

James G. Clynes
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022-1106
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com E-Mail

**The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8
Landmarks Committee
Monday, December 11, 2017
New York Blood Center
310 East 67th Street, Auditorium
6:30PM**

Minutes

Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Gayle Baron, Sarah Chu, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Kimberly Selway, Marco Tamayo

Public Members: Dylan Cerbini, Christina Davis

1. **980 Park Avenue (between 83rd and 84th Streets)-Saint Ignatius Loyola Church Rectory-Park Avenue Historic District-Lou Martino, architect-** Application to install accessibility ramp and elevator.

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: PART A — HANDICAPPED ACCESSIBLE ENTRANCES; PART B — LED SIGNAGE

PART A — HANDICAPPED ACCESSIBLE ENTRANCES

WHEREAS 980 Park Avenue is a Second Empire/Gothic Revival style church and rectory designed by Patrick C. Keely and constructed in 1881-83.

WHEREAS along the north or 84th Street side of the church there is an existing ramp, 80' long, that was built after WW I; the ramp is slightly out of compliance and does not provide access to Wallace Hall (the "undercroft") at the basement level of the church.

WHEREAS the applicant, to bring the handicapped access up to code and to provide for access to Wallace Hall, proposes to integrate an accessibility elevator using the current location of the ramp; the design of the new elevator pavilion precludes any penetration into the church which would impact the interior artwork.

WHEREAS the accessibility elevator requires a small 200 square foot addition on the north side of the church that reads as a small pavilion.

WHEREAS the small addition will have a footprint of 13' x 19'; the small addition will protrude toward the sidewalk, but will not go beyond the property line of the church.

WHEREAS the vocabulary of the small addition will match the existing detailing of the church including the limestone which will exactly replicate the coursing that exists on the limestone elevations of the church.

WHEREAS the wrought iron fence along 84th Street will remain.

WHEREAS the existing 80' ramp will be cut in half; one will enter the elevator pavilion from the sidewalk, go up 4', exit the elevator and proceed along the remaining 40' of ramp to reach the existing bronze door that provides the entrance into the church; the elevator will also go down to the below grade undercroft (Wallace Hall).

WHEREAS to provide handicapped access to the rectory, the applicant proposes to install a ramp behind a gate at the front of the rectory (to the south of the main church entrance on Park Avenue) where there is now a garden behind a wrought iron fence.

WHEREAS the new ramp will have a grade change of approximately 16" from the sidewalk down to the entrance level of the rectory and presents as a landscape project rather than a ramp project; the ramp will be 4' wide.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to keep an existing dogwood tree that will be protected by a tree pit.

WHEREAS in general, while the committee is opposed to the disruption of any of the historic material of the church; the church will not lose a significant amount of the historic fabric with the construction of the pavilion;
WHEREAS the removal of one half of the existing ramp will, in fact, expose more of the existing north elevation.
WHEREAS with the construction of the small addition at the north elevation, the applicant is using a vocabulary that presents as balanced.

WHEREAS the existing church structure does not lend itself to any unobtrusive way of increasing handicapped accessibility.

WHEREAS the ramp along Park Avenue is appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT PART A of this application is approved.

VOTE: 6 yes (Chu, Baron, Birnbaum, Helpern, Parshall, Ashby) 1 no (Tamayo)

PUBLIC MEMBERS IN FAVOR: 2 (Davis, Cerbini)

PART B: LED SIGNAGE

WHEREAS there are two directory displays on the front elevation of the church on either side of the main entrance doors.

WHEREAS the applicant would like to install LED signage within the original bronze enclosures in order to modernize and make more user friendly any changes that need to be made to the notices that are contained within the enclosures. (Any changes now have to be done by hand; with LED signage, changes are made by computer.)

WHEREAS the LED signage will present as too noticeable and too glaring on the front elevation; the subtlety of the existing signage is one of its charms.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT PART B is approved.

VOTE: 3 in favor (Tamayo, Helpern, Parshall); 3 against (Baron, Birnbaum, Ashby); 1 abstention (Chu)

PUBLIC MEMBERS: 0-1-1 Davis voted no; Cerbini voted to abstain.

2. 35 East 76th Street (between Madison and Park Avenues)-The Carlyle-Upper East Side Historic District-Tarra Cotterman, architect- Application to install a greenhouse.

WHEREAS a greenhouse was built on the western façade on the 19th floor on a bridge built between two small terraces in 1955/56;

WHEREAS the 1955/56 greenhouse was replaced in 1998 with a greenhouse with an improved design that was approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS the 1998 greenhouse was built on the same bridge constructed between the two terraces to support the prior greenhouse;

WHEREAS the 1998 greenhouse and prior greenhouse interrupted the vertical composition of the Art Deco building;

WHEREAS the preceding greenhouse destroyed art deco terracotta and brick details;

WHEREAS the current (1998) greenhouse will be removed and replaced with two small greenhouses at the two corner terraces that will be similar in scale to other greenhouses that have been added to the building at other locations;

WHEREAS the tops of brick walls that support the new greenhouses will have terracotta copings;

WHEREAS the parapets at the corner terraces and their vertical terminations that originally defined a three-window wide vertical composition on the façade will be rebuilt;

WHEREAS the parapet will be rebuilt with brick and terracotta, including terracotta copings, to match original details;

WHEREAS the bridge will remain but minimized in that the bridge and the terraces either side will have painted guard rails with metal balusters and continuous metal caps;

WHEREAS the greenhouses will have multi-pane windows set in bronze-colored aluminum frames;

WHEREAS the roofs of the greenhouses will be pitched with standing seam metal roofs;

WHEREAS the wall covered by the current greenhouse had been changed with new openings and loss of original detail;

WHEREAS the wall that will be uncovered by the removal of the existing greenhouse will be repaired to match the original wall;

WHEREAS the repairs to the brick and terracotta and the construction of the small greenhouses to be located on the corner terraces of the western façade on the 19th floor will bring back the original architectural character of the building on the western facade;

THEREFORE, be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 In favor: (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Helpern, Parshall, Selway, Tamayo)

Public Members In Favor: 2 (Cerbini, Davis)

3. **737 Park Avenue (between 71st and 72nd Streets)-Upper East Side Historic District-Michael F. Doyle, architect-** Application to remove ground floor window grilles.

WHEREAS 737 Park Avenue is a classicizing Art Deco style building designed by Sylvan Bien and constructed in 1940.

WHEREAS the applicant proposed to remove the decorative grilles on two windows on Park Avenue and on 18 windows on 71st Street.

WHEREAS the engineer for the building feels that the original mountings are too light to hold the grilles which have been refurbished and are to be reinstalled

WHEREAS Sylvan Bien, one of the great mid-century architects, used the grilles at the windows to enhance and articulate the Art Deco language of the architecture.

WHEREAS the grilles are essential to 737 Park Avenue.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT THIS APPLICATION IS DISAPPROVED AS PRESENTED.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Baron, Tamayo, Birnbaum, Helpern, Parshall, Ashby, Kimberly Selway)

PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR 1 (Cerbini)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall – Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee