

Alida Camp
Chair



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, NY 10022
(212) 758-4340

Will Brightbill
District Manager

(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
info@cb8m.com – E-Mail
www.cb8m.com – Website

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8

LANDMARKS COMMITTEE
Monday, May 14, 2018 – 6:30PM
Ramaz School – Heyman Auditorium
125 East 85th Street

MINUTES

Landmarks Committee Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Gayle Baron, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Sarah Chu, Alexandra Harrington Barker, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway, Marco Tamayo

Board Members Present: Barry Schneider

Public Members Present: Christina Davis

Item 1:

954 Madison Avenue (NE corner of Madison Avenue and 75th Street) [Carolina Herrera retail shop] — Upper East Side Historic District. *Jonathan Taylor, Higgins & Quasebarth, and Michel Franck, architect, presenting.* Application is for facade renovation and window renovation.

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: PART A is for the application as presented EXCEPT FOR THE LETTERING ON THE PROPOSED AWNINGS FOR THE WINDOWS. The proposed lettering for the awnings over the two entry doors — the existing entry door on Madison Avenue and the new entry door on 75th Street — is included in PART A. PART B is for the lettering proposed for the ground floor windows ONLY.

PART A: THE APPLICATION AS PRESENTED EXCEPT FOR THE LETTERING ON THE PROPOSED AWNINGS FOR THE WINDOWS

WHEREAS 954 Madison Avenue is a neo-classical style 3-story building designed by George F. Pelham and constructed in 1925; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, at the Madison Avenue elevation, to replace the non-historic windows on the 2nd and 3rd floors and the non-historic storefront infill (which includes the existing store entrance) with new steel divided light casement windows and a new divided light entry door. The existing mullions will remain; and,

WHEREAS the new entry door will be centered below the window above [There will be a slight reconfiguration of the front entry on Madison; a central pier will be introduced that will align with the existing piers on the second and third floors] the storefront infill surrounding the new door will match the existing terra cotta finish. (The existing door presents as a glass plate.); and, **WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to remove the non-historic flagpoles located between the 2nd and 3rd floors along Madison Avenue and to remove some existing attachments for outdoor lighting above the first floor; the original terra cotta finish will be restored at these locations; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, on 75th Street, to replace the non-historic service door, the non-historic storefront infill (which includes 7 existing plate glass shop windows) at the ground level and the non-historic windows on the 2nd and 3rd floors; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes new steel divided light casement windows on all three floors, including the service door; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to create a new 75th Street entry that will replace the middle window of the existing 7 windows along 75th Street; the door design will match the window design; and,

WHEREAS the two plate glass windows to the right of the service door are shorter than other window openings; the sills on these two windows will be lowered so that they match in height the other windows. [There are now 7 window openings and a service door along 75th Street. The middle two windows will be removed and, in their place, a new entry door with two side windows will be installed. This new configuration will be aligned with the windows above it on the second floor.]; and,

WHEREAS the store infill between the windows will match the existing terra cotta finish; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes fixed awnings for the windows on all three floors and for two entry doors and the service door (on 75th Street). The awnings will be white with a red strip framing the white color at either end; and,

WHEREAS the awnings will be attached to the window frames so that the terra cotta will not be disturbed; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes removable wood black painted planters in front of all the windows at the ground floor; the planters will come to the height of the sill and will vary in length from 3' to 5' and are approximately 2' wide; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes two smaller planters on either side of the entry door.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to place "Carolina Herrera" on the skirts of the two entry door awnings. [See Part B, below]; and,

WHEREAS the historic window millions will remain on all windows; the original terra cotta finish will be repaired for the entire building; and,

WHEREAS there will be 6" tall pin-mounted brass signage with the name "Carolina Herrera" only above the Madison Avenue entrance and above the new 75th Street entrance; and,

WHEREAS the proposed changes to 954 Madison Avenue are appropriate within the historic district and give this prominent corner building a much more homogeneous and consistent "look";

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that PART A of this application - which includes the lettering for the two entry door awning skirts only — is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Harrington Barker, Helpern, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

PART B: PROPOSED LETTERING ON AWNINGS FOR THE STOREFRONT WINDOWS AT THE GROUND LEVEL AT MADISON AVENUE AND AT 74th STREET

WHEREAS the applicant has proposed awnings for the Madison Avenue elevation and for the 74th Street elevation. The awnings would be on all the windows on all three floors and over the two entry doors and the service door; and,

WHEREAS the applicant has proposed that lettering be placed on the skirts of the awnings for the ground floor windows along both streets; and,

WHEREAS the lettering would advertise the name of the retail establishment, “Carolina Herrera”; and,

WHEREAS the applicant is also proposing the same lettering on the skirts of the awnings for the two entrances to the store (the reconfigured entrance on Madison Avenue and the new entrance on 74th Street); and,

WHEREAS the lettering on the skirts of the awnings over the entry doors help to define these entrances and are appropriate within the historic district; and,

WHEREAS the lettering on the skirts of the window awnings at the ground floor present as “busy”, detract from the overall elegance that the application presents and are out of context within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that PART B of this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Harrington Barker, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo); 1 against (Helpern)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

Item 2:

122 East 93rd Street (between Lexington and Park Avenues) — Carnegie Hill Historic District *Alan Berman, architect.* Application is for work at the front elevation.

WHEREAS 122 East 93rd Street is a 4-story neo-Grec style house designed by Thomas McAvoy and constructed in 1877-1878; and,

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove the right-angled, non-historic front stair that now leads to the existing entry on the 2nd floor; to create a new entry at the ground or 1st floor; to add brownstone sills and details that match with the historic neo-Grec style on the 4th floor; add masonry window enframements in context with neighborhood and the neo-Grec style to the existing windows on the second and third floors; replace existing French doors at the 2nd floor with double hung casement windows [see above — the new windows will have the window enframements mentioned above]; add a front door (now at ground level) decorative arch to match historical neo-Grec style; add a raised planting bed at the front areaway with a wrought iron security gate and fence; and,

WHEREAS all the windows on the front elevation will be replaced and will be made of wood.
WHEREAS the planting bed will be made of masonry and will present as a rectangle; part of the masonry will be at the property line on the sidewalk so that there is no transparency to the areaway. It presents as a low “wall” topped by a wrought iron fence. The masonry component will be 2’10” high with a 14” wrought iron decorative fence on top of the masonry (4’ altogether); and,
WHEREAS all masonry on the front elevation will be repaired; the existing masonry lintels and window sills will be repaired and restored to their original condition; and,
WHEREAS the new mahogany front entry door — now at the ground level — will be painted in a black lacquer finish; and,
WHEREAS the proposed changes at the front elevation, especially the removal of the metal staircase, are contextual and appropriate within the historic district; the addition of the new-neo-Grec detailing, while non-historic to the house, will add interest to the front elevation;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **APPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 10 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Camp, Chu, Harrington Barker, Helpert, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo, Schneider); 1 against (Birnbaum)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR: Christina Davis

Item 3:

1 East 70th Street, The Frick Collection (between Fifth and Madison) Individual Landmark. *Annabelle Selldorf, Architect* Application is to enlarge the Museum and Art Reference Library and for alterations to create accessible entrances.

WHEREAS the Frick Collection has expanded its mission from a House Museum to a museum with a multi-faceted mission; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs more space for temporary exhibits, public education, conservation for art and books; and administration; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs more space to display large works of art; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs more space to accommodate the increasing number of visitors including larger lobby, coat room, and rest rooms; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs a larger auditorium that can be used even when the museum is closed; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection Library is one of the top art research libraries in the world; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs to provide accessible entrances for the museum and the library; and,
WHEREAS the Frick Collection needs to replace old infrastructure with new, energy efficient, systems; and,
WHEREAS the garden is on the roof of below grade space including a vault; and,
WHEREAS leakage from the garden is causing corrosion; and,
WHEREAS the proposed additions and renovation will provide for the functional needs of the museum and library, incorporate new infrastructure, and mostly recreate the Russell Page designed 70th Street garden; and,

