

Alida Camp  
Chair

Will Brightbill  
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620  
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106  
(212) 758-4340  
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)  
www.cb8m.com - Website  
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

**The City of New York  
Manhattan Community Board 8  
Landmarks Committee  
Marymount Manhattan College  
221 East 71<sup>st</sup> Street  
Regina Peruggi Room  
January 8, 2018  
6:30PM**

**Minutes**

**Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Alida Camp, Susan Evans, Alexandra Harrington, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo

**Public Members:** Christina Davis

**1. 935 Park Avenue(between 80th and 81st Street) - Park Avenue Historic District.  
Walter Sedovic, architect. Application for penthouse addition.**

**WHEREAS** 935 Park Avenue is a Renaissance revival apartment building designed by Sugarman, Hess & Berger and constructed in 1923-24.

**WHEREAS** there is a small 2 1/2' area that resides between the south parapet wall and the south facing wall of the existing penthouse at the southeast corner of the building.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to move the south wall of the penthouse so that it meets the south wall of the building (parapet wall) utilizing the 2 1/2' area.

**WHEREAS** the applicant also proposes to move the penthouse upward by adding a 4' band of clerestory windows on all four sides of the now-enlarged penthouse. [A clerestory is a high section of wall that contains windows above eye level which admit light and air to the interior space.]

**WHEREAS** the penthouse space will increase by 120 sq. ft. as it is moved forward by 2 1/2'.

**WHEREAS** the penthouse addition will rise 6' higher than the parapet; the clerestory will add an additional 4' so that height of the addition is 14' from existing roof of the building.

(N.B. The first 4' of the addition will be behind the parapet wall.)

**WHEREAS** the existing height of 935 Park Avenue is 160'; the proposed new building height will be 163'8" so that only approximately 4 additional feet are being added

**WHEREAS** maximum visibility for the addition will be at 80th Street and Lexington Avenue where, through breaks in buildings, 3 1/2 to 4' of the addition is visibility from the street. As one moves north on Lexington Avenue, visibility decreases.

**WHEREAS** the color and materials for the penthouse addition are identical to those stipulated in the master plan for the building — the windows on the addition will be wood casement windows except for the 12' tall x 25'5" wide glass window facing east that will span width of the penthouse which will have a metal frame system.

**WHEREAS** the penthouse addition is at the rear of the building, the elevation facing the courtyard; the addition is invisible from Park Avenue.

**WHEREAS** the location, size and design of the addition reflect a sensitivity to the rest of 935 Park Avenue.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

**VOTE:** In Favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)

In Favor Public Member: (Christina Davis)

**2. 1141 Park Avenue -Application to replace and install new doors and windows, remove fire escape and replace existing rooftop addition**

**WHEREAS** 1141 Park Avenue was originally built in 1884-5 as a four-story apartment building with retail on the ground floor;

**WHEREAS** the building was originally built to a roof height of 46'-3" above the Park Avenue sidewalk at its northern property line;

**WHEREAS** the current height with the penthouse that was added is about 57'-3" above the Park Avenue sidewalk at its northern property line;

**WHEREAS** the original building had a first-floor entrance close to its northern property line on Park Avenue and a first-floor entrance up steps on East 91<sup>st</sup> Street close to its eastern property line;

**WHEREAS** the sidewalk slopes down continuously from north to south on Park Avenue and from west to east on East 91<sup>st</sup> Street about 9'-3", an entrance to the basement level that could be entered through an alley between 1141 Park Avenue and the building to the east was built on the eastern façade;

**WHEREAS** 1141 Park Avenue has undergone changes in use and alterations to the façade;

**WHEREAS** the most recent use was as a single-family home with no retail on the ground floor;

**WHEREAS** the intended use is to maintain the building as a single-family home;

**WHEREAS** there have been many changes to the architectural character of the building, the intent of the current renovation and restoration is to reference the history of the building and not to replicate a stylistic period in the life of the building;

**WHEREAS** the intent is to renovate and restore the building with a design that is appropriate to the Carnegie Hill Historic District;

**WHEREAS** the building occupies the northeast corner of Park Avenue and East 91<sup>st</sup> Street; terminates a row of four buildings to its north that are slightly smaller in scale, all of which have entrances on the Avenue, including 1141 Park Avenue; and has a penthouse that first appears in a 1980 photo, that is very visible because the penthouse spans from north to south and is easily seen because of the topography of this portion of Park Avenue;

**WHEREAS** the building is 22'-6" wide on Park Avenue and 66'-3" long on East 91<sup>st</sup> Street;

**WHEREAS** the entrance on Park Avenue has been eliminated and replaced with an arched window to match the other two arched windows;

