

Russell Squire  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Congestion Pricing Task Force  
Tuesday, November 16, 2021  
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

**Minutes**

**Board Members Present:** Rit Aggarwala, Michele Birnbaum, Lori Bores, Alida Camp, Billy Freeland, Craig Lader, Valerie Mason, Barbara Rudder, Russell Squire, Elaine Walsh.

*The meeting was called to order at 6:32 PM.*

**Item 1: Recap of any new developments from the state, city or MTA.**

There was no news regarding Congestion Pricing to report subsequent to the conclusion of the first round of public meetings, which was reported at the October 7<sup>th</sup> Congestion Pricing Task Force Meeting.

**Item 2: Introduction to upcoming December 2, 2021 Congestion Pricing Task Force Meeting Presentation on Transportation Demand Modeling**

Rit Aggarwala, a member of the Congestion Pricing Task Force and at-large member of CB8, arranged a presentation to take place at the December 2<sup>nd</sup> meeting of the Task Force featuring a representative of Replica HQ, a transportation demand modeling company that is assisting the MTA with travel simulations for their Central Business District Tolling Program.

Mr. Aggarwala provided a brief description of travel demand modeling, and how it uses various data sources as inputs into a model that generates a simulation of who is traveling where and why. As model outputs are used to help inform policy, meeting attendees were provided an opportunity to generate questions to be submitted to Replica that would help the Task Force understand who may be impacted by congestion pricing; the presentation on December 2<sup>nd</sup> will include analysis of the data generated, which then will be able to be used for the purpose of developing language for potential resolutions regarding areas in the vicinity of the 60<sup>th</sup> Street toll boundary and the broader issue of exemptions, discounts, credits and offsets. Mr. Aggarwala clarified that that Replica's capabilities are largely focused on recent and present timeframes rather than projecting into the future; thus, while Replica won't be able to assess how tolling policies may impact travel demand, they will be able to help create an understanding of who may be impacted by congestion pricing upon implementation.

**Item 3: Solicitation of Input of Congestion Pricing Policy Scenarios to be Modeled and Presented at December 2nd Congestion Pricing Task Force Meeting**

The list of questions that were generated and submitted to Replica HQ is as follows:

Queensboro Bridge

- Where are vehicles crossing the 59th St. Bridge coming from/going to?
- Directional Flows/volumes to CD8 (Community District 8), thru CD8 via FDR and thru CD8 via the street network, broken down by mode and time of day and by income levels:
  - From NJ Via GWB
  - From east of East River via QBB
  - From east of East River via each crossing south of 60<sup>th</sup> Street

- From Bronx and points north via “free” crossings
- From Bronx and points north via Henry Hudson Bridge/Triborough Bridge
- Breakdown of vehicles entering/exiting QBB by access & egress point
- What are the destinations of vehicles crossing the QBB? What is the modal split? What are the income levels?
- How many motorcycles, bikes, and other motorized modes (i.e. mopeds/scooters) are crossing the QBB?
- How many vehicles from the Upper West Side cross thru CD8 to access the QBB?

#### Boundary Zone

- Types of cars that are circling for parking North of the zone, and how many are coming from CD8, from outside of Manhattan, from outside of the City, from outside of the State, etc.
- # of cars that are destined for and parking either on street or in garages on the east side between 55<sup>th</sup> to 60<sup>th</sup> Streets (as this represents vehicles that may avoid crossing the boundary after congestion pricing begins)
- Can we determine how many vehicles are parking curbside vs. in garages, especially near the boundary of the toll zone?
- Can we differentiate between cars and trucks and small commercial vans? If so, can we get data
- How many times per day do people/vehicle cross over 60<sup>th</sup> St.?
- How many trip by private vehicles result from people living in the vicinity of 60th St. area? How many are “forced” into the congestion zone (i.e. anyone on East 61<sup>st</sup> St. west of Madison Ave. has no option but to enter the congestion zone – there are likely other buildings/businesses located on southbound directional avenues between 60<sup>th</sup> and 61<sup>st</sup> St. that are in a similar situation).
- # of Vehicles crossing via PANYNJ (Port Authority of New York and New Jersey) crossings vs. those crossing via TBTA Triborough Bridge and Tunnel Authority) crossings vs. NYCDOT crossings

#### Trucks

- Can we distinguish between different types of trucks (i.e. larger 18 wheelers vs. smaller box trucks, etc.)? If so, please break out any truck info requested below to distinguish between truck types by size?
- Can we discern the activity by hour of day, where they are coming from and how many cross from CD8 into the congestion zone?
- Can we determine how many trucks are traveling to or through CD8? If so, can we tell where they are coming from and where they are headed?

