

Russell Squire  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Congestion Pricing Task Force  
Tuesday, December 2, 2021  
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

*Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.*

**Minutes**

**Board Members Present:** Rit Aggarwala, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Lori Bores, Alida Camp, Rebecca Dangoor, Billy Freeland, Craig Lader, Russell Squire

**Resolution for Approval**

**Item 4 - Representation of Manhattan Residents on Transit Mobility Review Board**

*The meeting was called to order at 6:32 PM.*

**Item 1: Replica Presentation - Travel Demand Modeling for NYC Congestion Pricing and Analysis of Policy Scenarios, Including those Suggested by the Congestion Pricing Task Force**

Replica, a mobility data analysis and travel demand modeling company, opened the meeting with a presentation of data it analyzed on commuting patterns and socioeconomic factors that may influence the Task Force's recommendations. It focused on transportation within Community District 8 (CD8) and to and from the Central Business District zoned for congestion pricing, based on questions solicited by the Task Force at the November 16 Task Force Meeting. Steve Turell, Chief of Staff for Replica, presented data in response to questions posed by the Task Force following the November 2021 meeting.

Replica developed their presentation as a courtesy to CB8; Replica's clients are primarily public sector customers, including the MTA, though they are not involved in determining public policy. They provide detailed travel data to demonstrate a typical day in any season (Places) and trends in travel and economic behavior (Trends). Replica uses a simulation-based approach that does not compromise privacy and enables use of a variety of data sources, including census, consumer marketing, credit card transaction, and mobile location data. All data is de-identified, meaning that no person can be identified individually from Replica's data outputs.

Replica's presentation to CB8 used data to analyze a typical Fall 2019 day. While Replica answered many of the Task Force's questions, the data does not allow for analysis information on a variety of subjects that was asked about, including distinguishing between on-street versus garage parking activity and breaking out trips specially related to medical visits and to the major medical facilities, or trips taken by ambulance. Replica also made clear that they models aren't predictive and can't generate estimates on future potential scenarios, such as how different toll rates would impact congestion within CB8. It was noted that for the purposes of the analysis performed, two people in a car count as two trips, Commercial trucks, are counted but not drivers' residences, and although Replica categorizes data based on employment using the federal NCAIS system, all public employees are treated together as public employees. Length of time in a car determined whether Replica counts it as a trip.

The complete presentation is available on the CB8 website. The following are highlights of the presentation

### Community District 8 Profile, Modal Split Data and General Origin/Destination Data

- Community District 8 contains approximately 210,000 residents in approximately 110,000 households; 50% of CB8 residents are part of households earning over \$150,000/year.
- Approximately 35% of Community Board 8 residents are part of households that have access to a car.
- The percentage of car ownership by household income level was variable. 45% of people in households with incomes over \$150,000 had access to a car, while 28% of residents with incomes between \$75,000 and \$150,000 and 19% of residents in households with income levels below \$75,000 had access to a car.
- On the typical day Replica modeled, CB8 residents make an average of 3-4 trips per day. Over 80% of trips are made by public transportation or walking; about 5% were made by private automobile. The average trip length was just under 9 miles, while the median trip length was about 1 ½ miles.
- While the number of trips made in private vehicles by CB8 residents was generally around 5% across all income levels, over 8% trips were made for work purposes by persons with higher incomes, compared to just fewer than 5% for lower income households. For trips made by taxi/for hire vehicles such as Uber and Lyft, 8.6% were made by people in higher income households of over \$150,000, while it was 3.6% for people from households with incomes below \$75,000.
- CB8 residents made about 720,000 daily trips across all modes. 40% of these trips both started and finished within CB8; 22% were destined for the Central Business District (CBD) of Manhattan below 60<sup>th</sup> Street, with the same percentage coming into CB8 from the CBD. About 4% ended elsewhere in Manhattan, 6% in other boroughs, and the remainder outside of NYC.
- Among trips done by car, CB8 residents made about 37,000 daily trips. About 6,000 (16%) were entirely within CB8, and about 5,500 (14%) were destined for the CBD where congestion tolls would be in effect. 2,500 trips (7%) were destined for other boroughs. Notably, a much larger number of trips were destined to locations outside of NYC, including Nassau County (2,900, or 8%), New Jersey (2,500, or 7%) Westchester (1,500, or 4%), and locations beyond Westchester or New Jersey (5,300, or 14%).
- The predominant trip purpose for people taking cars was to go to/from work, with about 65% of all vehicular trips having a distance of over 4 miles.
- 240,000 vehicle trips started, ended or passed through the Community District 8 local street network (excluding the FDR Drive), with 55,000 being made by CB8 residents;
- Half of all vehicular trips using local roads within Community District 8 were made by Taxis or for-hire vehicle companies; the remaining were split evenly between private automobile trips and commercial vehicle trips;
- Vehicular trips using local roads within Community District 8 saw relatively consistent levels of activity every hour of the day between 7AM and 7PM, with only slight peaks in the 8AM, 5PM and 6PM hours
- Of the 240,000 daily trips using local streets within Community District 8, 34,000 of these trips started and ended within Community District
- While the majority of vehicular trips on CB8 local roads were either destined for work or home, nearly 25% of trips were for commercial purposes
- Just under 200,000 people go to jobs in Community District 8; of these, roughly 30,000 use a vehicle to go to work (including taxis and for-hire vehicles)
- Among all 240,000 vehicular trips using the Community District 8 local street network (including taxis and for-hire vehicles), 100,000 started and 100,000 ended in Community District 8. 12,000 trips started in Community District 7; 10,000 ended in Community District 11.

### Community District 8 and Region-wide Trips to/from the Central Business District

- Of the 240,000 daily trips using local streets within Community District 8, 34,000 are going to the CBD, with the majority of these trips occurring between 7AM and 10AM;
- Of these 34,000 trips destined for the CBD from Community District 8, only 2,000 (6%) are destined for locations between 50<sup>th</sup> Street and 60<sup>th</sup> Street east of 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue
- Approximately 6-8% are going to a destination north of 60 Street, peaking in the PM rush hour.
- 92,000 Community District 8 residents made approximately 160,000 trips that end in the CBD. Approximately 90% of trips were by public transportation or walking. About 3.5% of the trips were made by car. About 50% of the trips were for work purposes.

- From Community District 8 into CBD, about 5,500 residents traveled by private car into CBD using about 2,000 unique cars, excluding taxis and Uber/Lyfts. About half of the residents taking these trips are in households earning over \$200,000/year.
- Approximately 5.5 million trips, made by 2.5 million people, end in the CBD. Of those trips, about 1.1 million (20%) were taken by either car (including driver and passenger), taxi, Uber/Lyft, and commercial trucks.
- Of the 1.1 million vehicular trips headed to the CBD, about 120,000 (12%) pass through CD8 – among these 120,000 trips, 86,000 (72%) remain on the FDR Drive and don't enter the street network within CD8; the remaining 34,000 (28%) do enter the street network.
- Most trips originate in Manhattan.
- Of trips that start, end, or pass through CD8, most of the approximately 66% of trips that start in Manhattan originate in CD8. Of trips that end in Manhattan, most trips that start, end, or pass through CD8, end in CD11, to the north of CD8.
- Replica does not have precise information on residents who use cars but don't own cars. On a given day, it was estimated that approximately 25% of residents take trips in cars, including 11% that use taxis.

### Queensboro Bridge Trips

- 150,000 daily trips occur on the Queensboro trips, made by 120,000 unique people; There are 88,000 westbound trips compared to 62,000 eastbound trips.
- 56,000 (or 46%) of trips on the Queensboro Bridge are made by people who do not live in NYC.
- Approximately 4% of trip takers (4,400) are residents of CB8, who have a median household income of \$180,000.
- Trips by CB8 residents who use the Queensboro Bridge peak in the PM rush hour.
- Data is available on Replica's site about who uses the Queensboro Bridge because they have a preference for driving versus those who use public transportation because they live too far from a transit stop or it doesn't operate with enough service where they live.

Follow-up questions from meeting attendees included questions regarding how Replica included residents who live off the grid or didn't own a cell phone, and whether scooters are included. Replica's data collection from multiple sources and simulation-based modeling mitigates the issues of off-the-grid living. It was also noted that the number of people in Replica's studies correspond to the number of people counted by the census. A question was asked pertaining to equity and whether it would be possible to break down trips into the CBD into smaller income differentials, such as \$60,000-75,000 and below \$60,000 since persons with incomes under \$60,000 are eligible for tax credits under the Congestion Pricing law.

Replica also shared some data from their "Trends" product. Looking at car trips, 2021 use exceeds that in 2020, but is less than 2019 usage overall. Public transportation has not shown the same level of recovery as car trips but has accelerated in recent months. Also in 2021, retail was higher, for example, than pre-COVID timeframes.

Replica will provide further information on a variety of questions asked, which will be posted on the CB8 website. The additional data requested included:

- Data for trips made by Roosevelt Island residents, including destinations and amount of trips made by mode
- Specific origin/destinations of trips using the Queensboro Bridge
- Modal split breakdown for people in households with incomes below \$60,000, and between \$60,000 and \$75,000
- Age breakdown of persons making vehicular trips into the Congestion Zone

### **Item 2: Recap of any new developments from the State, City or MTA**

The MTA announced a second round of public meetings focused on environmental justice communities, with the meeting focused on New York State scheduled for December 7<sup>th</sup> at 6PM.

Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer announced her recommendation that Christine Berthet, a former Community Board 4 First Vice Chair and Transportation Committee Co-Chair, be appointed to the Traffic Mobility Review Board.

### **Item 3: Continuing Discussion of Congestion Pricing Concerns Specific to Stakeholders in the Immediate Vicinity of the 60<sup>th</sup> Street Toll Zone Boundary**

A recurring theme of discussions regarding the toll boundary zone related to the manner in which vehicles using the Queensboro Bridge will be tolled, and if there will be any distinction between access/egress points based on the 60<sup>th</sup> street boundary, or whether all users of the bridge will be tolled. There continued to be some uncertainty regarding whether the toll boundary will include 60<sup>th</sup> Street, though it was noted that the public meetings held in September/October used the phrase “inclusive of 60<sup>th</sup> Street”.

