Nicholas Viest Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

December 31, 2012

Hon. Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 119 East 78th Street (between Park and Lexington Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District

Dear Chair Tierney:

At the Land Use/Full Board meeting on Wednesday, November 14, 2012, the board adopted the following resolution regarding 119 East 78th Street (between Park and Lexington Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District - *Anik Pearson, Architect* – A Italianate style residence built in 1871 and altered by Harvey Stevenson & Eastman Studds, to reflect a neo-Classical (vernacular) style, in 1936. Application to modify the front fence, service entry and sidewalk.

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: Part A – The removal of an existing security grill at the property line at the front elevation to the east of the front door, the replacement of the existing service door with a new double door, new grillwork to provide security for the windows on the new double service door and for an existing window and a new security gate to be installed across the service entrance only. Part B - The enlargement of the entry way and the creation of a garden that would encroach into the sidewalk (and require a revocable consent from the Department of Transportation)

PART A- Part A - The removal of an existing security grill at the property line at the front elevation to the east of the front door, the replacement of the existing service door with a new double door, new grillwork to provide security for the windows on the new double service door and for an existing window and a new security gate to be installed across the service entrance only.

WHEREAS 119 East 78th Street is an Italianate style residence constructed in 1871 and altered by Harvey Stevenson & Eastman Studds, to reflect a neo-Classical (vernacular) style, in 1936. WHEREAS the applicant proposes to eliminate the security grill which sits 4" from the front elevation, with new operable bronze grills on the existing window at the ground elevation as well as at the windows on the proposed new double door (a total of three new window grills) and a metal gate at the service entrance.

WHEREAS the proposed removal of the security grill, the changes to the service door, and the new grillwork and the new gate are appropriate within the historic district.

WHEREAS the proposed changes at the ground level of the front elevation present as a less forbidding solution for security and are more contextual within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application is approved as presented.

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 33 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

Part B - The enlargement of the entry way and the creation of a garden that would encroach into the sidewalk (and require a revocable consent from the Department of Transportation)

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to create a garden in front of 119 East 78th St. that would extend onto the existing sidewalk and across the 15' width of the property.

WHEREAS the proposed new garden/entry way would be surrounded by a 48" high wrought iron fence with a gate; the garden area would have a surface of bluestone pavers and would incorporate narrow planting beds within the fenced-in area including in-ground planters with concrete curbs and a tree.

WHEREAS the proposed extension into the sidewalk would require a "revocable consent" from the Department of Transportation.

WHEREAS the house sits at the property line; the entire new garden would be outside the property line.

WHEREAS 4'7" is the current standard for clearance for pedestrian traffic on sidewalks; the proposed new garden would encroach on the public way at a buildout of 6'4".

WHEREAS there is also an existing street tree that the proposed new garden would encroach upon since the proposed new garden would extend to the first joint line of the sidewalk.

WHEREAS the proposed new garden is out of context and is inappropriate within the historic district, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 24 in favor, 7 opposed, 5 abstentions, and 1 not voting for cause.

Sincerely,

Nicholas Viest Chair David Helpern and David Liston Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Hon. Michael Bloomberg, Mayor of the City of New York

Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Manhattan Borough President

Hon. Liz Krueger, NYS Senate Member

Hon. Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member

Hon. Micah Kellner, NYS Assembly Member

Hon. Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member

Hon. Jessica Lappin, NYC Council Member