#### General Questions

- Where are destinations that people traveling by car from CD8 are headed in the Congestion Zone? Can we break this down for trips starting in the 60s, 70s, 80s and 90-96<sup>th</sup>?
- Can the model compare whether people are making similar trips by bus/subway compared to by car?
- Can we tell how many people currently drive into Manhattan and then take the subway?
- Can we tell how far people walk from their vehicles after parking to their ultimate destinations?
- Can we discern how many vehicles are going from Roosevelt Island into Manhattan, and how many are going into the Manhattan CD8 vs to destinations in the congestion zone?
- Do more vehicles park near subway stations compared to other locations?
- What are the income levels of the people going from CD8 into the congestion zone by car or for-hire-vehicle?
- How many vehicles are going from CD8 to key medical facilities south of the zone (i.e. NYU Langone, Beth Israel Hospital, Bellevue, etc.)? How many are coming from Queens via the Queensboro Bridge?
- For vehicles going to key medical facilities/hospitals, can we distinguish between those who are employed there versus patients/visitors?
- Can Replica help us understand how likely vehicles are to use a “free crossing” when a toll crossing is nearby (for trips that end in Manhattan that wouldn’t be subjected to additional tolling)? For example, what percentage of drivers that have an option to enter Manhattan from the Bronx for free (via a free crossing over the Harlem River) do so compared to the percent who pay an MTA toll to cross at the Henry Hudson Bridge or Triboro Bridge? Same question for those who specifically cross on a “free” bridge over the East River from Queens/Brooklyn compared to those who use the Battery Tunnel/Queens-

Midtown Tunnel or Triboro Bridge)? This would help us understand how willing people are to pay a toll to obtain added convenience and may not be price sensitive in a Congestion Pricing situation.

- Can we tell if vehicle trips end with on-street parking or in a garage? If so, how many?
- Can replica model emissions/pollution impacts based on mode?
- Can we show pre-pandemic vs. post pandemic data and understand how patterns have (or haven't) changed?
- Do they do economic modeling? If they do, can we ask them to do modeling of the economics and financial analysis of the MTA as it relates to congestion pricing?
- How many times per day do people cross by mode? By size of vehicle?
- Can we determine how many vehicles will shift their behaviors when Congestion Pricing begins (i.e. will more vehicles use the FDR Drive?)
- Can Replica break down travel by time of day?

#### For Hire Vehicles

- Can we discern between private vehicles and For-Hire Vehicles? If so, can we get data showing volumes from each?
- How often do FHV's come and go from the congestion zone?

#### **Item 4: Initial Discussion of Congestion Pricing Concerns Specific to Stakeholders in the Immediate Vicinity of the 60<sup>th</sup> Street Toll Zone Boundary**

Based on feedback provided at prior Task Force meetings, it was agreed upon that the Task Force should be working to address issues of specific concern related to the 60<sup>th</sup> Street tolling boundary that may impact residents and businesses in the surrounding area. The concerns raised included the following:

- The operational impacts of congestion pricing that may divide the immediate neighborhood and be a burden on residents and stakeholders of streets along and adjacent to the toll zone boundary;
- Some residents may live north of the toll zone but have long-term parking secured at garages south of the boundary;
- Impacts on small businesses, especially those who may be impacted by fees assessed on their vendors performing deliveries or that may need to pay to access delivery bays;
- Potential impacts specific to small businesses, including access to loading bays;
- Concerns about traffic generated by the Queensboro Bridge, and potential adverse impacts along streets providing bridge access/egress where tolls wouldn't be assessed to users;
- General concerns about congestion and air quality caused from any vehicular activity stemming from parking north of 60<sup>th</sup> street, including near subway stations;
- The manner in which traffic levels may change as a result of any vehicles that may try to avoid crossing into the toll zone;
- Potential physical impacts, such as the design and aesthetics of tolling structures, and whether they will generate flashes or other disruptive visual or audible activity; it was also requested that any design be presented for comment to CB8 and obtain Public Design Commission approval;
- Parking policies, and whether there need to be changes to where certain types of vehicles are allowed to park, the length of time they would be permitted to park, and whether residential parking permits may be a viable option;
- Loading zones, and how to accommodate deliveries to businesses in and around the boundary zone;
- Potential disproportionate impacts on businesses, including hotels near the boundary, that generate significant passenger pick-up and drop-off activities, especially by For-Hire Vehicles;
- Frequent construction activity that may force drivers into the tolling zone who otherwise don't intend to enter the zone;
- The lack of parking and whether zoning codes should be revised to require certain buildings to once again require a minimum amount of parking, similar to policies in most of NYC outside of Manhattan south of 96<sup>th</sup> Street.

### **Item 5: Determination of Next Steps**

Based on the expectation that the Replica presentation will provide a significant amount of information that may inform Task Force deliberations, the expectation was that there would be discussions at the next meeting to further discuss boundary zone issues and potentially to begin discussing the broader topic of discounts/credits/exemptions/offsets. There was also some interest in revisiting the congestion fees being assessed to NYC Yellow Taxis.

### **Item 6: Old & New Business**

There was no old or new business discussed.

*There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:32PM.*

Respectfully submitted,

*Alida Camp & Craig Lader, Co-Chairs*