James G. Clynes Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

October 22, 2015

Hon. Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 1143 Fifth Avenue (between 95th and 96th Streets)-Carnegie Hill Historic District

Dear Chair Srinivasan:

At the Full Board meeting on Wednesday, October 21, 2015, the board adopted the following resolution regarding 1143 Fifth Avenue (between 95th and 96th Streets)-Carnegie Hill Historic District-Judith Saltzman, architect. Application for a rooftop addition.

WHEREAS 1143 Fifth Avenue is a seven story mid-block building that was designed when the zoning resolution limited the height to 75 feet;

WHEREAS the 75 foot height restriction was eliminated in favor of the prior 150 foot height;

WHEREAS the building does not appear to have been designed for a vertical addition;

WHEREAS the proposed addition was designed to make a clear distinction between the existing structure and the vertical expansion on the front façade but be complementary at the same time;

WHEREAS the existing building has a two story limestone base with a brick facade above;

WHEREAS the existing windows on the front façade are six over six double hung;

WHEREAS the existing cornice would be retained;

WHEREAS the proposed six story vertical expansion has a brick façade with casement windows with transoms above:

WHEREAS the current canvas canopy that hides the entablature above the entrance would be replaced with a metal and glass canopy that reveals the architectural detail;

WHEREAS the garden, formerly at the base of the building, would be recreated to match the depth of the gardens at 1148 and 1140;

WHEREAS the top of the cornice at 1143 would have been 140'-3", lower in height than the top of the cornice of 1148 of 155'-4' and the top of the cornice of 1140 of 158'-7";

WHEREAS the top floor of 1143 would be clad in zinc and sloped away from the façade so that the return of the cornice on 1148 continues to be visible;

WHEREAS the fire escape in the rear of the building would be eliminated and replaced with a fire stair within the building;

WHEREAS the cladding material at the rear of the building would be a rain screen of terracotta or porcelain panels;

WHEREAS balconies would be provided on the rear of the building;

WHEREAS windows would be punched in openings with either double hung or casements;

WHEREAS the color of the rain screen would have matched the existing brick, the windows would have been charcoal, the zinc of a dark hue, and all other metal burnished bronze;

WHEREAS this vertical addition is not appropriate and contextual in the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 29 in favor, 14 opposed, 2 abstentions, and 0 not voting for cause.

Sincerely,

James G. Clynes Chairman

James D. Clipnes

David Helpen - Jane Pershall David Helpern and Jane Parshall Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York cc:

Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 26th Senatorial District

Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73rd Assembly District

Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5th Council District Honorable Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District