Nicholas Viest Chairman

Latha ThompsonDistrict Manager



505 Park Avenue Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8

<u>Landmarks Committee, October 15, 2012 – 6:30PM</u> Lenox Hill Hospital, 131 East 76th Street, Einhorn Auditorium

Present: Jane Parshall, Teri Slater, Elizabeth Ashby, Marco Tamayo, David Helpern, David Liston, Christina Davis, Kenneth Austin, Susan Evans

Excused: Michele Birnbaum Kenneth Austin, Susan Evans

1. **21 East 70th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District –** *Adam Yarinsky, Architect and Robert Bates, Architect* – A Neo-French Classic style residence designed by William J. Rogers and built in 1918-19. Application is to replace windows, conduct restorations, and alter the rooftop and exterior façade.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace windows on the east and north facades, construct various restorations and alterations to the south facade, and alter the rooftop.

WHEREAS the Committee wishes to consider this application in three parts: 1) the south facade, which faces the street, from the second floor up; the east facade; and the rooftop; 2) the north façade which faces the rear yard; and 3) the south facade at the ground floor.

1) The South Facade from the Second Floor Up, the East Facade, and the Roof:

WHEREAS the proposed restoration to the south facade from the second floor up would restore the south facade from the second floor up to its original colors and ornamental details, installing new bronze rails on the existing upper floor balconies, and a new marble veneer to the bottom of the existing balconies to match the existing marble veneer.

WHEREAS the proposed alteration to the roof would result in the movement of mechanicals from the south side of the roof to the north side of the roof where they would not be visible from the public way.

WHEREAS the proposed window replacement on the east facade would involve replacing existing lot windows with windows of a different scale but of the same size, with new windows to be taller and more narrow than the existing windows.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT the Committee approves the proposed changes to the south facade from the second floor up, the east facade, and the roof as they would not be inconsistent with the character and design of the building.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

2) The North Facade:

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the north facade would involve replacing the existing windows with fixed and sliding floor-to-ceiling windows with spandrel panels finished to match the frames and new stucco over existing masonry wall.

WHEREAS said changes would not be inconsistent with the character and design of the building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT the Committee approves the proposed changes to the north facade.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater) 1 in opposition (Tamayo)

3) The South Facade at the Ground Floor:

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing two front doors with new bronze doors with decorative bronze grille, install a new granite base on the far sides of said doors, and install a new marble panel in between said doors.

WHEREAS said changes to the south facade at the ground floor would involve materials too dark in color, too contemporary in style, and a design totally unrelated to, and at odds with, the character and design of the building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT the Committee disapproves the proposed changes to the south facade at the ground floor.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Evans, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo) 1 in opposition (Helpern)

2. **11-15 East 70th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District** – *Andre Tchelistcheff Architects* – A Neo-French Classic style residence designed by John Duncan and built in 1909-10. Application to add windows to the 3rd Floor.

WHEREAS the proposed lot line windows for the third floor overlook the Frick Collection Garden, **WHEREAS** there are windows that overlook the Garden on the northern end of 11 East 70th Street, **WHEREAS** the proposed windows match the double hung windows on the front of 11 East 70th Street.

WHEREAS the four proposed windows are arranged in pairs because of the two fireplaces on the western wall of 11 East 70th Street.

WHEREAS the four windows are relatively small, and whereas the four windows appear incidental within the wall and do not compete with the monumental arches in the Frick Garden wall below, **THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT** this application is approved.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Tamayo) 3 in opposition (Evans, Parshall, Slater)

3. **800 Fifth Avenue (between 61st and 62nd Streets) - Upper East Side Historic District -** *John P. Williams, Architect* – A Post Modern style residence designed by Ulrich Franzen & Associates and built in 1977-78. Application to alter garden rooftop and plaza.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to remove the current garden rooftop and plaza which includes a decorative water pool in order to make repairs to the parking garage beneath same.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace said garden rooftop and plaza with a new garden rooftop and plaza which would have more shade trees and ornamental plantings, and a larger water pool, then are presently there, and which would be configured such that there would less exposed pavement than is presently there in the current configuration.

WHEREAS the applicant would replace the existing planters along the 61st Street side of the current garden rooftop and plaza with new planters and new plantings, substantially similar in size and design to those presently there.

WHEREAS the above changes would not significantly change the view of the garden rooftop and plaza from what is currently visible from the public way.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT this application is approved.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo) 1 in opposition (Helpern)

4. **11-13 East 67th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District** - *Peter Pennoyer, Architect* – 11 East 67th Street is a neo-French Classic style townhouse designed by Thom & Wilson and built in 1881-82. 13 East 67th Street is an English neo-Classical style townhouse designed by Harry Allan Jacobs and built in 1920-21. Application to combine two townhouses into one residence and restore the façades, alter areaway and rooftop, and replace bricks and windows.

WHEREAS the two townhouses are to be combined into a single family residence, whereas the two front facades are to be restored with minimal changes and with each house maintaining its original architectural identity,

WHEREAS the original grill work will be replicated at the ground floor of 11 West 67th Street including a grill over the former service door and a fence around a new areaway,

WHEREAS the windows on the sixth floor of 11 West 67th Street will be brought back to the original design,

WHEREAS other windows will be replaced in kind but with insulated glass, whereas the missing roof top railing on 13 East 67th Street will be replaced,

WHEREAS a new bulkhead will be added to 13 East 67th Street that will not be visible from the Street, whereas the bulk of the rear portion of the house will be reduced,

WHEREAS the exposed metal stair at the rear will be removed,

WHEREAS the rear facades of the two houses will be combined into a new design that is traditional in its architectural character and that repeats some of the motifs from the front facades such as the arched windows,

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT this application is approved.

VOTE: 9 in favor (Ashby, Austin, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

5. **38-40 East 75th Street (Madison/Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District -** *Mr. Walter Marin, Architect* – 38 East 75th Street is a neo-Grec style residence built in 1881-82 by Thom & Wilson and altered by John W. Ingle in 1926. 40 East 75th Street is a noe-Grec with Beaux-Arts addition style residence designed by Thom & Wilson and built in 1881-82. Application to combine the two buildings into one residence, alter the façade and rooftop, and install windows.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to combine two townhouse buildings, 38 East 75th Street and 40 East 75th Street, into one residence, altering the facade and rooftop, and installing uniform windows and railings.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes, as part of the above-mentioned combination, to 1) install a new matching bay window on the 38 East 75th townhouse with the same style and details as are present on the 40 East 75th Street townhouse; 2) install the same townhouse facade and architectural details on the 38 East 75th townhouse as are present on the 40 East 75th Street townhouse, but replace the existing brownstone facade and install a new metal dormer roof on the top of the 38 East 75th Street townhouse with the same finish and details as the dormer roof on the 40 East 75th Street townhouse; 3) build an open garden porch on top of the existing roof of the 38 East 75th Street townhouse; 4) install brownstone wall panels and cornices on the front facade of both townhouses; and 5) install a wrought iron railing and fence on the 38 eat 75th Street townhouse to match the existing railing style at the 40 East 75th Street townhouse.

WHEREAS the above changes would be inconsistent with the architecturally significant scale of the individual rowhouses and would eliminate the individual character of the two buildings which are each distinctly separate, individually identifiable, and historically significant rowhouses.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOVLED THAT this application is disapproved.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Austin, Ashby, David, Helpern, Liston, Slater, Tamayo, Parshall) 1 opposition (Evans)

David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs