

Russell Squire  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com – Website  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee Meeting  
Monday, March 15, 2021 – 6:30 PM  
This meeting was conducted via Zoom**

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, March 17, 2021 via Zoom**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**MINUTES:**

**CB8 Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, P. Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Anthony Cohn, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Barry Schneider, and Marco Tamayo. Public member Kimberly Selway's absence was excused.

**Resolutions for Approval:**

**Item 1 – 201 East 65<sup>th</sup> Street Disapproval (Unanimous)**

**Item 2 – 14 East 60<sup>th</sup> Street Approval (Unanimous)**

**Item 3 – Ruin Among the Gardens Memorial Day Approval (Unanimous)**

1. **201 East 65<sup>th</sup> Street (Individual Landmark)** – *Adam Kushner, Architect* - A modern style mixed-use building designed by Mayer & Whittlesey and Skidmore, Owings, & Merrill and constructed in 1947-1951. Application is for installation of an exterior awning.

**WHEREAS** 201 East 65<sup>th</sup> Street is an international style building constructed in 1951;

**WHEREAS** there is an original stair leading to a lower level;

**WHEREAS** the space on the lower level is occupied by medical offices;

**WHEREAS** the stair was originally designed as a stair open to the sky;

**WHEREAS** the stair is currently open to the sky;

**WHEREAS** the applicant seeks to cover the stair with a canopy to provide protection from the weather;

**WHEREAS** the color of the canopy material and the color of the aluminum supports is bright blue;

**WHEREAS** the canopy has an L shape in that the entrance portion of the canopy extends over the sidewalk and the stair portion of the canopy is parallel to the sidewalk;

**WHEREAS** the stair portion of the canopy follows the slope of the stair;

**WHEREAS** the building is set in a garden behind stone walls;

**WHEREAS** the color of the building is muted in that the major material is an off-white brick;

**WHEREAS** the shape of the canopy is awkward and ungainly;

**WHEREAS** the canopy visually blocks the view across the low stone wall and garden to the building;  
**WHEREAS** the blue color is in such sharp contrast to the muted colors of the building and the walls that the canopy has a jarring appearance;  
**WHEREAS** some of the signage appears to be an advertisement and not just an announcement of medical offices;  
**WHEREAS** the canopy is an intrusion on the quiet presence of the building in the garden;  
**WHEREAS** the proposed canopy is not in character with the minimalist architecture of the building and the site;  
**WHEREAS** the canopy is not contextual with the modernist aesthetic of the building and grounds;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Schneider, Tamayo)

2. **14 East 60<sup>th</sup> Street (Upper East Side Historic District – Adrian R. Figueroa, Architect** - A Beaux-Arts style twelve-story building designed by R.C. Gildersleeve and constructed in 1902. Application is for window replacement, retractable awning and signage installation.

**WHEREAS** 14 East 60th Street is a beaux-arts style 12-story building designed by R. C. Gildersleeve and constructed in 1902.

**WHEREAS** 14 East 60th Street was originally designed as a hotel; in 1969, it was converted to offices with restaurants on the ground floor;

**WHEREAS** the canopy for the entrance into the restaurant space was approved at the staff level;

**WHEREAS** adjacent to the entrance is an existing arched window which is now fixed; the applicant proposes to replace this fixed window with an operable window that presents as French doors that swing out so that the doors (formerly a fixed window) may be opened to the outside when the weather is nice;

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to retain the fixed transom above the window;

**WHEREAS** the detail for the window will match exactly the detail on the window to the right of the opening; (This window belongs to a different restaurant.)

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to install a canopy above the window — a straight retractable awning with arch filler over the window— the filler piece will match the curvature of the arch;

**WHEREAS** the retractable awning will mimic the curve of the window arch and will be similar to the awning to the right of the new French-door style window;

**WHEREAS** the applicant also proposes an understated sign to the right of the new operable window for the new restaurant; brass lettering will be mounted onto the stone from behind;

**WHEREAS** the design for the new awning is consistent with the awning over the entry (to the right) of the proposed new restaurant and with the awning at the window to the left of the proposed new restaurant; both awnings for the new space (entrance and window) will be the same color — a marine blue with gold colored lettering;

**WHEREAS** the applicant's proposal is consistent, understated, and restrained;

**WHEREAS** the applicant is to be commended for showing images of the Landmarks Preservation Commission staff level approval for the entrance and entrance awning in order to provide context for the applicant's proposal for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the window, the awning over the window and the signage;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

NEW BUSINESS

### **RUIN AMONG THE GARDENS MEMORIAL DAY RESOLUTION**

Stephen Martin from Friends of the Ruin gave a presentation to the Landmarks Committee on a proposal to turn what is left of the James Renwick-designed Smallpox Hospital (located just north of the Four Freedoms/FDR memorial) into a Memorial as well as a garden to create a physical and digital remembrance for all victims of all the plagues and pandemics the city has lived through over the years, including the smallpox, AIDS, HIV,

COVID. The “Ruins” are the only landmarked ruin in the city; James Renwick also designed St. Patrick’s Cathedral, Grace Church, and the Smithsonian Institution Building, to name only a few of the major buildings he designed. The presentation gave a history of the uses for the hospital (constructed using prison labor) over the years as well as a timeline for the completion of fundraising and possible execution of an overall design.

The Landmarks Committee passed to following resolution:

**WHEREAS** the Smallpox Hospital was designed by, James Renwick, an American architect in the 19th century and one of the most successful American Architects of his time;

**WHEREAS** the history of the Smallpox Hospital, situated on what was then known as Blackwell’s Island and intertwined with the social and economic history of the city, should be preserved for generations to come;

**WHEREAS** the hospital structure is located on the southernmost tip of the island — to the south is the human rights memorial Four Freedoms Park and to the north is the Cornell Technion campus;

**WHEREAS** the project to create a memorial and a ruin among gardens open to the public is in the very initial planning and fundraising stages;

**WHEREAS** the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M supports creating a memorial and a garden at the “Ruins” that will remind New Yorkers of the history of the hospital, the history of the island and the history of the pandemics that the city has faced over the years, including Smallpox, AIDS, HIV, and COVID;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that this resolution is **APPROVED** as presented.

**VOTE:** 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

**David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs**