James G. Clynes Chairman

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com - E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8 Landmarks Committee Marymount Manhattan College 221 East 71st Street Regina Peruggi Room June 13, 2016

Present: Elizabeth Ashby, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo, Sarah Chu, Gayle Barron, Michele Birnbaum, Susan Evans Public Member: Christina Davis

Absent excused: Alida Camp, David Liston

1. **1112 Park Avenue (between 89th and 90th Streets) - Park Avenue Historic District**-*Alex Schweitzer, architect.* Application is to relocate and extend chimney flues.

WHEREAS 1112 Park Avenue is a colonial style apartment building designed by Emery Roth and constructed in 1926-27.

WHEREAS the height of the newly constructed building at 1110 Park Avenue has meant that 10 existing chimney flues at 1112 Park Avenue are out of compliance with the building code since they must be at least 10' from the adjacent property line. [There is an additional existing flue that is attached to the front/east elevation of the existing bulkhead that is not part of this application.] **WHEREAS** the existing 10 flues are on the south property line of 1112 Park; the applicant proposes moving them to the south face of the existing bulkhead.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes that this is a solution which least interferes with existing conditions at the roof.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to pull up the flues and extend/angle them up and over [by approximately 14'] so that they are attached by brackets

to the south wall of the existing bulkhead.

WHEREAS each of the 10 flues will extend 3' above the bulkhead parapet and will be made of aluminum.

WHEREAS the applicant did not provide a sample of the color for the proposed flues.

WHEREAS the drawings provided by the applicant were not clear; the drawings did not provide clarity on how the flues would be angled so that they could be extended from their original position on the roof at the south property line to the south wall of the bulkhead.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Liston, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron); PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR (Davis)

2. **7 East 84th Street-(between 84th and 85th Streets)-Metropolitan Museum Historic District** *Mark Ferguson, architect*-Neo-Grec style designed by John Brandt and constructed in 1884-85. Application to modify door and garage opening; rear façade alterations and installation of rooftop mechanical equipment and bulkhead.

WHEREAS the façade of this 1880's, 25 foot wide row house was replaced with an "English Regency Style" façade in 1906 with a limestone base at the basement level, a brick façade on the first, second and third floors, and a copper mansard fascia on the fourth floor;

WHEREAS the pair of main, metal and glass entrance doors is in the center of the façade, with a narrow window located either side of the entrance, and a service door located at the western edge; **WHEREAS** the windows on the second, third, and fourth floors are organized in a tripartite composition in the center of the facade;

WHEREAS the western window and service door were replaced with a garage entrance in 1975, prior to the designation of the historic district;

WHEREAS the garage door created an asymmetrical relationship around the entrance doors by eliminating the western window and changed the character of the base of the building by eliminating the substantial limestone surround at the western side of the entrance doors;

WHEREAS the proposed design shifts the main entrance to the east, in line with the window above and replaces the garage door with a slightly wider pair of doors, also shifted to the east, with its western edge aligned, approximately, with the western edge of the tripartite windows above;

WHEREAS the proposed design for the base of the building restores the overall symmetry and the substantial character or the limestone base by creating wide piers at either side of the building; **WHEREAS** this arrangement creates a wide pier either side of the entrance doors, recalling the original framing of the doors within the limestone wall;

WHEREAS the stucco framing of the existing garage door will be replaced with limestone; **WHEREAS** the existing metal and glass doors are being restored, the original stone surround is being rebuilt, the existing limestone is being reused, and new limestone will match the existing; **WHEREAS** a lantern style, sconce light fixture will be located at the center of the masonry pier between the garage doors and the main entrance doors:

WHEREAS the façade will be restored to include new, divided light, wood casement windows to match the existing; repair and cleaning of stone; repair and repainting of metal railings at first and third floors; and repair of standing seam copper on mansard roof;

WHEREAS the existing curb and fence will be removed and the areaway in front of the building reorganized to reflect the new locations of the main entrance and garage entrance;

WHEREAS the proposed new decorative metal fence and gate will be six feet high and will be similar in design to the metal fence from 1906;

WHEREAS there is a partial fifth floor which extends to the rear façade;

WHEREAS there is an extension on the eastern side of the lot which includes four floors;

WHEREAS the divided light wood windows on basement through second floor on the rear façade, which are set in a copper clad bay, will be replaced with new, divided light, wood French doors with windows either side and new, painted metal balconies on the first and second floors;

WHEREAS the wood, divided light, double hung windows on the brick faced, third through fifth floors will be slightly re-proportioned and replaced with painted, wood casement windows;

WHEREAS the existing lattice walls on the ground floor of the main building and the extension will be restored;

WHEREAS the ground floor of the extension will receive a new Dutch door and new wood French doors with divided lights to match the existing;

WHEREAS the windows in the extension on the first and second floors will be replaced with divided light, painted, wood casement windows;

WHEREAS the third floor terrace will receive a new wood pergola and a new, decorative metal railing;

WHEREAS the existing stair to the high roof on the western side will be demolished;

WHEREAS a new bulkhead will be built to cover the vertical extension of the elevator and a new stair on the eastern side of the roof;

WHEREAS the new bulkhead will not be visible from the street;

WHEREAS a new skylight will be installed on the eastern side of the roof;

WHEREAS the roof will be converted into a terrace and connected to the lower roof behind the parapet portion of the mansard;

WHEREAS this renovation is contextual and appropriate within the historic district; **THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo) Public member in favor (Davis)

3. **34 East 62nd Street (between Madison and Park Avenues) - Upper East Side Historic District -** *Henry Jessup, architect.* Application is for a new building

WHEREAS 34 East 62nd Street was originally a new-Grec style brownstone designed by L. D. Russell & J.B. Wray and constructed in 1881-1882.

