

Russell Squire
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com – Website
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Social Justice Committee
Monday, April 26, 2021 – 6:30PM
*This meeting was conducted via Zoom***

MINUTES

Present: Lori Bores, Alida Camp, Barbara Chocky, Sarah Chu, Saundra I. Coleman, Rebecca Dangoor, Billy Freeland, May Malik, Peter Patch, Rita Popper, Barbara Rudder, Cos Spagnoletti, Russell Squire, Wendy Machaver (public member)

1. **Presentation by Hassan Naveed (HSNAVEED@cityhall.nyc.gov), Deputy Director of the New York City Office for the Prevention of Hate Crimes(OPHC)**
 - a. OPHC is 19 months old. It was created by the City Council in February 2019. The office's creation was spurred by Anti-Semitic incidents across the city in 2019.
 - b. OPHC is not a law enforcement entity. It is located within the Mayor's Office for Criminal Justice and is focused on non-law enforcement deterrence efforts, public education, outreach, community safety models, and preventative best practices.
 - c. Education is #1 way to combat hate
 - i. Late 2019/early 2020 - students in schools were asking about the City's rash of anti-Semitic hate crimes. OPHC developed materials to help teachers talk about these topics by creating a hate crime curriculum for NYC schools.
 - ii. Anti-Asian hate crimes have also raised the profile of the office
 - d. Community Relations work is conducted through town halls and work with community groups.
 - e. OPHC liaises with NYPD/law enforcement on violent hate crimes, but generally promotes restorative justice approaches. OPHC also hosts the Interagency Committee (IAC), a group of city agencies that meet to collaborate on addressing hate crimes in NYC.
 - f. For more information about OPHC, see: <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/stophate/about/about.page>
 - g. Why are hate crimes different?
 - i. Hate crimes result in enhanced penalties
 1. This is intended to send a message to people who commit hate crimes
 2. This is also intended to send a message to victims of hate crimes that they are seen and their pain is acknowledged.
 - ii. Protected categories include:
 1. Race, color
 2. National origin
 3. Gender identity
 4. Sexual orientation
 5. Age
 6. Disability
 - iii. NYC laws
 1. Local Laws 46 &47
 2. Local Lay 49
 - h. NYC Hate Crime Data
 - i. Reported to NYPD hate crime with/without having identified the person who committed the crime
 - ii. Hate crime statistics from [OPHC 2020 Annual Report](#) (p.4)

Hate crime complaints (which can be the result of civilian reporting or law enforcement activity) went down by 37% between 2019 and 2020, from 446 to 282, in part because of COVID-19. Hate crimes complaints were down from 2019 across all bias categories with some exceptions. Most notably, anti-Asian hate crime complaints experienced a significant and concerning increase from 1 to 30. Anti-Asian hate crimes were mostly violent (16/30). Arrests (referring to an individual who has been taken into custody) decreased by 22% from 2019 to 2020, from 119 to 93 arrests.

The decrease in hate crime complaints can also be attributed to a 52% decrease (from 251 to 120) in anti-Jewish hate crime complaints, despite continuing to comprise the largest proportion of complaints (43%). 73% of anti-Jewish hate crime complaints were for vandalism related incidents (Aggravated Harassment and Criminal Mischief 4). Anti-LGBTQ bias comprised the second-highest proportion of hate crime complaints (15%), followed by anti-Black (14%) and anti-Asian (11%). Anti-LGBTQ and anti-Jewish each comprised the greatest proportion and volume of arrests in 2020 (27% of total, 25 arrests each) across all bias categories. Similar to past years, Brooklyn led the boroughs with the highest number of hate crime complaints and arrests, followed by Manhattan. In 2020, 28% of hate crime complaints were violent compared to 25% in 2019. It is important to note that hate crimes have been found to be vastly under-reported, so these numbers only reflect reported incidents.