**WHEREAS** a new entrance has been located at the center of the long façade to reflect the central hall and stair on the interior;

**WHEREAS** the new front entrance doors will be up six steps from the sidewalk;

**WHEREAS** the new entrance doors will replicate the double door entrance from 1908;

**WHEREAS** the fire escape on the 91<sup>st</sup> Street façade will be removed;

**WHEREAS** the penthouse is set back 14'-4" feet from Park Avenue and 18'-8" from the eastern face of the building;

**WHEREAS** the penthouse will be set back 5'-8" from the parapet on 91<sup>st</sup> Street;

**WHEREAS** the continuity of the cornice on 91<sup>st</sup> Street will be restored;

**WHEREAS** the penthouse will be about 14'-2" wide in the north south direction and 33'-3" long in the east west direction;

**WHEREAS** the current penthouse is 10'-3" high;

**WHEREAS** the rebuilt penthouse will vary from 9'-8" in height to 11'-6" in height;

**WHEREAS** the rebuilt penthouse will have a hip roof that slopes up symmetrically on its eastern and western ends and slopes up symmetrically on its north and south sides from a continuous cornice at the 9'-8" height;

**WHEREAS** the elevator penthouse will be in the northeast corner of the penthouse, 38'-0" from Park Avenue, and will be 14'-3" to the top of the skylight over the elevator shaft;

**WHEREAS** the windows on the west façade and south façade of the building will be symmetrical on each façade;

**WHEREAS** the windows in the penthouse will be symmetrical within the penthouse;

**WHEREAS** the windows will be multi-pane casements;

**WHEREAS** the façades will be coated to match the existing color;

**WHEREAS** the windows will be a dark color to be determined from an analysis of the layers of paint;

**WHEREAS** the proposed renovation and restoration is contextual within the historic district;

**THEREFORE**, this application is approved as presented.

<b>VOTE:</b>	In Favor	(Harrington, Helpen, Parshall, Tamayo)
	Opposed	(Birnbaum, Camp, Evans)
	Abstain	(Ashby)
	Opposed Public Member:	(Davis)

The Committee has no position on this application.

**3. 41 East 70th Street - Application to replace and install new doors and windows, reclad existing penthouse and rear rooftop extension, restore Juliet balcony, modify rear porch and sub-cellar excavation.**

**WHEREAS** 41 East 71st Street is a 6 story Colonial Revival style townhouse designed by Aymar Embury and constructed in 1928-29.

**WHEREAS** the house is built primarily of brick with limestone, stucco and cast stone accents and trim elements.

**WHEREAS** the south, north and west elevations are fully exposed; the west elevation fronts a service alley for the adjacent apartment building.

**WHEREAS** at the street level south elevation there are 4 arched openings accommodating windows and the main entry door; the windows are set within wood surrounds detailed with pilasters and wooden fan details (fanlights) filling out the arched openings.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the original wood fanlights with glazed fanlights and to replace the entry door with a new wood door with a glazed fanlight above.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to restore the previously removed wrought iron Juliet balcony at the 2nd floor.

**WHEREAS** at the 6th floor, the south elevation is set back behind a shallow terrace overlooking 70th Street.

**WHEREAS** at the set back 6th floor, the applicant proposes to remove the existing stucco cladding and replace with limestone cladding that will match the limestone detailing on the rest of the front elevation; the existing wrought iron guardrail will be replaced with a more decorative wrought iron guard rail.

**WHEREAS** a limestone cornice will be added at the top of the 6th floor.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes other restorative work at the front elevation, including replacement of all existing windows with new in-kind wood windows.

**WHEREAS** at the sidewalk level, an open lightwell/areaway behind an iron fence provides access via concrete stairs to the cellar level below. The applicant proposes to join the window wells to connect the two windows.

**WHEREAS** at the sidewalk level the applicant proposes to restore the existing iron work.

**WHEREAS** the west (alley) elevation is composed of brick with 12 flat and segmentally-arched window openings set into the wall irregularly.

**WHEREAS** at the 6th floor on the west elevation at the north the applicant proposes to install a new bronze divided lite window unit topped by a bronze cornice and metal roof and with a wrought iron guard rail above.

**WHEREAS** the new bronze divided light system will be 24'11" wide x 8'3" high; the cornice will be 1'8" high and the metal railing will be 42" high.

**WHEREAS** at the roof, behind new wrought iron guard rail, the applicant proposes a clerestory with a metal roof.

**WHEREAS** the proposed clerestory will be an 8' square, 4' tall and set into the roof.

**WHEREAS** at the 5th and 4th floors on the west elevation, the applicant proposes to replace the irregular window pattern with 4 new windows (2'7" wide by 4'7" high) on each floor that present as symmetrical and are placed in the middle of the west elevation.

**WHEREAS** at the third floor, the applicant proposes a picture window that presents as off center (8'6" wide by 8'7" high) to be flanked by two windows that match the proposed new openings on the 4th and 5th floors.

**WHEREAS** at the 2nd floor on the west elevation, the existing windows will be restored.

**WHEREAS** at the 1st floor, the applicant proposes two arched openings with glazed fanlights and wood trim that will match in detail the new proposed openings (7'5" tall by 3'7" wide) on the south facing front elevation. [The front elevation presents as returning at the corner by the alley; the new arched openings that face the alley make it appear that the front elevation wraps around to the side of the house.]

**WHEREAS** at the west elevation, there will also be a new window below grade and at the first floor an existing window will be replaced.

**WHEREAS** at the north or rear elevation, there are three large, arched openings (two windows flanking a central doorway).

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the three openings with a bronze divided light window and door units; the two windows flanking the center door opening will be carried to the floor (they do not now go down to the floor).

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to install a wrought iron railing enclosing the now extended and enlarged terrace that will be surfaced in glass with limestone steps to the garden/ rear yard. [The existing 31' rear yard will remain.]. [The terrace formerly presented as a landing at 3'2" deep by 6' wide and will now extend along the width of the house measuring 8' deep x 29' wide.]

**WHEREAS** there will be set into the surface of the garden and directly below the terrace one long glass rectangle measuring 29' wide x 3' 2" deep to provide light to the below grade cellar.

**WHEREAS** at the rear elevation at the 6th floor, the applicant proposes a bronze multi-light system (25' wide x 8'3" tall) to match the similar system being proposed at the 6th floor of the west elevation with the same bronze cornice above and the railing with the clerestory behind.

**WHEREAS** at the roof, the applicant proposes a new generator, a new stair bulkhead, a new elevator shaft (4' higher than the existing elevator shaft), a new chimney at the west side of the roof to extend 3' above highest construction to meet building code requirements (brickwork for the chimney will match existing brickwork), and a new wrought iron guard rail. [The height of the house from the ground to the roof is 66'; the new stair bulkhead will increase the height to approximately 74'8".]

**WHEREAS** the stair bulkhead is not visible from the public way.

**WHEREAS** at the north end of the roof, the applicant proposes a 4' clerestory which reads as a skylight. (See above)

**WHEREAS** the existing chimney to the east will be raised 3' above the parapet.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to excavate down 11' for a new subcellar.

**WHEREAS** all the changes proposed by the applicant are appropriate and contextual within the historic district and will enhance the streetscape on one of the most architecturally interesting and beautiful blocks within the Upper East Side Historic District.

**WHEREAS** the architect is to be commended for his sensitive treatment of 41 East 70th Street and for the thoroughness of his presentation to the Landmarks Committee.

**THEREFORE THIS APPLICATION** is approved as presented.

**VOTE:** In Favor: (Birnbaum, Camp, Evans, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo);  
Oppose: (Ashby);  
In Favor Public Member: (Christina Davis)

**4. 1065 Park Avenue - Application for a Master Plan to change windows to tilt and turn windows.**

**WHEREAS** 1065 Park Avenue is a 30-story brick tower dating from 1973;

**WHEREAS** 1065 Park Avenue was designed with a combination of picture windows and double hung windows;

**WHEREAS** the building currently has a mix of windows due to changes made by individual apartment owners over the life of the building;

**WHEREAS** the brick appears to be a medium brown color;

**WHEREAS** the frames and mullions of the original windows, the current windows, and the proposed windows are of a dark bronze color;

**WHEREAS** the proposed Master Plan proposes tilt and turn windows in combination with picture windows:

**WHEREAS** the architectural character of the building derives from the texture and proportions of the picture windows and double hung windows in the original design;

**WHEREAS** the Master plan replaces double hung windows either side of wide picture windows with single-pane, insulated glass, tilt and turn windows;

**WHEREAS** the Master Plan replaces pairs of double hung windows with single-pane, insulated glass, tilt and turn windows;

**WHEREAS** the Master Plan replaces pairs of double hung windows with narrow picture windows with single-pane, insulated glass, tilt and turn windows;

**WHEREAS** these large, tilt and turn windows are dissimilar in proportion to the original pairs of double hung windows;

**WHEREAS** these large, tilt and turn windows eliminate much of the texture of the window frames and mullions that were integral to the original design;

**WHEREAS** the pattern of windows of the original design, typical of modern buildings of that period, would be lost if the proposed Master Plan were to be implemented;

**THEREFORE**, this application is disapproved.

**VOTE:** In Favor: (Ashby, Birnbaum, Camp, Evans, Harrington, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo)