Russell Squire Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com – Website info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

The City of New York Community Board 8 Manhattan Full Board & Land Use Committee Meeting PUBLIC HEARING Wednesday, November 17, 2021 - 6:30 PM Conducted Remotely via Zoom

MINUTES:

Community Board Members Present: Rohit Aggarwala, Vanessa Aronson, Elizabeth Ashby, P. Gayle Baron, Lowell Barton, Michele Birnbaum, Lori Ann Bores, Taina Borrero, Lorraine Brown, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, Saundrea Coleman, Rebecca Dangoor, Felice Farber, Billy Freeland, Edward Hartzog, David Helpern, Wilma Johnson, Craig Lader, Rebecca Lamorte, May Malik, Valerie Mason, Evan Meyerson, Gregory Morris, Jane Parshall, Harrison Pierson-Panes, Peter Patch, John Philips, Margaret Price, Sharon Pope-Marshall, Rita Popper, Elizabeth Rose, Barbara Rudder, Abraham Salcedo, William Sanchez, M. Barry Schneider, Tricia Shimamura, Lynne Strong-Shinozaki, Rami Sigal, Cos Spagnoletti, Russell Squire, Marco Tamayo, Carolina Tejo, Yma Rodriguez-Thoma, Adam Wald, Elaine Walsh, Charles Warren, and Sharon Weiner.

Total Attendance: 49

Chairman Russell Squire called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

- 1. **Public Session** Those who wish to speak during the Public Session must register to do so by 6:45 pm.
 - Council Member-elect Julie Menin introduced herself to the community as the newly elected council member for the 5th District of the NYC Council.
 - Marty Bell spoke on his opposition to the Blood Center Rezoning and thanked the board and community for their support.
 - Elaine Walsh, representing the East 86th Street Merchants Association, spoke on her opposition to the Blood Center Rezoning and related NYC Council actions that week.
 - Anthony Cohn, representing himself, spoke on his opposition to the Blood Center rezoning.
 - Alida Camp, representing herself, spoke on her opposition to the Blood Center rezoning.
 - Valerie Mason, representing the East 72nd Street Neighborhood Association, spoke on her opposition to the Blood Center rezoning and the community's efforts.
 - Liat Hotz spoke in support of NY Senate Bill 189, which would require eating disorder prevention courses in grades 5-12.
 - Yma Rodriguez-Thoma, representing the Normandy Court Tenant Association, invited the board and the community to attend a press conference that weekend to highlight affordable housing issues at Normandy Court and around NYC.
 - Lo van der Valk, representing Carnegie Hill Neighbors, spoke in support of 1060 Park Avenue Landmark's Application, and his opposition against the Blood Center rezoning.
 - Council Member Ben Kallos thanked the board and community for eight years of support during
 his Council tenure, gave a report on various initiatives occurring in his office, and spoke about
 the Blood Center rezoning.
 - Sharon Pope-Marshall, speaking as the Executive Director of Civitas, spoke on her opposition to the Blood Center and suggested to the board and community to petition all NYC Council members.

- Wendy Machaver spoke on her opposition to the Blood Center rezoning, the loss of amenities
 that would occur, and asked the Community Board and the community to petition all NYC
 Council members.
- 2. Adoption of the Agenda Agenda Adopted
- 3. Adoption of the Minutes Minutes Adopted
- 4. Manhattan Borough President's Report

Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer reported on her latest initiatives.

6. Elected Officials' Reports

Elected officials or their representatives reported on their latest initiatives.

- 1. Council Member Ben Kallos
- 2. State Senator Liz Krueger
- 3. Assembly Member Rebecca Seawright
- 4. Assembly Member Dan Quart
- 5. State Senator Jose Serrano

7. Chair's Report – Russell Squire

Chair Russell Squire gave his report.

8. District Manager's Report – Will Brightbill

District Manager Will Brightbill gave his report.

- 9. Election of Community Board 8 Officers:
 - a. Chair Edward Hartzog
 - b. Chair Russell Squire*
 - c. First Vice Chair Peter Patch
 - d. First Vice Chair Tricia Shimamura*
 - e. Second Vice Chair Valerie Mason*
 - f. Second Vice Chair Abraham Salcedo
 - g. Secretary Anthony Cohn
 - h. Secretary Saundrea I. Coleman*
 - i. Secretary Rebecca Dangoor*
 - j. Secretary Rami Sigal*

Russell Squire was re-elected Chair. The vote was 33 for Russell Squire, 14 for Ed Hartzog, 2 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Tricia Shimamura was re-elected First Vice Chair. The vote was 35 for Tricia Shimamura, 12 for Peter Patch, 2 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Valerie Mason was re-elected Second Vice Chair. The vote was 43 for Valerie Mason, 2 for Abraham Salcedo, 3 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Saundrea I. Coleman, Rebecca Dangoor, and Rami Sigal were elected Secretaries. The vote was 36 for Saundrea I. Coleman, 41 for Rebecca Dangoor, 30 for Rami Sigal, 23 for Anthony Cohn, 14 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

^{*}Indicates Elected Winner

10. Committee Reports and Action Items

a. Landmarks Committee – David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs

LM-1: Items 1 - Approval

Item 1: 1060 Park Avenue (Park Avenue Historic District) – Jennifer Gerakaris presenting for Peter Pennoyer – A Colonial Revival style apartment building designed by J.E.R. Carpenter and constructed in 1922-1924. Application is to enlarge a penthouse.

WHEREAS 1060 Park Avenue is a colonial revival style apartment building designed by J.E.R. Carpenter and constructed 1922-1924;

WHEREAS the stair egress from the interior portion of the penthouse is not legally compliant; the application is to correct the noncompliance;

WHEREAS the proposed enlargement is minimally visible from the public way at the corner of 87th Street and Madison Avenue;

WHEREAS to access the existing egress door to the terrace requires passage though the living quarters of the apartment; the applicant proposes to correct this by increasing the footprint of the existing extension to the penthouse by 65' to create a new vestibule;

WHEREAS the purpose of the vestibule (the proposed enlargement) is to separate the stairwell from the apartment;

WHEREAS the new vestibule will provide a pathway from the staircase to the terrace by means of a small hallway with a new door to the terrace thus correcting the existing egress from the staircase;

WHEREAS the overall height of the enlargement will increase from 9'5" be 10'3 1/2"; lifting the existing part of the previously angled roof so that the entire roof of the penthouse presents as flat:

WHEREAS the width of the enlargement will be 5'11";

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to change the cladding for the entire penthouse, including the enlargement from the existing light gray stucco to a red brick colored stucco;

WHEREAS the proposed penthouse enlargement is a logical response to the existing fire code safety violation issue at a small cost of very minimal visibility;

WHEREAS the penthouse enlargement is appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 47 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

b. Parks and Waterfront Committee - Barry Schneider and Tricia Shimamura, Co-Chairs

PW-1: Item 1- Approval

PW-2: Item 2- Approval

PW-3: Item 3 - Approval

PW-4: Item 4 - Unanimous Approval

PW-1, Item 1: Improvements to the East River Esplanade from E.72 – E. 78 Streets

WHEREAS Hospital for Special Surgery (HSS) has committed to improving the East River Esplanade from 72nd to 78th Streets, and

WHEREAS the proposed design was consistent with the notable and distinct features of the rest of the Esplanade, including the hexagonal pavers, bow railing, native, durable plantings and World's Fair benches, and

WHEREAS both HSS and the Parks Department have agreed to include additional garbage receptacles in their final design, and

WHEREAS Community Board 8 Manhattan recognizes the importance of connectivity along the Esplanade and urges HSS to do everything possible to conduct these beautification efforts as expeditiously as possible in order to return access to the public, and

WHEREAS Community Board 8 Manhattan recognizes the critical role our parks and open spaces play in the City's overall resiliency and therefore urges HSS to utilize the best practices to increase resiliency along the Esplanade, and

WHEREAS this approval is granted on the stipulation that HSS works with the Parks Department to permanently repair the two existing sinkholes at 71st Street, and

WHEREAS this approval is granted on the stipulation that HSS come back to Community Board 8 Manhattan with a plan for continued maintenance for the section between 72nd and 78th street, and

WHEREAS this approval is granted on the stipulation that HSS provides periodic updates on the entire project, therefore

BE IT RESOLVED Community Board 8 Manhattan approves the proposed design of the Esplanade beautification efforts as presented by Hospital for Special Surgery.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 47 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

PW-2, Item 2: Asphalt Green Cooling Tower Replacement

WHEREAS Asphalt Green is working with Zaskorski & Associates Architects to replace its cooling tower with a more energy efficient, functioning cooling machinery, and

WHEREAS Asphalt Green has used materials that help camouflage the machinery to not distract from the neighboring DaKovats playground, and

WHEREAS Asphalt Green plans to install the new cooling tower completely internally without disrupting traffic on the FDR or surrounding streets, therefore

BE IT RESOLVED Community Board 8 Manhattan approves of the planned cooling tower replacement at Asphalt Green.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 47 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention, and 1 not voting for cause.

PW- 3, Item 3: Central Park Conservatory Restoration of the Kinderberg Chess and Checkers House

WHEREAS The Central Park Conservancy will restore the Kinderberg/Chess and Checkers House to improve accessibility and create a public restroom, and

WHEREAS the rustic structure will maintain the mature trees currently at the site, and

WHEREAS the project will increase the amount of seating inside the structure, and

WHEREAS A public restroom will meet the strong demand for a restroom in this portion of the park, and

WHEREAS the project will increase accessibility both for the Chess and Checkers House as well as the Dairy, therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 8 Manhattan approves the proposed restoration of the Kinderberg/Chess & Checkers House as presented.

Community Board 8 Manhattan unanimously approved this resolution by a vote of 48 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

PW-4, Item 4: Vandalism at UES for BLM Vigil

WHEREAS the UES for BLM Vigil has continued in Carl Schurz Park since the Summer of 2020, and

WHEREAS the UES for BLM Vigil offers all visitors a place to reflect on the violent attacks on people of color and has been a place for education and community, and

WHEREAS there continues to be vandalism at this site, including spray-painting, ripped signs, and the smearing of feces on the posters, posing significant health risks and safety concerns for those who have continued to visit and care for the Vigil, and

WHEREAS members of the UES for BLM Vigil have continued to raise concerns about the vandalism taking place at the Vigil, therefore

BE IT RESOLVED Community Board 8 Manhattan strongly condemns the vandalism in the Carl Schurz Park and calls on the Parks Department and the NYPD to do everything they can, including sharing any available video footage of this vandalism broadly, to stop these acts of hate.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 46 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

c. Social Justice Committee - Sarah Chu and Saundrea I. Coleman, Co-Chairs

SJ: Item 1– Approval

Item 1: New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) Reform Proposal from the Community

WHEREAS the EPA defines environmental justice as the "fair treatment and meaningful involvement of all people regardless of race, color, national origin, or income, with respect to the development, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies" and is characterized by having "the same degree of protection from environmental and health hazards" and "equal access to the decision-making process to have a healthy environment in which to live, learn, and work," we believe that it is a form of social justice,

WHEREAS NYCHA residents are our neighbors, and many are first responders who continue to serve our NYC community through COVID, and we are concerned that NYCHA disrepair exposes or exacerbates health conditions among these members of our community. We also acknowledge there is disparities in housing protections between NYCHA residents and non-NYCHA residents,

WHEREAS public health evidence has established that prevention is cheaper and more effective than treatment, we should apply the same philosophy to housing. However, we have let the health of our NYCHA buildings deteriorate, and consequently this impacts the health of NYCHA residents. We believe that the solution to this harm is to commit to a serious course of "treatment" while implementing a "prevention plan" to remediate NYCHA building repairs,

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED we call upon the NYC Council, State legislature, and Congress to prioritize and fully fund NYCHA housing and renovations such that the housing is modernized, and negative health impacts are minimized.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, we call on **Governor Hochul**, the incoming NYC **mayor**, **NYCHA**, and **NYC administration** to address the following urgent issues:

• NYCHA residents are the best experts of their needs and NYCHA should partner with residents to initiate, direct, and implement the future of NYCHA initiatives. Residents

must be empowered to lead and meaningfully integrated in any major decision making, in addition to the CCOP-RAB,

- The next NYCHA Chair should have lived experience with NYCHA housing.
- Prioritize the oversight, monitoring, and enforcement of NYCHA regulations and housing law, including NYCHA's legal responsibility to respond to tickets within 24 hours and complete work as soon as possible to return homes to habitability,
- Implement the recommendations of NYCHA Federal Monitor Bart M. Schwartz as detailed in the reports on the federal monitor's website, https://nychamonitor.com/.
- Prioritize and fully fund NYCHA housing and renovations such that the housing is modernized, and negative health impacts are minimized by starting with the buildings producing the greatest harm.
- Transform ground floor space for commercial purposes to provide residents with needed services and use the profits to support residential programs and repairs.
- Keep people housed when renovations are happening and do not displace them as we believe in the principle that communities need to be kept together,
- Change NYCHA regulations so residents' rights are honored and afforded the same rights as any other tenant.
- Transition to resident management cooperation model for tenant groups that choose to do
- Fund training NYCHA residents on their rights under 24 CFR 964.
- Properly sequence repair work to ensure its efficacy, send out appropriate service providers for the problem (competence), and appropriately conduct all NYCHA building inspections and fully inspect individual apartments before they are transitioned.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED we call on the incoming Manhattan District Attorney to hold NYCHA accountable to the law and investigate corruption and violations of law, audit NYCHA expenditures, and hold vendors and contractors to NYCHA accountable for their contracts.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved this resolution by a vote of 46 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

d. Street Life Committee - Abraham Salcedo, Chair

SL-1: Items 1a - 1h – **Unanimous Approval**

Item 1a: <u>RT Restaurant Inc, dba Rothschild TLV, 1129 Lexington Avenue (Between 78th and 79th Streets)</u> - New Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License but in practice a transfer; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 80% / 20%; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1b: <u>GP & Max LLC, dba Agata & Valentina, 1513 First Avenue.</u> (Between 79th and 80th Streets) - New Application for Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 95% / 5%;

WHEREAS the applicant only operates indoors; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1c: <u>Citadel Cinemas Inc, dba Cinema 123 By Angelika, 1001 Third Avenue (Between 59th and 60th Streets)</u> - New Application for Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 60% / 40%; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is APPROVED, subject to the stipulations above

Item 1d: <u>Maco 205 Corp.</u> dba Campagna Quatrro Gatti, 205 East 81st Street (Between Second and Third Avenues) - New Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Wine, Beer, and Cider License but in practice a transfer; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 85% / 15%; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1e: <u>Taste of Shanghai Restaurant Inc, 242 East 79th Street (Between Second and Third Avenues)</u> - New Application for Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 90% / 10%; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1f: <u>Inspir Carnegie Hill LLC</u>, <u>dba Inspir Carnegie Hil</u>, <u>1802 Second Avenue</u> (<u>Between 93rd and 94th Streets</u>) - New Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls:

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 85% / 15%;

WHEREAS this is an assisted living establishment, and is only for inhouse personnel; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is APPROVED, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1g: <u>Ashhill Inc, 1471 First Avenue (Between 76th and 77th Streets)</u> - New Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS no one from the public objected;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 85% / 15%;

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed NOT to use rear yard, until appropriate approval has been issued; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Item 1h: <u>Lashevet LLC</u>, <u>dba Lashevet</u>, 1663 First Avenue (Between 86th and 87th Streets) - New Application for Liquor, Wine, Beer, & Cider

WHEREAS this is a New application for a Liquor, Wine, Beer, and Cider License; and

WHEREAS no one from the public objected; and

WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to Community Board 8's stipulations concerning delivery bikes and bar crawls;

WHEREAS the food and drink ratio are 90% / 10%;

WHEREAS the applicant only has agreed NOT to use rear yard, until appropriate approval has been issued; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED that the application is **APPROVED**, subject to the stipulations above.