NYPD Hate Crimes Dashboard is located here:

<https://app.powerbigov.us/view?r=eyJrIjoiYjg1NWl3YjgtYzkyOS00Nzc0LTkwMDAtNTgzM2I2M2JmYWE1IiwidCI6IjIOWY1N2ViLTc4ZDEtNDZmYi1iZTgzLWEyYWZkZDdjNjA0MyJ9>

- iii. 2019-2020, hate crimes decreased by 37% due to the reduction of people in public spaces due to COVID lockdowns.
 - a. However, the emergence of reported Asian hate crimes increased and the majority of these incidents were violent. The trending in increasing numbers of reported COVID hate crimes continues. To date, 39 incidents have been reported.
- iv. There are data limitations to hate crime information. They are generally under-reported due to language barriers, concerns about immigration status, tried to report and not taken seriously, privacy, and affected communities' historically fraught relationships with law enforcement.
- v. NYC Commission on Human Rights found that 71% of people in vulnerable groups do not report hate motivated incidents and harassment.
- i. Bias incidents are treated differently from hate crimes
 - i. Bias incidents are acts of prejudice that are not a violation of criminal law, but can violate civil law
 - ii. NYCHR handles discriminatory harassment
 - iii. Is it a hate crime or bias incident?
 - a. Hate crimes involve violence, violent threats, or vandalism.
 - b. Bias is discrimination.
 - c. OPHC guidance can be found here: http://criminaljustice.cityofnewyork.us/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/OPHC_WhatIsAHateCrime_FINAL.pdf
- j. What do you do if you experience or witness a hate crime?
 - i. Each NYPD precinct has a crime victim assistance program (CVAP).
 - ii. DA's offices have victim services units.
 - iii. In NYC, victims of crime don't need a police report to get access to services.
- k. Stop Asian Hate Toolkit - www1.nyc.gov/site/cchr/community/stop-asian-hate.page
- l. What do you do when you witness a hate crime? The Asian American Federation provides the following guide - "The 5 Ds" on how to respond:

5 "D'S" OF BEING AN UPSTANDER

What to do when you see someone being harassed

Respond directly to the person causing harm or physically intervene if necessary



Be confident, assertive, & calm

DIRECT

Get help from someone else

Ask for assistance, a resource, or help from a third party



DELEGATE

Excuse me

Do you know what the next step is?

DISTRACT

Bring attention away from the person causing harm, the person who was harmed, or the situation itself

DELAY

Check in with the person who was harmed after the incident



And **educate** ourselves & our communities on why this happened

DOCUMENT

If someone is already helping the person in crisis,



document through photo or video*

*Never post or share a video without the consent of the person being harmed



5 "D's" adapted from Hollaback!



To download your own free guide, you can find the 5 D's and other information in the *STay Safe from Hate* booklet here: <https://mailchi.mp/aafederation/aaf-landing-page>.

m. Contact OPHC at: OPHC@cityhall.nyc.gov

n. **Q& A:** (paraphrased or summarized)

Q: Can a bias incident be reclassified as a hate crime after more information? What happens if more information elevates the event?

A - Hassan Naveed, OPHC: Yes, more information can redefine a bias incident as a hate crime.

Q: How do you tell vulnerable communities that more policing or more criminalization doesn't stop hate?

A: That's why our office was created. People come to us without knowing the potential of other approaches and we give them more exposure to other options that exist. The best way to be effective is to be able to engage with communities who are affected and put a safety model together that doesn't involve law enforcement.

Q: What is the youngest age that we can educate?

A: OPHC has middle school and high school curriculums and hopes to expand to elementary school curriculum soon.

Q: (1) Are there statistically more attacks of people on the street or in remote areas?

A: Hate crime attacks generally happen as people are walking on the street.

Q: How do we raise community awareness in CB8? Are there safe havens type solutions? Is there social media outreach?

A: OPHC is working on putting together a media campaign to build awareness. We have posters in multiple languages, many businesses in Flushing , Jackson Heights - post posters in various languages. They are also part of a grassroots initiative of a network of businesses - was carried out. More materials are coming soon.

Q: With so much money being spent - why are hate crimes increasing? More boots on the ground, more local communities taking care of it? Education takes time.

A: There hasn't been a lot of money put into non-law enforcement side of the efforts - we are one of the first offices created first of its kind. Our work focuses on engaging communities directly. We have the boots on the ground - with those community and ally organizations. Diverse communities with unity and allyship work together to oppose hate.

Q: I'm engaged in the South Bronx, with faith based organizations, and leaders in NYCHA. Does OPHC work within these communities?

A: As part of the Mayor's action plan - they are working with NYCHA in South bronx. All these groups work with each other, work with each other and with other coalitions and grassroots organizations to compliment our efforts.

Q: Have you made videos like "School House Rocks" for your campaigns?

A: We are trying to make it fun and create curricula that catches the audience. We want to make it interactive to serve public school students.

2. Old Business – None

3. New Business - None

Saundrea I. Coleman and Sarah Chu, Co-Chairs