

Alida Camp
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, NY 10022
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail
www.cb8m.com – Website

The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, June 17, 2019 – 6:30PM
Marymount Manhattan College, Regina Peruggi Room
221 East 71st Street (between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)

Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, June 19, 2019, at the New York Blood Center, Auditorium (310 East 67th Street) at 6:30PM**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

Minutes

Resolutions for Approval:

Item 1 (Unanimous)

Resolutions for Disapproval:

Item 2, Item 3

1. **8 East 93rd Street (between Madison and 5th Avenues) – Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District** *Lichten Architects*. A Neo-Classical style townhouse designed by Harvey Stevenson and constructed in 1940. Application for a reconfiguration of the existing front yard and lowering the sill heights of three existing windows.

WHEREAS 8 East 93rd Street is a five-story townhouse with a brown stucco façade;

WHEREAS the existing masonry and stucco wall separating the front yard and the sidewalk will be demolished;

WHEREAS the wall will be replaced with a new, black, wrought iron railing set on a 9” high curb with the top of the railing set at 3’-6” above the sidewalk;

WHEREAS new, black painted wood planters, 15’ high and 11 ½” deep will be set on the curb behind the new railing;

WHEREAS the fence and planters will be similar to that at 12 East 93rd Street;

WHEREAS the parlor floor windows had been shortened about 18 inches in a prior renovation;

WHEREAS the existing parlor floor windows that are set in the shortened, arched openings will be replaced with new windows in a restored arched opening that will replicate the height of the original windows;

WHEREAS the first floor and the parlor floor are separated on the façade by a water table – or string course;

WHEREAS the new windows will sit on sills just above the water table to maintain the continuity of the water table;

WHEREAS the new windows will have divided lights;

WHEREAS the new windows will have a similar relationship to the water table as the windows in other townhouses along the street have in their facades;

WHEREAS the new iron window guard and service guard will match the design at 10 East 93rd Street;

WHEREAS the new main entrance door will be a new raised panel wood door painted black;

WHEREAS the glass transom above the new entrance door will remain;

WHEREAS this house had been owned and renovated by F.A.O. Schwartz;

WHEREAS the “drum” light over the entry door and the existing stucco, nautical figures in a frieze just below the water table will be preserved;

WHEREAS all the stucco repairs will match the color of the existing stucco;

WHEREAS the renovations to the townhouse are contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **approved** as presented.

VOTE: 9 in Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: (Davis)

2. **20 East 74th Street (SW corner of Madison Avenue and 74th Street) - Upper East Side Historic District.** Loren Canon architect. Application is to replace existing black stone exterior cladding at entrance and to remove one window at entrance.

WHEREAS 20 East 74th Street is a modern-style apartment building designed by Sylvan Bien and constructed in 1945-47;

WHEREAS the residential entrance to the building is on East 74th Street;

WHEREAS on either side of the residential entrance at the ground level, the applicant proposes to replace the existing black stone, which is damaged, with new stone to match the stone to be removed;

WHEREAS there are two windows of the existing residential entrance set into the black stone; **WHEREAS** one window is for an office; the other window that is to the east of the entrance is part of a retail space that faces Madison Avenue and is not used by the occupant of the retail space;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the unused window for the retail space with black stone that would match the rest of the residential entrance;

WHEREAS to maintain the existing symmetry of the residential entrance with the two flanking windows, the applicant proposes to create a recess in the black stone that would mimic in size and dimension the existing to-be-removed window. [The window to the west of the entrance would remain; the window to the east of the entrance would now present as black stone that is detailed with a recess to mimic the removed window, thus maintaining the symmetry of the entrance.];

WHEREAS the existing symmetry of the residential entrance is the most important aspect of an otherwise banal white brick building;

WHEREAS the existing window to the east of the residential entrance should not be removed; removing the window diminishes completely the existing symmetry;

WHEREAS the idea of a “blind” window in a modern building is architecturally inappropriate;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **disapproved** as presented.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)
3 against (Baron, Chu, Cohn)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER AGAINST: Christina Davis

3. 20 East 68th Street (NE corner Madison Avenue and 68th Street) — Upper East Side Historic District. Anthony Orlando, architect. Application is to change the windows from aluminum double-hung windows to casement windows.

WHEREAS 20 East 68th Street is an apartment building designed by Boak & Road and constructed in 1955;

WHEREAS 20 East 68th Street is considered to be a no-style building in the designation report for the district;

WHEREAS the original windows were aluminum double-hung windows;

WHEREAS the original double-hung windows were replaced approximately 30 years ago with in-kind aluminum windows;

WHEREAS the applicant now proposes to replace the existing double-hung windows with aluminum casement windows;

WHEREAS the applicant’s proposal for aluminum casement windows do not present as an aesthetic improvement;

WHEREAS the double-hung design of the original windows provide more texture for the otherwise banal building design; the original design for the windows should be retained;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is **disapproved** as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER AGAINST: Christina Davis

4. Old Business
5. New Business

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs