Alida Camp Chair

Will Brightbill District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, NY 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com – E-Mail www.cb8m.com – Website

## The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

Landmarks Committee Monday, June 18th 2018 – 6:30PM Marymount Manhattan College – Regina Peruggi Room 221 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street (2<sup>nd</sup> Ave and 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave)

**PLEASE NOTE**: When evaluating Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness, the Landmarks Committee of Community Board 8M ONLY considers the appropriateness of the proposal to the architecture of the building and, in the case of a building within an Historic District, the appropriateness of the proposal to the character of that Historic District. All testimony should be related to such appropriateness. The Committee recommends a Resolution to the full Community Board, which votes on a Resolution to be sent to the Landmarks Preservation Commission. These Resolutions are advisory; the decision of the Landmarks Preservation Commission is binding.

Applicants and members of the public who are interested in the issues addressed are invited, but not required, to attend the **Full Board meeting on Wednesday, June 20, 2018, Nightingale-Bamford School, 20 East 92^{nd} Street (Madison – Fifth), Auditorium – at 6:30PM.** They may testify for up to three minutes in the Public Session, which they must sign up for no later than 6:45PM. Members of the Board will discuss the items in executive session; if a member of the public wishes a comment made or a question asked at this time, he or she must ask a Board Member to do it.

**Board Members in attendance:** Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Alexandra Harrington, David Helpern, Marco Tamayo **Public Members in attendance:** Kimberly Selway

1. 870 Madison Avenue (between East 70<sup>th</sup> and East 71<sup>st</sup> Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District *Panorama Windows, Ltd.* – Neo-Italian Renaissance style residence designed by Albert Joseph Bodker and constructed in 1910-1911. Application is to replace windows.

**WHEREAS** 870 Madison Avenue is a five story Neo-Italian Renaissance building; **WHEREAS** the wood multi-pane windows that remain are in poor condition; **WHEREAS** the building has commercial use on the first and second floors and residential use on the third, fourth and fifth floors;

**WHEREAS** the existing metal storefront facing Madison Avenue on the first and second floors replaced the original wood windows;

**WHEREAS** the applicant seeks to replace the wood windows on the third through fifth floors facing Madison Avenue and the wood windows on the second through fifth floors on the north and south elevations;

**WHREAS** the windows will be replaced in kind functionally and operationally including the windows in arched openings;

**WHEREAS** the windows will be multi-pane insulated glass windows with the same number of divisions in each window;

**WHEREAS** the divisions will be made with dividers set within the two panes of insulated glass;

**WHEREAS** the aluminum frames and mullions will be similar in profile to the original wood windows;

**WHEREAS** the aluminum windows are not appropriate replacements for wood windows in the context of this relatively small building;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** this application is **<u>DISAPPROVED</u>** as presented.

## **VOTE:**

4 In Favor (Baron, Birnbaum, Helpern, Tamayo) 2 Opposed (Ashby, Harrington)

1 Public Member Opposed (Selway)

**2. 50** East **69**<sup>th</sup> Street (between Park and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District *Julie Hausch-Fen, Architect* – Neo-French style residence designed by Henry C. Pelton and constructed in 1917-1918. Application is for façade and roof work.

**WHEREAS** 50 East 69<sup>th</sup> Street is a 44-foot-wide, two lot, townhouse, set in two zoning districts;

**WHEREAS** the mechanical equipment on the roof is almost on center with respect to the 69<sup>th</sup> Street façade;

**WHEREAS** this mechanical equipment is set back from the face of the building but still visible from the Street;

WHEREAS there is zoning area available on the eastern half of the building; WHEREAS the applicant proposed to shift the bulk of the mechanical equipment to the eastern half of the roof and replace it with a penthouse solarium that is light and elegant in contrast to the limestone façade below;

**WHEREAS** the mechanical equipment is moved to the high roof at the rear of the building;

**WHEREAS** the penthouse is set back from the face of the building but, based on the mock-up, slightly visible from Madison Avenue, from across 69<sup>th</sup> Street; and from Park Avenue;

**WHEREAS** the architects committed to moving the face of the penthouse further back from the front face of the building, an additional 14 to 18 inches, to eliminate the view of the penthouse from Madison Avenue and from across 69<sup>th</sup> Street – leaving only a small area visible from across Park Avenue;

**WHEREAS** there was a concern about the amount of light that might radiate at night from the solarium, there was also an expectation that the owners will use a method of light control that will preclude disturbing their neighbors;

**WHEREAS** the fire place flues will be re-routed diagonally within the building so that they are to the rear of the penthouse;

**WHEREAS** the flues that are currently next to the penthouse do not have to be raised because they will be relocated;

**WHEREAS** the existing railing black metal railing close to the edge of the roof at the front façade will be refurbished and repainted;

**WHEREAS** the skylight on the roof, which is not visible, will be replaced with a new skylight that will not be visible;

**WHEREAS** the mechanical equipment on the high roof in the rear will be screened by horizontal louvers that extend 7'-0" above the parapet;

**WHEREAS** acoustically absorbent material will be set behind the louvers to minimize the noise from the mechanical equipment;

**WHEREAS** the limestone façade is in generally good condition but will be repaired with limestone to match the existing limestone wherever there is deterioration;

**WHREAS** the wood multi-pane windows on the front façade will be replaced in kind with new, insulated glass windows with solid mahogany frames and mullions;

WHEREAS the pair of decorative metal entrance doors will be refurbished;

WHEREAS the secondary door at the westerly edge will be replaced;

WHEREAS the wood and metal will have dark finishes;

**WHEREAS** the work on the roof and the façade is appropriate and contextual within the historic district;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED**, this application is <u>APPROVED</u> as presented.

## **VOTE:**

7 In Favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Harrington, Helpern, Tamayo) 1 Public Member in Favor (Selway)

**Respectfully Submitted,** Jane Parshall and David Helpern, Co-Chairs