

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee Meeting
Monday, October 19, 2021 –6:30PM
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, October 20, 2021**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

AGENDA:

CB8 Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, David Helpen, Jane Parshall. Public members, Christina Davis and Kimberly Selway were also present.

Resolutions for Consideration:

Items 1-2: Unanimous Approvals

- 1. 1133 Fifth Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District) – Erin Rulli, Higgins Quasebarth and Partners; Steven Harris, Steven Harris Architects.** Application is for modifications to the penthouse including a) removal of a non-historic greenhouse, b) modifying masonry openings, c) replacement of non-historic greenhouses with new construction and new pergolas, d) window replacement and railings replacement.

WHEREAS 1133 Fifth Avenue is an apartment building designed in the neo-Federal style by Emery Roth and constructed in 1927-28;

WHEREAS the south-facing exposed side elevation of 1133 Fifth Avenue looks over the magnificent Delano and Aldrich designed Willard Straight house at 1130 Fifth Avenue and 95th Street;

WHEREAS there is a long history of change both at the building itself and at the penthouse;

WHEREAS Emery Roth constructed the penthouse as a triplex, at the 15th and 16th floors and utilizing the usable space at the bottom of the water tower; this was unusual at the time;

WHEREAS by the 1980s, many changes had taken place at the penthouse/triplex including the addition of the lookout or projecting bay window at the 3rd floor of the triplex (bottom of water tower);

WHEREAS the applicant is replacing all existing windows with new bronze framed windows — some of the replacement windows will present as enlarged;

WHEREAS any new masonry construction which will match in materiality and construction the existing masonry;

WHEREAS all proposed replacement railings will be use a design based on the original Emery Roth design for the railings;

WHEREAS the two existing pergolas will be replaced with new pergolas;

WHEREAS at the west-facing 5th Avenue elevation, the terrace is set back 14' from the base of the building;

WHEREAS at the west-facing Fifth Avenue elevation at the 16th floor [the second floor of the penthouse/triplex] the applicant proposes to remove the existing, non-historic greenhouse at the north side of the terrace, to modify and enlarge two windows and to insert one new window into new masonry infill at the front elevation where the greenhouse previously stood. (The existing greenhouse flows into the living space.) [Some masonry will be removed to enlarge the windows.];

WHEREAS the enlarged windows will be bronze-framed and will be operable;

WHEREAS at the usable space at the water tower, the glass lookout window will be repaired and repainted and the existing railings will be replaced by a new 42" bronze railing; the Palladian opening at the next level will also have a new 42" bronze railing;

WHEREAS 18" wide masonry piers will separate the windows at the 16th floor; the piers will present as grounding the water tower above, providing visual continuity;

WHEREAS the existing railings will be replaced with new railings based on the original Emery Roth railing design for the building;

WHEREAS at the west-facing elevation, at the usable space at the water tower or 3rd floor of the penthouse, the existing glass lookout/bay window will be repaired and repainted and new bronze 42" railings will be added;

WHEREAS at the east elevation, at the useable space under the water tower, the masonry openings will be enlarged with new bronze-framed operable glazing; a new wood framed pergola will be added and the railings will be replaced;

WHEREAS at the east elevation, at the 16th floor, the visible part of the existing greenhouse will be replaced with an enlarged masonry opening with divided lights and a door (13'8" wide x 10' high); the one existing window will be deleted and replaced with infill so that there is just the one enlarged masonry opening on the east elevation; the existing railings will be replaced with new railings;

WHEREAS at the south-facing elevation at the 16th floor, the east end of the existing greenhouse will be replaced with ribbon-like multi light glazing (25'2" x 7'6") ; an additional window (9' x 9'6") will be inserted at the west of the terrace; a new wood-framed pergola will be added at the east end of the terrace; the existing railings will be replaced with new railings;

WHEREAS at the 16th floor of the south-facing elevation, the deletion of the greenhouse and the substitution of the masonry creates a continuous line of masonry across the facade that is more harmonious to the eye;

WHEREAS at the 16th floor, the new enlarged windows on the west-facing elevation, separated by masonry piers, as minimally visible from the far west side of Central Park;

WHEREAS all masonry will match the original historic brick;

WHEREAS buildings evolve over time; the interventions proposed by the applicant improve the aesthetic of the penthouse/triplex;

WHEREAS the removal of the "airport modern" greenhouses alone add immensely to the both the streetscape and roofscape along 5th Avenue as well as to the views back from Central Park of both the west-facing elevation and the south-facing elevation;

WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for a thoughtful presentation;

WHEREAS the application is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 6 IN FAVOR: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Parshall, Helpert)

TWO PUBLIC MEMBERS IN FAVOR: Christina Davis, Kimberly Selway

- 2. 7 East 81st Street (Metropolitan Museum Historic District)** – Alex Gault, Architect – A four story row house designed by Griffith Thomas and erected in 1878-79. Application is for the removal of existing stucco across front of the building and reconstruction of facade in limestone.

WHEREAS 7 East 81st Street was built originally as one of a row of 10 brownstones;

WHEREAS none of these houses remain as originally designed;

WHEREAS there was an evolution of style and materials in the neighborhood paralleling the phased development of the Metropolitan Museum;

WHEREAS that evolution resulted in the front enlargement of the Metropolitan Museum and many of the houses nearby transitioning from their original materials to limestone facades;

WHEREAS 7 East 81st Street has four stories and a habitable basement, and is about 19 feet wide;

WHEREAS 7 East 81st Street is 57'-8 ½" inches high, less than the allowable 60-foot height;

WHEREAS the stoop and original brownstone details had been removed in a prior renovation;

WHEREAS the existing façade has a stucco veneer;

WHEREAS the stucco veneer is to be removed;

WHEREAS this application proposes a new limestone façade;

WHEREAS this application proposes a design in a classical style to relate to the current context;

WHEREAS the sheet metal cornice will be the one original element to be preserved;

WHEREAS the rusticated base, which is not original, will remain;

WHEREAS all elements of the façade except the cornice and the base will be new;

WHEREAS the proportions and details of the new design are inspired by the proportions and details of buildings in the vicinity;

WHEREAS all the details for the new design have been taken from buildings in the district;

WHEREAS the two windows on the second through fourth floors will have limestone headers, frames, sills, and aprons;

WHEREAS the windows on the second through fourth floors will have divided lights and will be double hung, four over four, wood windows with insulated glass;

WHEREAS the windows on the first floor will be taller than the typical windows, will be similar to French doors, will have limestone headers with limestone brackets, limestone frames, and limestone balustrades;

WHEREAS the basement floor, or ground floor, will have an areaway set down from the sidewalk with a decorative iron fence and gates;

WHEREAS the basement floor will have pair of wood, raised panel doors at the main entrance and a single wood, raised panel door at the service entrance;

WHEREAS the windows will have light grey glass and frames painted beige, the doors will have dark green paint with brushed gold hardware, and the metal will be black;

WHEREAS the proposed façade has a cohesive design incorporating details copied from buildings that reflect the evolution of style and materials represented by the Metropolitan Museum and many of the houses in the district;

WHEREAS the proposed design is appropriate and contextual within the Metropolitan Museum Historic District;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 6 IN FAVOR: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Helpern, Parshall)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: (Selway)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs