

**Alida Camp
Chair**

**Will Brightbill
District Manager**



**505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail**

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

July 17, 2020

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10007

RE: 1083 Fifth Avenue (between 89th and 90th Streets) - Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District-
Jeffrey R. Karp, Ogden Codman LLC, Brian J. Connolly, Architect - Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner & Killian and built in 1901-02 with significant alterations by Ogden Codman in 1913-15. Application to install a low wall and railing at the front of the building.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on July 15, 2020, the board **unanimously APPROVED** the following resolution by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue is a Beaux-Arts style townhouse designed by Turner & Killian in 1901 – 1902 and significantly altered by Ogden Codman in 1913-15;

WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue is being turned back from an institutional building into a private residence;

WHEREAS the applicant seeks to create a transitional zone from the public sidewalk to the entrance of 1083 Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the building was at one time an “L” shape that included 3 East 89th Street;

WHEREAS the applicant showed that the original house had a transitional area;

WHEREAS the applicant stated that Codman turned 1083 Fifth into a Carriage House and removed the former wall enclosure that created a transitional space;

WHEREAS the applicant stated that the Carriage House provided a transitional zone on the interior, where people moved from the protected space for a carriage into the house;

WHEREAS the applicant stated that 3 East 89th Street became the main pedestrian entrance to the “L” shaped house;

WHEREAS the applicant pointed out that the ground floor of 1083 Fifth had been lowered to sidewalk level to enable a carriage to enter from Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the applicant could not confirm that there had been a curb cut on Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS 1083 Fifth Avenue and 3 East 89th Street are no longer connected;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional zone has a curved design with the spring point of the curve starting at the line of the low wall of the garden of 1080 Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the curve of the proposed low wall follows the curve of the townhouse;

WHEREAS the proposed low wall enclosure is of solid limestone;

WHEREAS the proposed railing above the limestone wall is brass;

WHEREAS there is a decorative metal entry gate with two leaves swinging inward;

WHEREAS the height of the stone wall is about 2’-6” and the height of the rail is about 3’-4”;

WHEREAS the enclosure is held just short of the building to leave the façade material specified by Codman unaffected;

WHEREAS the six proposed planters are free standing (and not part of a garden) to enable the building to meet the ground plane per the Codman design;

WHEREAS the depth of the enclosure is about 8’-0” and the remaining width of the sidewalk is about 15’-0”

WHEREAS the new sidewalk will match the grid and the color of the sidewalk on either side;

WHEREAS the sidewalks on the east side of Fifth Avenue are generally open with gardens that are set in front of and along the buildings – gardens that can be enjoyed by the public;

WHEREAS the applicant showed that Fifth Avenue sidewalks were typically 10 to 15 feet wide but with instances where sidewalks were less than six feet wide between tree pits and building gardens;

WHEREAS the examples of transitional spaces in the neighborhood that the applicant showed as precedents are visually open and welcoming;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional space at 1083 Fifth Avenue is visually closed and unwelcoming;

WHEREAS the proposed enclosure takes space from the public way for strictly private use;

WHEREAS the limestone wall appears additive and not a natural extension of the architectural character of the building;

WHEREAS the elongated rectangles and centered circles of the proposed limestone wall relate more to the design of the new main entrance doors (which are not a part of this application) than to the building;

WHEREAS the delicate metal gates are not related to the architectural language of the building;

WHEREAS the proposed transitional space is not contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE, be it resolved that this application is **DISAPPROVED**.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,

Alida Camp

Alida Camp
Chair

David Helpern and Jane Parshall

David Helpern and Jane Parshall
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York
Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative
Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District
Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District
Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District