WHEREAS the pre-existing structure at 34 East 62nd Street was leveled by a gas explosion in 2006. **WHEREAS** in 2007, the Landmarks Preservation Commission approved a Certificate of

Appropriateness for a modern 5-story limestone and glass townhouse that was never built.

WHEREAS the applicant, a new owner of the property, proposes a historically based design with a separate base, projecting bay above with emphasis on the piano nobile and a setback mansard roof with dormers.

WHEREAS the entry will be simply cut into the stone base so that the emphasis is on the piano nobile above; there will be a service entrance that goes down to the cellar.

WHEREAS the contextual design presents a genuine vocabulary of moldings and cornices and profiles.

WHEREAS the applicant's design is intended to be a link between the 1916 neo-Georgian Cross & Cross designed Links Club to the east and the gray brick Cumberland House, a 1958 modern apartment building to the north.

WHEREAS the proposed new house reads as "Beaux Arts derivative" -- with a rusticated base, a bowed 2nd and 3rd floor and decreasing in scale up to the dormered mansard roof that is intended to mimic the mansard roof of the adjacent Links Club.

WHEREAS the front elevation will be made of limestone with the Beaux Arts style most apparent in the lovely arched and slightly over scaled detailing at the top of the second floor windows (piano nobile) and at the black slate mansard roof with its copper clad dormer windows

WHEREAS there will be a stone entablature/projecting cornice supported by limestone brackets at the top of the 4th floor and metal railings at the ground floor, the 2nd floor and the 4th floor.

WHEREAS the applicant's design is intended to be a link between the elegant and restrained 1916 neo-Georgian Cross & Cross designed Links Club to the east and the gray brick Cumberland House, a 1958 modern apartment building to the north.

WHEREAS the building extends 65' to the top of the mansard and 73' to the top of the elevator bulkhead and is 68'4" deep.

WHEREAS adjacent to 34 East 62nd Street is a 10' wide ramp to the below-grade parking garage for Cumberland House; the Links Club is set back from the property line.

WHEREAS both the 10' wide ramp and the Links Club setback allow for "quoins" or masonry blocks at the corners of the front elevation; thus there is an interlocking of the limestone on the front elevation and the brick on the east and west elevations to make a decorative feature at the corners.

WHEREAS the rear elevation will be brick; the windows at the 2nd floor will mimic exactly the 2nd floor windows on the front elevation, including the metal railing.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes steel casement windows on both the front and rear elevating and for the 5 windows on the west elevation [where the driveway for the Cumberland House is]; the windows will be painted black.

WHEREAS the applicant has presented an outstanding example of a new highly contextual building within the historic district by using a derivative vocabulary and is to be commended. **BE IT THEREFORE RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron)

PUBLIC MEMBER IN FAVOR (Davis)

4. **215 East 61st Street-(between Second and Third Avenues)-Treadwell Farm Historic District**-*Sarah Drake, architect*-French Second Empire style brownstone designed by A & S Bussell and constructed in 1875. Application to change door opening.

WHEREAS in 1980 a metal hood was added over the front door;

WHEREAS the metal hood is to be removed;

WHEREAS the simple stucco door surround is to be replaced with a sculptural surround and a cornice above to match the configuration of the frames of the windows above;

WHEREAS the material for the new surround will match the color of the existing brown stucco; **WHEREAS** the surround of the door will be similar to the surround of the entrance door to the building next door;

WHEREAS this alteration is contextual and appropriate within the historic district; **THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED** that this application is approved as presented.

VOTE: 8 in favor (Ashby, Baron, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Tamayo) Public member in favor (Davis)

5. **1111 Park Avenue (between 89th and 90th Streets) - Park Avenue Historic District** - *Megan Rispoli, architect*. Application is for a window replacement master plan.

WHEREAS 1111 Park Avenue is a colonial-revival style apartment building designed by Schwartz & Gross and constructed in 1924-25.

WHEREAS the original historic windows presented as 6 over 6; all of the original windows have been replaced.

WHEREAS a 2004 Master Plan for the building required either double hung aluminum windows or double hung aluminum clad windows [aluminum on the outside with wood on the inside within the apartment]; shareholders had the option of using muntins attached to the glazing to recreate the 6 over 6 original window (not a true divided light).

WHEREAS applicant now proposes a master plan that would reintroduce 6 over 6 windows for the first three floors of the Park Avenue elevation only; all other windows would be one over one double hung windows. [The muntins would be attached to the glazing and not, present as a true divided light.]

WHEREAS the windows would be aluminum or aluminum clad (where the shareholder has a wood interior option) and would have a bronze colored finish.

WHEREAS a one over one double hung window is an option for 1111 Park Avenue; however, the original historic Schwartz and Gross window was a 6 over 6 wooden window with wooden muntins dividing the glazing.

WHEREAS the Master Plan as presented is out of context and inappropriate within the halitosis district.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that this application is disapproved as presented.

Vote: 7 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Chu, Evans, Parshall, Tamayo, Baron), 1 against (Helpern) Public Member Against (Davis)