Russell Squire Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com – Website info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

The City of New York Community Board 8 Manhattan

July 26, 2021

Hon. Sarah Carroll, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building 1 Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

RE: 1022 Lexington Avenue (SW corner of Lexington Avenue and 73rd Street) — Upper East Side Historic District Extension. *Theodore Bodnar, Architect.* Application is for first floor facade redesign and for infill at the upper two floors.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on July 21, 2021, the board approved the following resolution by a vote of 30 in favor, 1 opposed, 2 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a three-story neo-Grec style row house designed by Thom & Wilson and constructed in 1880-1881;

WHEREAS the applicant has submitted two prior applications for Certificates of Appropriateness — both were unanimously turned down by the Landmarks Committee — at the June 2021meeting of the Landmarks Committee and before that, at the October 2020 meeting of the Landmarks Committee;

WHEREAS the Landmarks Committee objected to the applicant's initial proposal to replace the existing configuration of the windows at both the Lexington Avenue 1st floor elevation and the 73rd Street 1st floor elevation by enlarging the windows and replacing with large plate glass windows was inappropriate within the historic district; the Landmarks Committee objected to the applicant's second proposal which also retained too much single pane glass plate; [*Please refer to the attached June 2021 Resolution and to the October 2020 resolution.]*

WHEREAS the Committee also felt that the proposed 3rd and 4th floor 2-story infill at the west side of the 73rd Street elevation (formerly the Farrow and Ball retail shop) with proposed stucco cladding to distinguish it from the original historic brick building was inappropriate within the historic district;

WHEREAS the applicant has now returned for a 3rd time with an application that 1) reduces the amount of single plate glass windows by breaking up the visual look of flat glass panes and 2) replaces the 2-story stucco-clad infill with painted brick slightly darker than the existing brick of the historic building so that that the infill is differentiated from the rest of the building;

WHEREAS the majority of the ground floor windows on both the Lexington Avenue elevation and the 73rd Street elevation will now match the divided-lite windows on the 2nd floor of both

elevations; the applicant proposes using mutins on the previously proposed single pane glass doors to divide the glass;

WHEREAS the window at the far west side of the building (where the Farrow and Ball store used to be) will not have divided lights;

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is not a distinguished building within the historic district; WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for embracing the comments of the Landmarks Committee with the thoughtful implementation of the Committee's feedback especially with regard to the windows on both the Lexington Avenue elevation and the 73rd Street elevation; WHEREAS the proposed solution for the infill, while more contextual with a painted brick cladding, could have been more thoughtful, even for such a modest building;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is APPROVED as presented.

JUNE 2021 RESOLUTION:

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a neo-Grec brownstone row house designed by Thom & Wilson and constructed between 1880-1881;

WHEREAS the Landmarks Preservation Commission previously approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for 1022 Lexington Avenue in October, 2020 for changes to the windows at the 1st and 2nd floors on both the Lexington Avenue elevation and the 73rd Street elevation;

WHEREAS the applicant now proposes to install full height glass doors in place of the approved first floor windows on both the Lexington Avenue elevation and the East 73rd Street elevation to gain access to the outdoor eating areas for the new restaurant that has taken the space;

WHEREAS the windows approved in the applicant's previous application would now be dropped to the floor with sliding or operable glass openings (the previously approved application indicated 16" of brick below the windows);

WHEREAS the openings include 5 sliding windows along Lexington Avenue and 4 bays, a glass door and an entry door to the residential component along 73rd Street;

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes moving/shifting the entry to the west from the previously approved entry point on the 73rd Street elevation;

WHEREAS to summarize — along 73rd Street as one moves west, first the glass entry door, then 4 bays, then the entrance to the residential part of the building (floors 3 and 4) which retains the original wrought iron door for residential component - the entry door was formerly on Lexington Avenue;

WHEREAS there will be approximately 70' of solid plate glass along East 73rd Street;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to add to two floors of infill (10' x 17') at the most westerly part (western corner) of the building — to be differentiated [as requested by the Landmarks Preservation Commission] from the original historic brick building by having a stucco finish;

WHEREAS there is too much continuous plate glass along East 73rd Street which is primarily a residential block;

WHEREAS there is a disembodied quality to the proposed windows on the first floor as they relate to the proposed and previously approved divided lite windows at the 2nd floor;

WHEREAS divided lights would be more appropriate for all of the windows along both elevations and more contextual within the historic district;

WHEREAS the proposed infill removes the interest of the existing building; the existing fencing at the 2nd floor, which would be removed for the infill, adds to the charm of the historic building;

WHEREAS the proposed stucco cladding for the infill to distinguish it from the original historic brick building is inappropriate within in the historic district; extending the language of the existing building would be a more appropriate solution;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that this application is DISAPPROVED as presented.

OCTOBER 2020 RESOLUTION:

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a neo-Grec-style brownstone designed by Thom and Wilson and constructed between 1880-1881;

WHEREAS applicant has revised his original proposal [*Please see attached original September resolution*] and has now 1) reduced the size and amount of glass 2) reduced the massiveness of the glass 3) reintroduced wooden transoms on the 73rd Street elevation 4) broken up the glass in terms of visual appearance by thickening up the masonry pilasters at the 73rd Street elevation 5) retained the decorative wrought iron interior door now at the entrance to the residential section of the building by changing its location to the relocated entrance to residential part of building on 73rd Street where it will be more visible];

WHEREAS in general, the applicant has reduced the size of the windows on the Lexington Avenue elevation at the ground level and has retained the multipaned window above and has reduced the size of the windows along the 73rd Street elevation, retained the transoms and increased the width of the pilasters and kept the multipaned windows at the 2nd floor;

WHEREAS the applicant's revised proposal retains much of the original charm of the first two floors at 1022 Lexington Ave;

WHEREAS the applicant's revised proposal is appropriate within the historic district;

WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for returning to the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 with a more contextual design;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

ORIGINAL SEPTEMBER RESOLUTION:

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a neo-Grec brownstone rowhouse designed by Thomas & Wilson Between 1880-1881.

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue has two elevations: 80' along 73rd Street and 17' along Lexington Avenue

WHEREAS the first two floors of 1022 Lexington present as a restaurant; the upper two floors are residential.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to increase the amount of light into commercial space by enlarging all the windows at the first and second floor both on the Lexington Avenue elevation and at the 73rd Street elevation.

WHEREAS by adding more glass at the first and second stories, the applicant will reduce the now- existing inconsistencies among the windows which are of different sizes and have differing characteristics.

WHEREAS at the 73rd Street elevation, the applicant proposes 5 large plate glass windows and at the ground floor, 3 new plate glass windows and two new doors (one for the commercial space and one for the residential space); the windows will range in area from 64 sq. ft. to 95 sq. ft.;

WHEREAS at the Lexington Avenue elevation, the applicant proposes one large glass window at the second floor with 143 sq. ft. of area and at the first floor one large glass window with 110 sq. ft. of area;

WHEREAS the applicant's objective is to align the new windows with the vertical glazing in the residential portion of the building, to separate the commercial use from the residential use and to present consistency and visual uniformity on both elevations.

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes to change the existing entry to the residential portion of the building — now located on Lexington Avenue at the south portion of the building — to 73rd Street;

WHEREAS the applicant will retain the decorative wrought iron panel at the internal residential entry at the new entry on 73rd Street;

WHEREAS at the 73rd Street elevation, the applicant proposes to remove the existing one wood cladding and replace with brick so that the historic look and fabric of the 73rd Street elevation for the first two floors is restored;

WHEREAS although disorganized, the existing windows add great charm and character to 1022 Lexington Avenue, especially the non-historic multi-paned window at the 2nd floor at Lexington Avenue;

WHEREAS the proposed design presents as not integrated — the artistry needed to combine something historic with something contemporary is lacking; the quirkiness of the 1022 Lexington Avenue is lost.

WHEREAS the applicant's proposal to replace the existing configuration of the windows with huge glass is out of context and inappropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is DISAPPROVED as presented.

Sincerely,

Russell Squire

Russell Squire Chair

David Helpern and Gane Parshall

David Helpern and Jane Parshall Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District Honorable José M. Serrano, NYS Senator, 29th Senatorial District Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District Honorable Robert J. Rodriguez, NYS Assembly Member 68th Assembly District Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District