Nicholas D. Viest Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) **www.cb8m.com** Website **info@cb8m.com** - E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

FULL BOARD MEETING

New York Blood Center 310 East 67th Street Auditorium Wednesday, November 19, 2014 6:30PM

Community Board Members Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Albert Barrueco, Lowell Barton, Michele Birnbaum, Matthew Bondy, Lori Ann Bores, Barbara Chocky, James Clynes, Christina Davis, Jeffrey Escobar, Susan Evans, A. Scott Falk, Edward Hartzog, David Helpern, Lorance Hockert, Sophia James, Lorraine Johnson, Allison Kopf, Craig Lader, David Liston, Jacqueline Ludorf, Domenico Minerva, Laurence Parnes, Jane Parshall, Ellen Polivy, Rita Lee Popper, Margaret Price, Hattie Quarnstrom, David Rosenstein, Barbara Rudder, Abraham Salcedo, William Sanchez, Judith Schneider, M. Barry Schneider, Teri Slater, Cos Spagnoletti, Marco Tamayo, Debra Teitelbaum, Nicholas Viest, Elaine Walsh, Charles Warren, Hedi White, Timothy Yeo, Gregory Zaffiro Community Board Members (Excused): Sarah Chu, Jonathan Horn, Dave Kleckner, Community Board Members (Unexcused): Sharon Pope, Jared Stone Total Attendance: 44

Chair Nicholas D. Viest called the meeting to order at 6:30PM.

1. Public Session – Those who wish to speak during the Public Session must register to do so by 6:45 pm

- Member of the public, Don Allen, representing 799 and 815 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to 807 Park Avenue.
- Member of the public, Edward Stubin, representing 815 Park Avenue, spoke in opposition to destroying 807 Park Avenue.
- Member of the public, Suzanne Friend, representing Allen Stevenson School, spoke in favor of construction at Allen Stevenson School.
- Member of the public, Mary White, spoke in opposition to the light effect of the landmarked Allen Stevenson School project.
- Member of the public, Rick Cotton, spoke in opposition to the landmarked Allen Stevenson School.
- Member of the public, Harvey Silverman, spoke.
- Member of the public, Maurice Fogoda, spoke in opposition to 807 Park Avenue.
- Member of the public, Lisa Lanzi, representing Trevor Day School, spoke regarding the street closing permit.
- Member of the public, David R. Teower, spoke on the Landmarks Committee request.
- Member of the public, McCartney Wilkins, spoke in favor of Allen Stevenson School.
- Member of the public, Allan Arlfan, spoke in opposition to the proposed addition to 129 East 94th street.
- Member of the public, Betsy Smith, spoke in opposition to the landmarked Allen Stevenson School project.
- Member of the public, Leslie Tabor, representing the Yorkville Library, spoke on the library's events.

- Member of the public, Bryan Verona, representing the 78th Street Block Association, spoke in opposition to the Allen Stevenson landmark project.
- Member of the public, Meredith Verona, spoke in opposition to the landmark Allen Stevenson project.
- Member of the public, Jeffrey Stern, spoke.
- Member of the public, Elizabeth Mathus, representing the Allen-Stevenson School, spoke in favor of the renovation.
- Member of the public, Fredda Goldberg, representing the Allen-Stevenson School, spoke in favor of the renovation.
- Member of the public, Peter Phillips, representing 815 Park Avenue Owners, Inc., spoke on 807 Park Avenue.
- Member of the public, Alec Michaels, spoke in opposition to 129 East 94th Street.
- Member of the public, Celeste Sant Angelo, spoke in opposition to the 807 Park Avenue renovation.
- Member of the public, Alan Levine, spoke.
- Member of the public, Betsy Smith, spoke on the Allen Stevenson expansion.
- Member of the public, Rick Cohen, spoke on the Allen Stevenson project.
- Member of the public, a parent at Allen-Stevenson school, spoke in favor of the Allen-Stevenson project.
- Member of the public, Martha Kellner, representing a block association, spoke in opposition to the Allen Stevenson project.
- Member of the public, Judy Schneider, representing the East Sixties Neighborhood Association, spoke on the toy drive.

