

Nicholas Viest
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8

Landmarks Committee – Monday, November 18, 2013 – 6:30PM
Marymount Manhattan College, 221 East 71st Street, 2nd Fl., Regina Peruggi Room

Present: Jane Parshall, Elizabeth Ashby, Marco Tamayo, Susan Evans, Michele Birnbaum, David Liston, Christina Davis

Absent Excused: David Helpern, Teri Slater

1. **12 East 82nd Street - Metropolitan Museum Historic District** – *Robert Marx, Roger Ferris + Partners LLC, Architect* - A neo-Georgian style row house built in 1888-89 and altered in 1920 by Bradley Delehanty. Application is for restoration and cleaning, replacement of studio window glazing, and alterations to rear façade including removal of rear extensions and new construction.

THIS APPLICATION IS DIVIDED INTO TWO PARTS: PART A – The Front Elevation and PART B – The Rear Elevation

PART A – The Front Elevation

WHEREAS 12 East 82nd Street is a neo-Georgian style row house built in 1888-89 and altered in 1920 by Bradley Delehanty.

WHEREAS 12 East 82nd Street was originally one of a row of 6 houses; as part of a 1920s alteration, the stoop was removed, the house was extended to the property line and 2 extensions into the rear yard were added.

WHEREAS in 1945, in a significant alteration, the existing mansard roof was converted from standing seam metal to glass which presents as a glass studio window.

WHEREAS in 2007, the Landmarks Preservation Commission granted a C of A for work to be done at the property – this included permission to demolish and rebuild the extensions at the rear. This work was not completed – as a result the back of the house where the extensions were removed is now open (see Part B).

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to restore the entire front elevation, including the in-kind studio window.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to eliminate the projecting operable windows (“pop-outs”) and install flush windows in the glass studio window.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove the non-historic security grilles at the 2nd floor and the non-historic light fixtures at the ground level.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing windows with new painted wood double hung windows, repaint the wood doors at the ground level, and install a clear glass guardrail at the rooftop which will be set back 4’.

WHEREAS at the roof, a stair bulkhead, an elevator bulkhead and mechanical equipment will be added, increasing the overall height of the house by 6’4” and set back 17 ½’ from the cornice and encased within a wood acoustical enclosure.

WHEREAS the proposed work at the front elevation is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part A of this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

PART B – The Rear Elevation

WHEREAS the 2007 Certificate of Appropriateness permitted the removal of the 1920s extensions in the rear – now part of the existing condition; there is now a new owner of the property.

WHEREAS at the rear, as a result of the demolition work approved under the C of A, the townhouse is now open and the rear yard is excavated to the cellar level.

WHEREAS the proposed new rear extension stays within the envelope of the historic volume, although with reduced massing which will allow for a larger rear yard; the incursion into the rear yard will be 10' less than the demolished extension and the rear yard will be increased to 440 square feet creating a rear yard approx. 21' deep.

WHEREAS the design of the new rear elevation is contemporary and is 2' lower than the height of the original extension and will consist mostly of glazing.

WHEREAS the glazing will be framed by gray zinc with brick on the returns

WHEREAS there will be 3 balconies at the 2nd, 3rd and 4th floors and glass handrails at the balconies and at the roof.

WHEREAS the new rear elevation is “frankly” modern with an excessive use of glazing.

WHEREAS there is no relationship between the lovely restrained neo-Georgian front elevation and the new rear elevation.

WHEREAS the new glass elevation is completely out of context within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part B of this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 5 in favor (Ashby, Evans, Liston, Birnbaum, Tamayo), 2 against (Davis, Parshall)

2. **19 East 79th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Metropolitan Museum Historic District** – *Matthew Haberling, Architect* – A neo-Grec style townhouse built in 1880 and designed by D. & J. Jardine, with alterations by Herts & Tallant completed in 1902. Application is to reconstruct existing rooftop sunroom.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to reconstruct an existing rooftop sunroom which has fallen into a state of disrepair.

WHEREAS the proposed reconstruction will result in a rooftop sunroom that will copy the profile and dimensions of the existing sunroom and will be only minimally visible from the public way.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

3. **1127 Third Avenue (between 65th and 66th Streets) [Manhattan House] – Individual Landmark** - *Burnham New York, Inc.* - A modern style mixed-use complex designed by Mayer & Whittlesey and Skidmore, Owning, and Merrill, and built between 1947 and 1951. Application is to alter signage to allow more than 1 ft. of signage and black banner behind signage at Lululemon Store.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to expand the existing storefront signage by one foot and to install a black banner backdrop to said signage.

WHEREAS the applicant’s presentation to the Committee failed to comply with presentation guidelines in several respects, including the failure to include presentation boards and sample materials, with the result that the Committee did not have sufficient information with which to conclude that the proposed changes to this individual landmark would be appropriate.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, David, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

4. **973 Fifth Avenue (between 78th and 79th Streets) – Metropolitan Museum Historic District – Azar Associates, Beach Associates, CD Gardens, Inc.** – A neo-Italian Renaissance style mansion designed by McKim, Mead & White and built in 1902-5. Application is to alter the rooftop bulkhead, railings, and HVAC equipment.

WHEREAS 973 Fifth Avenue was designed by McKim, Mead & White in the neo-Italian Renaissance manner and constructed between 1902 and 1905 who were also the architects of the adjacent Payne Whitney House at 972 5th Avenue (now owned by the French government).

WHEREAS 973 Fifth Avenue is 6 stories high and only 25' wide; the narrow width is not readily apparent because of the unity of the façade with its neighbor, the Payne-Whitney house.

WHEREAS at the roof the applicant proposes to create a garden composed of a series of outdoor rooms that will process from the west elevation facing 5th Avenue to the east elevation; since the roof is pitched, there will be a series of steps at various intervals to accommodate the change in grade as one moves from west to east within the garden.

WHEREAS the inspiration for the proposed garden was a reinterpretation of a Beaux Arts classical garden which keeps the relationship to the McKim, Mead and White design; the garden will require minimum maintenance and will incorporate an irrigation system.

WHEREAS the garden will be set back 30' from the 5th Avenue elevation.

WHEREAS the unusual construction of the roof (which measures 25' wide by 100' deep) with a depth of 27" allows for and supports the weight of the garden; all trees will be in planters.

WHEREAS as part of the design for the rooftop garden the applicant proposes to remove the non-historic 1966 bulkhead for the existing elevator.

WHEREAS the original stair bulkhead will be slightly modified and lowered to 14'1" and a new accessory stair bulkhead will be constructed that will be 10'8" high.

WHEREAS the new accessory stair bulkhead will present as a garden folly with a clear tempered glass roof ("glass cupola") with applied lattice work at the base and the below roof, with glazing surrounded by stucco on the west, south, east and north elevations (the east elevation will be stucco). The glazing on the north and south elevations will present as a Palladian window.

WHEREAS at the existing modified bulkhead, decorative treillage will be integrated into the south elevation that will mimic the design of the new stair bulkhead.

WHEREAS there will be a 42" high metal and cable railing surface mounted to the inside of the parapet.

WHEREAS the bulkhead with the glass cupola and the existing modified bulkhead clad in treillage are set approximately 2/3rds back from 5th Avenue on the roof.

WHEREAS the new accessory stair bulkhead will be minimally visible from the public way.

WHEREAS proposed changes to alter the rooftop bulkheads are contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

WHEREAS the design for the stair bulkhead with its glass cupola and Palladian-style window on the south and north elevations as it is incorporated into a modern interpretation of a Beaux Arts garden echoes the extraordinary quality of the McKim, Mead and White house on which it will sit and adds substantially to the roofscape within the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

5. **48 East 73rd Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District – Ronnette Riley Architect** – A brick building designed, with a neo-Grec style, by Richard W. Buckley in 1885-86 and altered by S. Edson Gage, with a neo-Federal style, in 1916. Application is to restore the street façade and reconstruct the rear façade, roof, and interiors.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to restore the front façade and reconstruct the rear façade and roof.

WHEREAS with regard to the front façade and the roof, the applicant proposes to remove two existing rooftop additions and replace them with a staircase bulkhead, an HVAC system camouflaged with wood screen, a roof garden which will be recessed from the front of the building, and a reconstructed balustrade made of limestone; and to restore solid wood double hung windows on the first, second, and third floors of the front facade, to their original design.

WHEREAS with regard to the rear façade, the applicant proposes to remove non-conforming additions and install a ground level garden and terrace and first and second floor extensions reaching to the current height of the building, using space created by the removal of the above-mentioned additions, with the new rear façade to include aluminum hinged shutters, steel frame tilt-turn windows, and a folding and lifting shutter element, to be aligned with the party wall, and comprised of 1” perforated and edged sheet aluminum.

WHEREAS the Committee wishes to separately consider the proposed changes to the front façade and roof and the proposed changes to the rear façade.

PART A – The front façade and roof

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the front façade are contextual within the historic district and, in that regard, an improvement on the existing conditions.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED the Committee approves the application as relates to the proposed changes to front façade and roof.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo) 1 against (Ashby)

PART B – The rear façade

WHEREAS the materials and design for the proposed changes to the rear façade are out of context with the character of the building and the historic district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED the Committee disapproves the application as relates to the proposed changes to the rear façade.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs