James G. Clynes Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

## The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

July 22, 2015

Hon. Meenakshi Srinivasan, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 11 East 89th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues)-Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District

Dear Chair Srinivasan:

At the Full Board meeting on Wednesday, July 15, 2015, the committee adopted the following resolution regarding 11 East 89th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues)-Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District-Mary Burnham, Architect-Application is for building renovation.

## This Application is divided in two parts:

## Part 1: Front, Rear, and Side Facades

WHEREAS 11 East 89<sup>th</sup> Street was formerly the Trevor Day School for the lower grades and is being renovated to become an educational building for Park Avenue Synagogue;

WHEREAS the south, front façade will be repaired, its two balconies and railings will remain, and its aluminum windows replaced with wood casement windows on second and third floors to resemble the circa 1912 windows and replaced with wood casement windows on the fourth and fifth floors to continue the look and feel of the windows below;

WHEREAS the existing cast iron gates will be combined with ballistic glass to create a new interior vestibule with the look and feel of the current exterior stone vestibule;

WHEREAS the lot line windows on the east, north, and west will be replaced with fire rated windows and the stucco finish on east elevation repaired;

WHEREAS the facades are contextual and appropriate within the historic district;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part 1 of this Application is approved as presented.

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 40 in favor, 2 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

## Part 2: Roof

WHEREAS there is a main upper roof and a lower roof in the rear;

WHEREAS the existing stair bulkhead and mechanical equipment will be removed from the main roof and the chain link fence which encloses portions of the main roof and lower, rear roof will be removed;

WHEREAS the roofs will be reorganized with a terrace and planters at the front of the main roof to be used as the primary outdoor area for school age children, a new elevator bulkhead for a new elevator to enable access to the main roof will be located at about the center of the building toward the rear of the main roof, a new skylight will be located behind the elevator bulkhead at the rearmost portion of the main roof, an emergency generator will be located in an acoustic enclosure just south of the elevator at the western edge of the main roof, and a seating area with planters will be located on the lower rear roof;

WHEREAS there will be a 10 foot high "vanishing metal coil fence" at the front of the main roof and a 6 foot high "vanishing metal coil fence" at the lower rear roof;

WHEREAS the new elevator bulkhead will be about 11 feet higher than the existing stair bulkhead;

WHEREAS the new fence can be seen from the east and the west, and the bulkheads and generator cannot be seen from the east due to an apartment building to the east but can be seen from the west due to a lower building to the west;

WHEREAS the new bulkheads are larger and/or taller than the current bulkhead;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Part 2 of this application is disapproved and FURTHER RESOLVED that the Landmarks Preservation Commission delay action on this application until the applicant has had a thorough discussion of its plans with its immediate neighbors

This recommendation was approved by a vote of 36 in favor, 3 opposed, 1 abstention, and 0 not voting for cause.

Sincerely,

Chairman

David Helpem & Jam Parshall Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

Honorable Bill de Blasio, Mayor of the City of New York cc:

Honorable Gale Brewer, Manhattan Borough President

Honorable Liz Krueger, NYS Senator, 26th Senatorial District

Honorable Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member, 73<sup>rd</sup> Assembly District Honorable Ben Kallos, NYC Council Member, 5<sup>th</sup> Council District

Honorable Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member, 4th Council District