

Alida Camp  
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, NY 10022  
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill  
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail  
www.cb8m.com – Website

**The City of New York  
Community Board 8 Manhattan  
Landmarks Committee  
Monday, January 14, 2019 – 6:30PM  
Marymount Manhattan College  
221 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street (between 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenues)**

*Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.*

**PLEASE NOTE:** When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, January 23, 2019, at the New York Blood Center Auditorium (310 East 67<sup>th</sup> Street, between 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenues) at 6:30PM**. They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

### Minutes

**Items 1 and 2:** Unanimous Approval  
**Items 3 and 4:** Approval

1. **132 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street (between Lexington and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** *Erin Bartling, Selldorf Architects*. Application is for work at the front elevation, the rear elevation and at the penthouse.

**THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: PART A - THE FRONT ELEVATION AND PART B - THE REAR ELEVATION**

**PART A - THE FRONT ELEVATION**

**WHEREAS** 132 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street was originally designed by F. T. Camp as a Queen Anne-style brownstone and constructed in 1884-85;

**WHEREAS** 132 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street was remodeled in 1928 into a brick neo-Federal style house (architect unknown);

**WHEREAS** at the front elevation, the applicant proposes to restore in-kind all of the painted black wooden windows except at the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor;

**WHEREAS** at the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor, the applicant proposes to drop the existing sills on the two existing windows by 15"; the windows now present as 2'10" high, they will now be 3'8" high – the width will not change;

**WHEREAS** at the penthouse level, the applicant proposes to retain the existing bulk;

**WHEREAS** at the penthouse level, the applicant proposes to revise the window and door openings; the existing window at the left on the front elevation of the penthouse will become a door and the existing door at the right on the front elevation of the penthouse will become a window. The new door will now provide access to the existing terrace;

**WHEREAS** dropping the sills at the windows on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

**WHEREAS** the penthouse is set quite a bit back at the front elevation;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application — The work at the Front Elevation — is approved as presented.**

**VOTE:**           7 in Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)  
                  1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

## **PART B - THE REAR ELEVATION**

**WHEREAS** at the rear elevation, the windows present as a potpourri of styles and treatments;

**WHEREAS** at the 4th and 5th floors, there is a decorative brick arch above one window on the 4th floor and one window on the 5th floor — on the left side as one faces the rear elevation;

**WHEREAS** at the 5th floor, there is an existing divided light French door leading to a small terrace with an existing decorative wrought iron fence/guard rail — the existing divided light French door will be replaced by a sliding clear glass door and the parapet will be raised for code compliance;

**WHEREAS** at the penthouse level (6th floor), there are two existing divided light bay windows: the one on the left will be replaced by a sliding glass clear door—and the parapet will be raised for code compliance since a new small terrace is being created;

**WHEREAS** at the penthouse level, the bay window on the right will be replaced by a clear glass bay and will be dropped by 18" to create a larger opening;

**WHEREAS** at the 4th and 5th floors, the applicant proposes to retain the two historic arched openings;

**WHEREAS** otherwise all of the windows (9 out of 12 now with divided lights) will be, in general enlarged and changed to either wooden framed sliding glass or "tilt and turn" style windows, including the new bay at the penthouse level and the new set of sliding plain glass doors at the penthouse level and the sliding plain glass door at the 5th floor;

**WHEREAS** the raised parapets at the 5th floor and at the penthouse present as "raised brick walls"; the applicant is removing the existing decorative wrought iron fence at the fifth floor and building up the parapet/ roofline at the penthouse level;

**WHEREAS** at Lexington Avenue between 70th and 71st Street there is a view corridor created by an existing one story building that allows the viewer to see the raised parapets;

**WHEREAS** there is an angled roof over the new bay window at the penthouse; the applicant proposes to change the roof from the existing tar to a new gray metal/zinc roof;

**WHEREAS** on the roof, the applicant also proposes a new elevator bulkhead and new mechanical equipment;

**WHEREAS** at the penthouse, the applicant proposes to swap the existing brick for stucco; the applicant does not propose to increase the footprint of the penthouse;

**WHEREAS** the proposed enlarged “tilt and turn” or sliding glass “blank windows” for all floors at the rear are too big and lacking in character and are inappropriate and inconsistent with the windows on the front elevation;

**WHEREAS** the existing rear elevation with divided lights on all of the windows provides more texture than the proposed “blank” windows; the existing elevation with its divided light windows has a much stronger tie to the front elevation;

**WHEREAS** the buildup the brick parapet at the 5th floor window at the expense of losing the decorative wrought iron railing and the buildup of the brick parapet for the new penthouse level terrace is inappropriate and not contextual within the historic district;

**WHEREAS** the proposed rear elevation would present as “bulked up” or heavy with the extended brick parapets; the grace of the existing elevation is lost;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that Part B of this application — the proposed changes at the rear elevation— are **disapproved** as presented.

**VOTE:** 7 in Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo)  
1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

2. **20 East 74<sup>th</sup> Street (between Madison and 5<sup>th</sup> Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** *Loren Cannon, LECA Architect.* A Modern style building designed by Sylvan Bien and constructed in 1945-47. Application is for the replacement of entrance doors, transoms, sidelights, and the building awning.

**WHEREAS** the existing stainless-steel framed entrance doors, transoms, and sidelights have deteriorated;

**WHEREAS** the doors are no longer functional and are difficult to maintain;

**WHEREAS** the canopy has deteriorated;

**WHEREAS** the entrance doors, transoms, sidelights, and canopy will be replaced in kind;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **approved** as presented.

**VOTE:** 7 in Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo)  
1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

3. **150 East End Avenue (between East 86<sup>th</sup> and East 87<sup>th</sup> Street) – Henderson Place Historic District.** *Nick Elliot, Owner.* Application is to replace the 3rd floor windows in the building.

**WHEREAS** 150 East End Avenue is part of the Henderson Place Historic District;

**WHEREAS** 150 East End Avenue is one of the 32 houses originally built by the developer John C. Henderson for persons of modest means;

**WHEREAS** the houses were all designed by Lamb & Rich in the Queen Anne style;

**WHEREAS** 150 East End Avenue was formerly lived in by Alfred Lunt and Lynne Fontaine;

**WHEREAS** the windows on the 1st, 2nd and 3rd floors are to be replaced with new black-painted wood windows; there will be no change to the ground level windows;

**WHEREAS** the new windows at the 1st and 2nd floors were approved at the staff level at the LPC, but were included in the applicant's presentation at the request of the LPC;

**WHEREAS** the windows at the 3rd floor (two windows) will be changed to match with the 6 over 6 double hung windows at the 1st and 2nd floors; the existing original and historic transoms will be removed;

**WHEREAS** new brick mold casing for the windows will be matched to the historic brick mold; the third floor wood brick molding will remain in place;

**WHEREAS** the applicant is essentially swapping a 3-part window at the 3rd floor for a 6 over 6 double hung window;

**WHEREAS** other historic windows within the historic district have been changed; the two new 6 over 6 replacement windows are consistent with windows on neighboring houses;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **approved** as presented.

**VOTE:** 4 in favor (Birnbaum, Chu, Cohn, Parshall)  
3 against (Ashby, Helpern, Tamayo)  
1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

4. **828-850 Madison Avenue (between East 69<sup>th</sup> and East 70<sup>th</sup> Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District** *Maxwell Pau, Beyer Blender Belle Architects*. A neo-Renaissance style building designed by George Fred Pelham and constructed in 1925-26. Application is for proposed repair and modification to the marquee to shorten its depth.

**WHEREAS** the existing marquee on Madison Avenue is faced with a decorative metal banding;  
**WHEREAS** the existing marquee has a metal and acrylic skirt in which acrylic panels are set in a decorative metal frame;

**WHEREAS** the existing marquee is 14'-11" wide and extends 12'-9" from the face of the building;

**WHEREAS** the existing marquee is similar in design to the main entrance marquee on East 69<sup>th</sup> Street;

**WHEREAS** the 69<sup>th</sup> Street marquee has textured glass panels;

**WHEREAS** the Madison Avenue marquee had textured glass panels that were changed to acrylic panels;

**WHEREAS** the existing marquee has been damaged by trucks backing in to park;

**WHEREAS** acrylic panels are missing;

**WHEREAS** the underside of the marquee is subdivided into eight bronze rectangles with a surface mounted metal cylinder lighting fixture in the center of each rectangle;

**WHEREAS** the marquee will be shortened by two 15" modules to extend 10'-3" from the face of the building;

**WHEREAS** the shorter marquee will comply with current code that requires that the outer face of the marquee be held back from the curb a minimum of two feet;

**WHEREAS** all the decorative elements will be the same as the existing and the acrylic panels will be changed to textured glass to match the 69<sup>th</sup> Street marquee;

**WHEREAS** the pattern of the underside of the marquee will be similar to the existing except that the panels will be shorter;

**WHEREAS** the existing metal cylinder lights will be replaced with custom, clear glass cylinder lights;

**WHEREAS** sconces with a downlight component with illuminate the first floor;  
**WHEREAS** the first two stories of the façade will be illuminated with lighting fixtures that will be located on stone sills and on permanent awnings, and shielded from view;  
**WHEREAS** the lighting will create a soft glow that will illuminate only to the tops of the decorative arches at the second floor;

**THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **approved** as presented.

**VOTE:**           5 in Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Helpern, Parshall)  
                  1 Opposed (Tamayo)  
                  1 Not Voting for Cause (Cohn)  
                  1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

5. **Old Business**

6. **New Business**

1. The National Society Colonial Dames property, 215 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street.

**David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs**