

Alida Camp
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, NY 10022
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail
www.cb8m.com – Website

The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, October 19, 2020 – 6:30PM

Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, October 21, 2020 via Zoom at 6:30PM**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Resolutions for approval:

Approvals: Items 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6

Minutes

- 1. 135 East 71st Street – Upper East Side Historic District – Noelle Fontaine, Cowley Engineering, P.C.** A multi-family building originally designed by Hyman Isaac Feldman and constructed in 1959. Application is to re-clad the first floor exterior and replace storefronts, amend the window master plan and propose a signage master plan.

WHEREAS 135 East 71st Street was built as a co-op in 1959; the building (which presents as two separate residential buildings joined in the middle) extends along Lexington Avenue between 71st and 72nd Streets;

WHEREAS Hyman Isaac Feldman is listed as the architect of record. However, at the entrance, there is plaque which lists Sylvan and Robert Bien as the architects. The applicant could not explain the reason for this discrepancy;

WHEREAS 135 East 71st Street is considered a “no-style” building on the designation report;

WHEREAS only the southern half of the building is in the Upper East Side Historic District;

WHEREAS this application is for work to be done at the southern half of the building — the half of the building which is included in the historic district with its entrance on 71st Street. (The northern half of the co-op has a separate entrance on 72nd Street;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes 1) lower level recladding, 2) storefront replacement, 3) signage master plan, and 4) window master plan amendment;

WHEREAS at the ground level only the applicant proposes to reclad the deteriorating red granite with gray granite — the historic color of the granite — along 71st Street and along Lexington where there are 9 storefronts. The recladding also includes the above-grade planters at either side of the front entrance at 71st Street, where the granite has also deteriorated;

WHEREAS the planter on the east side of the entrance will be lowered by 12”; the planter on the west side of the entrance can’t be lowered because it sits atop a service stair;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to add a small reveal to the columns that frame the front entry way and to the planters to provide texture and visual interest;

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes, at the ground level, to change the windows to black; the windows now present as a whitish yellow; the ground level windows at 71st Street and at the storefronts along Lexington Avenue would now be black [proposed amendment to the window master plan];

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, on Lexington, where the storefront windows as low to the sidewalk as a result of the slope/slant along this part of Lexington, to raise the sill to accommodate new slightly smaller energy efficient windows;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove all existing fixed awnings; the applicant proposes that all signage for the 9 retail shops would now be black with stainless steel lettering to create uniformity along the ground elevation along Lexington — the signage would fit into the 12” area above the windows where there were formerly the cases for the retractable awnings that have not been in-use for some years and that were hidden by the now-to-be deleted fixed awnings [Signage Master Plan];

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes to upgrade the lighting at the front entrance to a more modern look and replace the existing doctor’s office door (at left of front entrance) with a new door;

WHEREAS the applicant’s proposes changes at 135 East 71st Street create a more uniform look for the 1950’s no-style building, especially for the retail storefronts along Lexington Avenue and also tidies up the discordant elements around the entrance on 71st Street;

WHEREAS the applicant’s proposed changes are appropriate within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Squire)
ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

2. 969 Park Avenue – Park Avenue Historic District –A Renaissance Revival apartment building designed by Pickering and Walker in 1911-12. Application is to establish a master plan for 6/1 aluminum clad double hung windows in the primary facades of the building.

WHEREAS the Master Plan will match the existing six-over-one muntin pattern of the double hung windows;

WHEREAS the Master Plan will maintain the uniformity of the single glazed, six-over-one, wood windows currently installed in the building;

WHEREAS the current uniformity is due to the building’s requirement that all window replacements be done in the six-over-one configuration;

WHEREAS six-over-six and six-over-one were both possible original configurations;

WHEREAS the building has maintained the six-over-one configuration for the three visible elevations;

WHEREAS the six-over-one is an appropriate uniformity for a building of its period;

WHEREAS the smaller bathroom windows will be four-over-one;

WHEREAS the proposed windows will be aluminum clad wood windows with insulated glass;
WHEREAS the Master Plan window details will have similar profiles to the frames and muntins of the existing wood and aluminum clad wood windows;
WHEREAS the Master Plan will apply to the three visible facades: the west façade on Park Avenue; the south façade on East 82nd Street; and the east façade;
WHEREAS variations in window types and or grilles will be allowed in rear courtyard areas that are not visible;
WHEREAS the current window configuration has been in place since the 1980's and will be replicated in the Master Plan;
WHEREAS the proposed window configuration in the Master Plan is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Malik, Parshall, Squire); 1 opposed (Birnbaum); 1 abstention (Tamayo)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

3. **163 East 67th Street (Park East Synagogue) – Individual Landmark** – Application is to replace two existing sign boards with LED sign boards. [This application was originally heard at the September Landmarks Committee meeting and then withdrawn.]

WHEREAS 163 East 67th Street is a Moorish-style building designed by Schneider and Herter and constructed between 1889-1990.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing signage with LED signage to allow for more current display of updated information for services and special events at the Synagogue.

WHEREAS the existing mounting brackets will be used for the proposed signage.

WHEREAS in general the display will be monochromatic and the light level will be dimmed after dark and further dimmed after 11 pm.

WHEREAS the conduit path for the signs will run along molding to the rear wall for approximately 7'; the interior dimension of the conduit is approximately 1/2"; the conduit will be held in place by 2 curved straps and will be painted to match the concrete base below the baluster;

WHEREAS the applicant's proposal to replace the two existing sign boards with LED sign boards is appropriate for this unusually distinctive INDIVIDUAL LANDMARK.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Malik, Parshall, Pierson-Panes, Tamayo); 4 opposed (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Squire)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

4. **61 East 77th Street – Upper East Side Historic District** – *Christopher Stone Architect* – A neoFederal style building with Beaux-Arts features, designed by Harde and Hasselman, and built in 1916. – Application is for the addition of an access ramp, and the reconstruction and alteration of the existing stoop.

WHEREAS the building is currently occupied by Lenox Hill Radiology and residential tenants and has no accessible entrance to the first floor.

WHEREAS the New York Human Rights Commission has cited the building for lack of an accessible entrance to the Community Facility on the first floor.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to create a legal ramp 24 feet long and 4 feet wide between the existing building face and the decorative posts at the sidewalk edge.

WHEREAS the landing must be enlarged to conform to code minimum dimensions for wheelchair turning radius which necessitates extending the stoop 10” into the public way, requiring approval from the Department of Transportation.

WHEREAS sections of the existing decorative railings will be removed to make way for the ramp.

WHEREAS the entry doors will be widened to meet code and will be on actuators mounted on the exterior handrail (with no visible wiring).

WHEREAS the new stoop and ramp will be painted to match the existing color of the ramp and stoop which are painted limestone.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 11 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpert, Malik, Parshall, Pierson-Panes, Tamayo, Squire).

- 5. **5 East 62nd Street – Upper East Side Historic District – Arthur Chabon Architects** – A Modern style synagogue building designed by Percival Goodman and built in 1956. Application is to alter the façade, replace entry infill, and install an illuminated canopy.

WHEREAS applicant previously came before the Committee for approval of a rooftop addition and elevator extension;

WHEREAS existing building egress at ground floor does not meet building code requirements for exit path separation;

WHEREAS the building entry sequence does not meet current security requirements;

WHEREAS the existing canopy leading from the entry to the sidewalk edge is not in character with the distinctive modernist architecture of the building façade;

WHEREAS the proposed entry doors sensitively echo the original construction;

WHEREAS the proposed egress doors will be flush with the ground floor façade and will be sheathed in granite to match the original;

WHEREAS the proposed façade alterations taken as a whole strengthen the existing design and satisfy the egress and security requirements;

WHEREAS the applicant presented two permanent canopy options, either of which was acceptable and an appropriate addition to the historic façade;

WHEREAS the canopy will be flat, one foot thick, and will illuminate the pavement below it;

WHEREAS the canopy will appear to float free from the building façade although it will be firmly anchored to the building structure;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 11 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpert, Malik, Parshall, Pierson-Panes, Tamayo, Squire).

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

- 6. **1022 Lexington Avenue – Upper East Side Extension Historic District – Theodore Bodnar, Architect** –Application is for the enlargement of the first and second floor window bays, structural work, and the relocation of the residential building entry from Lexington Avenue to East 73rd

Street. [This application was originally heard at the September Landmarks Committee meeting. The applicant has modified his original proposal.]

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a neo-Grec-style brownstone designed by Thom and Wilson and constructed between 1880-1881;

WHEREAS applicant has revised his original proposal [*Please see attached original September resolution*] and has now 1) *reduced the size and amount of glass* 2) *reduced the massiveness of the glass* 3) *reintroduced wooden transoms on the 73rd Street elevation* 4) *broken up the glass in terms of visual appearance by thickening up the masonry pilasters at the 73rd Street elevation* 5) *retained the decorative wrought iron interior door now at the entrance to the residential section of the building by changing its location to the relocated entrance to residential part of building on 73rd Street where it will be more visible*];

WHEREAS in general, the applicant has reduced the size of the windows on the Lexington Avenue elevation at the ground level and has retained the multipaned window above and has reduced the size of the windows along the 73rd Street elevation, retained the transoms and increased the width of the pilasters and kept the multipaned windows at the 2nd floor;

WHEREAS the applicant's revised proposal retains much of the original charm of the first two floors at 1022 Lexington Ave;

WHEREAS the applicant's revised proposal is appropriate within the historic district;

WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for returning to the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 with a more contextual design;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 11 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Malik, Parshall, Pierson-Panes, Tamayo, Squire)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

ORIGINAL SEPTEMBER RESOLUTION:

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue is a neo-Grec brownstone rowhouse designed by Thomas & Wilson Between 1880-1881.

WHEREAS 1022 Lexington Avenue has two elevations: 80' along 73rd Street and 17' along Lexington Avenue

WHEREAS the first two floors of 1022 Lexington present as a restaurant; the upper two floors are residential.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to increase the amount of light into commercial space by enlarging all the windows at the first and second floor both on the Lexington Avenue elevation and at the 73rd Street elevation.

WHEREAS by adding more glass at the first and second stories, the applicant will reduce the now- existing inconsistencies among the windows which are of different sizes and have differing characteristics.

WHEREAS at the 73rd Street elevation, the applicant proposes 5 large plate glass windows and at the ground floor, 3 new plate glass windows and two new doors (one for the commercial space and one for the residential space); the windows will range in area from 64 sq. ft. to 95 sq. ft.;

WHEREAS at the Lexington Avenue elevation, the applicant proposes one large glass window at the second floor with 143 sq. ft. of area and at the first floor one large glass window with 110 sq. ft. of area;

WHEREAS the applicant's objective is to align the new windows with the vertical glazing in the residential portion of the building, to separate the commercial use from the residential use and to present consistency and visual uniformity on both elevations.

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes to change the existing entry to the residential portion of the building — now located on Lexington Avenue at the south portion of the building — to 73rd Street; **WHEREAS** the applicant will retain the decorative wrought iron panel at the internal residential entry at the new entry on 73rd Street;

WHEREAS at the 73rd Street elevation, the applicant proposes to remove the existing one wood cladding and replace with brick so that the historic look and fabric of the 73rd Street elevation for the first two floors is restored;

WHEREAS although disorganized, the existing windows add great charm and character to 1022 Lexington Avenue, especially the non-historic multi-paned window at the 2nd floor at Lexington Avenue;

WHEREAS the proposed design presents as not integrated — the artistry needed to combine something historic with something contemporary is lacking; the quirkiness of the 1022 Lexington Avenue is lost.

WHEREAS the applicant's proposal to replace the existing configuration of the windows with huge glass is out of context and inappropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 12 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Malik, Mason, Schneider)

TWO PUBLIC MEMBERS IN FAVOR: Christina Davis, Kimberly Selway

7. Old Business

4. New Business

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs