

Alida Camp
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, NY 10022
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail
www.cb8m.com – Website

**The City of New York
Community Board 8 Manhattan
Landmarks Committee
Monday, December 17, 2018 – 6:30PM
Marymount Manhattan College
221 East 71st Street (between 2nd and 3rd Avenues)**

Please note: The resolutions contained in the committee minutes are recommendations submitted by the committee chair to the Community Board. At the monthly full board meeting, the resolutions are discussed and voted upon by all members of Community Board 8 Manhattan.

PLEASE NOTE: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Tuesday, December 18, 2018, at the New York Blood Center Auditorium (310 East 67th Street, between 1st and 2nd Avenues) at 6:30PM.** They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

AGENDA

1. **950 Park Avenue (between East 81st and East 82nd Streets) – Park Avenue Historic District**
Michael Robarge, Panorama Windows LTD. Application is for a Master Plan for window replacement.

WHEREAS 950 Park Avenue is a Renaissance Revival-style apartment building designed by J.E.R. Carpenter and constructed in 1919-1920;

WHEREAS the proposed Master Plan would apply to the windows along Park Avenue, the 82nd Street elevation and the west facing elevation plus a small section of the windows on south and west elevations within the inner courtyard;

WHEREAS the Master Plan would not apply the lot line windows on the south elevation;

WHEREAS the original historic window design is a 6 over 6 wooden window with double hung one over ones on the non-primary elevations — the west elevation and part of the south elevation;

WHEREAS in general, on the two primary elevations, the windows have all been replaced with “tilt and turn” windows except at the ground level where they remain 6 over 6 (the original historic design);

WHEREAS the applicant’s Master Plan proposes metal “tilt and turn” windows as the official replacement window on the primary elevations, except at the ground where the historic 6 over 6 windows would remain;

WHEREAS 950 Park Avenue was designed by one of the giants of early twentieth century apartment house architects, J. E. R. Carpenter, and is in a prominent location on the Upper East Side;

WHEREAS on the secondary elevations, one over one double hung windows are acceptable;

WHEREAS on the primary elevations, the building should return to the original historic wooden 6 over 6 window for its Master Plan;

WHEREAS the texture of the 6 over 6 historic windows is important to the architectural integrity of the building;

WHEREAS metal framed “tilt and turn” windows are inappropriate and out of context within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Harrington, Helpert, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

2. **4 East 79th Street (between Madison and 5th Avenues) – Metropolitan Museum Historic District** *Theodore H.M Prudon FAIA, Prudon and Partners*. Application is for a new temporary ornamental fence and gate.

WHEREAS the bus stop has been extended from the corner of Fifth Avenue to the front of 4 West 79th Street due to the use of articulated buses;

WHEREAS the paved area in front of the house is used as an extension of the sidewalk for people waiting for buses;

WHEREAS the house is set back from the property line;

WHEREAS the main entrance door to the house is in the center of the façade;

WHEREAS the house currently has a fence on either side of the main entrance;

WHEREAS the houses on either side of 4 East 79th Street have fences;

WHEREAS a temporary fence with a centrally located gate would limit access to the open area in front of the house;

WHEREAS the proposed temporary fence and gate would be removed when the bus stop is relocated from the front of the house;

WHEREAS the open area in front of the house is defined by a wrought iron fence that is set, in part, on granite curbs;

WHEREAS the existing fence is eight feet high;

WHEREAS the proposed fence and gate are set in line with the east-west portions of the existing fence along the property line of the house;

WHEREAS the temporary fence and gate is made of the same wrought iron as the existing fence;

WHEREAS the temporary fence and gate would be 4'-6" high and would be set on a granite curb to match the granite curbs at the existing fence;

WHEREAS the temporary fence and gate would be independent of the existing fence in that it would have short returns on the ends and would not touch the rounded corners of the existing fence;

WHEREAS the temporary fence would have the same decorative motif at the base of the fence as the existing fence;

WHEREAS the tops of the verticals of the temporary fence would be simple arrowheads matching the arrowheads on the tops of the verticals of the existing fence but without the decorative motif at the top of the existing fence;

WHEREAS the lower height of the temporary fence is meant to create a sense of welcome while also precluding access to people waiting for the buses;

THEREFORE BE IT REOLVED that the temporary fence is approved as presented.

VOTE: In Favor (Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

Opposed (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn)

Public member In Favor (Davis)

3. **33 East 93rd Street (between Madison and 5th Avenues) – Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District** *Arpad Baksa, Arpad Baksa Architect, P.C.* Application for a new, retractable canvas awning above the entrance door.

WHEREAS 33 East 93rd Street is a Renaissance revival-style apartment building designed by Gilbert Schellenger and constructed in 1889-1890;

WHEREAS 33 East 93rd Street is a corner building and is part of a group of row houses that turns the corner and designed by the well-respected architect, Gilbert Schellenger. (No's. 25, 27, 29, 31 are on 93rd Street; 33 is the corner house; 1318 and 1320 are on Madison.);

WHEREAS row houses turning a corner are unusual in Carnegie Hill;

WHEREAS the proposed canopy is for the East 93rd Street basement entrance to a retail establishment;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a retractable canvas awning 5'6" deep x 6'4" with a 6" skirt;

WHEREAS the proposed awning is angled down and would be a bright orange color;

WHEREAS the awning would flank the beveled corner of the building and would look awkward and out of place;

WHEREAS there are no other awnings along 93rd Street;

WHEREAS the proposed awning is inappropriate and out of context within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

4. **Kaye Playhouse Entrance at Loewe’s Plaza, North Building, Hunter College (East 68th Street, between Lexington and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** *Pat Giacalone and Tom Abraham, Elemental Architecture LLC*. Application is for limited exterior renovations and door modifications.

WHEREAS Kaye Playhouse is an International Modern-style building designed by Shreve, Lamb & Harmon and constructed in 1938-1941;

WHEREAS in general there are 6 major components to the application: 1. New doors and portal; 2. New display board; 3. Repairing and cleaning stone cladding panels; 4. Refurbishing canopy and signage; 5. Replacing the west vestibule doors; and 6. Replacing southeast auditorium doors;

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to move the Kaye Playhouse entrance outer door 1’5” outward to improve ADA compliance; there will be a new automatic door actuator;

WHEREAS the replacement outer doors will replicate historic inner stainless steel and glass doors; the stainless steel column enclosure jointing (between the doors) will be changed from vertical to horizontal;

WHEREAS there will be new stainless steel signage on the newly refurbished canopy; the existing 10’ stainless steel signage will now be 10 1/2’ and will be mounted to a discontinuous steel L whereas before the steel L was continuous;

WHEREAS there will be a new smaller digital LED display board (3’ wide x 4’3” high) that will replace the existing display case for printed posters;

WHEREAS a new lead coated copper metal seam roof will replace the existing metal seam roof.

WHEREAS new stainless steel panels with flush mounted recessed light fixtures will replace the existing white painted metal soffit panels;

WHEREAS the canopy signage and the canopy edge will contain LED strip lighting; the new canopy soffit will contain 3” recessed LED downlights;

WHEREAS at the west vestibule entrance the existing anodized aluminum and glazed doors will be replaced; the new doors will match exactly the proposed new outer doors for the adjacent Kaye Playhouse;

WHEREAS at the East 68th Street auditorium entrance, the existing deteriorated doors, frames and portals will be replaced in kind;

WHEREAS the applicant is to be commended for his thoughtful and subtle blending of the old with the new for the dark and somewhat dreary existing condition of the Kaye Playhouse entrance and the two auxiliary entrances (the west vestibule entrance and the East 68th Street auditorium entrance);

WHEREAS the applicant’s proposed changes honor and improve the space and make the entrance to the Kaye Playhouse, with its improved lighting, much more readable from the street;

WHEREAS the applicant’s proposed changes are appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

5. **115 East 75th Street (between Lexington and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** *David Tepper, Ennead Architects*. Parking garage located at the ground level.

Application is to rehabilitate heavily modified ground floor to accommodate new entrances, restore historic window openings and brick detailing, and other installations and replacements.

WHEREAS the current parking garage will be converted into an ambulatory care facility;
WHEREAS the building, which dates from 1888, was converted into a garage in 1912;
WHEREAS the restoration and conversion have aspects that need to be considered separately;

This Application is reviewed in two parts.

PART A

WHEREAS the building has been painted grey;
WHEREAS the paint will be removed, and the original brick and terracotta revealed and repaired;
WHEREAS the masonry openings in the base of the building have been substantially changed except for the central opening;
WHEREAS the central portal will be restored and will be the main entry to the building;
WHEREAS the original openings flanking the central entry portal will be reconstructed;
WHEREAS new aluminum windows with insulated glazing will simulate original wood windows;
WHEREAS the base of the building was originally designed with an areaway that no longer exists;
WHEREAS the watercourse at the base of the building will be reconstructed to meet the current condition;
WHEREAS the watercourse will be reconstructed with a brownstone coping, a portion of which will be a restoration of the original coping, and new gray granite below in lieu of brick;
WHEREAS four brick window arches on the second and third floors on the north façade will be reconstructed to match existing;
WHEREAS one new arched window opening will be created on the third floor on the north façade to achieve symmetry and alignment of openings;
WHEREAS existing window openings on the first floor and fourth floor of the north façade will be retained;
WHEREAS the westerly window on the second floor of the north façade will be replaced with an opening to a new bridge that will connect 115 East 75th Street to 122 East 76th Street;
WHEREAS the new connector bridge will be brown painted metal at the top and bottom with full height glazing on either side of the bridge;
WHEREAS one partially obstructed widow opening on the East façade will be removed and infilled with brick to match existing;
WHEREAS partially obstructed openings on the West façade will be removed and infilled with brick to match existing;
WHEREAS the connector bridge is not visible from Park Avenue or Lexington Avenue
WHEREAS the front portion of the building is four stories high plus the cellar and the larger, rear portion of the building is three stories high plus the cellar;
WHEREAS new mechanical equipment will be placed on the rooftop of the three-story portion of the building;
WHEREAS a new guardrail will be placed behind the parapet of the north façade;

WHEREAS the mechanical equipment is minimally visible from 76th Street and Lexington Avenue – and not visible from 75th Street and Park Avenue;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the restoration and reconstruction described herein is contextual within the historic district and is approved as presented.

VOTE: In favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Schneider)

PART B

WHEREAS the entry at the restored portal has a pair of glass doors with glass panels on either side and a glass transom with signage above;

WHEREAS the new marquee will be set in front of the transom and extend over the sidewalk from within the restored portal;

WHEREAS the new marquee will be steel and glass with the steel painted brown;

WHEREAS two vertical white banner signs will be projected from the second floor on either side of the entrance;

WHEREAS the rear windows will be fire rated single lites of insulated glass;

WHEREAS these elements are not contextual within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, the elements described herein are disapproved.

VOTE: In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Cohn, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

Opposed (Schneider)

6. **Old Business**

7. **New Business**

1. The National Society Colonial Dames property, 215 East 71st Street. **(TABLED)**

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs