Nicholas D. Viest Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

#### LAND USE-FULL BOARD MEETING WEDNESDAY, JULY 18, 2012 Hunter College 695 Park Avenue West Building, Room HW 714 6:30PM

**Community Board Members Present:** Elizabeth Ashby, Kenneth Austin, Albert Barrueco, John Bartos, Michele Birnbaum, Molly Blayney, Matthew Bondy, Lori Ann Bores, Barbara Chocky, Sarah Chu, James Clynes, Christina Davis, Jeffrey Escobar, Cory Evans, Susan Evans, A. Scott Falk, George Fuchs, Edward Hartzog, David Helpern, Lorance Hockert, Jonathan Horn, Dave Kleckner, David Liston, Jacqueline Ludorf, Domenico Minerva, Laurence Parnes, Jane Parshall, Mary Boresz Pike, Rita Lee Popper, Margaret Price, Hattie Quarnstrom, Barbara Rudder, William Sanchez, Judith Schneider, M. Barry Schneider, Teri Slater, Cos Spagnoletti, Marco Tamayo, Debra Teitelbaum, Nicholas Viest, Charles Warren, Hedi White

**Community Board Members (Excused):** Deirdre Breslin, Roy Carlin, Lorraine Johnson, Ellen Polivy, David Rosenstein, Patrick Stewart, Elaine Walsh

**Community Board Members (Unexcused):** Helene Simon, **Total Attendance: 42** 

Total Attendance: 42

Chair Nicholas D. Viest called the meeting to order at 6:30PM.

#### **1. Public Session:**

- Member of the public, Kaitlin Moore and Andrew Smith, representing Whole Foods Market, introduced themselves and Whole Foods Market to the community.
- Member of the public, Megan Ahearn, representing New York Public Interest Research Group/New York City Coalition for a Smoke-Free City, spoke on tobacco advertising and youth.
- Member of the public, Marcy Barkan, spoke in opposition to the potential news stand on the north east corner of 79<sup>th</sup> Street between 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue.
- Member of the public, Michael Abrams, spoke in opposition to the news stand at 79<sup>th</sup> Street and Third Avenue.
- Member of the public, Mary O'Connor, spoke in opposition to the Landmarks Committee Allen Stevenson School rooftop renovation and in favor of the resolution against the renovation.
- Member of the public, Roman Dvoracek, representing 1480 Second Avenue, spoke in favor of the 1480 Second Avenue liquor license.
- Member of the public, Roberta Horne, spoke in opposition to the news stand at the north east corner of 79<sup>th</sup> Street.
- Member of the public, Brad Sonnenberg, spoke in opposition to the news stand at 79<sup>th</sup> Street and Third Avenue.
- Member of the public, Toby Maranga, spoke in opposition to the news stand.
- Member of the public, Pavel Irbecky, representing 1480 Second Avenue, spoke in favor of the 1480 Second Avenue liquor license.
- Member of the public, Jeff Hersh, representing 1480 Second Avenue, spoke in favor of the liquor license.

- Member of the public, Jordan Wouk, spoke in opposition to phone booths.
- Member of the public, Mason Goldberg, representing 1480 Second Avenue, spoke in favor of the liquor license.
- Member of the public, William J. Williams, representing 570 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group license application.
- Member of the public, Dana Conroy, representing 116 East 63<sup>rd</sup> Street, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Albert F. Gordon, representing 570 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Phyllis Weisberg, representing the Preservation Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, James Johnson, representing the Central Presbyterian Church, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group license application.
- Member of the public, Marilyn Jenkins-Madina spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Douglas Paul, representing the Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Hilary Oran, representing Preservation, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Kevin P. Morrissey, representing the Preservation Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Robert Bard, representing 570 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, John Pyne, representing the Preservation Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Bernard Leventhal, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Steven Delyee, representing the Preservation Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Gerold Klauer, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Philip Cowen, representing 580 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Adele Hogan, representing the Preservation Coalition, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group license application.
- Member of the public, Susan Ferriere, representing Millan Howe, spoke in opposition to the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Theresa Russo, representing the Rose Group, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine application.
- Member of the public, Sally Minaris, representing neighbor, spoke in favor of 583 Park Avenue.
- Member of the public, Clint Johnson, spoke in favor of the Rose Group.
- Member of the public, Tom Draper, representing the Third Church of Christ Scientist, spoke in favor of the Rose Group wine and beer license.
- Member of the public, Joyce Horman, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine license.
- Member of the public, Jean Hall, representing the Third Church of Christ, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine license.
- Member of the public, Dora Redman, representing the Church, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine license.
- Member of the public, Robbyn Tongue, representing the Third Church of Christ, Scientist, spoke in favor of the Rose Group license.
- Member of the public, James Hallquist, representing 583 Park Avenue Rose Group, spoke in favor of the beer/wine license.
- Member of the public, Louise Wilson, representing the Rose Group Park Avenue, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine license.
- Member of the public, Ellen Lord, representing 583 Park Avenue, spoke in favor of the beer and wine license.
- Member of the public, Victor Kovner, representing the Rose Group, spoke in favor of the Rose Group beer and wine license.

- **Informational Presentation:** New York-Presbyterian Hospital will provide an overview of its proposed new medical facility to be located on York Avenue between 68th and 69th Streets.
- **Public Hearing: 421-a Application, 1113 York Avenue** Application for Preliminary Certification of Eligibility for Partial Tax Exemption under Section 421-a of the New York State Real Property Tax Law and 11-245 of the New York City Administrative Code.

Whereas, this is an application for preliminary certification of eligibility for partial tax exemption under section 421-a of the New York State Real Property Tax Law and 11-245 of the New York City Administrative Code; and
Whereas, Community Board 8M held a public hearing regarding this matter;
Whereas, the applicant and their representative did not attend this meeting,
Be it resolved that Community Board 8M recommends denial of this application.
Community Board 8M voted to Disapprove this application by a vote of 30 in favor, 0 opposed, 2 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause.

• **Public Hearing: BSA Calendar No. 198-12-BZ, 31-33 East 74<sup>th</sup> Street, Block 1389, Lot 25**-Application for variance pursuant to ZR Section 72-21 to allow construction of an enlargement to the existing buildings, which would contain Use Group 6 retail and Use Group 2 residential use and require modification of various bulk and supplementary use regulations.

Whereas, the application for variance pursuant to ZR Section 72-21 to allow construction of an enlargement to the existing buildings, which would contain Use Group 6 retail and Use Group 2 residential use and require modification of various bulk and supplementary use regulations. Whereas, Community Board 8M held a public hearing regarding this matter; therefore **Be It Resolved** that Community Board 8M approves the BSA application to allow construction of enlargement to the existing buildings, which would contain Use Group 6 retail and Use Group 2 residential use and require modification of various bulk and supplementary use regulations. **Community Board 8M adopted the resolution by a vote of 39 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.** 

- 2. Adoption of the Agenda Agenda adopted.
- 3. Adoption of the Minutes June Land Use and Full Board meeting minutes adopted.

#### 4. Manhattan Borough President's Report:

No presentation was made by the Manhattan Borough President's Office.

#### 5. Elected Official's Reports:

- Council Member Jessica Lappin reported on her latest initiatives. She reported on a brand new pilot program that the New York City Council is enacting. The Council will have to pass legislation to enact the legislation that will allow the City to deputize Department of Transportation employees to write tickets along with the New York Police Department. She also updated the community on the issue of the charter schools that had applied for space in District 2's PS 158. She thanked everyone for writing letters and getting in touch with the Chancellor in regards to this issue so that the space will not be used for the charter school spots. She is also opposed to the proposed newsstand at 79<sup>th</sup> Street and Third Avenue and is working with the Department of Consumer Affairs, the people who live on that lot and possible legislative remedies to resolve this issue.
- Assembly Member Dan Quart reported on his latest initiatives. He spoke on his disappointment with the legislative process regarding the 24.5% tax abatement for class 2 owners. The Assembly Member feels that the unequal treatment of class 2 owners is a very crucial issue to property owners in our community and it needs to be resolved. He is going to continue working on getting the reauthorization through legislation of the tax abatement for the class 2 coop and condominium owners and recommends that the community also engage with the new Mayoral candidates on this critical matter. The Assembly Member also announced that his office along with the American Italian Cancer Foundation is sponsoring free mammogram screenings on Friday, August 24<sup>th</sup>, 10AM-5PM, at East 56<sup>th</sup> Street (between 1<sup>st</sup> & 2<sup>nd</sup> Ave).

The screenings are by appointment and can be scheduled by calling his office at 212-605-0937 or by email at <u>quartd@assembly.state.ny.us</u>

- Patrick Madigan, a representative from State Senator Liz Krueger's office, reported on her latest initiatives. He gave an update on the 583 Park Avenue issue regarding the request of the Rose Group to transform the landmarked church building at 583 Park Avenue into a commercial catering hall. The community argued that this proposal would significantly harm the community's quality of life, increase traffic, and undermine the integrity of New York City's zoning laws. In an effort to undermine a state law that prohibits the issuance of full liquor licenses to businesses operating within 200 feet of a school or religious institution an upstate Senator introduced legislation to create an exception to the law banning liquor license at this location legislation that made no provision for community input. Senator Krueger spoke out strongly in the Senate floor against this bill, which passed the Senate but, fortunately, died in the Assembly.
- Helen Ohw, a representative from Assembly Member Kellner's office, reported on his latest initiatives. She briefly gave the latest update addressing the Assembly Member's new lawsuit against Mayor Bloomberg and others aimed at stopping the East 91<sup>st</sup> Street Marine Transfer Station (MTS) by stating that there will <u>not</u> be a contract being sent to the Comptroller's Office before October.
- Genevieve Michel, a representative from Council Member Daniel Garodnick's office reported on his latest initiatives. The Council Member was happy to report that in June the City Council passed the Fiscal Year 2013 budget. For his part, Council Member Garodnick moved to create greater access and transparency in the budget process by releasing a list of every meeting he or a member of his staff, had with any group seeking funding for this year's budget. He also revealed whether there were lobbyists or other advocates present in the meeting, as well as every letter his office received for funding. All this information is available at <u>www.garodnick.com</u>

#### 6. Chair's Report – Nick Viest:

Nick Viest wanted to keep the agenda moving so he urged all the CB8M Board Members to be brief in regards to the comments regarding the Rose Group issue.

#### 7. Committee Reports and Action Items:

#### Street Life Committee – Domenico Minerva and Cos Spagnoletti, Co-Chairs

1a. Jasper Hospitality, LLC d/b/a East End Bar & Grill, 1664 First Avenue (86<sup>th</sup>/87<sup>th</sup> Streets) – New application for an unenclosed sidewalk café with 5 tables and 10 seats, DCA #1433632. Due date: July 30<sup>th</sup> WHEREAS there were two (2) 311 calls in 2012,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the application is Approved.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

2a. Northeast Corner (NEC) of East 79<sup>th</sup> Street and Third Avenue – New proposed newsstand, DCA #: 1435494. Due date: August 31<sup>st</sup>

WHEREAS this location has been rejected before,

WHEREAS there were people from the affected building present,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **DIS-Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 24 in favor, 18 opposed, and 1 abstention.

3a. Sark Holdings, LLC d/b/a Desmond's, 153 East 60th Street (Lexington/ Third Avenues) - New

application to alter the existing bar for an wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license **WHEREAS** there were no 311 calls in 2012,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

WHEREAS this is only an alteration to the inside, and operational changes,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

## 4a <u>Rose Group Park Avenue, LLC d/b/a 583 Park Avenue, 583 Park Avenue (63<sup>rd</sup>/64<sup>th</sup> Streets)</u> – New

application for a wine and beer only license

**WHEREAS** this application is for wine and beer,

**WHEREAS** there was one (1) official 311 call received in 2010 but there were many local area residents present that stated that they had complained since the start of business by this establishment and have given up calling it since because of perceived inaction,

**WHEREAS** the people in support of the application were largely from the Church or were Rose Group employees/clients,

WHEREAS almost all of local area residents present objected to this application,

WHEREAS the residents complained about ongoing traffic problems, congestion, lighting, loading & unloading at all hours,

**WHEREAS** the events held can have as many as 1,300 attendees which contribute to these quality of life problems,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **DISAPPROVED**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 26 in favor, 15 opposed, and 1 abstention.

Manhattan Community Board 8 also voted to disapprove a proposed resolution to approve with stipulations by a vote of 17 in favor, 24, opposed, and 1 abstention.

4b. <u>Phillipos Restaurant, Inc. d/b/a Barking Dog Luncheonette, 1678 Third Avenue aka 183 E. 94<sup>th</sup> Street</u> - New application for an liquor, wine and beer (on-premises) liquor license

WHEREAS the applicant failed to show for the second time,

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the application is DIS-Approved.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 1 abstention.

4c. <u>A Aso, Inc., 1103 First Avenue (60<sup>th</sup>/61<sup>st</sup> Streets)</u> – New application for a wine and beer only license **WHEREAS** this is for beer & wine only,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4d. Asian Eatery, NY, Inc., 207 East 59<sup>th</sup> Street (Third/Second Avenues) – New application for a wine and beer only license

WHEREAS this is for beer & wine only,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4e. <u>Venky's Food Corp. d/b/a Om Restaurant, 1593 Second Avenue (82<sup>nd</sup>/83<sup>rd</sup> Streets)</u> – New application for a wine and beer only license

WHEREAS this is for beer & wine only,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4f. Ludi Bruca, Inc. d/b/a Café Evergreen, 1367 First Avenue (73<sup>rd</sup>/74<sup>th</sup> Streets) – New application for a wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

**BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4g. Tonino 205, East, Inc. d/b/a Campagna Quattro Gatti, 205 East 81st Street (Third/Second Avenues) -

New application for a wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license

WHEREAS this is for beer & wine only,

WHEREAS no one from the public objected,

BE IT RESOLVED THAT the application is Approved.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4i. <u>Corp. to be formed by Frank Locker d/b/a Vinus & Mark, 1825 Second Avenue (94<sup>th</sup>/95<sup>th</sup> Streets)</u> – New application for a wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license **WHEREAS** no one from the public objected, **BE IT RESOLVED THAT** the application is **Approved**. **Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.** 

4j. Le Bilboquet NY, LLC d/b/a Le Bilboquet, 22 East 60<sup>th</sup> Street (Madison/Park Avenue) – New application for a wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license WHEREAS no one from the public objected, BE IT RESOLVED THAT the application is Approved. Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 43 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

4k. <u>Corp. to be formed by Pavel Srbecky, 1480 Second Avenue (@ 77<sup>th</sup> Street)</u> – New application for an wine, beer, and liquor (on-premises) license
WHEREAS this is for a new location,
WHEREAS there were objections from the public,
WHEREAS the applicant has agreed to 2AM closing, instead of 4AM,
WHEREAS the applicant will close all windows by 10PM,
BE IT RESOLVED THAT the application is Approved.
Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the resolution by a vote of 41 in favor, 2 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

#### • Transportation Committee – A. Scott Falk and Chuck Warren, Co-Chairs Re: Request by MTA contactor Skanska Traylor JV for truck layover lanes on the east side of 2nd Avenue between E. 88 – E. 89th Streets and E. 89th – E. 90th Street, and a request from MTA contractor SSK JV for truck layover lanes between E. 74 – E. 75th Streets for the adjacent traffic lane and from E. 75 – E. 76th streets for adjacent traffic lane only.

Part I: 88th to 91st was presented by Phil Rice, MTA Capital Construction Manager. Mr. Rice stated that up to fourteen muck trucks could be operating at peak times, which would involve 70 to 72 truck trips per day. The Committee was concerned about the issues of truck idling, the potential for tying up traffic, and the ability of people to use the parking lanes when the trucks are around. There was also concern about the use of two spaces between East 90th and East 91st Streets on the west side of Second Avenue. Mr. Rice stated that these lanes, which are No Standing lanes, would only be used in unusual circumstances and only from 10 a.m. to 4 p.m. and from 7 p.m. to 10 p.m., both non-rush hour times. It is expected that the primary location would be between East 88th and East 89th Streets with less use of the spaces between East 89th and East 90th Streets. The muck truck operations are expected to last for approximately one year.

**WHEREAS,** it is necessary that truck layover lanes be available for muck truck operations on the east side of Second Avenue between East 88th Street and East 90th Street, and

**WHEREAS,** it is also necessary to have truck layover lanes on the west side of Second Avenue between East 90th and East 91st Streets as a contingency measure, and

**WHEREAS**, the MTA and its contractor have committed to make efforts to control the flow of trucks using the layover lanes and to enforce the no idling rules,

**THEREFORE RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8M approves the MTA proposal to use the curb lane on Second Avenue from East 88th Street to East 89th Street as a muck truck queuing lane from 7 a.m. to 7 p.m. Monday through Friday and to use the travel lane adjacent to the curb lane on Second Avenue between East 88th Street and East 89th Street as an additional muck truck queuing lane from 7 a.m. to 10 p.m. Monday through Friday, and

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that Community Board 8M approves the MTA proposal to use the curb lane on Second Avenue between East 89th and East 90th Streets as a muck truck queuing lane from 7 a.m. to 10 a.m. Monday through Friday and to use the travel lane adjacent to the curb lane on Second Avenue between East 89th and East 90th Streets as an additional muck truck queuing lane from 7 a.m. to 10 a.m. Monday through Friday, and

**FURTHER RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8M approves the MTA proposal to use the "No Standing" zone on the west side of Second Avenue between East 90th and East 91st Streets as a muck truck queuing lane from 10 a.m. to 4 p.m. and 7 p.m. to 10 p.m. Monday through Friday. The use of this area should only be in the event of a contingency situation.

Part II: 74th Street to 76th Street was presented by Dan Mando, MPT Coordinator for MTA Capital Construction. Muck truck operations could involve up to 24 trips per day. Community Board 8M had already approved use of certain lanes only for muck truck operations. These operations are expected to last until February 2013. However, concrete truck operations are just beginning and are expected to last for one year until July 2013. The concrete trucks, will service three drop locations (66th, 68-69, 72nd Street Shaft). To pour 200 yards per day, involves about 20 trucks, 4 - 5 trucks per hour (per site) from 7 am to 2 pm. At peak periods there could be up to 500 yards poured daily, 4 to 6 trucks per hour (per site), from 7 AM to about 6 PM. Every effort will be made to move the trucks out as quickly as possible since concrete trucks have to keep their motors running at all times.

**WHEREAS,** it is necessary for the MTA to have access to additional lanes on Second Avenue between East 74th Street and East 76th Street to help the traffic flow in connection with the continuing muck truck operations and the beginning concrete truck operations; and

**WHEREAS**, the MTA will only use the lanes that are necessary for these operations and will come back to us after the muck truck operations are over in February, 2013;

**THEREFORE, RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8M approves the MTA proposal to use the lane adjacent to the curb lane on the East side of Second Avenue between East 74th Street and East 75th Street for truck queuing operations from 7am to 10 pm, Monday through Friday and to use the lane adjacent to the curb lane on the East side Second Avenue between 75th Street and 76th Street for truck queuing operations from 7am to 10 pm, Monday through Friday and to use the lane adjacent to 10 pm, Monday through Friday.

**FURTHER RESOLVED,** that the MTA will come back to Community Board 8M after the muck truck operations are completed to review the situation between East 74th Street and East 76th Street in order to restore those areas to regular parking to the extent possible.

Community Board 8M <u>APPROVED</u> the resolution by a vote of 40 in favor, 1 opposed, 1 abstention and 0 not voting for cause.

#### **Re: Request for Information-Future of Public Pay Telephones**

**WHEREAS,** some public pay phones are necessary since cell phone use is not universal, and **WHEREAS,** there have been problems over the years with poorly maintained pay phones and proliferation of advertising on pay phones,

**THEREFORE RESOLVED,** that Community Board 8M recommends to DOITT (1) that the number of pay phones in our district be reduced by at least 50 percent, (2) that advertising on pay phones be restricted as much as possible, (3) that the design of the pay phones reduce their presence on the sidewalk as much as possible and approximate in size muni-meters, and (4) that no licenses be granted to companies that have consistently failed to maintain their existing pay phones.

Community Board 8M <u>APPROVED</u> the resolution by a vote of 38 in favor, 2 opposed, 2 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause.

### • Landmarks Committee – David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs

**Re:** 2 East 91<sup>st</sup> Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) [Carnegie Mansion] – Carnegie Hill Historic District - *Beyer Blinder Belle, Architect* - A neo-Georgian style mansion designed by Babb, Cook & Willard and built in 1899-1903. Application is to install a new Con Edison sidewalk vault in front of the museum at 2 East 91<sup>st</sup> Street.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to remove a portion of the sidewalk in front of the gate at its location to create a vault which would be beneath the sidewalk to house a transformer which ConEd has advised the applicant is necessary to meet the applicant's electrical needs.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes replacing the removed portion of the sidewalk, which is made of granite, with concrete slabs as well as five metal grates, two of which would measure 2' x 3' and three of which would measure 4' x 6".

**WHEREAS** the Committee is sensitive to the need of the applicant to work with ConEd to meet the applicant's electrical needs, but the Committee is not persuaded that the applicant has considered other options that may well be less intrusive from a landmarks perspective and yet be equally effective in meeting the applicant's electrical needs, for example, the applicant has not explained to the Committee why it is that the same vaults cannot be constructed somewhere on the inside of the applicant's fence rather than on the sidewalk outside of the applicant's fence.

**WHEREAS** the proposed changes would be contrary to the original design and fabric of this landmark and the applicant has failed to demonstrate that there are not reasonable alternatives.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is **disapproved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 41 in favor, 1 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

### Re: 11 East 75<sup>th</sup> Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District Extension

- *Chris Fogarty, Architect* - Neo-federal former row house originally designed by William E. Mowbray, and built in 1987-89 and altered to a multiple dwelling in 1923 by Henry M. Polhemus. Application is to alter the facade and penthouse and to recreate an areaway.

WHEREAS this building will be converted from a multiple dwelling back to a single family house;

**WHEREAS** the façade will be restored and modified to have a limestone base and a central entrance to differentiate it from the apartment house next door,

**WHEREAS** the house will have decorative wrought iron railings around a new areaway and at the second floor windows; whereas the house will have a new stone cornice to carry out the theme of the stone headers over the windows,

**WHEREAS** the side wall of the rear extension facing the garden will be notched to accommodate new oriel windows,

**WHEREAS** the top floor of the rear extension will be reduced in height, with the top floor converted from a brick box with punched in windows to a wood and glass conservatory,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that is application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

**Re: 150** East **72<sup>nd</sup>** Street (corner of Lexington Avenue) - Upper East Side Historic District Extension - *Dan Shannon, Architect* - A Renaissance Revival style apartment building designed by Schwartz & Gross and built in 1913-14. Application is to replace the existing lobby doors and side lights, realign stairs and add an areaway gate and side door canopy.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace the existing lobby doors and side lights, realign the front stairs, and add an areaway gate and a canopy over a side door.

**WHEREAS** the Committee wishes to consider this application in two parts: 1) the side door canopy and 2) the remaining elements of the application.

#### PART 1: The side door canopy

**WHEREAS** the elegance and simplicity of the Renaissance Revival style of the building and its importance as an anchor at the southeast corner of Lexington Avenue and 72nd Street within the Upper East Side Historic District Extension would be compromised by the insertion of a side door canopy at the ground level on the north elevation.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that the portion of the application related to the side door canopy is **disapproved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted Part 1 of this application by a vote of 27 in favor, 13 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

#### PART 2: Remaining elements of the application

**WHEREAS** the proposed lobby doors and side lights, the realignment of the stairs, and the areaway gate are consistent with the character of the Historic District and the original design of the building.

**THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that the proposal to replace the existing lobby doors and side lights, realign the front stairs, and add an areaway gate is **approved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

### Re: 132 East 78<sup>th</sup> Street (between Lexington and Park Avenues) [Allen Stevenson School] – Upper East

**Side Historic District** - *Francois de Menil, Architect* – A neo-Federal style, five-story school building designed by James W. O'Connor and built in 1923-24. Application to renovate the roof canopy.

**WHEREAS** the proposed roof structure for the school's rooftop play area is 4'-6 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>" taller than the current roof structure making the top of the structure 21'-10 <sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub>" instead of 17'-4" above the roof;

**WHEREAS** the proposed roof structure is covered about equally on top with photovoltaic solar panels and clear polycarbonate panels and the current roof structure is open on top except for a protective mesh;

**WHEREAS** the perimeter of the proposed structure is covered with a protective mesh and the perimeter of the current structure is covered with a protective mesh;

**WHEREAS** the proposed roof structure is extended to include a small play area on the roof at the rear of the building;

WHEREAS the proposed extension would be visible over a one story building on Lexington Avenue;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 25 in favor, 17 opposed, and 1 abstention.

**Re: 834 Fifth Avenue (@ 64<sup>th</sup> Street) (Partial 13<sup>th</sup> and 14<sup>th</sup> Floors) – Upper East Side Historic District** – A neo-Renaissance style apartment building designed by Rosario Candela and built in 1930. Application is to replace existing metal railings.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to replace existing metal railings, which are 30" in height, on the west and south facing terraces on the 13th and 14th floors in order to comply with the Building Code, with new railings which will be 42" in height.

**WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to incorporate the same decorative elements in the new railings as are present in the existing and original railings and the applicant proposed to use materials closely matching same.

**WHEREAS** the impact of the proposed changes would be minimal in terms of the appearance of the building and would, in any event, be consistent with the original design and character of the building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that is application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

### • Street Fair Committee – Barbara Chocky and Hedi White, Co-Chairs

# Re: Metallic Lathers Local 46 to close East 76<sup>th</sup> Street between Third and Lexington Avenue on Saturday, September 8, 2012 from 8AM to 4PM for a Block Party

This event has been held annually for many years. It is a Labor Day celebration.

There will be free beverages and a barbeque prepared by members; No alcohol is served. Appropriate permits will be obtained. There will be music. Clean-up is done by members.

The event is open to the public.

There were no complaints.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

## Re: Marymount Manhattan College to close East 71<sup>st</sup> Street between Second and Third Avenue on Wednesday, September 12, 2012 from 12Noon to 4PM for a Block Party

This "Apple Fest" event has been held since 2009 during second week of new semester to welcome new and returning students. There will be two inflatables and music at  $2^{nd}$  Ave. end of event. Food served will have been prepared in school kitchen. Staff cleans up.

The event is open to the public.

There were no complaints.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 36 in favor, 5 opposed, and 1 abstention.

## St. Stephen of Hungary Church to close East 82<sup>nd</sup> Street between First and York Avenue on Saturday, September 15, 2012 from 8AM to 6pm for a Block Party

Applicant was not present.

However, since this event has been held annually for many years and there were no complaints, it was decided to vote on the application.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

# PS 6 to close East 82<sup>nd</sup> Street between Madison and Park Avenue on Saturday, September 29, 2012 from 11AM to 5PM for a Block Party

Applicant was not present.

However, since this event has been held annually for many years and there were no complaints, it was decided to vote on the application.

## Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

# The Town School to close East 76<sup>th</sup> Street between York and Dead End Street on Sunday, September 30, 2012 from 11AM to 4PM for a Block Party

This event has taken place each year since 2005

It is a Welcome Back festival for grades 3-8. It will include inflatables.

It is open to the public. There will be music for children. Food served will have been prepared in school kitchen. Event is held at the far end of a dead end street; neighbors are invited to attend.

There were no complaints.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

# Manhattan Country School to close East 96<sup>th</sup> Street between Madison and Fifth Avenue on Saturday, October 20, 2012 from 11AM to 4PM for a Block Party

Applicant did not appear.

Committee agreed that it could not approve an event to be held on East 96<sup>th</sup> Street, a busy 2-way main artery through our community.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend disapproval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

# The Town School to close East 76<sup>th</sup> Street between York and FDR Drive on Sunday, October 21, 2012 from 12Noon to 3PM for a Block Party

This event has taken place each year since 2008

It is a Fall "Pumpkin" festival for grades K-2. It will include limited inflatables.

It is open to the public; neighbors are invited to attend.

The street is a dead end street;

One Board member expressed concern that this event follows very closely to a second event (see above). Other venues (including nearby park) have been tried but the street in front of the school was determined to be the safest and easiest to control for small children.

There were no complaints.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

# Trevor Day School to close East 90<sup>th</sup> Street between Madison and Fifth Avenue on Saturday, November 17, 2012 from 10AM to 4PM for a Block Party

This application is for the School's annual Fall festival that has been held for many years.

The event is open to the public.

There were no complaints received.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted the motion to recommend approval by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

**8. Old Business** No old business.

**9. New Business** No new business.

The meeting was adjourned at 10:30PM.

Nicholas D. Viest, Chair