes	Yes	Tes	Tes	Tes	Tes
SALCEDO, ABRAHAM SANCHEZ, WILLIAM	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SCHNEIDER, M. BARRY	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
SIGAL, RAMI	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
SPAGNOLETTI, COS	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Vac	Yes	Yes	Yes
SQUIRE, RUSSELL	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
STRONG-SHINOZAKI, LYNNE	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
TAMAYO, MARCO	Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Vor	Yes	No	Yes	No
TEJO, CAROLINA		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	105	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
WALD, ADAM	Present Present	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NO	Yes	Yes	Yes
WALD, ADAM WALSH, ELAINE											
WALSH, ELAINE WARREN, CHARLES	Present Present	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No
WEINER, SHARON	Present	Yes	Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes Yes	Yes Yes	Yes No	Yes	Yes No
,			1			1				Yes	
Total Yes	42	42	39	37	36	42	42	27	27	41	38
Total No		0	3	4	6	0	0	14	14	0	3
Total Abstain		0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Not Vote For Cause		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Votes		42	42	42	42	42	42	41	41	41	41