Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8
Landmarks Committee
May 15, 2017
Marymount Manhattan College
221 East 71st Street (Second-Third),
Regina Perruggi Room
6:30PM

## **Minutes**

**Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Susan Evans, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo, Gail Baron, Alida Camp, Michele Birnbaum, Sarah Chu, Christina Davis (Public Member)

1. **21 East 73rd Street (between 5th and Madison Avenues)**, **Upper East Side Historic District**, *Caitlin Stewart*, *architect*. Application is to reclad front elevation, to replace windows and window surrounds on front elevation, to replace front fence and to replace areaway and steps into areaway.

WHEREAS 21 East 73rd Street is a 5 story residence designed in the neo-Grec style by J. W. Marshall and constructed in 1871.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the deteriorated stucco at the front elevation, including the now-stucco-clad columns and portico at the ground level entry, with limestone and to replace the existing one over one windows with in-kind wooden windows.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the existing fence with a new more decorative wrought iron fence and gate that would mimic the design of the existing decorative wrought iron railing at the second floor; the height of the fence would not change.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to change the existing brick areaway and the brick steps down into the areaway from the sidewalk to bluestone.

**WHEREAS** the window surrounds at the 5th floor would be simplified; the window surrounds at the 4th floor would be modified, retaining some of the original detailing; WHEREAS the decorative work at the top of the existing window surrounds at the 3 floor would be replaced with new limestone decorative pediments that would refer back to the original neo-Grec pediment design. The existing ornamental railing at the 3rd floor would be removed.

WHEREAS the changes at the front elevation are contextual and appropriate within the historic district. WHEREAS the replacement of the window surrounds, the introduction of the neo-Grec style pediments at the third floor and the removal of the wrought iron railing at the 3rd floor present a more unified composition to the front elevation.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron, Camp, Davis [Public Member]); 1 against (Birnbaum)

2. **753 Madison Avenue** (65<sup>th</sup>/66<sup>th</sup>), Upper East Side Historic District, *David Silverman*, *architect* [Loffredo Brooks Architects], Application is for the renovation of the storefront façade.

**WHEREAS** 753 Madison Avenue is a red brick, modernist, post-World War II building, constructed in 1963;

WHEREAS the building's base has three retail spaces;

WHEREAS the south east corner store has a façade of black granite and glass;

WHEREAS this storefront is being demolished and replaced with a new storefront;

WHEREAS a new storefront was built on the northern store about a year and a half ago;

**WHEREAS** the new storefront for the south east corner store will have rusticated limestone piers with a rusticated limestone sign band and large display windows;

**WHEREAS** the underside of the new sign band will be raised to match the underside of the sign band on the northern store;

**WHEREAS** the overall height of the proposed sign band will match the height of the sign band on the northern store;

**WHEREAS** the piers are set back from the corner on Madison Avenue and on East 65<sup>th</sup> Street thereby framing the corner entrance;

**WHEREAS** the south eastern store has a glass corner entrance with a glass transom and two entrance doors, with each door abutting a pier;

**WHEREAS** the store in the middle is made of white panels and large glass areas but whose height and whose sign band are similar in proportion to the storefront being demolished;

**WHEREAS** the design intent is for the new storefront to relate to the northern storefront in anticipation of achieving a more ordered façade when the storefront for the middle store changes;

**WHEREAS** the limestone for the new storefront will be different from the limestone of the northern storefront;

**WHEREAS** the rusticated design of the new storefront will be different from the planar design of the northern storefront;

**WHEREAS** the vertical proportions of the new storefront will be the same as those of the northern storefront but the limestone will be similar but different;

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

**VOTE:** 3 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Tamayo)

6 opposed (Birnbaum, Camp, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall)

**Public Member** 

1 in favor (Davis)

This resolution is **DISAPPROVED.** 

3. **49** East 68th Street (between Park and Madison Avenues), Upper East Side Historic District, *Jean-Gabriel Neokomm*, *architect*. Application is for a rooftop mechanical addition and for window replacement at the rear yard.

**WHEREAS** 49 East 68th Street -- referred to as "Automation House" in the designation report -- was designed by Trowbridge and Livingston in the new-Federal style and constructed in 1913-1914.

**WHEREAS** 49 East 68th Street is part of an outstanding group of neo-Federal townhouses which extends along the west side of Park Avenue, between 68th and 69th Streets.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to remove the existing painted blue elevator tower (23'6" high off the roof) and service catwalk, the existing stair bulkhead, and the existing guardrail.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes a new bulkhead -- lower than the bulkhead at the adjacent building. **WHEREAS** proposed new bulkhead will include an interior stair and an elevator extension.

**WHEREAS** the proposed new stair bulkhead is 10'9" high; the elevator extension on top of the new stair bulkhead will present as a cube 5' high x 7' so that the overall height of the bulkhead is 15'9" -- approximately 6' lower than the bulkhead that is being removed.

**WHEREAS** the proposed new bulkhead is set back 29' from the front elevation and is very minimally visible from the public way at Park Avenue and 68th Street.

WHEREAS the proposed new bulkhead will be clad in limestone.

**WHEREAS** at the rear, there is an extension, part of the original house, with 2 east-facing windows and 3 east facing windows that have been infilled with brick.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace this "hodge podge" of openings on the east elevation on the extension with 3 more regularized wooden windows: at the third floor, new glass doors to match the historic window profile and a new Juliette balcony; at the second floor, new glass doors to match the historic profile and a new Juliette balcony; at the ground floor, new glass doors to match the historic profile.

**WHEREAS** the three new openings will be approximately 9' high by 9' wide with wooden mullions; the removed window openings will have brick infill.

WHEREAS both the very minimally visible proposed new bulkhead, at a lower height than the bulkhead to be removed and the proposed new windows/French doors at the east facing elevation on the extension are sensitive to the historic fabric of the house and contextual within the historic district.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT** that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Chu, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron, Camp, Davis [Public Member]; 1 abstention (Birnbaum)

David Helpern and Jane Parshall - Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee