



Alida Camp
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager

505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, July 13, 2020 – 6:30PM**

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8 Manhattan ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within a Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, July 15, 2020 via Zoom**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Resolutions for approval:

Unanimous Approvals: Item 1a

Unanimous Disapprovals: Items 1b, 2

Minutes

1. **706 - 708 Madison Avenue (SW corner of Madison Avenue and 63rd Street), 702 - 704 Madison Avenue (adjacent to 706 - 708 Madison Avenue), 22 East 63rd Street (around the corner from 706 - 708 Madison Avenue) - Upper East Side Historic District - [Three interconnected structures.]**
706 - 708 Madison Avenue is a neo-Federal style bank building designed by Frank Easton and constructed in 1922. 702 - 704 Madison Avenue and 22 East 63rd Street designed by Page Ayers Crowley and constructed 2014-2016. Cas Stachelberg, Higgins and Quasebarth; *Space Smith Architects*.

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS:

PART A — All work proposed by the applicant at the three interconnected buildings now to be the flagship store for Hermès of Paris **EXCEPT FOR** the covering over of the original signage.

PART B — The Bank of New York sign above the existing entry to “the bank building” (706 - 708 Madison Avenue)

PART A

WHEREAS 706 - 708 Madison Avenue is a distinctive neo-Federal style bank building designed by Philadelphia architect Frank Easton Newman and constructed in 1921;

WHEREAS 702 - 704 Madison Avenue is a 5-story infill building designed by Page Ayres Crowley to replace a previously existing 2-story neo-Federal building designed by Mersin Shrady and built in 1940;

WHEREAS 22 East 63rd Street was formerly an empty lot with a brick wall at the sidewalk that now contains a 5-story building also designed by Page Ayers Crowley and constructed 2014 – 2016;

WHEREAS both 702 - 704 Madison Avenue and 22 East 63rd Street are contemporary in style;

WHEREAS the now existing buildings at 702 - 704 Madison Avenue and at 22 East 63rd Street were part of a Certificate of Appropriateness approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission in 2014 and constructed 2014 - 2016 [*Note that Community Board 8 voted to disapprove the two new buildings — presented as one new building to be connected to the preserved and restored bank building at the corner — in October 2013*];

WHEREAS the 3 buildings which were interconnected as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness application in 2013 have now been purchased by Hermès of Paris to serve as a new flagship location;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes at 706 Madison Avenue: a) replacing the wood main entry door with a glass door, b) installing new a new signage plaque over the main entry, c) replacing the first-floor wood windows with steel windows, d) installing awnings at the second-floor windows, and e) constructing a new statue (the Hermès signature cavalier of a rearing horse carrying flags) and railings at the roof, behind the historic balustrade;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes at the 4-story 702 - 704 Madison Avenue storefront infill and at the 5-story 22 East 63rd Street infill: a) replacing storefront infill, b) installing storefront signage, c) constructing a skylight and mechanicals at the roof;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the main entry door at 706 Madison Avenue, to change the existing wood door with a glass paneled door with a brass kick plate that will allow for views into the store; the door will lead into an interior vestibule;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing wood windows [for security at the ground level] at the base of the restored bank building with steel framed windows with the exact same profile and on the same plane as the existing wood windows; wood windows will be retained on the floors above the ground floor;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes at the 2nd floor at 706 Madison Avenue, fabric non-retractable awnings with loose skirts;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the roof of 706 Madison Avenue, to install a cavalier statue identical to the cavalier statue at the roof of the existing Hermès store at 62nd Street and Madison Avenue; the cavalier will be positioned at the corner facing NE;

WHEREAS the cavalier will stand on its own base, inboard and above the existing balustrade;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the roof, to remove the existing glass railing and install a taller simple iron railing inboard from the balustrade;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the base of the 702 - 704 Madison building, to replace the storefront infill [the existing storefront windows] with painted metal storefront windows with a charcoal brass finish; there will be decal signage on the entry doors [the Hermès logo];

WHEREAS the applicant proposes awnings at the 2nd floor with the Hermès logo on the loose balances or flaps;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to install new mechanical equipment at the roof at 702 -704 Madison Avenue to fit within an updated roof plan including new HVAC equipment, new skylights and new duct work;

WHEREAS an updated roof plan is required since the building code/New York City Fire Department regulations require a 6' clearance around mechanical equipment;

WHEREAS the updated roof plan will include a series of air handlers combined into a single enclosed unit and placed as far to the south on the roof as possible; smaller units to service the cellar of the building and flues that are not visible from the public way; there is an existing catwalk at the roof that will be retained;

WHEREAS at the roof at 702 - 704 Madison Avenue a new skylight will be installed that will extend 3' above the roof; the new skylight will not be visible from the public way;

WHEREAS the front edge of the large unit of combined air handlers is minimally visible on the NE corner of 63rd Street and Madison Avenue and is minimally visible looking SW along Madison Avenue;

WHEREAS however, as one looks south from 64th Street and Madison Avenue, the horizontal side of the packaged unit is very visible — at approximately 8' above the roofline; [The unit will be painted gray so that it presents as fading into the roofscape of the surrounding buildings.]

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the ground level of the 22 East 63rd Street infilled building, to replace the wooden egress door with a solid metal door which will now serve as the entrance to a small security office behind an enclosed display vitrine;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove the existing flagpole at 706 - 708 Madison Avenue (“the bank building”);

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT PART A of this application, all work at the three interconnected buildings **EXCEPT FOR** the covering over of The Bank of New York sign, is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

TWO PUBLIC MEMBERS IN FAVOR: Christina Davis, Kimberly Selway

PART B - The existing Bank of New York signage above the entry door at “the bank building”

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to place a new marble panel with the name of the applicant, Hermès, in front of the existing Bank of New York sign which is incised in a marble slab above the front entrance;
WHEREAS The Bank of New York was founded by Alexander Hamilton in 1784;
WHEREAS Alexander Hamilton, the first secretary of the United States Treasury, founded the bank to help stabilize the financial situation in America after the Revolutionary War; Alexander Hamilton is considered to be the father of the American banking system;
WHEREAS the applicant proposes awnings at 14 second floor windows both along the two buildings on Madison Avenue and on 63rd Street; the awnings will extend out 3’2” [8 windows along Madison Avenue and 6 windows along 63rd Street at “the bank building”; 22 East 63rd Street will not have awnings;
WHEREAS the skirts of the 14 awnings will have the “Hermès” logo printed on them;
WHEREAS “Hermès” lettering will be placed on each of the brass frames of the replaced storefront infill windows at 602 - 604 Madison Avenue;
WHEREAS the “Hermès” logo will be placed on the two glass entry doors of “the bank building”;
WHEREAS the signature “Hermès” cavalier statue will be placed on the roof of “the bank building; the cavalier will be highly visible;
WHEREAS the existing Bank of New York sign above “the bank building” refers to a time and a place in the history of our great city that should not be forgotten;
WHEREAS the applicant proposes almost an excess of signage; the new flagship store for Hermès will be easily recognizable;
WHEREAS the retention of the sign will not detract in any way from the visibility of the three interconnected buildings as they now present as the premier location for Hermès in North America;
WHEREAS the covering over of the marble plaque above “the bank building’s” Madison Avenue entry cannot be allowed;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT PART B of this application, the covering over the existing Bank of New York signage, be **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Kimberly Selway

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER AGAINST: Christina Davis

2. **1083 Fifth Avenue (between 89th and 90th Streets) - Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District-** *Jeffrey R. Karp, Ogden Codman LLC, Brian J. Connolly, Architect* - Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner & Killian and built in 1901-02 with significant alterations by Ogden Codman in 1913-15. Application to install a low wall and railing at the front of the building.

WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue is a Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner & Killian in 1901 – 1902 and significantly altered by Ogden Codman in 1913-15.
WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue is being turned back from an institutional building into a private residence;
WHEREAS the applicant seeks to create a transitional zone from the public sidewalk to the entrance of 1083 Fifth Avenue;
WHEREAS the building was at one time an “L” shape that included 3 East 89th Street;
WHEREAS the applicant showed that the original house had a transitional area;
WHEREAS the applicant stated that Codman turned 1083 Fifth into a Carriage House and removed the former wall enclosure that created a transitional space;
WHEREAS the applicant stated that the Carriage House provided a transitional zone on the interior, where people moved from the protected space for a carriage into the house;
WHEREAS the applicant stated that 3 East 89th Street became the main pedestrian entrance to the ‘L’ shaped house;
WHEREAS the applicant pointed out that the ground floor of 1083 Fifth had been lowered to sidewalk level to

enable a carriage to enter from Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the applicant could not confirm that there had been a curb cut on Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue and 3 East 89th Street are no longer connected;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional zone has a curved design with the spring point of the curve starting at the line of the low wall of the garden of 1080 Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the curve of the proposed low wall follows the curve of the townhouse;

WHEREAS the proposed low wall enclosure is of solid limestone;

WHEREAS the proposed railing above the limestone wall is brass;

WHEREAS there is a decorative metal entry gate with two leaves swinging inward;

WHEREAS the height of the stone wall is about 2'-6" and the height of the rail is about 3'-4";

WHEREAS the enclosure is held just short of the building to leave the façade material specified by Codman unaffected;

WHEREAS the six proposed planters are free standing (and not part of a garden) to enable the building to meet the ground plane per the Codman design;

WHEREAS the depth of the enclosure is about 8' and the remaining width of the sidewalk is about 15'-0"

WHEREAS the new sidewalk will match the grid and the color of the sidewalk on either side;

WHEREAS the sidewalks on the east side of Fifth Avenue are generally open with gardens that are set in front of and along the buildings – gardens that can be enjoyed by the public;

WHEREAS the applicant showed that Fifth Avenue sidewalks were typically 10 to 15 feet wide but with instances where sidewalks were less than six feet wide between tree pits and building gardens;

WHEREAS the examples of transitional spaces in the neighborhood that the applicant showed as precedents are visually open and welcoming;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional space at 1083 Fifth Avenue is visually closed and unwelcoming;

WHEREAS the proposed enclosure takes space from the public way for strictly private use;

WHEREAS the limestone wall appears additive and not a natural extension of the architectural character of the building;

WHEREAS the elongated rectangles and centered circles of the proposed limestone wall relate more to the design of the new main entrance doors (which are not a part of this application) than to the building;

WHEREAS the delicate metal gates are not related to the architectural language of the building;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional space is not contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, be it resolved that this application is **DISAPPROVED**.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo)

1 abstention (Freeland)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: (Selway)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER AGAINST: (Davis)

3. Old Business: There was no discussion of old business.

4. New Business: Brief discussion of status of Window Master Plan Subcommittee including plans for a forum in 2021 and status of letter drafted by Elizabeth and sent to the Chair of the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These items will be on the agenda for the August meeting of the Landmarks Committee.

David Helpert and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs