Nicholas Viest Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) info@cb8m.com - E-Mail www.cb8m.com - Website

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

April 22, 2013

Hon. Robert B. Tierney, Chair NYC Landmarks Preservation Commission Municipal Building One Centre Street, 9th Floor New York, NY 10007

Re: 11-15 East 70th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District

Dear Chair Tierney:

At the Full Board meeting on Wednesday, April 17, 2013, the board adopted the following resolution regarding 11-15 East 70th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District – *Andre Tchelistcheff, Architect.* Application is to amend Certificate of Appropriateness for a Master Plan for the installation of new window openings.

WHEREAS 11-15 East 70th Street is a neo-French "classic" style residence, designed by John Duncan and built in 1909-1910 and a Beaux-Arts style residence, designed by Charles I. Berg and built in 1909-1910

WHEREAS 11-15 East 70th Street is adjacent to the garden of the Frick Museum.

WHEREAS at the October meeting of the full board of Community Board 8, an application to add 4 windows on the lot line on the west elevation at the 3rd floor was disapproved by a nearly unanimous vote (38 in favor, 1 opposed, 0 abstentions); however, the Landmarks Preservation Commission subsequently approved the application.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to amend the original Certificate of Appropriateness for the 3rd floor windows so that now there will be windows at the 4th, 5th and 6th floors. The 4 openings at the 4th floor will match the openings at the 3rd floor; the 4 openings at the 5th floor and the 2 openings at the 6th floor will be narrower and less tall because of existing chimney breasts between the windows on the upper floor.

WHEREAS all of the proposed new windows overlook the Frick Collection garden; however, whereas formerly 4 new openings were proposed, now 14 <u>new</u> windows are proposed.

WHEREAS the 14 proposed windows do not appear incidental within the wall and compete with the monumental arches in the Frick Garden wall below that are now well served by the blank wall above. **WHEREAS** at the time of the original application last fall, there was concern that approval of the 4 proposed openings would lead to a proliferation of windows on the west elevation.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

This recommendation failed by a vote of 14 in favor, 14 opposed, and 2 abstentions.

A substitute motion to **approve** this application was presented before the Full Board. This substitute recommendation passed with a vote of 15 in favor, 11 opposed, and 3 abstentions.

Sincerely,

Nicholas Viest Chair David Helpern and David Liston Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee

cc: Hon. Michael Bloomberg, Mayor of the City of New York

Hon. Scott M. Stringer, Manhattan Borough President

Hon. Liz Krueger, NYS Senate Member Hon. Dan Quart, NYS Assembly Member Hon. Micah Kellner, NYS Assembly Member Hon. Daniel Garodnick, NYC Council Member Hon. Jessica Lappin, NYC Council Member