Nicholas Viest Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

July 25, 2012

Hon. Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 2 East 91st Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) [Carnegie Mansion] – Carnegie Hill Historic District

Dear Chair Tierney:

At the Full Board meeting on Wednesday, July 18, 2012, the board adopted the following resolution regarding **2 East 91st Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) [Carnegie Mansion] – Carnegie Hill Historic District -** *Beyer Blinder Belle, Architect -* A neo-Georgian style mansion designed by Babb, Cook & Willard and built in 1899-1903. Application is to install a new Con Edison sidewalk vault in front of the museum at 2 East 91st Street.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove a portion of the sidewalk in front of the gate at its location to create a vault which would be beneath the sidewalk to house a transformer which ConEd has advised the applicant is necessary to meet the applicant's electrical needs.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes replacing the removed portion of the sidewalk, which is made of granite, with concrete slabs as well as five metal grates, two of which would measure 2' x 3' and three of which would measure 4' x 6".

WHEREAS the Committee is sensitive to the need of the applicant to work with ConEd to meet the applicant's electrical needs, but the Committee is not persuaded that the applicant has considered other options that may well be less intrusive from a landmarks perspective and yet be equally effective in meeting the applicant's electrical needs, for example, the applicant has not explained to the Committee why it is that the same vaults cannot be constructed somewhere on the inside of the applicant's fence rather than on the sidewalk outside of the applicant's fence.

WHEREAS the proposed changes would be contrary to the original design and fabric of this landmark and the applicant has failed to demonstrate that there are not reasonable alternatives.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 41 in favor, 1 opposed, and 0 abstentions.

Sincerely,

Nicholas Viest Chair David Helpern and David Liston Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Hon. Michael Bloomberg, Mayor of the City of New York Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Manhattan Borough President Hon. Liz Krueger, NYS Senate Member Hon. Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member Hon. Micah Kellner, NYS Assembly Member Hon. Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member Hon. Jessica Lappin, NYC Council Member