

Russell Squire  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

October 21, 2021

Hon. Sarah Carroll, Chair  
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission  
Municipal Building  
1 Centre Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10007

**RE: 1133 Fifth Avenue (Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District)** – *Erin Rulli, Higgins Quasebarth and Partners; Steven Harris, Steven Harris Architects.* Application is for modifications to the penthouse including a) removal of a non-historic greenhouse, b) modifying masonry openings, c) replacement of non-historic greenhouses with new construction and new pergolas, d) window replacement and railings replacement.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on October 20, 2021, the board approved the following resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

**WHEREAS** 1133 Fifth Avenue is an apartment building designed in the neo-Federal style by Emery Roth and constructed in 1927-28;

**WHEREAS** the south-facing exposed side elevation of 1133 Fifth Avenue looks over the magnificent Delano and Aldrich designed Willard Straight house at 1130 Fifth Avenue and 95th Street;

**WHEREAS** there is a long history of change both at the building itself and at the penthouse;

**WHEREAS** Emery Roth constructed the penthouse as a triplex, at the 15th and 16th floors and utilizing the usable space at the bottom of the water tower; this was unusual at the time;

**WHEREAS** by the 1980s, many changes had taken place at the penthouse/triplex including the addition of the lookout or projecting bay window at the 3rd floor of the triplex (bottom of water tower);

**WHEREAS** the applicant is replacing all existing windows with new bronze framed windows — some of the replacement windows will present as enlarged;

**WHEREAS** any new masonry construction which will match in materiality and construction the existing masonry;

**WHEREAS** all proposed replacement railings will be use a design based on the original Emery Roth design for the railings;

**WHEREAS** the two existing pergolas will be replaced with new pergolas;

**WHEREAS** at the west-facing 5th Avenue elevation, the terrace is set back 14' from the base of the building;

**WHEREAS** at the west-facing Fifth Avenue elevation at the 16th floor [the second floor of the penthouse/triplex] the applicant proposes to remove the existing, non-historic greenhouse at the north side of the terrace, to modify and enlarge two windows and to insert one new window into new masonry infill at the front elevation where the greenhouse previously stood. (The existing greenhouse flows into the living space.) [Some masonry will be removed to enlarge the windows.];

**WHEREAS** the enlarged windows will be bronze-framed and will be operable;

**WHEREAS** at the usable space at the water tower, the glass lookout window will be repaired and repainted and the existing railings will be replaced by a new 42” bronze railing; the Palladian opening at the next level will also have a new 42” bronze railing;

**WHEREAS** 18” wide masonry piers will separate the windows at the 16th floor; the piers will present as grounding the water tower above, providing visual continuity;

**WHEREAS** the existing railings will be replaced with new railings based on the original Emery Roth railing design for the building;

**WHEREAS** at the west-facing elevation, at the usable space at the water tower or 3rd floor of the penthouse, the existing glass lookout/bay window will be repaired and repainted and new bronze 42” railings will be added;

**WHEREAS** at the east elevation, at the useable space under the water tower, the masonry openings will be enlarged with new bronze-framed operable glazing; a new wood framed pergola will be added and the railings will be replaced;

**WHEREAS** at the east elevation, at the 16th floor, the visible part of the existing greenhouse will be replaced with an enlarged masonry opening with divided lights and a door (13’8” wide x 10’ high); the one existing window will be deleted and replaced with infill so that there is just the one enlarged masonry opening on the east elevation; the existing railings will be replaced with new railings;

**WHEREAS** at the south-facing elevation at the 16th floor, the east end of the existing greenhouse will be replaced with ribbon-like multi light glazing (25’2” x 7’6”) ; an additional window (9’ x 9’6”) will be inserted at the west of the terrace; a new wood-framed pergola will be added at the east end of the terrace; the existing railings will be replaced with new railings;

**WHEREAS** at the 16th floor of the south-facing elevation, the deletion of the greenhouse and the substitution of the masonry creates a continuous line of masonry across the facade that is more harmonious to the eye;

**WHEREAS** at the 16th floor, the new enlarged windows on the west-facing elevation, separated by masonry piers, as minimally visible from the far west side of Central Park;

**WHEREAS** all masonry will match the original historic brick;

**WHEREAS** buildings evolve over time; the interventions proposed by the applicant improve the aesthetic of the penthouse/triplex;

**WHEREAS** the removal of the “airport modern” greenhouses alone add immensely to the both the streetscape and roofscape along 5th Avenue as well as to the views back from Central Park of both the west-facing elevation and the south-facing elevation;

**WHEREAS** the applicant is to be commended for a thoughtful presentation;

**WHEREAS** the application is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

Sincerely,

*Russell Squire*

Russell Squire  
Chair

*David Helpern and Jane Parshall*

David Helpern and Jane Parshall  
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York  
Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative  
Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President  
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District  
Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District  
Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District  
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District  
Honorable Robert J. Rodriguez, NYS Assembly Member 68th Assembly District  
Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District  
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District