There were concerns raised that an inconsistent approach to tolling the Queensboro Bridge could have significant ramifications regarding congestion in the blocks immediately north of the boundary; a CB8 member raised the notion as to whether it would be in CB8’s interest to recommend tolling the Queensboro Bridge to avoid disrupting traffic patterns that may derive from a 60<sup>th</sup> street boundary near the bridge. Crashmapper data presented at the December 1<sup>st</sup> Transportation Committee meeting showed that there are more accidents in the East 60’s than on streets further north. If the Bridge were tolled the impact on Roosevelt Island residents and businesses would need to be examined, and there would need to be assurances that any fees assessed would be either the actual congestion fee of offset against the total fee a driver would otherwise be charged for driving below 60<sup>th</sup> Street.

Concerns were also raised about how to help small businesses deal with the impacts of the tolls, both for their customers and their vendors performing deliveries. Also noted was the prevalence of road construction in this area, and how impacts of such activities will be mitigated if there is significant congestion along certain streets near the boundary zone. The issue of the timing of congestion pricing implementation, given that New York is still recovering from economic and other consequences of the pandemic, was also raised.

Parking near the boundary continues to be a concern. However, there is some comfort in Replica’s data that shows of the 34,000 trips that pass through CD8 on local streets, only about 2,000 are private vehicles with a destination between 50<sup>th</sup> and 60<sup>th</sup> Streets east of Fifth Avenue, which is the most likely destination of any vehicles that would be most likely to park near the boundary where drivers finish their trip by walking into the congestion zone. Whether other cars will seek to park and continue to further destinations is unknown.

Although a question was raised about whether the City Charter requires one free access between the boroughs and Manhattan, information was provided to debunk that theory.

### **Item 4: Initial Discussion on Credits/Discounts/Exemptions**

Given the extensive amount of information provided in the Replica presentation, the Task Force decided to defer discussion of credits/discounts/exemptions to the next meeting. As the function of Traffic Mobility Review Board was being noted, a member suggested that the Task Force formally support the recommendation of Borough President Gale Brewer to nominate Christine Berthet to the TMRB, and a brief bio of Ms. Berthet was read aloud.

The following resolution was then put forward by CB8M:

**WHEREAS;** Community Board 8 has resolved that two Manhattan residents, one south of 60 Street and one north of 60 Street be appointed to the Transit Mobility Review Board; and  
**WHEREAS;** the congestion pricing zone is to be located in Manhattan, from 60<sup>th</sup> Street southward; and  
**WHEREAS;** Manhattan below 60 Street is home to about 685,000 residents; and  
**WHEREAS;** the issues facing Manhattan residents residing north and south of 60 street are unique to Manhattan; and

**WHEREAS;** the interests of residents below 60 Street and in the districts bordering the Congestion Pricing Zone boundary will not be adequately represented by Traffic Review Mobility Board members who do not reside in Manhattan; and

**WHEREAS;** inclusion of Manhattan residents on the Traffic Review Mobility Board to represent the interests of Manhattan residents and businesses is essential; and

**WHEREAS;** Borough President Gale Brewer has nominated Christine Berthet to be appointed to the TMRB; and

**WHEREAS;** Christine Berthet's bio, attached, states that Ms. Berthet was a former Chair of CB4, is co-chair of CB4's Transportation Committee, among other qualifications for appointment to the Traffic review Mobility Board; and

**WHEREAS;** Christine Berthet is a resident of Manhattan, below 60 Street; and

**WHEREAS;** the issues for residents and businesses south of 60 Street are not the same as for residents and businesses north of 60 Street; and

**WHEREAS;** Community District 8 borders the congestion pricing zone; and

**WHEREAS;** private cars, taxis, for hire vehicles, commercial trucks pass through CB8 to a destination within the congestion pricing zone; and

**WHEREAS;** residents and businesses located at or proximate to the boundary of the congestion pricing zone will be impacted in unique ways;

**BE IT RESOLVED** that Community Board 8 endorses Borough President Gale Brewer's nomination of Christine Berthet to the Traffic Review Mobility Board and recommends Ms. Berthet's appointment to the TRMB;

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** that Community Board 8 continues to call for the appointment of a resident living north of 60 Street in Manhattan to the TRMB.

**Opposed: 0**

**In Favor (5): Aggarwala, Camp, Dangoor, Freeland, Lader.**

**Abstain (1): Birnbaum**

#### **Item 5: Determination of Next Steps**

The next meeting will continue the discussion on boundary zone issues and further delve into credits/discounts/exemptions. Replica will provide some further information that was requested as follow-ups.

#### **Item 6: Old & New Business**

There was no old or new business discussed.

*There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:38PM.*

Respectfully submitted,

*Alida Camp & Craig Lader, Co-Chairs*