Community Board 8 Manhattan approved these resolutions by a vote of 46 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

- 11. Old Business
- 12. New Business

Name	Attendanc	Oberin Election	ant Vine Chain	ou d'Vine Chain	Committee	G	G	LM-1:	PW-1: Item	DNAV or Various or	PW-3: Item	DVAY 4. VA	SJ-1: Item	
Name	e	Chair Election	1st Vice Chair	2nd Vice Chair	Secretary 1	Secretary 2	Secretary 3	Item 1	1	PW-2: Item 2	3	PW-4: Item 4	1	1h
AGGARWALA, ROHIT	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
ARONSON, VANESSA ASHBY, ELIZABETH	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
- ,	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
BARON, P. GAYLE	Present	Ed Hartzog	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
BARTON, LOWELL	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Anthony Cohn	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
BIRNBAUM, MICHELE	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Anthony Cohn	Rami Sigal	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Abst	Yes	Yes
BORES, LORI ANN	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Abst	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
BORRERO, TAINA	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Abst	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
BROWN, LORAINE	Present	Russell Squire	Peter Patch											
CAMP, ALIDA	Present	Ed Hartzog	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
CHU, SARAH	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
COHN, ANTHONY	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
COLEMAN, SAUNDREA	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
DANGOOR, REBECCA	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
FARBER, FELICE	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
FREELAND, BILL	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
HARTZOG, EDWARD	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Abst	Saundrea I. Coleman	Anthony Cohn	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
HELPERN, DAVID P.	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	NVFC	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
JOHNSON, WILMA	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rami Sigal	Abst	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
LADER, CRAIG	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
LAMORTE, REBECCA	Present	Russell Squire	Abst	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Anthony Cohn	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MALIK, MAY	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MASON, VALERIE	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MEYERSON, EVAN	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
MORRIS, GREGORY	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PARSHALL, JANE	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Abst	Yes
PATCH, PETER	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rami Sigal	Yes	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PHILIPS, JOHN	Present	Abst	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PIERSON-PANES, HARRISON	Present	Russell Squire	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
POPE-MARSHALL, SHARON	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
POPPER, RITA	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
PRICE, MARGARET	Present	Ed Hartzog	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
RODRIGUEZ-THOMA, YMA	Present	Abst	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Abst	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes			
ROSE, ELIZABETH	Present	Russell Squire	Abst	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
RUDDER, BARBARA	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SALCEDO, ABRAHAM	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Abraham Salcedo	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SANCHEZ, WILLIAM	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rami Sigal	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SCHNEIDER, M. BARRY	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SHIMAMURA, TRICIA	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SIGAL, RAMI	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rami Sigal	Rebecca Dangoor	Saundrea I. Coleman	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SPAGNOLETTI, COS	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
SQUIRE, RUSSELL	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
STRONG-SHINOZAKI, LYNNE	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Rami Sigal	Rebecca Dangoor	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
TAMAYO, MARCO	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
TEJO, CAROLINA	Present	Ed Hartzog	Tricia Shimamura	Abraham Salcedo	Abst	Abst	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
WALD, ADAM	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Anthony Cohn	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
WALSH, ELAINE	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Abst	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
WARREN, CHARLES	Present	Russell Squire	Tricia Shimamura	Valerie Mason	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Rami Sigal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
WEINER, SHARON	Present	Ed Hartzog	Peter Patch	Valerie Mason	Anthony Cohn	Saundrea I. Coleman	Rebecca Dangoor	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Total Yes		0	0	0	0	0	0	47	47	47	48	46	45	46
Total No		0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total Abstain		2	2	3	1	3	10	0	1	0	0	1	1	0
Total Not Vote For Cause		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0
Total Votes		49	49	48	48	48	48	48	48	48	48	47	46	46
Votes for Ed Hartzog - Chair		14								i	İ			$\overline{}$
Votes for Russell Squire - Chair		33												
Votes for Peter Patch - 1st VC		33	12											
Votes for Tricia Shimamura - 1st VC			35											
Votes for Valerie Mason - 2nd VC			33	43										
Votes for Abraham Salcedo - 2nd VC				43										-
Votes for Anthony Cohn - Sec				- 4	23									+
Votes for Saundrea I. Coleman - Sec					36									-
Votes for Rebecca Dangoor - Sec Votes for Rami Sigal - Sec					41 30									+