James G. Clynes Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

September 28, 2016

Hon. Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 172-174 East 73rd Street (between Lexington and 3rd Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District

Dear Chair Srinivasan:

At the Full Board meeting on Wednesday, September 21, 2016, the board adopted the following resolution regarding 172-174 East 73rd Street (between Lexington and 3rd Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District – Andrew W. Wright, architect; Adam Taubman, Valerie Campbell, Kramer Levin. NB: Li Saltzman Architects prepared the existing conditions report. Application is for enlargement of 3rd floor, addition of a 4th floor and a rooftop bulkhead. Application for a report pursuant to Section 74-711 of the Zoning Resolution.

[Section 74-711 Special Permit –the City Planning Commission may permit modification of the use and bulk regulations provided that the application includes a report from the Landmarks Preservation Commission stating that a program has been established for a continuing maintenance program that will result in the preservation of the building. Any application shall include a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Preservation Commission stating that the bulk modifications relate harmoniously to the subject landmark building.]

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO THREE PARTS FOR VOTING PURPOSES. See below.

WHEREAS 172-174 East 73rd Street is a Romanesque Revival style carriage house designed by Frank Wennemer and constructed in 1889.

WHEREAS 172-174 East 73rd Street is a 3-story carriage house designated an Individual Landmark in 1980 and is one of several carriage houses along the block that have individual designations.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes an expansion of the existing 3rd floor, the addition of a 4th floor and the addition of a rooftop bulkhead.

WHEREAS the existing rear elevation is set back 6' from the property line and is non-compliant within the existing zoning.

WHEREAS a special permit (Section 74-711) is required to waive the rear yard requirement and to waive the minimum distance for/and between the legally required windows that face the rear yard.

WHEREAS the applicant, as part of the Section 74-711 special permit, has agreed to a program for continuing maintenance and a restrictive declaration will be filed against the property.

WHEREAS as part of the continuing maintenance program, the applicant has agreed to a complete restoration of 172-174 East 73rd Street, including restorative work at the front elevation.

WHEREAS at the 3rd floor, the applicant proposes a build out of the existing 3rd floor that would add 1,405 square feet so that the 3rd floor would now be 25' wide x 60'long.

WHEREAS the new 4th floor would add an additional 1,655 sq. ft. to the house and measure 25' x 66'; the height of the 4th floor would be 10'7". [The existing height of the carriage house is 38'10" to the top of the cornice.]

WHEREAS the bulkhead above add another 393 sq. ft. to the building; the bulkhead which extends across width of the house, is set back 30' from the front elevation and 56' from rear elevation.

WHEREAS the existing cornice at the 3rd floor visually blocks 3 ½ feet of the new 4th floor front elevation. WHEREAS the new 4th floor and the new bulkhead are not visible from the public way; the 4th floor is set back 15' from the front elevation.

WHEREAS the restoration of the existing carriage house has a preservation purpose including, at the front elevation, restoring the now-painted limestone at the ground level, replacing all the windows with in-kind wood windows and repairing and matching damaged bluestone at the base.

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant is removing an existing 6' x 10' addition that extended to the rear lot line and creating 2 new windows at the new rear ground floor elevation where the addition formerly stood.

WHEREAS at the rear, at the new 3rd floor buildout, as well as at the new 4th floor, there will be new windows, French doors and terraces.

WHEREAS at the rear, the applicant proposes the mimic the arched tops of the existing windows for the new wooden windows and to reincorporate the sawtooth brick corbelling at the top of the 3rd and 2nd floors at the new masonry walltops.

WHEREAS at the 4th floor, the applicant proposes a light stucco finish that would present a "fading away" quality to the addition.

WHEREAS the stucco finish at the new 4th floor and at the bulkhead present as inexpensive; the stucco finish does not fit in with the character of the rest of the house which is brick.

WHEREAS the 3rd floor buildout, the addition of the 4th floor and the bulkhead add too much bulk to existing carriage house and are not contextual both for an individual landmark of this stature and within the historic district and would alter the historic character of the entire block.

PART A.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application – the buildout at the 3rd floor, the addition of a 4th floor and the rooftop bulkhead -- is disapproved as presented

PART B – The restoration of the existing carriage house based on the existing conditions report by Li Saltzman Architects.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part B of this application – the restoration of the existing carriage house and the continuing maintenance program going forward is approved as presented.

PART C - That the requirements for the Section 74-711 Special Permit have been met.

This recommendation was adopted by a vote of 37 in favor, 1 opposed, 1 abstention, and 1 not voting for cause.

Sincerely,

James G. Clynes

Chairman

David Helpern and Jane Parshall

racial Helpern + Jane Probable

Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc:

Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 26th Senatorial District

Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District

Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District

Honorable Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District