2. Adoption of the Agenda – Agenda adopted.

3. Adoption of the Minutes – September 10, 2014 Land Use and September 17, 2014 Full Board meeting minutes adopted.

4. Manhattan Borough President's Report:

Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer reported on her latest initiatives which included her tech assistant forums, CB8M applications, mom and pop stores, school and arts and tech groups, banning of plastic bags, and composting. She also announced that she was in support of the CB8M 1010 Park Avenue resolution.

5. Elected Official's Reports:

- Tricia Shimamura, a representative from Congress Member Carolyn Maloney's office, reported on her latest initiatives.
- George Damalas, a representative from Senator Jose Serrano's office reported on his latest legislative initiatives.
- Rohan Narine, a representative from Assembly Member Dan Quart's office, reported on his latest initiatives.
- Will Brightbill, a representative from Council Member Daniel Garodnick's office, reported on his latest initiatives.
- Ed Sullivan, a representative from Public Advocate Letitia James' office, reported on her latest initiatives.
- Council Member Ben Kallos reported on his latest initiatives which included his Ebola Town Hall, the MTS, Comcast Cable, school tours, the participatory budget, the greenmarkets, and legislation.

6. Chair's Report – Nick Viest:

Chair Nick Viest gave his report. Nick announced that an important thing happened. Community board members Allison Kopf and David Kleckner ran the New York City Marathon. He was very proud of these 2 members. He then moved the agenda to the election of the Community Board 8 officers for the 2015 term.

7. Election of Community Board 8 Officers

A vote was taken by the Community Board 8 members for the slate of officers for the 2015 term.

The following Community Board 8 members were elected for the following 5 posts. James Clynes – Chair Elect – Unopposed – 43 votes Scott Falk – 1st Vice Chair Elect – 29 votes Sarah Chu – 1st Vice Chair – 13 votes Debra Teitelbaum – 2nd Vice Chair Elect – Unopposed - 42 votes Susan Evans – Secretary – Unopposed – 43 votes Jane Parshall – Secretary – Unopposed – 43 votes

8. Committee Reports and Action Items:

• Transportation Committee – A. Scott Falk and Charles Warren, Co-Chairs Re: A request for a new Revocable Consent for fenced-in area at 20 East 83rd Street

WHEREAS Goyard NY LLC has petitioned for a new revocable consent at 20 East 63rd Street to construct, maintain, and use proposed fenced-in areas; and

WHEREAS petitioner's stated purpose for the request is for beautification, protection, and to align with adjacent properties; and

WHEREAS Community Board 8 Manhattan approved the petitioner's related landmarks application, including a proposed fence, in March 2014; and

WHEREAS no members of the public raised any objections;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Community Board 8 Manhattan approves Goyard NY LLC's petition for a new revocable consent at 20 East 63rd Street to construct, maintain, and use the proposed fenced-in areas. **Manhattan Community Board 8 passed the resolution of approval by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions and 0 not voting for cause.**

• Street Fair Committee – Barbara Chocky and Hedi White, Co-Chairs

1. Public Hearing re: Applications for Multi-Block Street Fairs for Calendar Year 2015

A. Museum Mile to close Fifth Avenue between East 82nd and East 105th Streets on Tuesday, June 9, <u>2015 from</u> 6:00PM to 9:00PM for a Street Festival

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

B. PS 183 to partially close the sidewalk on East 67th Street between York and First Avenues for parking and vendors and the sidewalk on the north side of East 66th Street between First and York on Saturdays from Saturday, January 3, 2015 to Saturday, December 26, 2015 for a Flea Market

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

C. Brick Presbyterian Church to close Park Avenue between East 90th and East 93rd Street on <u>Sunday</u>, <u>December</u> 6, 2015 from 5:00PM to 6:30PM for the annual Tree lighting

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

D. Gracie Square Art Show to close East End Avenue from 84th to 89th Streets on Saturday, <u>October 3, 2015 to</u> Sunday, October 4, 2015 from 10AM to 5PM for the annual Art Show

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

2. Public Hearing re: Applications for Single-block Street Fairs for Calendar Year 2014

A. Rudolf Steiner School to partially close the sidewalk on East 79th Street between Madison and <u>Fifth Avenues</u> on Saturday, November 22, 2014 from 10:00AM to 4:00PM for a Block Party.

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to <u>disapprove</u> the application by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

B. Christ Church to close the curb lane only on Park Avenue between East 60th and East 61st Streets <u>on Sunday</u>, <u>December 7, 2014 from 2:00PM to 5:00PM for a Religious Ceremony</u>

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

C. Manhattan Sephardic Congregation to close the sidewalk and curb lane on East 75th Street between First and Second Avenues on Sunday, December 21, 2014 from 5:00PM to 8:00PM for a <u>Religious Ceremony</u> Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

D. The Dalton School to close East 91st Street between Park and Madison Avenues on Friday, May <u>22, 2015 from</u> <u>11:30AM to 3:00PM for a Block Party</u>

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

E. Trevor Day School to close East 90th Street between Madison and Fifth Avenues on Thursday, <u>June 11, 2015</u> from 5:00PM to 6:30PM for a Block Party

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 31 in favor, 8 opposed and 2 abstentions.

F. Episcopal School to close East 69th Street between Park and Madison Avenues on Thursday, May 14, 2015 from 3:30PM to 5:30PM for a Block Party

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

G. Sephardic Academy of Manhattan to close East 67th Street between First and Second Avenues on <u>Sunday, May</u> 3, 2015 from 10:00AM to 4:00PM for a Block Party. **This is a new application.**

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

H. PS 267 East Side Elementary School to close East 63rd Street between Second and Third Avenues <u>on Sunday</u>, <u>May 3, 2015 from 11:00AM to 3:00PM for a Block Party</u>.

Manhattan Community Board 8 motioned to approve the application by a vote of 41 in favor, 0 opposed and 0 abstentions.

• Landmarks Committee – David Helpern and Jane Parshall, Co-Chairs

Re: 129 East 94th Street (between Park and Lexington Avenues) -- Carnegie Hill Historic District – *David Hottenroth, Architect.* Application is for restoration work at front elevation, enlargement of front areaway, and a rear yard addition.

Part 1: The front elevation.

WHEREAS 129 East 94th Street is a neo-Grec style rowhouse designed by F. S. Barus and constructed in 1878-1879.

WHEREAS 129 East 94th Street is in the middle row of 9 houses.

WHEREAS at the front elevation, the applicant proposes to recreate the original historic stoop (removed in the 1940s) and railing configuration, replace an existing window with a door based on the original design, and return the brownstone wherever it has been changed.

WHEREAS the proposed restoration work at the front elevation is appropriate and contextual within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part 1 of this application is **approved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 40 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Part 2: Rear Yard Extension

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant proposes to extend out 12' at the garden level and 6' at the 2^{nd} and 3^{rd} floors.

WHEREAS the depth of the rear yard will be reduced from 48' to 35'6".

WHEREAS there will be new enlarged windows at the ground and first floors; the rear elevation will be brick painted white (the same as the existing elevation.

WHEREAS the rear gardens on this block (94th Street on one side and 95th Street on the other between Lexington and Park Avenues) create one of the most unique open spaces in Carnegie Hill.

WHEREAS further encroachment into the "donut" or open space should not be allowed.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part 2 of this application is **disapproved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 30 in favor, 12 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 17 East 80th Street (between Madison and Fifth Avenues -- Metropolitan Museum Historic District – David Kent, *Architect*. Application is for window replacement at front elevation.

WHEREAS the windows on either side of the center window on the fourth floor were originally double hung, one over one;

WHEREAS the original center window was a casement with a transom above;

WHEREAS the original windows were mahogany;

WHEREAS the double hung windows are being replaced in kind with mahogany frames and sash;

WHEREAS the central casement window will be replaced with a full height casement window without a transom to take full advantage of the masonry opening for light and view;

WHEREAS the new casement window will be installed with a mahogany frame and sash;

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 40 in favor, 1 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 713 Madison Avenue (between 63rd and 64th Streets) [Longchamp] – Upper East Side Historic District – *Eric Lagerberg, Architect.* Application is to install new signage.

WHEREAS 713 Madison Avenue is a neo-Grec style rowhouse designed by Charles Baxter and constructed in 1877.

WHEREAS the application is for an illuminated sign for a retail shop at the ground level of the front elevation. **WHEREAS** the applicant proposes to remove the existing signage (a logo for the shop and the shop's name) and replace with identical signage that will be backlit with a light halo glow.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes an elegant and attractive solution for highlighting the signage for the shop. **THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 575 Park Avenue (between 62nd and 63rd Streets) – Upper East Side Historic District - *Adam Kushner, Architect.* Application is for work at first floor front elevation.

WHEREAS 575 Park Avenue is an apartment house with a restaurant on the ground floor with entrances on East 63rd Street;

WHEREAS there is a main entrance in the fifth bay of 11 bays and a secondary entrance in the 11th bay (counting from Park Avenue);

WHEREAS the entrances to the restaurant have divided lights;

WHEREAS the main entrance has a yellow canopy in the form of an arch and the secondary entrance has a canvas awning in the form of a semi-circle;

WHEREAS the central entrance is flanked by two large lantern fixtures and a menu box to one side; **WHEREAS** the secondary door has a menu box to one side;

WHEREAS the existing doors, which are not original to the building, are to be replaced with doors with single lights of glass to match the character of the existing original doors in the building;

WHEREAS the canopy at the central door will be replaced with a smaller canopy of rectilinear design of black canvas with beige stripes and bronze posts – to match the bronze metal used elsewhere in the building -- and the awning at the secondary door will be replaced with an awning of rectilinear design of black canvas with beige stripes;

WHEREAS the large lanterns flanking the main entrance will be replaced with smaller lanterns set at a lower elevation and whereas the exposed conduit will be replaced with concealed conduit;

WHEREAS the menu boxes will be replaced in kind with bronze frames;

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 23 in favor, 17 opposed, 2 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 820 Park Avenue (between 75th and 76th Streets) – **Upper East Side Historic District** - *Kevin Blusewicz, Architect.* Application is for window replacement.

WHEREAS 820 Park Avenue is a neo-Medieval style apartment building designed by Harry Allan Jacobs and constructed in 1926-27.

WHEREAS at the 6^{th} floor of the duplex apartment (on the 6^{th} and 7^{th} floors), there are two original stained glass windows visible from Park Avenue.

WHEREAS the windows are not in good condition; the applicant proposes to replace them with two casement windows with transoms above that will match the windows in the rest of the apartment and that match, as well, the original historic window for the building.

WHEREAS although the building does not have a window master plan, the building has chosen a casement window with a transom above that matches the original window design as the standard replacement window for all apartments in the building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 42 in favor, 0 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 130-134 East 78th Street, 126 East 78th Street, 128 East 78th Street, [Allen-Stevenson School] – Upper East Side Historic District - *Klilment Halsband Architects*. Application is to add a rooftop gymnasium, add rear extensions and create a rooftop greenhouse.

130-134 East 78th Street:

WHEREAS 130-134 East 78th Street has an existing outdoor covered play roof;

WHEREAS a proposed roof top gymnasium that was 2'-8" lower than the newly proposed gymnasium was previously approved by the Landmarks Preservation Commission;

WHEREAS the new design for the proposed gymnasium includes a new outdoor covered play space above that is set back from the street wall about half the depth of the proposed gym;

WHEREAS the top of the gym will be terminated with a mansard roof which blocks the view of the mechanical equipment on the roof;

WHEREAS the overall height of the building to the top of the mansard will be 105'-8" and to the top of the covered outdoor play space will be 117'-8";

WHEREAS the overall height of the building will be less than the allowable height under the Zoning resolution of 170'-0";

WHEREAS the façade of the proposed gymnasium will be made of brick to match the brick below the cornice; will have three large windows with divided lights to express the large space within; and will be visually terminated with a new limestone cornice;

