

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
February 14, 2022 – 6:30PM
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, February 16, 2022**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

AGENDA

CB8 Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpert, and Marco Tamayo. Public member Kimberly Selway was also present. Alida Camp and Jane Parshall's absences were excused.

Resolutions for Consideration:

Items 1-3: Approval

1. **112 East 75th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Beyer Blinder Belle Architects & Planners LLP* – A modern style building designed by Schuman & Lichtenstein and erected 1964-1968. Application is for an addition to enclose an open-air space and for window replacement.

WHEREAS 112 East 75th Street is a modernist building in the brutalist style;

WHEREAS 112 East 75th Street was built for and remains Temple Israel;

WHEREAS the major design element is an elliptical drum oriented on the diagonal on the site, and set back from the property line;

WHEREAS the drum rises through a three-story rectilinear mass that aligns with the property line;

WHEREAS the rectilinear floor above the drum, the building's second floor, is set back from the building line to create a playground terrace;

WHEREAS the drum rises above the second floor for another two floors;

WHEREAS the three-story rectilinear mass, with its limestone facing, hovers over the dark void in front of the drum;

WHEREAS the ground floor of the drum is the main sanctuary;

WHEREAS the Temple had a fence with three gates installed to provide security, but easy access and egress when needed;

WHEREAS the lobby was under-sized for the sanctuary;

WHEREAS the unenclosed space in front of the drum could only be used in warm weather;

WHEREAS the Temple needed a larger lobby and gathering space for events;

WHEREAS the Temple proposed to enclose the outdoor space under the rectilinear mass to provide the needed space;

WHEREAS the new interior space will be enclosed with a ballistic-rated glass wall set 1'-6" back from the property line to create the needed multipurpose lobby/event space;

WHEREAS the glass wall is separated from the limestone mass above with a continuous dark bronze louver;

WHEREAS the setback of the glass wall maintains the shadow line of the original design;

WHEREAS all of the glass is clear except for spandrel glass at the eastern end for the mechanical space and the western end for the security booth;

WHEREAS the glass panels are framed with dark bronze mullions aligning with the joints in the lowest course of limestone above;

WHEREAS there is a new main entrance to the West and a secondary entrance for service and egress to the east;

WHEREAS there is a vertical bulletin board enclosure between the main entrance and security booth;

WHEREAS the color of the spandrel panels is dark bronze with linear graphics that include the Star of David;

WHEREAS the bulletin board will have a surface for pinning and will not have an LED screen;

WHEREAS there will be a dark gray, flamed "Picasso" granite base under the glass wall;

WHEREAS the sidewalk in front of the glass wall will be lit from above with strip LED lighting;

WHEREAS the granite base and transitions within the vestibules navigate the changes in elevation from the sloping sidewalk to the ground floor level within the new enclosure;

WHEREAS the glass in the new wall will have a Low-E coating that will contribute to the feeling of the original void;

WHEREAS the glass will be transparent at night thereby making the interior and events within more visible than during the day;

WHEREAS night lighting when there is no major occupancy will be at a low level of illumination;

WHEREAS the original Temple Israel sign with pinned letters on the limestone face with a serif font will be replaced with a sign with pinned letters with a sans serif font;

WHEREAS there will be a small sign on the full glass panel to the east of the main entrance as the sign on the limestone is not easily seen from oblique angles;

WHEREAS the windows in the upper setback floor and the windows in the drum will be replaced with windows that will appear almost the same as the existing and will follow the pattern of the existing windows;

WHEREAS all new windows will be thermally broken and have insulated glass;

WHEREAS all the windows on the second floor are operable;

WHEREAS the windows on the setback floor are currently a combination of a fixed panel at the top, an awning in the middle, and a hopper at the bottom;

WHEREAS the new windows will have almost the same proportioning of the glass, but the awning and hopper will be combined into one awning window to enable an accessible reach;

WHEREAS the frames and horizontal mullions will be generally slightly larger than the existing, there will be a reduction in glass area of 9.5 % to 12% depending on the width of the window;

WHEREAS there are currently two glass doors to the terrace;

WHEREAS there will be three glass doors to provide access to the terrace from all three classrooms abutting the terrace;

WHEREAS the windows on the third and fourth floors alternate between fixed glazing and operable windows;

WHEREAS the existing and proposed operable windows are essentially the same as the windows on the second floor;
WHEREAS there will be a reduction of glass area of 6% in the new operable windows on the third and fourth floors;
WHEREAS the proposed enclosure of the space at grade meets the program needs of the synagogue while maintaining the spirit and intent of the original design;
WHEREAS the changes in the proportions of the proposed window replacements will be almost imperceptible;
WHEREAS the proposed changes to the building complement the original design;
WHEREAS the proposed improvements to the building are appropriate within the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

7 In Favor: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpem, Tamayo)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Selway)

2. **18 East 68th Street (Upper East Side Historic District)** – *Steven B. Jacobs Group PC* – A Beaux-Arts Style building designed by Cass Gilbert and erected 1904-1905. Application is for installation of two ornamental lion figures at the front entry stoop and installation of a cast iron gate at the front stoop to match the existing wrought iron fencing at the front areaway.

WHEREAS 18 East 68th Street was restored under a different application;
WHEREAS 18 East 68th is a limestone building with limestone plinth blocks set symmetrically either side of the main entry steps;
WHEREAS there is no record of the elements that were on top of the plinth blocks at the time the building was constructed;
WHEREAS the original drawings indicate the possibility of urns having been on top of the plinth blocks;
WHEREAS the applicant would prefer to have a pair of lion sculptures instead of urns framing the entrance steps to the house;
WHEREAS there are precedents for lions in the neighborhood;
WHEREAS the applicant proposes to install two bronze casts of lions made in Thailand;
WHEREAS each bronze lion is 33 inches high by 13.5 inches wide;
WHEREAS the applicant requires a gate at the front steps to make clear that this is a private residence;
WHEREAS the gate will preclude passersby from sitting on the steps of a private residence;
WHEREAS the gate will span across a step as the steps and areaway extend beyond the property line;
WHEREAS the gate will replicate the ornamental design of the areaway fence;
WHEREAS the fence will be made of wrought iron and painted black;
WHEREAS the proposed lions and gate are contextual in the historic district;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

6 In Favor: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpem, Tamayo)

1 Opposed: (Cohn)

1 Public Member in Favor: (Selway)

3. **965 Fifth Avenue (Upper East Side Historic District)** – Oliver Cope, Architect – A Classic Modern Style building designed by Irving Margon and constructed in 1937. Application is to replace windows on the rear façade.

WHEREAS the applicant has proposed the combination of two apartments on the 12th floor of a contributing building in the Upper East Side Historic District;
WHEREAS the resulting changes to the floorplan calls for certain changes to window location;
WHEREAS all but two of the openings are only minimally visible from the public way;
WHEREAS all new windows will visually replicate the predominant and historic windows on the Fifth Avenue façade (which will not be altered in any way), and the proposed terrace doors will replicate the material, color and pattern of an existing terrace door adjacent;
WHEREAS 965 Fifth Avenue has no LPC approved Window Replacement Master Plan;
WHEREAS all new windows and terrace doors will fill existing masonry openings except for two new terrace doors near the northeast corner of the building;
WHEREAS one of the two new terrace doors will require moving its masonry opening 12” to the north;
WHEREAS the masonry opening for the remaining terrace door will be moved 15” to the south, taking it out of alignment with the window on the floor above;
WHEREAS all new windows and terrace doors except the aforementioned terrace door whose opening is moving 15” were approved by the LPC at staff level;
WHEREAS the applicant seeks a Certificate of Appropriateness for the location of this terrace door;
WHEREAS window alignment from floor to floor on the building façade in question (east) is nonexistent;
WHEREAS an existing (and to be retained) retractable awning further compromises any continuity of openings in the east façade;
WHEREAS the proposed changes do not substantively alter neither the original design nor its current condition;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented;

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that this Board urges 965 Fifth Avenue to pursue a Window Replacement Master Plan incorporating a requirement that all new windows adhere to the type, material, color and layout of the original and historic windows of the Fifth Avenue façade.

7 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Tamayo)
1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

David Helpern and Joan Parshall, Co-Chairs