

Nicholas Viest
Chairman

Latha Thompson
District Manager



505 Park Avenue
Suite 620
New York, N.Y. 10022
(212) 758-4340
(212) 758-4616 (Fax)
www.cb8m.com - Website
info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York
Manhattan Community Board 8

Landmarks Committee, September 10, 2012 – 6:30PM
Lenox Hill Hospital, 131 East 76th Street, Einhorn Auditorium

Present: Jane Parshall, Teri Slater, Elizabeth Ashby, Marco Tamayo, Michele Birnbaum, David Helpern, David Liston, Christina Davis

Excused: Kenneth Austin, Susan Evans

1. **12 East 67th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District -**
An altered Regency Revival style townhouse built in 1879 and re-designed in 1920 by James Gamble Rogers, and altered in 1978. Application is to alter the façade and create an areaway.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to make various alterations to the front façade including 1) installing limestone columns, an entablature, and a black wrought iron railing across a row of three windows in the center of the third floor; 2) installing black wrought iron railings in front of the three windows on the second floor; 3) replacing the current exterior limestone base of the ground floor with a new rusticated limestone base so as to distinguish the base of the building from the upper floors; 4) replacing the ground floor center main door with a new wood door; 5) replacing the other ground floor door with an iron and glass door; and 6) creating a third door on the ground floor by replacing an existing window with an iron and glass door to match the above-mentioned proposed iron and glass door with the result that the ground floor will have a wooden center main door with identical iron and glass doors on either side.

WHEREAS the proposed changes constitute a restoration to the façade that is sensitive to the character of the building both in terms of proposed materials and proposed design.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the application is approved.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo)

2. **42 East 69th Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) [Jewish National Fund] - Upper East Side Historic District – Neil Weisbard, Counsel and Herb Mandel, Architect –** A neo-French Renaissance (Francois I) style residence designed by C.P.H. Gilbert and built in 1919-21. Application to alter the existing façade, replace windows, and demolition and reconstruction of Annex.

WHEREAS the Committee wishes to take this application in two parts: Part 1 (the Main Building) and Part 2 (the Annex).

Part 1 – the Main Building

WHEREAS the changes to the front façade are limited to removing the grills in front of the eastern window and the western egress door;

WHEREAS the eastern window will be replaced with a door that will enable access for the handicapped and will match the existing western door;

WHEREAS the enlargement of the cellar in the rear enables the construction of a terrace at the first floor;

WHEREAS the new doors to the terrace are within the existing window openings and are similar in character to the windows being replaced;

WHEREAS the enlargement of the fifth floor will align the face of the fifth floor with the rear façade of the first through fourth floors below;

WHEREAS the façade of the enlargement will be of brick to match the brick at the rear of the building and whose windows will be smaller but similar to the windows on the fourth floor;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the application is approved.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

Part 2 – the Annex

WHEREAS the screen wall in front of the Annex will incorporate one of the grills removed from the east and west doors of the front façade;

WHEREAS the front façade of the Annex, which is set back 15 feet from the property line, will be of translucent glass in a contemporary character to reflect that this structure is not part of the original building;

WHEREAS there will be a glow through the translucent glass of the Annex when the building is occupied during the evenings;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the application is approved.

VOTE: 3 in favor (Davis, Helpern, Liston, Slater) 4 in opposition (Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall, Tamayo)

3. **18 East 69th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District - Javier Robles, Principal** – A neo-Grec style residence designed by Charles Buek & Co and built in 1881-82. Application for a rooftop addition and new street facade windows (2nd to 4th stories).

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to install three bay windows on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th stories along a vertical line of the street façade;

WHEREAS the above-mentioned three windows would be installed into what are “blind bays” in that they are presently without windows;

WHEREAS the above-mentioned new windows would be double-hung with brownstone surround to match the existing windows on either side of the bay on the 2nd, 3rd, and 4th stories;

WHEREAS the applicant also proposes to install an additional bulkhead on the rooftop which will be set back 26’ from the street, thereby increasing the bulk in the rear of the rooftop in order to accommodate an internal staircase leading to the roof.

WHEREAS with regard to the rear façade, the applicant proposes to remove the existing second floor window and fill the opening with masonry to match the existing masonry and to add new steel fixed and casement windows in the existing masonry openings on the 3rd and 4th floors;

WHEREAS the Committee wishes to take this application in two parts: Part 1 (the Bay Windows) and Part 2 (the Bulkhead and Rear Façade).

Part 1 - the Bay Windows

WHEREAS the present absence of bay windows along a vertical line of the street façade contributes to the unique character of this building and adding said windows would be inconsistent with the existing design and character of the building;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Committee disapproves Part 1 – the bay windows portion of the application.

VOTE: 4 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpem, Parshall) 3 in opposition (Liston, Slater, Tamayo)

Part 2 - the Bulkhead and Rear Façade

WHEREAS the Committee finds that the proposed expansion to the bulkhead is not visible from the street and neither the proposed bulkhead nor the proposed windows for the rear façade are inconsistent with the design and character of the building;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Committee approves Part 2 – the Bulkhead and Rear Façade of the application.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpem, Parshall, Liston, Slater, Tamayo)

4. **123 East 71st Street (between Park and Lexington Avenues) – Upper East Side Historic District - Garrow Kedigian, Architect** – A Italianate style residence built in 1865 and redesigned by Thomas Nash, with some Italianate elements remaining, in 1904. Application for a 5th floor addition.

WHEREAS the architectural character of the fifth floor addition is compatible with the style of the building;

WHEREAS the front façade of the addition will be made of lead coated copper to match the material of the fifth floor of the adjacent building;

WHEREAS the rear façade will be set back to align with the fourth floor below;

WHEREAS this is an appropriate design for the historic district

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the application is approved.

VOTE: 7 in favor (Ashby, Davis, Helpem, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo) 1 in opposition (Birnbaum)

5. **11 East 68th Street (at Madison Avenue) - Upper East Side Historic District - Richard Metsky, Architect** - A neo-Renaissance style apartment building designed by Herbert Lucas and built in 1912-13. Application to alter windows, entry and entry courtyard, and sidewalk, and to construct rear yard and penthouse additions.

WHEREAS 11 East 68th Street is a contributing building within the Upper East Side Historic District;

WHEREAS 11 East 68th Street, also known as “The Marquand”, occupies the site of 3 brownstones designed by Richard Morris Hunt for Henry G. Marquand.

WHEREAS 11 East 68th Street is a particularly fine example of the neo-Renaissance style and presents the austerity and restraint of an Italian palazzo as translated into an apartment building;

WHEREAS the brick and bow-window upper floors rest atop a handsome pillow-rusticated limestone base;

WHEREAS the Committee wishes to take this application into four parts: Part 1 (the Changes to the East 68th Street Elevation), Part 2 (the Changes to the Entrance and Entry Courtyard and Sidewalk on East 68th Street), Part 3 (the Enlargement of the Cellar Space and 1st floor), and Part 4 (the Changes to the Existing Copper-clad Penthouse, including Changes to the Height, Floor area and Fenestration).

Part 1 (the Changes to the East 68th Street Elevation)

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to enlarge the retail window at the corner, cutting the window down through the limestone base (water coursing element) while retaining the pillow keystone feature of the existing window.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to create a new storefront entry door to the east of the existing entry courtyard, also cutting through the limestone base (water coursing element).

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the East 68th Street elevation will compromise the symmetry, restraint, and elegance of the original neo-renaissance design.

WHEREAS the proposed changes to the East 68th Street elevation will cut through and destroy original material that is integral to a contributing building in the historic district.

WHEREAS the proposed changes will alter forever, and bring disharmony to, the dominant elevation of one of the great neo-Renaissance style apartment buildings in the city

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as relates to the above-described Part 2.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

Part 2 (The Changes to the Entry and Entrance Courtyard and Sidewalk on East 68th Street)

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to create a handicapped accessible ramp along the west side of the entry courtyard.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes a new entry marquee to cover the door only to take the place of the existing awning which now goes from the sidewalk through the entry courtyard to the front door.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to add planters to both the east and west sides of the entry courtyard.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes adding steps at the front of the entry courtyard just in from the sidewalk to correct the change in grade from the sidewalk to the entry door – a change of 2 ½’.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing material of the entry court with granite pavers.

WHEREAS handicapped-accessible entrance ramps on both the east and west sides of the entry courtyard to create handicapped accessibility would enhance the symmetry that is the great hallmark of the East 68th Street elevation while installing said ramp on only one side the entry courtyard sharply diminishes said symmetry.

WHEREAS the proposed granite pavers and the proposed planters are inappropriate and out-of-context and too contemporary for a neo-Renaissance-style apartment building of this stature within the historic district.

WHEREAS the proposed granite pavers and the proposed planters diminish the austerity of the East 68th Street elevation.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as relates to the above-described Part 3.

VOTE: 4 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall, Slater) 4 in opposition (Davis, Helpern, Liston, Tamayo)

(With there being an even split between the members, the Committee took no further action with regard to Part 2 of this application).

Part 3 (the Enlargement of the Cellar Space and 1st floor)

WHEREAS with regard to the rearyard, the applicant proposes to extend the rear of cellar to create an additional space of 11’ by 66’ and the rear of the ground floor by 752 square feet.

WHEREAS the proposed extension of the rear of the cellar will not be visible and the proposed extension of the rear of the ground floor is not visible from the public way and is not an excess intrusion into the rearyard space.

THEREFORE BET IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as relates to the above-described Part 4.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall, Slater, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Tamayo)

Part 4 (the Proposed Changes to the Existing Copper-clad Penthouse, including Changes to the Height, Floor Area and Fenestration)

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to transform an existing structure on the rooftop, enlarging the first floor of same by 455 square feet and an additional 640 square feet to be added to the second floor of same, replacing existing copper with a green-colored corrugated metal.

WHEREAS said changes are inconsistent with the character and design of the building and would upset the balance and scale of same.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is approved as relates to the above-described Part 5.

VOTE: 6 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Parshall, Slater, Liston, Tamayo) 2 in opposition (Davis, Helpern)

6. **12 East 78th Street (between Fifth and Madison Avenues) – Metropolitan Museum Historic District** – *Selldorf Architects* – A rowhouse designed by Charles Graham and built in 1886-7. Application to alter the front façade and stoop facing 78th Street.

WHEREAS this brownstone building had been painted a dark grey;

WHEREAS probes showed various shades of grey;

WHEREAS the building will be painted a light grey to emulate limestone;

WHEREAS the decorative accents painted dark grey will remain dark grey;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the application is approved.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

David Helpern and David Liston, Co-Chairs