WHEREAS the face of the mansard will have a standing seam metal roof;

WHEREAS the design of the top of the gymnasium, which sets the new cornice below the top of the gym and adds a mansard roof to complete the new enclosure, minimizes the height of the street wall with respect to the enlargement of the building;

126 and 128 East 78th Street:

WHEREAS 126 and 128 East 78th Street were built as two, three story townhouses;

WHEREAS 126 and 128 were expanded vertically to five stories;

WHEREAS the fifth stories will be removed to enable a new Art Room to be built in their place;

WHEREAS the new Art Room will have a new Green House above the rear portion of the Art Room:

WHEREAS the Art Room will have a low vertical wall faced with metal panels and a sloping north window wall;

WHEREAS the angle of the north window wall and the north face of the glass roof of the green house are in line with the view angle from the sidewalk to the top of the new metal panel wall and cannot be seen from the street; **WHEREAS** the fourth floor windows will be replaced with fixed windows to match the profiles of the existing windows;

WHEREAS the existing colors of the townhouses will remain to reflect their history as two separate structures;

WHEREAS the townhouses are in a 60 foot limited height district and will be submitted to the Board of Standards & Appeals for a variance;

WHEREAS a multi-purpose dance studio will be built in the rear yard of 126 East 78th Street up to the allowable height of 23'-0";

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is **approved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 24 in favor, 17 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

Re: 807 Park Avenue (between 75th and 76th Streets – Upper East Side Historic District - *Charles Platt, Architect.* Application is for a new building on the site of the existing building.

WHEREAS 807 Park Avenue is a neo-Renaissance style building designed by Neville and Bagge and constructed in 1898.

WHEREAS 807 Park Avenue (formerly 813 Park Avenue) is at the midblock between two larger apartment buildings.

WHEREAS 807 Park Avenue was originally 5 stories tall; the designation report for the historic district indicates that the style for the original 5-story building is Romanesque Revival/neo-Renaissance.

WHEREAS a six-story addition was added in 1982 keeping much of the historic fabric on the lower floors and at the top floor mimicking the round arched windows with keystones that present at the 2nd and 3rd floor windows on the historic structure.

WHEREAS 807 Park Avenue is now 12 stories high, but appears from the street as 11 stories. (The interior configuration of the apartments allow for 12 stories, the lot is 25' wide and the rear elevation is minimally visible from the public way.) An easement from 815 Park Avenue allowed for the construction of an elevator shaft at the north elevation in a courtyard adjacent to 815 Park Avenue; the elevator shaft is set back 25' from the street wall.

WHEREAS the applicant suggests that because of the compromised status of 807 Park Avenue with the original 5-story building and the 6-story addition above, there is a basis for a development project for the site.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to construct a new building 139'8' (including elevator bulkhead 156'6") high, 25' higher than the existing building at 114' high. The applicant will maintain the same number of floors (12), but the floor to floor height for each apartment will rise to 11'7" – this accounts for the increase in height for the building.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to pull back the rear elevation 5'10".

WHEREAS in general, the metal windows on the front elevation will be 8' tall by 6' wide; the materials for the front elevation include limestone and granite; at the base the entry door will be bronze surrounded by limestone with some metal detailing.

WHEREAS at the top, above the cornice element, there is a large skylight which presents as a glass wall.

WHEREAS the new building will present as modern; there are minimal vague references to the original Romanesque revival/neo-Renaissance style of the original 5-story building included in the designation report for the district.

WHEREAS when the 6-story addition was constructed in 1982, it respected and retained much of the distinctive elements/historic fabric of the 1898-1899 Neville & Bragg building.

WHEREAS the proposed new building with its "modern" look and oversized fenestration is out of context and inappropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is **disapproved** as presented.

Manhattan Community Board 8 adopted this recommendation by a vote of 23 in favor, 18 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

9. Old Business

No old business.

10. New Business

No new business.

The meeting was adjourned at 9:50PM.

Nicholas D. Viest, Chair