WHEREAS the galleries in the original mansion will remain unchanged and will continue to display the personal collection of Henry Clay Frick; and,
WHEREAS the second floor of the mansion will become galleries open to the public;
WHEREAS most elements of the garden will be restored or replaced including the plantings, pool, east and west walls, paths, stone bench and urn; and,
WHEREAS the north wall of the garden will be reconstructed to its original appearance except that windows will replace the niches and trellises in the wall, and the planter with trees on the top of the wall will be eliminated; and,
WHEREAS the removal of the garden will enable the demolition of the vault and the construction of an underground auditorium; and,
WHEREAS the reconfigured steps and the switch-back ramp at the entrance to the museum enable appropriate access for the disabled; and,
WHEREAS the linear ramp alongside the wall on 71st Street leading to an existing basement entrance, in combination with a new elevator, enable access for the disabled directly into the library building; and,
WHEREAS the existing rear wall of the library was not intended to have been seen and would have been minimally visible from the public way as it was shielded from the south by three large townhouses that preceded the 70th Street garden; and,
WHEREAS the library building will be expanded into the rear yard of the building up to the north wall of the garden; and,
WHEREAS the library addition will step up from east to west to an enlarged penthouse for mechanical equipment; and,
WHEREAS the penthouse will have louvers that will match the limestone in color; and,
WHEREAS the enlargement will match the Indiana limestone and window proportions of the facades of the library building visible from 71st Street; and,
WHEREAS the windows in the library enlargement will be thermally broken, double glazed casement windows with rolled bronze mullions and bronze frames; and,
WHEREAS a two-story structure will be added to the west of the library over the “Music Room;” and,
WHEREAS the north façade of the lower floor of the addition is set back in line with the northern edge of the upper floors of the mansion and the upper floor is set further back; and,
WHEREAS the south façade of the two-story structure is set in line with the southern face of the enlarged library; and,
WHEREAS the new two-story addition is intended to provide conservatory space and administrative space – and create a stronger visual connection of the museum to the library when viewed from the exterior; and,
WHEREAS the two-story addition is linked to the library with a 16-foot-wide, three bay, bronze and glass curtain wall with limestone spandrel panels; and,
WHEREAS the new one-story addition to the reception hall pavilion is set down into the upper volume of the reception hall to enable a second-floor lobby and a connection from the mansion to the library; and,
WHEREAS setting the second floor through the roof of the reception hall pavilion eliminates the shallow, curved ceiling of the current reception hall; and,
WHEREAS the height of the new one-story addition is kept to a minimum but is still visible; and,

WHEREAS the façade of the one-story addition is continuously glazed with bronze frames and mullions; and,

WHEREAS the roof of the one-story addition is made of copper to match the copper roofs that exist; and,

WHEREAS there was little in the presentation of actual proposed dimensions, there were no site line studies; and there was no mock-up of the enlargements (even though a mock up for highly visible elements is not required by the Landmarks Preservation Commission); and,

WHEREAS the model of the Frick Collection was diminutive within the surrounding buildings and, thereby, not as instructive as a larger model of the building or a mock-up of the proposed bulk relationships; and,

WHEREAS it appears as if the programmatic requirements of the Frick Collection have been met with the current application, the proposed additions are too large and not in scale with the landmark mansion or the Russell Page designed garden; and,

WHEREAS it appears, per observations made during the Committee discussion, that programmatic requirements can be met with other functional iterations that would reduce the size of the above grade additions; and,

WHEREAS the garden will not be fully restored in that the niches and trellises in the rear wall will be replaced with glazed openings, and the continuous planter on the top of the wall and its trees will be eliminated; and,

WHEREAS the perspective from the garden to the north will be lost due to the overwhelming mass of the library addition; and,

WHEREAS the existing one-story connection between the mansion and the library does not detract from the mansion, the two-story addition over the Music Room is very visible and extends the more institutional scale and character of the library into the sector of the mansion; and,

WHEREAS the one-story addition to the entry hall pavilion is visible, changes the scale of the pavilion, and eliminates the high copper roof with its fan-like termination that was more in the family of the mansion's roofs than the proposed shallow copper roof; and,

WHEREAS the experience of the mansion from the exterior is of a large house, the proposed enlargements will change the character of the mansion and detract from the experience of the Frick Collection as a House Museum; and,

WHEREAS maintaining the scale of the mansion does not preclude the Frick Collection from growing as an institution;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, except for the two ramps for the handicapped which are approved, this application is **DISAPPROVED** as presented.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Harrington, Helpern, Tamayo); 4 against (Baron, Chu, Schneider, Selway); 1 abstention (Parshall)

ONE PUBLIC MEMBER OPPOSED: Christina Davis

Respectfully submitted,

David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs