

Alida Camp
Chair

Will Brightbill
District Manager



The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan

505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

February 20, 2020

Honorable Sarah Carroll, Chair
NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission
Municipal Building
One Center Street, 9th Floor
New York, New York 10007

RE: 1295 Madison Avenue - Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District. Julio Magarino, Architect, FORM4 Design Studio
– A Neo-Renaissance style hotel building designed by Louis Korn and constructed in 1899-1900. Application to reconfigure and enlarge existing penthouse; reintroduce decorative cornice on primary facades; relocate and upgrade roof- top mechanicals; remove fire escape stair at 2nd and 3rd level; and fill rear exterior court along the east façade.

Dear Chair Carroll,

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on February 19, 2020, the board **DISAPPROVED** the following resolution by a vote of 31 in favor, 0 opposed, 3 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

WHEREAS 1295 Madison Avenue is a nine-story building with a 10th floor penthouse;

WHEREAS the original cornice was removed between 1940 and 1985;

WHEREAS a new cornice to approximate the original cornice will be added;

WHEREAS the cornices on the two hotel examples from the early 20th century shown as typical for buildings of that style had cornices with ample height for friezes;

WHEREAS the design of the new cornice for 1295 Madison Avenue will approximate the design of the cornice at 91-31 Fifth Avenue, a building also designed by Louis Korn at about the same time as he designed 1295 Madison Avenue;

WHEREAS the height of the space for the frieze on the cornice of 91-31 Fifth Avenue will be reduced for 1295 Madison Avenue, the overall height of the cornice for 1295 Madison Avenue will be reduced and the proportions changed from the cornice at 91-31 Fifth Avenue;

WHEREAS the top of the cornice will be set at 3'-6" above the roof so that the cornice can also serve as the parapet;

WHEREAS the new cornice will be made of fiberglass, a light durable material acceptable to the Landmarks Preservation Commission as a substitute for the original stone;

WHEREAS the intent of the proposed cornice is to bring back the palazzo form of the building, perform the termination function of the original cornice, and to make the proposed addition on the roof invisible;

WHEREAS there are two large light wells in the northern and southern halves of the building and two recesses in the rear in the northern and southern halves of the building;

WHEREAS the current 10th floor approximates an "L" running east-west on the north end and north-south along the rear to the east;

WHEREAS the tenth floor provides access to the roof;

WHEREAS there is mechanical equipment, a water tank, and a water tower on the 10th floor;

WHEREAS the existing 10th floor, mechanical equipment, and water tower are minimally visible from various points of view;

WHEREAS the proposed addition fills in the two light wells and the northern recess in the rear;

WHEREAS the proposed 10th floor is set back 10 feet from the front of the building and 15 feet from the southern face of the building on East 92nd Street;

WHEREAS the proposed 11th floor is set into the north east quadrant of the building;

WHEREAS the proposed 10th floor provides access to a roof terrace and the proposed 11th floor provides access to a private roof terrace;

WHEREAS mechanical equipment is set on top of the proposed 11th floor;

WHEREAS the design of the water supply for the building eliminates the water tower;

WHEREAS the top of the water tower and the top of the new proposed mechanical equipment are both about 36 feet above the roof level;

WHEREAS the design of the habitable portions of the 10th and 11th floors will use brick and Indiana limestone to match the existing masonry materials;

WHEREAS the proposed windows at the penthouse levels will be separated by narrow brick piers;

WHEREAS the typical window at the penthouse levels will have a vertical orientation and be divided in the center into narrow vertical halves for operation;

WHEREAS the proposed windows at the penthouse levels will have a rust color, different from the color of the windows in the nine floors below;

WHEREAS the intent of the design of the proposed penthouse levels is to be compatible with the original design without replicating the original design;

WHEREAS the proposed penthouse levels and mechanical equipment are almost fully visible from various points of view;

WHEREAS this highly visible addition, which is meant to be compatible with the original building, is not appropriate with respect to its excessive bulk and is out of character with respect to its architectural language;

THEREFORE, this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

Sincerely,


Alida Camp
Chair


David Helpen and Jane Parshall
Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York
Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative
Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President
Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District
Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District
Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District
Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District
Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District