Alida Camp Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York Community Board 8 Manhattan

January 25, 2019

Hon. Sarah Carroll, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Center Street, 9th Floor New York, NY, 10007

RE: 132 East 71st Street (between Lexington and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District *Erin Bartling, Selldorf Architects.* Application is for work at the front elevation, the rear elevation and at the penthouse.

This application is divided into two parts.

Dear Chair Carroll:

PART A, THE FRONT ELEVATION

At the Full Board meeting of Community Board 8 Manhattan held on January 23, 2019, the board voted to <u>approve</u> the following section of the application in accordance with the following resolution by a vote of 38 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause:

WHEREAS 132 East 71st Street was originally designed by F. T. Camp as a Queen Anne-style brownstone and constructed in 1884-85;

WHEREAS 132 East 71st Street was remodeled in 1928 into a brick neo-Federal style house (architect unknown);

WHEREAS at the front elevation, the applicant proposes to restore in-kind all of the painted black wooden windows except at the 3rd floor;

WHEREAS at the 3rd floor, the applicant proposes to drop the existing sills on the two existing windows by 15"; the windows now present as 2'10" high, they will now be 3'8" high – the width will not change;

WHEREAS at the penthouse level, the applicant proposes to retain the existing bulk; WHEREAS at the penthouse level, the applicant proposes to revise the window and door openings; the existing window at the left on the front elevation of the penthouse will become a door and the

existing door at the right on the front elevation of the penthouse will become a window. The new door will now provide access to the existing terrace;

WHEREAS dropping the sills at the windows on the 3rd floor is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

WHEREAS the penthouse is set quite a bit back at the front elevation;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application — the work at the Front Elevation — is <u>approved</u> as presented.

PART B, THE REAR ELEVATION

The board voted to <u>disapprove</u> the following section of the application in accordance with the following resolution by a vote of 39 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause:

WHEREAS at the rear elevation, the windows present as a potpourri of styles and treatments; WHEREAS at the 4th and 5th floors, there is a decorative brick arch above one window on the 4th floor and one window on the 5th floor — on the left side as one faces the rear elevation; WHEREAS at the 5th floor, there is an existing divided light French door leading to a small terrace with an existing decorative wrought iron fence/guard rail — the existing divided light French door will be replaced by a sliding clear glass door and the parapet will be raised for code compliance; WHEREAS at the penthouse level (6th floor), there are two existing divided light bay windows: the

one on the left will be replaced by a sliding glass clear door—and the parapet will be raised for code compliance since a new small terrace is being created;

WHEREAS at the penthouse level, the bay window on the right will be replaced by a clear glass bay and will be dropped by 18" to create a larger opening;

WHEREAS at the 4th and 5th floors, the applicant proposes to retain the two historic arched openings;

WHEREAS otherwise all of the windows (9 out of 12 now with divided lights) will be, in general enlarged and changed to either wooden framed sliding glass or "tilt and turn" style windows, including the new bay at the penthouse level and the new set of sliding plain glass doors at the penthouse level and the sliding plain glass door at the 5th floor;

WHEREAS the raised parapets at the 5th floor and at the penthouse present as "raised brick walls"; the applicant is removing the existing decorative wrought iron fence at the fifth floor and building up the parapet/ roofline at the penthouse level;

WHEREAS at Lexington Avenue between 70th and 71st Street there is a view corridor created by an existing one story building that allows the viewer to see the raised parapets;

WHEREAS there is an angled roof over the new bay window at the penthouse; the applicant proposes to change the roof from the existing tar to a new gray metal/zinc roof;

WHEREAS on the roof, the applicant also proposes a new elevator bulkhead and new mechanical equipment;

WHEREAS at the penthouse, the applicant proposes to swap the existing brick for stucco; the applicant does not propose to increase the footprint of the penthouse;

WHEREAS the proposed enlarged "tilt and turn" or sliding glass "blank windows" for all floors at the rear are too big and lacking in character and are inappropriate and inconsistent with the windows on the front elevation:

WHEREAS the existing rear elevation with divided lights on all of the windows provides more texture than the proposed "blank" windows; the existing elevation with its divided light windows has a much stronger tie to the front elevation;

WHEREAS the buildup the brick parapet at the 5th floor window at the expense of losing the decorative wrought iron railing and the buildup of the brick parapet for the new penthouse level terrace is inappropriate and not contextual within the historic district:

WHEREAS the proposed rear elevation would present as "bulked up" or heavy with the extended brick parapets; the grace of the existing elevation is lost;

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that Part B of this application — the proposed changes at the rear elevation—are **disapproved** as presented.

Please advise us of any action taken on this matter.

(US)

Sincerely,

Chair

June Posselal (WB) David Helpern and Jane Parshall

Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York cc:

Honorable Carolyn Maloney, 12th Congressional District Representative

Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 28th Senatorial District

Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District

Honorable Rebecca Seawright, NYS Assembly Member 76th Assembly District

Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District

Honorable Keith Powers, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District