Nicholas Viest Chair

Latha Thompson District Manager



505 Park Avenue, Suite 620 New York, N.Y. 10022-1106 (212) 758-4340 (212) 758-4616 (Fax) www.cb8m.com - Website info@cb8m.com E-Mail

The City of New York Manhattan Community Board 8 Landmarks Committee, Monday, May 19, 2014 – 6:30PM Marymount Manhattan College, 221 East 71st Street, Regina Peruggi Room, 2nd Floor

Present: Elizabeth Ashby, Michele Birnbaum, Christina Davis, Susan Evans, David Helpern, Jane Parshall, Marco Tamayo

1. **45 East 65th Street (between Park and Madison)-Upper East Side Historic District**-*David Bae, Architect*-Application for the renovation of a single family townhouse.

WHEREAS this building, which was designed as a residence and then converted to institutional use, will be returned to a residence;

WHEREAS all paint will be removed from the brick and limestone on the front façade;

WHEREAS all brick masonry and limestone will be repaired on the front façade;

WHEREAS all wood windows on the front façade will be replaced in kind;

WHEREAS the black iron window guards on the front façade, which are not original, will be removed;

WHEREAS the two story mansard with copper trim on the front façade will be restored and repaired;

WHEREAS the stair, elevator, and mechanical bulkheads on the roof will be repaired and there will be no increase in the height of the roof top elements;

WHEREAS the rear of the building, a portion of which extends to the rear property line, will be demolished to create a 30' rear yard;

WHEREAS the below grade areaway in the rear will be filled in to garden level;

WHEREAS the new rear façade will have tan colored brick with iron spots;

WHEREAS wood windows to reflect the front will be installed -- with French doors at the garden level, casements with transoms at the parlor level, double hung at floors three through five, and studio windows with operable awning windows at the sixth floor;

WHEREAS the new rear elevation is contextual and appropriate in the historic district;

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

Vote: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

2. **44 East 74th Street (between Park and Madison)-Upper East Side Historic District***-Roxana Escobar, Architect*-Application to make changes at front elevation.

WHEREAS 44 East 74th Street is a Beaux Arts style house designed by George F. Pelham and constructed in 1904-1905.

WHEREAS 44 East 74th Street was formerly apartments; it has been returned to single family use.

WHEREAS 44 East 74th Street is a 5 story building with a metal railing at the roof above the parapet Whereas the metal railing has 2' wide openings that present a safety hazard.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the existing metal railing with a wall that will be the same exact height as the railing at 32"

WHEREAS the proposed replacement wall will be set back approximately 32" from the roofline and is minimally visible from the public way.

WHEREAS the proposed replacement wall will be finished in stucco Whereas the proposed replacement wall is contextual and appropriate within the historic district.

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

Vote: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

3. **34 East 68th Street (between Park and Madison)-Upper East Side Historic District***-Michael Chen, Architect*-Application to amend the original LPC approval for the renovation of the front facade.

WHEREAS 34 East 68th Street received a Certificate of Appropriateness in December, 2012; WHEREAS the restoration of the brownstone front façade was approved with brownstone stucco; WHEREAS it was found at the start of construction that the finish on the original brownstone was an elastomeric paint and not brownstone stucco;

WHEREAS the elastomeric paint is peeling and not an appropriate surface on which to apply stucco;

WHEREAS a sounding of the facade found that 90% of the original brownstone had eroded to depths ranging from 1/2" to 2".

WHEREAS the deteriorated brownstone cannot serve as the base for resurfacing with stucco;

WHEREAS terra cotta has been used to simulate brownstone;

WHEREAS terra cotta is a durable product and is being used on the rear of the house;

WHEREAS terra cottas is an appropriate material for use in the historic district;

WHEREAS terra cotta will replace and replicate the deteriorated brownstone on the front façade;

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is approved as presented.

Vote: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

4. **605** Park Avenue (between East 64th and East 65th Streets)-Upper East Side Historic District-*Barry Rice, Architect*-Application to make exterior renovations.

WHEREAS through the years many of the original open terraces both at the corners of the building and at the front of the building have been enclosed, but in an inconsistent manner.

WHEREAS all the remaining open balconies will be enclosed; a combination of aluminum and bronze will be used on the enclosures.

WHEREAS the windows will be aluminum; sitting in front of the aluminum a vestige of the original balcony will be represented in bronze to replicate the original profile of both the balcony and the building itself.

WHEREAS at the 2-story base of the building, currently clad in black granite, there are recessed (by 5') storefront windows with columns in front.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to reclad the base in limestone and to bring the recessed windows forward to engage the existing columns -- the columns will now read as pilasters.

WHEREAS the new windows at the base and the entry door will be made of bronze.

WHEREAS the applicant proposes to replace the rest of the windows with in-kind aluminum windows.

WHEREAS the A/C and heating unit grills for the apartments are irregular in shape and have been added to over the years; to create uniformity and symmetry, the applicant proposes to replace all existing grills with slightly larger bronze grills that will be exactly centered beneath with the windows above.

WHEREAS a new, more distinctive canopy will be added at the entrance

WHEREAS the changes proposed by the applicant will give elegance and symmetry to an otherwise undistinguished building.

THEREFORE this application is approved as presented.

Vote: 7 in favor (Ashby, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo), 1 against (Birnbaum)

- 5. **1 East 78th Street (at Fifth Avenue)-Metropolitan Museum Historic District**-*Scott Marble, Architect*-Application to install a breezeway and handicap lift.
- 6. **3 East 78th Street (between Fifth and Madison)-Metropolitan Museum Historic District**-*Scott Marble, Architect*-Application for interior alterations, replace windows or doors, rooftop or rear yard HVAC and new window or door opening.

Since the applications for 1 East 78th Street and 3 East 78th Street represent two parts of a single project, the two applications were heard and discussed together and the resolution, therefore, applies to both applications

WHEREAS the applications are to build a breezeway to connect 1 East 78th Street and 3 East 78th Street and to install a handicap lift in a 9'-6" wide space between the two buildings on the 1 East 78th Street property; **WHEREAS** the breezeway will have perforated metal sides and a metal roof;

WHEREAS the existing air conditioning unit in the adjacent courtyard on the 3 East 78th Street property will be replaced with a smaller unit;
WHEREAS windows to be replaced on the lower two levels of 3 East 78th Street will be replaced in kind;
WHEREAS these are significant buildings by significant architects;
WHEREAS the presentation information did not fully illustrate the proposed changes;
WHEREAS the breezeway and handicap lift are visible from the public way;
WHEREAS the presentation of the public way;

WHEREAS the materials are not appropriate to the existing buildings;

WHEREAS the proposed construction disturbs the original fabric of 1 and 3 East 78th Street;

THEREFORE be it resolved that this application is **<u>disapproved</u>** as presented.

Vote: 8 in favor (Ashby, Birnbaum, Davis, Evans, Helpern, Parshall, Slater, Tamayo)

7. Old Business-Parish House, Park Avenue Christian Church

After discussion, the committee recommended that the Chair of the board send a letter to the Landmarks Preservation Commission regretting that the Parish House was included as a "no-style" building in the designation report for the new Park Avenue Historic District, consistent with the Board's September, 2013 resolution.

8. New Business

David Helpern and Jane Parshall – Co-Chairs, Landmarks Committee