

Alida Camp  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue  
Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
[www.cb8m.com](http://www.cb8m.com) Website  
[info@cb8m.com](mailto:info@cb8m.com) - E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan**

May 25, 2020

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair  
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission  
Municipal Building  
One Center Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10007

**RE: 1107 Fifth Avenue – Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District**—*Pietro Cicognani, Architect*—A Neo Renaissance Style building originally constructed in 1925 by Rouse & Goldstone. Application is for window replacement and enlargement at the 14<sup>th</sup> floor.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on May 20, 2020, the board approved the following resolution by a vote of 48 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue is a neo-Renaissance style apartment building designed by Rouse & Goldstone and constructed in 1925;

**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue is one of the grandest prewar apartment buildings on 5th Avenue;

**WHEREAS** Marjorie Merriweather Post owned a mansion on the building site, known as the Burden mansion;

**WHEREAS** Mrs. Post agreed to give up her home but only if the developer, George Fuller, agreed to recreate her 54 room mansion on the building's top three floors, creating New York City's first penthouse;

**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue was converted to a co-op in the mid-fifties; the top three floors were converted into 6 apartments;

**WHEREAS** the application being presented to the committee is for the apartment on the south half of the 14th floor, Apt. 14S;

**WHEREAS** this apartment has 3 elevations: the west-facing elevation on 5th Avenue, the south-facing elevation and the east-facing elevation;

**WHEREAS** the applicant is proposing changes to the windows at the south and east elevations which are considered to be secondary elevations;

**WHEREAS** at both non-primary elevations there is a series of windows that do not align with the programming of the interior space and are inconsistent in organization;

**WHEREAS** at the south elevation, the applicant proposes to regularize the windows — there are now 8 windows, a void which presents as a window opening and a door on a recessed terrace so that the existing south elevation has 10 openings;

**WHEREAS** at the south elevation, the 10 openings will be retained but reconfigured: — a window will be added at the recessed terrace and two small openings east of the recessed terrace will be combined to create a new tripartite window;

**WHEREAS** at the east elevation, the applicant also proposes to regularize the windows — there are now 4 windows; of the 4, two have mullions and present as "hot cross buns";

**WHEREAS** at the east elevation, the applicant proposes that three of the 4 window openings windows retain their original dimensions and that one window be enlarged;  
**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes that all of the windows on both the south and east elevations present as whole glass lights framed in bronze with in-swing casements;  
**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue implemented a Master Plan in 2009 for the windows;  
**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes departing from the building's Master Plan with his application for the windows on the south-facing and east-facing elevations by proposing whole glass lights;  
**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue stands out visually and stands out historically;  
**WHEREAS** 1107 Fifth Avenue is surrounded by low-in-scale buildings which enhance significantly the south-facing elevation; the south-facing elevation assumes an importance within the historic district that cannot be ignored;  
**WHEREAS** the windows on south-facing elevation would be improved by the introduction of some kind of division of lights instead of using the whole glass lights proposed by the applicant;  
**WHEREAS** the applicant was unable to reference the original historic windows; images from mid-century tax photos appear to show double hung windows;  
**WHEREAS** the applicant's presentation to the committee lacked clarity;  
**WHEREAS** the applicant's proposed changes to the windows at the south-facing elevation and the east-facing elevation for Apt. 14S are out of context and inappropriate within the Historic District;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,

*Alida Camp*  
Alida Camp  
Chair

*David Helpern and Jane Parshall*  
David Helpern and Jane Parshall  
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York  
Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12<sup>th</sup> Congressional District Representative  
Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President  
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28<sup>th</sup> Senatorial District  
Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73<sup>rd</sup> Assembly District  
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76<sup>th</sup> Assembly District  
Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5<sup>th</sup> Council District  
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4<sup>th</sup> Council District