

Nicholas Viest
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8

Landmarks Committee, Monday, September 16, 2013 – 6:30PM
Lighthouse International, 111 East 59th Street, 6th Floor, Studio Ballroom

Present: Jane Parshall, David Liston, Teri Slater, Marco Tamayo, Susan Evans, Michele Birnbaum, David Helpern

Absent Excused: Elizabeth Ashby, Christina Davis

1. **785 Fifth Avenue (at 60th Street) – Upper East Side Historic District** – *Diller Scofidio+Renfro, Architects* – An apartment building designed by Richard Roth of Emery Roth & Sons in 1962-63. Application is to renovate the penthouse.

WHEREAS, 785 Fifth Avenue is an apartment building designed by Richard Roth of Emery Roth & Sons in 1962-63.

WHEREAS, 785 Fifth Avenue is a non-contributing building within the historic district, it presents some “modernist” architectural elements.

WHEREAS, the applicant is proposing (1) a rooftop addition (2) new glass guardrails (3) changes to the glazing at the 19th floor

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to change the guardrails at the 9th, 16th, 18th and 19th floors and adding a glass balustrade at the roof. [Although the application is for changes to the penthouse at the 18th and 19th floors, the applicant, to retain unity for the terrace guardrails, is changing all the existing guardrails, not just the guardrails for the penthouse terraces.]

WHEREAS, the guardrails were originally framed glass guard rails; the applicant proposes to replace them with cantilevered structural glass guardrails.

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes to replace the 19th floor glazing from punched to stripped (glass curtain wall) windows.

WHEREAS, also at the 19th floor, on the south elevation, the applicant proposes to replace three existing windows with two windows, the larger of which will present as a bay window.

WHEREAS, the applicant proposes an addition at the roof – a bulkhead made of a light teak wood that will weather to gray. The new bulkhead will present as a modernist asymmetrical canopy 44’ wide x 23’ deep, with a height off the parapet of 10’. The enclosed portion of the bulkhead measures 32’ x 9’3”.

WHEREAS, the applicant suggests that this “modernist asymmetrical canopy” will add an assertiveness and a little bit of detail to the top of the building.

WHEREAS, the rooftop addition will change the overall height of the building from 192’9” to 202’3”]; however, the addition will sit underneath the existing bulkhead for the building mechanicals.

WHEREAS, the applicant suggests that the existing setbacks at the penthouse level “dematerialize” the building; the 19th floor and rooftop addition fade away into the sky. Thus, the proposed changes to the windows and especially at the rooftop are minimally visible from the public way.

WHEREAS, the application is sympathetic to the architecture of the building and not out-of-context within the historic district, given that the 785 Fifth Avenue is a non-contributing building within the district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 4 in favor (Evans, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo); 1 against (Birnbaum)

2. **125 East 73rd Street (between Park and Lexington Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District** - *Janko Rasic Architect* - A neo-Federal style dwelling designed by Charles Brendon and constructed in 1909-1910. Application is to replace windows.

WHEREAS, this application is to replace the front windows located on the second, third, and fourth floors.

WHEREAS, photographs taken in or around 1910 indicate that the original windows on the second floor were casement windows which were later replaced with double hung windows, matching those on the third and fourth floors.

WHEREAS, the applicant has considered restoring the windows to their original casement windows but, as this is this is a diplomatic residence, bullet resistant glass is required and, according to the applicant, such glass would not work well with the original casement configuration due the thickness of the glass and the manner in which light interacts with such glass, resulting in the windows on the second floor appearing dissimilar in appearance from those on the third and fourth floors.

WHEREAS, the proposed double hung windows are consistent with what is currently at the location and not inconsistent with the design and character of the building.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, the application is approved.

VOTE: Yes (Birnbaum, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

3. **2 East 91st Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District** – *Sharon C. Park, Architect* – A Neo-Georgian with Beaux-Arts elements style mansion designed by Babb, Cook & Willard and built in 1899-1903. Application is to alter the 90th street garden entrance, awning and corner piers lighting.

WHEREAS, 2 East 91st Street is a Neo-Georgian with Beaux-Arts elements style mansion designed by Babb, Cook & Willard and built in 1899-1903.

WHEREAS, the applicant wishes to alter the 90th Street garden entrance awning and corner piers lighting.

WHEREAS, with regard to the 90th Street garden entrance, the applicant proposes to refurbish the fence and gate and install a new, painted steel awning which would extend, at its longest point, 5' out over the sidewalk and at its shortest point, 4' feet over the sidewalk, and would be 8' above the sidewalk.

WHEREAS, with regard to the existing Fifth Avenue granite piers, the applicant proposes to insert LED dimmable white low-glow lighting strips within the stone reveals, with said insertion to be flush with the exterior face of the piers, and reversible with no mechanical fastening into the existing structure.

WHEREAS, numerous members of the community present at the meeting voiced concerns about a lack of sufficient time to study the proposed changes to so significant a landmark and concerns regarding the impact of the proposed changes to the property at issue.

WHEREAS, the Landmarks Committee felt that the presentation did not provide sufficient details, for example the applicant did not provide a panoramic picture of the streetscape as it would appear with the proposed changes, and the applicant did not provide firm or specific details as to the size or color of the lettering that the applicant proposes to include at the front of the proposed awning.

WHEREAS, the proposed changes as presented would be inconsistent with the historic character and design of this unique architectural gem of the Expanded Carnegie Hill Historic District.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, this application is **DENIED**.

VOTE: Yes: Birnbaum, Evans, Helporn, Liston, Parshall, Slater. 1 abstention (Tamayo)

4. **42 East 76th Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District –** *Robert A.M. Stern Architects & Bill Higgins, Preservation Consultant* – A Queen Anne style residence designed by John G. Prague and built in 1881-82. Application is to alter the front areaway, reconfigure the rear elevation, and add a rear-yard extension and rooftop addition.

This Resolution has two parts. Part A includes the front façade and the roof top addition. Part B includes the rear façade and rear yard extensions

Part A – Front Façade and the Rooftop Addition

WHEREAS, the original façade design remains from the second floor up;

WHEREAS, first floor façade will be restored to be similar to the original façade except for the stoop;

WHEREAS, the existing areaway planter will be restored;

WHEREAS, a new railing similar in design to the railing at the second floor will be added to the wall of the planter abutting the sidewalk;

WHEREAS, the rooftop addition which is partly classroom and partly mechanical bulkhead, will be set back 19'-10" and will rise about 17' above the top of the parapet; and

WHEREAS, the rooftop addition is not visible from the street except very minimally at three locations;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, Part A is approved.

VOTE: Yes (Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

Part B – Rear façade and rear yard extensions

WHEREAS, the windows have too much glazing; and

WHEREAS, the windows are too institutional in appearance;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, Part B is disapproved

VOTE: Yes (Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, and Slater) 1 abstention (Tamayo)

5. **48 East 64th Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District -** *Peter Pelsinski, Partner* – A neo-Grec style residence designed by John G. Prague and built in 1883-84. Application is to alter the front and rear façades, replace windows, and extend the rooftop and second floor.

WHEREAS, the original façade design remains from the second floor up;

WHEREAS, the existing metal stoop will be removed and replaced with a new stone stoop replicating the stoop next door;

WHEREAS, the existing entrance door on the first floor will be replaced with a new entrance door and door surround replicating the door and surround next door;

WHEREAS, the basement window facing the areaway will be replaced with a new wood window;

WHEREAS, the non-original skylight on the first floor roof of the rear extension will be removed and the roof converted into a deck;

WHEREAS, the wood windows on the upper floors of the rear facade will remain or be replaced; and

WHEREAS, the windows on the basement, first, and second floors will be replaced with new steel and glass fenestration;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT, this application is approved.

VOTE: Yes (Birnbaum, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, and Tamayo)

6. **Discussion: 350 East 88th Street (between First and Second Avenues) [Rhineland Children's Center]** – Discussion regarding possible proposal to designate the Rhineland Children's Center a landmarked building.

Sarah Chu had prepared information about the building and advised that the building was being submitted to the Landmarks Preservation Commission for evaluation. The building will be brought back to the committee once it becomes an official candidate for land marking.

7. **New Business – Park Avenue Christian Church, 1010 Park Avenue (between 84th and 85th Streets)** - Discussion regarding proposal to designate the church a landmarked building.

WHEREAS, the Park Avenue Christian Church began as a group of nine members of the Ebenezer Baptist Church which branched off to form the Disciples of Christ in 1810 which makes it the oldest of Disciples of Christ Churches in America,

WHEREAS, the congregation established itself as a permanent fixture on the Upper East Side of Manhattan in a building designed by Ralph Adams Cram, Bertram Goodhue and Frank Ferguson, which created a Church in the gothic revival style, and

WHEREAS, the Church, inspired by Sainte Chapel in Paris, laid its cornerstone in 1909, and

WHEREAS, the Church and Rectory are built of stone salvaged from the construction of Central Park, and

WHEREAS, the church houses beautiful stained glass windows, including one designed by Tiffany, and

WHEREAS, it is necessary to preserve the Church and Rectory light and air so as to permit the southern light to enliven the Tiffany glass window and others which bathe the Church in light, and

WHEREAS, the sunlight currently bounces off the roof in a playful and beautiful way, and

WHEREAS, viewing the Church complex in the context of the current space, light and sky, are important backdrops for the complete preservation and enjoyment of the Church, Rectory and Parish House, and

WHEREAS, the materials and style unite these components, and

WHEREAS, the Church contains classic components, the nave with its peaked roof, 4 tall arched windows, a second lower peaked roof, a total of 17 tall windows and a tall window above the entrance, two massive front columns with distinct detail, gargoyles and figurines, and

WHEREAS, the Rectory, built at the same time and compatible with the Church in materials, style and trim having a peaked roof and projecting bay windows, complements the Church building, and

WHEREAS, the Parish House, built behind the Rectory in the 1960's is an integral, historic part of the complex allowing a diverse community access for important cultural educational and spiritual programs, and

WHEREAS, the façade of 1000 Park Avenue shares design elements with the Church and Rectory, making the entire block visually compatible,

THEREFORE, be it resolved that Community Board 8 strongly supports granting landmark status to the Park Avenue Christian site complex which includes the Church, the Rectory and the Parish House, and

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT, that Community Board 8 urges the Landmarks Commission to hear this application, grant landmark status to this unique building complex, at the earliest possible time.

VOTE: Yes unanimous (Birnbaum, Evans, Liston, Parshall, Slater and Tamayo); 1 NVFC (Helpern)

David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs